The China Which is Here: Translating Classical Chinese Poetry

By

Lawrence Kwan-chee Yung

A thesis

Submitted in Partial Fulfillment of the Requirements for the Degree of

PhD

in

Translation Studies

(Centre for British and Comparative Cultural Studies)

at the

University of Warwick

May, 1998

Table of Contents

Title: The China Which is Here

Acknowledgements

I would like to express my most heartfelt thanks to my advisor, Professor Susan Bassnett, for her interest in my efforts, and her advice concerning the organisation and English style of the text. Her innovative approach to scholarship gave me the inspiration and the sustenance to undertake this study. She spent many hours discussing the basic structure of the thesis with me. Much of the content owes its existence to her broad knowledge and profound understanding of poetics and Translation Studies. To say that she supervised this work gives little idea of how much of her generosity is bound up in it. Painstakingly reading the whole manuscript for a few times, she has saved me from many embarrassing errors and clumsy wordings. I alone bear responsibility for any errors that may be found in this thesis.

I am indebted to Dr. P. Kuhiwczak, who has taught me Translation Studies. I am deeply obliged to Ms. Janet Bailey at the Centre for British and Comparative Cultural Studies, for her kindness and encouragement. The opportunity to study at Warwick has been one of the most rewarding experiences of my life.

I wish to thank Prof. Yuan Heh-hsiang, Prof. John Deeney, and Dr. Cecile Sun, and the many people who have guided me before and during the writing of this thesis. I would like to thank the scholars and librarians at Warwick and some other universities for their help in locating works that are of great importance. Anyone who now writes about Waley and Pound must be aware of how much he is indebted to previous scholars.

I would like to thank my family members for their support and patience through the preparation of this thesis.

The China Which is Here: Translating Classical Chinese Poetry

The thesis proposes to address how the tradition of translating Chinese poetry in the English speaking world developed in the early twentieth century and has continued. Problems relating to this issue, such as the great change in poetics and intellectual atmosphere since 1915 when *Cathay* appeared, its impact on the translation of Chinese poetry, and the universe of discourse of the two cultures involved, those of the Chinese and the English speaking world, as well as the constraints of the target system on the translations, will also be discussed.

The introduction provides an overview of the poetics that valued traditional metres at the turn of the century, and applies polysystem theory to explain the lack of enthusiasm for translations of classical Chinese poetry before 1915. Chapter 2 discusses the constraints of language, the poetics and universe of discourse in the target system, suggesting that these constraints handicapped the widespread transfer of classical Chinese poetry before 1915.

Chapter 3 examines *xing*, the poetic device in Chinese poetry that emphasizes the poet's spontaneous response to nature and the merging of scene and feeling. The very nature of *xing* defies any attempt to make it explicit. The chapter is divided into two parts, discussing *xing* in the encoding and decoding process respectively. Reader-response criticism and phenomenology are also incorporated in the discussions. The chapter is followed by an analysis of various attempts to translate poems that are presented with *xing* in Chapter 4, which shows that there is a tendency on the part of some translators to add logical links between the scene and the feelings expressed.

Chapter 5 looks at the translation strategies of Arthur Waley, investigating the traditions of translating classical Chinese poetry that he has helped to build up. The kind of smooth grammatical lines he uses and the Chineseness he conveys have had great influence on subsequent translators. Chapter 6 studies Ezra Pound, with special focus on his innovative work *Cathay*, and his juxtaposition techniques. Chapter 7 studies Kenneth Rexroth's translations of Du Fu, while Chapter 8 examines Gary Snyder's translations of Cold Mountain. The vehicle of translating Chinese poetry in general-- language and poetics-- was close to that of modern poetry in the target culture.

Chapter 9, the conclusion, asserts that various strategies are adopted for various purposes. It tries to place the position of the translators discussed in a polysystem context. In the target system, poems are appreciated more for their charm than their being supposedly faithful to an original. The image of China created through translators remains distant. To the reader in the West, China is always far out "there," not here.

Chapter I

Introduction

a) All Roads Lead to the Polysystem

The thesis proposes to address how the English-language tradition of translating Chinese poetry developed in the early twentieth century and has continued. Problems relating to this issue, such as the great change in poetics and intellectual atmosphere since 1915 when *Cathay* appeared, its impact on the translation of Chinese poetry, and the universe of discourse of the two cultures involved, those of the Chinese and the English speaking world, as well as the constraints of the target system on the translations, will also be discussed.

Where the translators also wrote poetry, their own works have been compared with their translations, showing frequent correlations in syntax, moods, and mode of presentation. This correspondence reveals a crucial fact: that the vehicle of translating Chinese poetry in general-- language and poetics-- was very close to that of modern poetry in the target culture, that is, the repertory of translated poetry coincided with the repertory of English poetic conventions.

The late professor James Liu declares:

> [...] translations of Chinese poetry continue to be made, by those who can, or think they can read Chinese, as well as by those who can't. For reasons that are not wholly clear to me, Chinese poetry has attracted many "translators" who can't read Chinese, whereas it is relatively rare to find a translator of French, German, or even Greek poetry who can't read the original language. Translations of Chinese poetry, it seems, will always be with us, so that it is perhaps fitting and even necessary to continue to talk about translating Chinese poetry.[1]

Some of the reasons behind the occurrence that he finds not "wholly clear," I believe, are that Chinese culture is so ancient and distant that there is a lack of knowledge of it in

general. Translators may feel free to make an image of it, or to re-write according to their imagination. Classical Chinese syntax, meanwhile, allows plenty of room for interpretation and imagination.

But what is more important is that the phenomenon lamented by Liu points to two important notions. One is related to the status of the source culture, which was regarded as being on a lower level. Bassnett and Lefevere suggest that there is always a hierarchical relationship between the source and target texts, because either the translator regards his task as that of rising to the level of the source text and its author, or the translator regards the target culture as greater and it colonises the source text, especially when it is distanced in time and space.[2] The other one is related to the state of the target system, which was at a turning point. Lefevere comments that translations have often been made with the intention of influencing the development of a culture and a literature,[3] and the translation of Chinese poetry was used by Pound and other Imagists as a tool to confront the poetic norms at that time. With the advent of polysystems theory, as Susan Bassnett writes, "all kinds of questions could now be asked that had previously not seemed to be of significance," questions such as:

> why do some cultures translate more and some less? What kind of texts get translated? What is the status of those texts in the target system and how does it compare to the status of the texts in the source system? What do we know about translation conventions and norms at given moments, and how do we assess translation as an innovatory force? What is the relationship in literary history between extensive translation activity and the production of

---

[1] James J. Y. Liu, "Polarity of Aims and Methods: Naturalization or Barbarization," *Yearbook of Comparative and General Literature*, 24 (1975), 60.

[2] Susan Bassnett and André Lefevere, ed., "Introduction: Proust's Grandmother and the Thousand and One Nights," in *Translation, History and Culture* (London and New York: Pinter Publishers, 1990), p. 11.

[3] André Lefevere, *Translation/ History/ Culture: A Sourcebook* (London: Routledge, 1992), pp. 8-9.

> texts claimed as canonical? What image do translators have of their work and how has that image been expressed figuratively?[4]

Examining such questions may shed light on the reasons for changes of strategy in translating classical Chinese poetry as well as the response of the target culture in the twentieth century, when Waley and Pound came onto the scene.

Even-Zohar's hypotheses also prove to be useful in clarifying the issues why so many translations of Chinese poetry have taken place since 1915, not before. His exploration of the relationship between translated texts and the literary polysystem leads to the argument that translated works correlate in two ways:

> (a) in the way they are selected by the target culture, the principles of selection being never uncorrelatable with the home co-systems [...] and (b) by the way they adopt specific norms, behaviours policies, which are a result of their relations with the other co-systems.[5]

The consequence is, according to Even-Zohar, that selection seems to be dictated by the conditions of the polysystem. Texts are chosen because of their compatibility with the new forms needed by a polysystem to achieve a complete, dynamic, homogeneous identity.[6]

---

[4] Susan Bassnett, *Comparative Literature: A Critical Introduction* (Oxford: Blackwell Publishers, 1993) p. 142.

[5] Itamar Even-Zohar, "The Position of Translated Literature within the Literary Polysystem," in *Papers in Historical Poetics*, ed. by Benjamin Hrushovski and Itamar Even-Zohar (Tel Aviv: University Publishing Projects, 1978), p. 1.

[6] A. C. Graham's observation may be a case in point. Graham thinks that the art of translating Chinese poetry is a by-product of the imagist movement, first exhibited in Pound's *Cathay* (1915) and Waley's *One Hundred and Seventy Chinese Poems* (1918). To him, the humble origin remains unchanged for the next half a century, for he writes that

> the English reader continues to recognize Chinese poetry by the face which it turned towards the poetic revolutionaries of the second decade of the century [...] why all Chinese poetry has such a sharp definition [...] without any of the shadow and mystery which he senses in Sung landscape painting or Taoist philosophy, the answer is that this is the quality in poetry which least interested poets at the crucial moment of the revolt against Romanticism.

A. C. Graham, "The Translation of Chinese Poetry," in *Poems of the Late T'ang* (New York: Penguin, 1967), pp. 13-20.

The socio-literary conditions of the receiving culture determine those texts which get translated. If features such as techniques, forms, or even genres are missing, texts providing such elements are likely to be imported. If a system begins to stagnate, translation will tend towards the innovative to provide the system with the impetus to move on.[7]

The first part of Even-Zohar's comment fits in well with the environment in which Pound introduced *Cathay* to his audience, and Waley's sustained effort in the meantime satisfied those who wanted to "have a feel" of the original. The different approaches of the two translators, Pound and Waley, could also be seen in the light of the distinctions made by Even-Zohar, who suggests that when translation occupies a primary position, the distinction between translated texts and original texts are blurred and definitions of translation would include versions, imitations, and adaptations. When the function of translated texts is to introduce new work into the system, they tend to closely reproduce the original text's forms and textual relations.[8]

The distinctions, however, are not always clear. Pound's *Cathay* is seemingly moving towards the first situation, but when he uses a few independent images in a line, eschewing the connectives and verbs, they are also simulating the original textual relations. Professional sinologists like Waley, on the other hand, are not necessarily leaning towards the second situation. Waley's limpid and fluent style is achieved by disregarding the rigid

---

While one may not argue with Graham about the origin of the fashion of translating Chinese poetry, one may not need to agree to his determinism. Developments in the last two decades seem to point to something different. Various attempts on translating Wang Wei, Su Shi, Han Yu, Meng Jiao, Li Shangyin and Li He, already show some interest in the Buddhist, Taoist, or even the mystic and surrealistic poetic traditions, other than the sharp definition he and his readers are familiar with.

[7] Even-Zohar, *Papers in Historical Poetics*, p. 22.

[8] Even-Zohar, *Papers in Historical Poetics*, p. 22.

formal structure of the original and rendering it in a contemporary language, though he claims that the stresses in his English lines equal the number of syllables in the original.[9]

Lyrical poetry has always been considered to represent the core values of Chinese literature, which is not the case in the West, and this phenomenon could well serve as an answer to James Liu as to why "non-professionals" tried their hands at translating Chinese poetry, and this phenomenon also has effect on the treatment of the source texts. Lefevere writes that it is in the treatment of texts that play a central role within a culture and in the way a central culture translates texts produced by cultures it considers secondary, that the importance of such factors as ideology, poetics and the Universe of Discourse is most obviously revealed.[10] It is important to note that Chinese culture has not been regarded as central in the west, and translations of it have not been "scrutinized with the greatest of care."[11]

When talking about the "liberties" that Fitzgerald claimed to have taken in translating the *Rubaiyat* of Omar Khayyam, Lefevere holds that Fitzgerald

> would never have dared to take such "Liberties" with classical Greek or Latin literature, because of the prestige enjoyed by these literatures in his time [...] He would have been undermining his own cultural base had he tried to take any "Liberties" with them. Persian and, by extension, Islamic literature were and are seen as marginal, "exotic," and can be treated with much less reverence.[12]

Before the nineteenth century, there was even less contact between the west and China than the west and the Islamic world, and to the west Chinese literature was even more marginal

---

[9] See Arthur Waley, "Notes on Translation," in *Madly Singing in the Mountains: An Appreciation and Anthology of Arthur Waley,* ed. with a preface by Ivan Morris (London: George Allen & Unwin Ltd, 1970), pp. 152-164 (p. 159).

[10] Lefevere, *Translation/ History/ Culture: A Sourcebook*, p. 70.

[11] Lefevere, *Translation/ History/ Culture: A Sourcebook*, p. 70.

[12] André Lefevere, *Translation, Rewriting, & the Manipulation of Literary Fame* (London and New York: Routledge, 1992) p. 75.

and exotic.[13] The following conversation may throw some light on the lack of understanding of the East among some leading scholars in England in the eighteenth century:

> Johnson called the East-Indians barbarians. Boswell: "You will except the Chinese, Sir." Johnson: "No, Sir." Boswell: "Have they not arts?" Johnson: "They have pottery." Boswell: "What do you say to the written characters of their language?" Johnson: "Sir, they have not an alphabet. They have not been able to form what all other nations have formed." Boswell: "There is more learning in that language than in any other, from the immense number

[13] The Chinese people, for example, were believed to be the direct descendants of Noah, and the Chinese language was thought to be the "primitive language" used before Babel by some Europeans in the seventeenth century. John Webb wrote in 1669 that

> Now to give a Language the first or premier rank, as to succinct Sweetness, and graceful Brevity, is a great step towards the granting of it to be, the PRIMITIVE Language; considering which, together with the exemplary Vitality; remarkable Modesty; admirable Generality; great Simplicity, and high Antiquity; we may from these Arguments almost dare to affirm, that the Language of the Empire of China is the PRIMITIVE Language. But, having moreover found Noah to have lived both before and after the flood in China, and that Their speech hath from all Antiquity been in one and the same Character preserved in books to this day; which is such a plea, as can be drawn up and entered, for no other Nation under Heaven, since the Creation of the World besides; we may almost affirm, that the *Chinois* have obtained a full and final decree, for the settlement of this Their claim to the First of Languages without all farther dispute.

John Webb, *Essay* (London, 1669), p. 209. Quoted in Chen, Shou-yi, "John Webb: A Forgotten Page in the Early History in Europe," *Chinese Social and Political Review* 19.3 (October 1935), 295-330 (p. 324).

For a detailed discussion of the early contacts between China and the west see also Chen, Shou-yi, "Thomas Percy and His Chinese Studies," *Chinese Social and Political Review*, 20.2 (July 1936), 202-230; Chen, Shou-yi, "Oliver Goldsmith and His Chinese Letters," *T'ien Hsia* 8 (1939), 34-52; Arthur J. Weitzman, "Oriental Languages and Literature in Seventeenth-Century England," *Babel* 11 (1965), 163-167; Fan, Tsen-chung, "Chinese Culture in England: Studies from Sir William Temple to Oliver Goldsmith" (unpublished doctoral dissertation, Harvard University, 1931); Fan, Tsen-chung, "Sir William Jones's Chinese Studies," *Review of English Studies* 22.88 (October 1946), 304-314; Fan, Tsen-chung, *Dr. Johnson and Chinese Culture* (London: The China Society, 1945); Fan, Cunzhong (Fan, Tsen-chung), "The Beginnings of the Influence of Chinese Culture in England," *Waiguoyu* 6 (1982), 2-13; Edmund Blunden, "China in English Literature," *Eastern Horizon* 1 (August 1960), 27-33; Donald F. Lach, and Theodore Nicholas Foss, "Images of Asia and Asians in European Fiction, 1500-1800," *Asia in Western Fiction* (1990), 14-34; Donald F. Lach, "China and the Era of the Enlightenment," *Journal of Modern History* 14 (1942), 209-223; Donald F. Lach, "Literature," in *Asia in the Making of Europe, vol. I: The Century of Discovery* (Chicago and London: University of Chicago Press, 1965), pp. 74-80; Donald F. Lach, "English Literature," in *Asia in the Making of Europe, vol. II: A Century of Wonder* (Chicago and London: University of Chicago Press, 1965), pp. 361-392; Martha Pike Conant, *The Oriental Tale in England in the Eighteenth Century* (London: Frank Cass, 1966); Martha Pike Conant, *The Oriental Tale in England* (New York: Octagon Books, 1966); Limin Chu, "A Narrative Account of Westerners' Impressions of Old China," *Asian Culture Quarterly* 8.2 (Summer 1980), 1-33.

> of their characters." Johnson: "It is only more difficult from its rudeness; as there is more labour in hewing down a tree with a stone than with an axe."[14]

It is interesting to note that, a few centures later, Fenollosa found the Chinese characters an inspiration for a new poetics. Pound, meanwhile, dwells on Fenollosa's idea about the concreteness of Chinese characters and develops his imagist theory and ideogrammic method.[15]

---

[14] *Boswell's Life of Johnson*, ed. by G. B. Hill and L. F. Powell, 4 vols (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1934), 3, III, p. 339.

It should be pointed out that Johnson talked about the government and morality, architecture and gardening, and the Great Wall of China with warmth and respect. There is this conversation, for example:

> He talked with an uncommon animation of travelling into distant countries; that the mind was enlarged by it, and that an acquisition of dignity of character was derived from it. He expressed a particular enthusiasm with respect to visiting the wall of China. I catched it for the moment, and said I really believed I should go and see the wall of China had I not children, of whom it was my duty to take care. "Sir (said he), by doing so, you would do what would be of importance in raising your children to eminence. There would be a lustre reflected upon them from your spirit and curiosity. They would be at all times regarded as the children of a man who had gone to view the wall of China. I am serious, Sir."

Boswell's Life of Johnson, ed. by Hill and Powell, 3, III, p. 269.

[15] Chinese characters and their component parts appear in Pound's Confucian *Odes* and the *Cantos*. Fenollosa and Pound's concept of the Chinese character in relation to the modern poetics is perhaps summarized in the following passage. Pound, following Fenollosa, writes:

> In Europe, if you ask a man to define anything, his definition always moves away from the simple things that he knows perfectly well, it recedes into an unknown region, that is a region of remoter and progressively remoter abstraction [...] Thus if you ask him what red is, he says it is a "colour" [...] By contrast to the method of abstraction, or of defining things in more and still more general terms, Fenollosa emphasizes the method of science, "which is the method of poetry" [...] and is the way the Chinese go about it in their ideograph or abbreviated picture writing [...] He (the Chinaman) is to define red [...] He puts (or his ancestor put) together the abbreviated picture of
>
> | | | |
> |---|---|---|
> | | ROSE | CHERRY |
> | IRON | RUST | FLAMINGO |
>
> [...] he gets together a few hundred or thousand slides, and picks out what is necessary for his general statement.

Ezra Pound, *ABC of Reading* (London: Routledge, 1934), pp. 3-7. See also Ernest Fenollosa, *The Chinese Written Character as a Medium for Poetry: an Ars Poetica*, with foreword and notes by Ezra Pound (London: S. Nott, 1936).

For a more detailed discussion of the relation between Chinese characters (the ideograms) and imagism, see Hugh Kenner, *The Poetry of Ezra Pound* (New York: New Directions, 1951), particularly the chapters "Why Imagism?" "The Moving Image," "Vortex," "Ideogram: Seeing," "Ideogram: Making," and

Susan Bassnett, on the other hand, relates the sense of superiority specifically to political and cultural issues, which could result in the translator's attempt to measure up the source text with a pre-conceived criterion in the target system:

> Belief in the superiority of their own culture was a part of the politics of imperialism. The rhetoric which dismissed African or Asian peoples as 'primitive' or 'childlike' also dismissed their art forms in various ways [...] At the same time, because of the importance of the written epic in the European tradition, those cultures which had no epic and which saw the lyric as the highest form of poetry were also downgraded. Homer and the Greeks, the plays of Shakespeare, the poetry of Spenser and Milton, these were the texts against which other works were measured and found wanting.[16]

Different attitudes also lead to different strategies. Some translators take the original as a "classic" that could hardly be tampered with; examples are William Hung, David Hawkes and Wai-lim Yip, and some professional sinologists.[17] Some others regard the original as a starting point for rewriting, like Pound and Rexroth. Somewhere between them is Waley, whose knowledge of Chinese language and culture enabled him to work closely on the original meaning, whereas his consistent effort to write in a style that appealed to the contemporary reader was in line with Pound in the meantime. His translations, therefore, on many occasions are remembered as English poems, like those of Pound.[18]

"Ideogram: Reprise," pp. 56-105. See also Max Nänny, *Ezra Pound: Poetics for an Electric Age* (Bern: Francke Verlag, 1973).

[16] Bassnett, *Comparative Literature*, p. 18.

[17] See also Even-Zohar, *Papers in Historical Poetics*, p. 22. Wai-lim Yip's idea of translating Chinese poetry can be seen in his various works on translation. See, for example, his preface to his translation of Wang Wei, *Hiding the Universe: Poems by Wang Wei* (New York: Grossman Publishers, 1972). David Hawkes and William Hung, on the other hand, rendered Du Fu's poems into prose, mainly providing explicatory details to show the reader what the original is like and supposed to mean. One could argue, however, rendering poems into prose involves a lot of tampering with the text.

[18] See, for example, J. M. Cohen, "Dr. Waley's Translations," in *Madly Singing in the Mountains*, pp. 29-36.

The translators' strategies are inextricably related to their overall translation conception as well as their feelings for the source cultures or individual poets, and the two factors are inseparable. Lefevere writes that when the image of the original is no longer uniformly positive in the target culture, more liberties are likely to be taken in translation, because the original is no longer considered a "quasi-sacred" text.[19] This observation on the relationship between the source culture and the target culture is helpful in understanding the attitudes, hence their strategies, of most translators of classical Chinese poetry.

Even-Zohar's notion of the hierarchical structure of the polysystem holds that a text does not gain access to the highest hierarchical level of a certain culture just because of its absolute beauty, but because of the nature of the polysystem of the receiving culture, its social, literary, or historical circumstances, and also because of the difference between certain elements of the text and cultural norms. A text is never totally autonomous, but is always involved in all kinds of relationships with other elements of other systems at both the centre and margins of a cultural whole.[20] And there are always distinctions between the systems, which maintain *hierarchical* relations: some are in a more central position than others, or that some are *primary* while others are *secondary*.[21]

Translations were usually regarded as secondary, but according to Even-Zohar, this may not be always the case. It is true that the polysystems of larger, older cultures such as the Anglo-American tend to relegate translated literature to the margins.[22] Even-Zohar observes that there are three social circumstances which may enable a situation in which translation maintains a primary position:

---

[19] Lefevere, *Translation/ History/ Culture: A Sourcebook*, p. 91.
[20] Even-Zohar, *Papers in Historical Poetics*, pp. 16-22.
[21] Even-Zohar, *Papers in Historical Poetics*, p. 16.
[22] Even-Zohar, *Papers in Historical Poetics*, pp. 27-30.

> (a) when a polysystem had not yet been crystallised, i. e. when a literature is "young", in the process of being established; (b) when a literature is either "peripheral" or "weak", or both, and (c) when there are turning points, crises or literary vacuums.[23]

The present study is concerned with the third category. Though in the English speaking world translation is usually taken as secondary, there have been turning points since the beginning of this century, and translations, specifically translations of classical Chinese poetry, occupy an important position that one hesitates to call marginal. Gentzler comments on this third situation:

> perhaps analogous to the cultural situation in America in the sixties, established literary models no longer stimulate the new generation of writers, who turn elsewhere for ideas and forms. Under such historical circumstances, or combination of circumstances, both established and avant-garde writers produce translations, and through translated text new elements are introduced into a literary system that would otherwise fail to appear.[24]

The description may apply to the works of Rexroth and Snyder on the one hand and Pound's early work, the *Cathay* poems on the other.

Susan Bassnett notes that writing does not happen in a vacuum, but in a context and the process of translating texts from one cultural system into another is not an innocent activity. Translation is instead a highly charged activity, and translation has played a fundamental role in cultural change.[25] Classical Chinese poetry found its way into the English speaking world at a time when there was an increasing desire to shake off the residue of Romantic influence in poetry. Translation of Chinese poetry on any scale could only come after the advent of modernist poetics, mainly imagism. Pound's *Cathay*

---

[23] Even-Zohar, *Papers in Historical Poetics*, p. 24.
[24] Edwin Gentzler, *Contemporary Translation Theories* (London and New York: Routledge, 1993), pp. 117-118.
[25] Bassnett, *Comparative Literature*, pp. 160-161.

appeared in 1915, but before that, Waley could not find a publisher for his first translations,[26] which received more attention after 1917.[27] The general poetic atmosphere at the turn of the century valued discursive style, and the result of *Cathay* was a subversion of the *status quo*.

John G. Fletcher observes that

> The Pre-Raphaelites of the seventies, eighties and nineties had tried to get away from too much Victorian moralizing [...] The attempt that the Georgians were then making, in the England where I lived, to revive the pure nature-lyricism of the early Romantics [...] seemed to me rather artificial and forced.[28]

James Dunn also notices that Pound could not mount a successful frontal attack on the dominant mode, which in London was the Georgian revival of romantic nature-lyricism.[29] Dunn's summary of the situation of translating Chinese poetry before and after 1915 throws more light on the problem:

> The repertory of poetic procedures available to the translator of poetry is the same inventory available to the poet writing in that target language. What can or will be transferred depends on the target system's poetics. Corollary to this is the fact that an audience's poetic assumptions limit the field of receptivity within which the translator is confined.

---

[26] See Arthur Waley, "Introduction" to *A Hundred and Seventy Chinese Poems* (London: George Allen & Unwin Ltd, 1918), p. 6.

[27] Waley recalled many years later: "In 1917 things took a turn. The School of Oriental Studies began to bring out a Bulletin and in the first two numbers I published [...] most of what afterwards became the Hundred and Seventy. Several literary magazines also printed single poems. But the real turning-point was an article in the *Literary Supplement* of November 15, by some one (I was told it was A. Clutton-Brock) who had seen the two *Bulletins*." See Waley, *A Hundred and Seventy Chinese Poems*, pp. 6-7.

[28] John G. Fletcher, "The Orient and Contemporary Poetry," in *The Asian Legacy and American Life*, ed. by Arthur E. Christy (New York: John Day, 1945), p. 150.

For Pound's early contact with the Georgians see also Michael Reck, "A Yank Among the Georgians," *Ezra Pound: A Close-Up* (New York: McGraw-Hill Book Company, 1967), pp. 11-25.

[29] See James Dunn, "Translation and Poetics: Reciprocal Technologies in the History of Chinese-to-English Transfer," *Tamkang Review* 16.4 (Summer 1986), 381-94 (p. 392).

Georgianism, which is manifested in the form of romantic realism in traditional prosody, flourished in the 20s. For a more detailed study on Georgianism see Edward Howard Marsh, *Georgian Poetry 1920-1922* (London: The Poetry Bookshop, 1922).

> It is in this intersection of poetics and translation where Chinese poetry had a use in proposing innovation in the English target system. In this case, a reciprocal relationship developed between poetics and translation [...] The translations served poetic innovation as innovations served the poetics of translation.[30]

Chinese translations served poetic innovation, and *vice versa*. Rexroth has remarked that Chinese poetry entered the English speaking world "at exactly the right moment to purge the rhetoric and moralizing of 19th Century Romantic poetry and the even more moralistic, preachy poetry of the 90s."[31] One may also say translating Chinese poetry became a kind of testing site, or more violently, a battlefield, for a new poetics. The new poetics and poetry, in turn, prompted bolder strategies for translating Chinese poetry. Pound, Rexroth, and Snyder's poetry was very much influenced by their own translations of Chinese poetry. Without their experimentation with English syntax, it may be hard to conceive how professional sinologists like Wai-lim Yip and others could manipulate English syntax to accommodate the Chinese.[32]

Nor is it only a matter of complying or not with the present norms of the target culture; translation can be a powerful force that helps to reshuffle the existing order of the literary system, mainly by challenging the current poetics. Lefevere writes:

> Rewritings, mainly translations, deeply affect the interpenetration of literary systems, not just by projecting the image of one writer or work in another literature or by failing to do so [...] but also by introducing new

---

[30] Dunn, "Translation and Poetics: Reciprocal Technologies in the History of Chinese-to-English Transfer," p. 390.

[31] "Chinese Poetry and the American Imagination," ed. by Gregory Orr, in *Ironwood* 17 (1981), 11-21; 38-51 (p. 12).

[32] In his *Cathay* poems published in 1914 Pound sometimes broke up the line units and made graphic arrangement of images to achieve visual perspicuity. Pound wrote in a similar way in some of his imagist poems around this time as well as in his later work the *Cantos*. Wai-lim Yip opted for this kind of disrupted syntax in his study of Pound's *Cathay* and in subsequent works on the translation of Chinese poetry. He also adopted this method in his own translations from the Chinese. See Yip Wai-lim, *Ezra Pound's Cathay* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1969), pp. 8-33. See also Yip's translation work, *Hiding the Universe: Poems by Wang Wei.*

> devices into the inventory component of a poetics and paving the way to changes in its functional component.[33]

And Even-Zohar remarks that translation may be incorporated into another literary system.[34] Some of the translations discussed in this thesis, like Pound's *Cathay* and Rexroth's Du Fu (Tu Fu), have been hailed as superb English poems,[35] sometimes anthologized in collections of English poems.[36] It is already a fact that some translations are included in the polysystem. The translators discussed in this thesis, Arthur Waley, Ezra Pound, Kenneth Rexroth, and Gary Snyder, are not college professors teaching Chinese poetry, but they respectively paint a distinct and lively picture of the China they create, and of the poet they translate (Waley's Bo Juyi, Pound's Li Bo, Rexroth's Du Fu, and Snyder's Cold Mountain).[37] On top of that, they introduce new devices into the inventory component of the English poetics. Their translations are read not only in academic institutes. In the target system, translations are valued more for their poetic order than their being supposedly faithful to an original.

---

[33] Lefevere, *Translation, Rewriting, and the Manipulation of Literary Fame*, p. 38.

[34] Even-Zohar writes that it is necessary to include translated literature in the polysystem, and that no observer of the history of any literature can avoid recognizing as an important fact the impact of translations. See Even-Zohar, *Papers in Historical Poetics*, p. 15.

[35] Pound's *Cathay* poems have been praised by Ford Madox Huffeur as things of a supreme beauty, as quoted in T. S. Eliot's "Ezra Pound: His Metric and Poetry" in *To Criticize the Critic* (London: Faber, 1965), p. 181. William Carlos Williams said Rexroth's *One Hundred Poems from the Chinese* was "one of the most brilliantly sensitive books of poems in the American idiom it has ever been my good fortune to read." See "Two New Books by Kenneth Rexroth," *Poetry*, 90 (June, 1957), 180. Witter Bynner also has great admiration for Rexroth's translation from the Chinese. See Witter Bynner, "This Ancient Man Was I," *Chinatown News* (March 3, 1958), 11.

[36] Rexroth's Du Fu poems, for example, are anthologized in *Naked Poetry: Recent American Poetry in Open Forms*, ed. by Stephen Berg and Robert Mezey (Indianapolis: the Bobbs-Merrill, 1969).

[37] Lefevere has pointed out that rewriters created images of a writer, a work, sometimes even a whole literature. These images tended to reach more people than the corresponding realities did. Yet the creation of these images and the impact they made has not often been studied. The power wielded by these images and by their makers is enormous. See Lefevere, *Translation, Rewriting, and the Manipulation of Literary Fame*, p. 5.

Waley has argued compellingly that translations should be done by a native speaker. Commenting on the Japanese' regret that Japanese literature has been chiefly translated by foreigners, Waley writes:

> I believe, on the contrary, that it is almost always better for the translator to be writing in his own language. It is in the highest degree improbable that a writer will command all the resources of a foreign language even as regards vocabulary, and when it comes to rhythm he is almost certain to be completely floored.[38]

Here Waley also touches upon the notion of the position of translated poetry in the polysystem. What matters most, according to him, is the reception of the texts in the target culture. It is understandable that a "faithful" representation of the original text can be more conveniently achieved by a native speaker, but then, as Waley observes, the target text would be inadequate. What Waley has in mind about the target text is "all the resources" of a language, not just an accurate reproduction of a source text. While a translator writing in his own language may not do as well in decoding the source text, he should have a better chance in making his way through the target system, even producing texts that may eventually de-stabilise the *status quo*.

To the majority of readers who cannot read the original, translations are the original.[39] Many translated Chinese poems stand as English poems in their own right.[40] They are remembered in the form of, for example, Pound's "The River-Merchant's Wife,"

---

[38] Waley, "Notes on Translation," in *Madly Singing in the Mountains*, p. 164.

[39] A. C. Graham, for example, wrote: "The reader can know Li Ho or Li Shang-yin only by the English poem, or attempt at a poem; no additional information will bring him any nearer to the poetry of the original." Graham, *Poems of the Late T'ang*, p. 37.

[40] Rexroth gave his choices for the outstanding translators from Chinese poetry into Western languages: Judith Gautier, Klabund, Pound, Stuart Merrill, Bynner, Waley, and Karlgren. He spoke of individually recognized translations such as Pound's "The River Merchant's Wife: A Letter," and Witter Bynner's version of Yuan Chen's "Elegy for His dead Wife" as being important English poems in this century. See Rexroth, "The Poet as Translator," *The Craft and Context of Translation*, ed. by Arrowsmith and Shattuck (Austin: University of Texas Press, 1961), pp. 29-49. Commenting on Rexroth's words, Peter Dragin and Paul Dresman wrote that whether Rexroth originated this idea or not, it has certainly been repeated in regards to Pound's version of Li Bo's poem. See "Forms of Open Form: A Comparison of English Translations of Li Ch'ing Chao," *Tamkang Review* 15.1-4 (Autumn-Summer 1984-5), 285-306 (p. 287).

or Waley's Bo Juyi. And it has been indeed a long way since then, from the idea of "metaphrase," to the notion of "metapoem" put forward by Holmes, who writes:

> All translation is an act of critical interpretation, but there are some translations of poetry which differ from all other interpretive forms in that they also have the aim of being acts of poetry [...] it might be helpful if for this specific literary form, with its double purpose as meta-literature and as primary literature, we introduced the designation "metapoem."[41]

The crucial notion is that not only can translation be considered as meta-literature, but also as literature in its own right. Pound and Rexroth's translations are often anthologised in collections of English poems, or simply taken as their own creations, included in their own collections. They are acts of poetry.

One of the common phenomena among translators studied in this thesis is their tendency to stress and even exaggerate the exoticism of the Chinese tradition. Its characteristics are manifested in imagery and language aspects. Waley, Pound, Rexroth and Snyder have respectively adjusted English syntax to suggest to the reader a sense of strangeness. Language style, however, is inseparable from the imagery. The overall result is that these translators help to build up, consciously or not, a sense of Chineseness that readers are to expect from Chinese poetry.

Compared to Pound, Rexroth, and Snyder, Waley seems to pay more attention to the source culture, and may give the reader an impression that his translation is less target-oriented. This is a misconception, as he himself notes:

> Hundreds of times I have sat for hours in front of texts the meaning of which I understood perfectly, and yet been unable to see how they ought to be put

[41] James Holmes, "Forms of Verse Translation and the Translation of Verse Form," in *The Nature of Translation: Essays on the Theory and Practice of Literary Translation*, ed. by James Holmes (The Hague: Mouton, 1970), p. 93.

> into English in such a way as to re-embody not merely a series of correct dictionary meanings, but also the emphasis, the tone, the eloquence of the original.[42]

Throughout his book on Yuan Mei, Waley reveals his concern for the universe of discourse of both cultures. He is preoccupied with Yuan's life, works, and, particularly his era in connection with the West, to give his readers some better idea of what was going on in Europe at the same time, to provide a little sense of familiarity, to make acceptable the unfamiliar customs of the East. Despite the fact that most translators discussed in this thesis have in different degrees emphasized or even magnified the sense of exoticism of the Chinese tradition, they were not oblivious to the importance of making their translations acceptable to the target culture, by different means and for different reasons perhaps.

Contemporary theories of translation are increasingly oriented towards the idea of cultural transfer.[43] Wolfgang Iser takes a text as an outline, or skeleton consisting of gaps that require the reader's participation to fill in.[44] The text, therefore, is open and incomplete. Cultural codes, besides the linguistic aspects, are essential to an understanding of a text. The more a reader is acquainted with the cultural conventions the more likely he will be able to crack the codes of the text. Cultural codes include philosophical heritage, myth, religion etc. Literary features, such as the relationship between one poem to other

---

[42] Waley, "Notes on Translation," in *Madly Singing in the Mountains*, p. 158.

[43] See, for example, Mary Snell-Hornby, "Linguistic Transcoding or Cultural Transfer? A Critique of Translation Theory in Germany," in *Translation, History and Culture* ed. by Bassnett and Lefevere (London and New York: Pinter Publishers, 1990), pp. 81-82. See also the various essays, such as Milena Dolezelova, "Chinese Literary Modernity: Cultural Constraints Upon its Understanding," Darko Suvin, "On Fiction as Anthropology: Agential Analysis, Types, and the Classical Chinese Novel," Stanley Corngold, "Consternation: The Anthropological Moment in Literature," Mary Pratt, "'Killed by Science": Travel Narrative and Ethnographic Writing,' and Ackbar Abbas, "'La Musique Savante": Literature, Anthropology, and Knowledge,' in *Literature & Anthropology*, ed. by Jonathan Hall and Ackbar Abbas (Hong Kong: Hong Kong University Press, 1986), pp. 96-115, 116-155, 156-196, 197-229, 230-257.

[44] See Wolfgang Iser, *Prospecting* (Baltimore: John Hopkins University Press, 1989), pp. 33-34, and Wolfang Iser, "The Reading Process: A Phenomenological Approach," in *The Implied Reader* (Baltimore: Johns Hopkins University, 1974), pp. 274-294.

poems, the relationship between a genre in which the text is written and other genres implicated, are all relevant in the reading process.

The awareness of a transfer of culture taking place in an act of literary translation is shown in Waley's various attempts (it may be argued that this is actually a case of making a culture, rather than transferring). His conscientious efforts to demonstrate that texts are deeply embedded in a culture is reflected in the frequent commentaries or explanatory notes in his works, [45] sometimes also disguised in the expository style of the poems he translates. But an ancient China rooted in a cultural context that he helped to construct does not necessarily mean a more genuine China. If Pound invented Chinese poetry, Waley invented Chinese poetry and Chinese culture altogether, and the Chinese culture he invented in turn reinforces the Chineseness in the Chinese poetry he invented. I shall come back to this point in the chapter on Waley.

On the other hand Jonathan Culler argues that a reader understands a text according to conventions that he knows already. Literary presupposition, according to him, is essential in understanding a literary work:

---

[45] One example is that Waley often describes ancient Chinese customs in detail. Historical sites and their locations are also specified. The following description, for example, is common in his books: "On the fourteenth [...] he [Bo Juyi] was appointed Governor of Hangchow, the greatest city in Eastern China. The normal route from Ch'ang-an to Hangchow was through Lo-yang [...] for the moment made this route impossible, and he went down the Han River and the Yangtze to Chiang-chou (as he had done in 815), and thence down the river to Hangchow." Waley, *The Life and Times of Po Chu-i* (London: George Allen & Unwin Ltd, 1949), p. 147.

Burton Watson's remark on the significance of historical places in Chinese literature is relevant here:

> In a country as old as China, place names naturally come to have rich historical or legendary associations and their mere mention in literature is sufficient to call up scenes of departed glory [...] The poets of China [...] are fond of working place names into their poems [...] for the dramatic or nostalgic overtones that such names carry [...]

See Burton Watson, *Chinese Lyricism: Shih Poetry from the Second to the Twelfth Century, with Translations* (New York: Columbia University Press, 1971), pp. 128-129.

> To work on the presuppositions of a sentence which *promises* is to relate it to a whole series of other sentences, to place it in a discursive or intertextual space which gives rise to the conventions that make this sentence intelligible and significant as a speech act.[46]

Culler uses the sentence "Once upon a time there lived a king who had a daughter" to illustrate how "it relates the story to a series of other stories, identifies it with the conventions of a genre, asks us to take certain attitudes towards it."[47] One may find that a similar response may appear in the case of using traditional English metres and styles to accommodate classical Chinese poetry. What English readers of Chinese poetry before Pound and Waley were facing were texts that were not too different from their own in language, forms, and mode of presentation. Readers, as a result, could expect similar traits from the Chinese texts. Chinese poetry did not have a clear character of its own. With its sentimentalism, commonplace statements that lack ingenious conceits, it was not well received in the English speaking world that was not used to this kind of style.[48]

Waley once wrote of Lin Shu (1852-1924), the translator who did not know any foreign language, and approved of Lin's very free and even improvising approach.[49] It is the end result, that is, the effect of the target text on the target reader, that Waley was concerned with. He was, however, even more concerned with the role of the translator as a conveyor of culture in a much larger context, and in this regard not only the target culture, but also the source culture, could also benefit.[50] The ideal role of a translator, according to Waley, was not only to track down the original meaning or work out a readable style in the target language, but above all, to introduce a foreign culture. It is important to note that he viewed other people's translations as having the function of embellishing and even reviving the target culture.[51]

---

[46] Jonathan Culler, *The Pursuit of Signs* (Ithaca: Cornell University Press, 1981), p. 115.
[47] Culler, *The Pursuit of Signs*, p. 115.
[48] See the discussions in Dunn, "Translation and Poetics: Reciprocal Technologies in the History of Chinese-to-English Transfer," pp. 381-94. See also Fenollosa's comment in *The Chinese Written Character as a Medium for Poetry*, p. 5.
[49] "Arthur Waley on Lin Shu," *Rendition*, 5 (Autumn 1975), 30.
[50] "Arthur Waley on Lin Shu," p. 31.
[51] See "Arthur Waley on Lin Shu," 31.

b) Traditions and Trends

Classical Chinese literature has had a long and entangled relationship with English Romanticism, so much so that one may even call it a love-hate one. The *chinoiserie* in England in the eighteenth century has been regarded as a revolt against neo-classical aesthetics.[52] China (Cathay, or the city Xanadu), being "at the farthest degree of our eastern longitude,"[53] provided a rich source for romantic imagination for many poets. One famous example is Coleridge's "Kubla Khan," with its exotic and mysterious images in the poet's Cathayan dream. Wordsworth also mentions in "The Prelude" "the famed paradise of ten thousand trees" and "China's stupendous mound."[54] In Byron's *Don Juan* one can see the ship "From [...] far Cathay, unloads/ For him the fragrant produce of each trip [...]" (Canton XII, stanza IX). Similar descriptions abound in other Romantic works.

---

[52] See A. O. Lovejoy, "The Chinese Origin of a Romanticism," *Journal of English and Germanic Philosophy*, 32 (Jan. 1933), 1-20. Lovejoy has also said that the idealization of the Chinese garden was one of the origins of the English "horticultural Romanticism" itself.

For a more detailed study of the image of China in English literature around the Neo-classical age, or shortly before the Romantic period, see Adolf Reichwein, "Goethe," in *China and Europe: Intellectual and Artistic Contacts in the Eighteenth Century* (New York: A. A. Knopf, 1925), pp. 129-146; Adolf Reichwein, Introduction to "Return to Nature (Laotzu- Rousseau- Tolstoi)," in *China and Europe: Intellectual and Artistic Contacts in the Eighteenth Century* (New York: A. A. Knopf, 1925), pp. 3-11; Adolf Reichwein, "Rococo (Stage-comedy, Music-drama)," *China and Europe: Intellectual and Artistic Contacts in the Eighteenth Century* (New York: A. A. Knopf, 1925), pp. 67-69; Adolf Reichwein, *China and Europe* (New York: Barnes & Noble, 1968); A. Owen Aldridge, "Voltaire and the Cult of China," *Tamkang Review* 2.2/3.1 (October-April 1971-2), 25-50; A. Owen Aldridge, "The Perception of China in English Literature of the Enlightenment," *Asian Culture Quarterly* 14.2 (1986), 1-26; A. Owen Aldridge, "The First Chinese Drama in English Translation," *Asian Culture Quarterly*, 16.3 (Autumn 1988), 22-32; A. Owen Aldridge, "China in the Spanish Enlightenment," *International Comparative Literature Association* 12 (1990), 404-409; A. Owen Aldridge, "K'ieng Long and Western Letters," *Tamkang Review* 22.1-4 (Autumn-Summer 1991-2), 17-42; William W. Appleton, *A Cycle of Cathay: The Chinese Vogue in England During the Seventeenth and Eighteenth Centuries* (New York: Columbia University Press, 1951); Harold Lawson Bruce, *Voltaire on the English Stage* (Berkeley: University of California Publications in Modern Philosophy, 1918); T. Blake Clark, *Oriental England: A Study of Oriental Influences in Eighteenth Century England as reflected in the Drama* (Shanghai: Kelley and Walsh, 1939); G. F. Hudson, *Europe and China* (London: Edward Arnold, 1931); Ch'ien Zhongshu, "China in the English Literature of the Seventeenth Century," *Quarterly Bulletin of Chinese Bibliography*, 1.4 (December, 1940), 351-384; "China in the English Literature of the Eighteenth Century" (in two parts), *Quarterly Bulletin of Chinese Bibliography*, 2.1-2 (1941), 7-84; 2.3-4 (1941), 113-52; J. D. Frodsham, "Landscape Poetry in China and Europe," *Comparative Literature* 19.3 (Summer 1967), 193-215.

[53] Sir William Temple (1628-1699) wrote that China was "at the farthest degree of our eastern longitude" and Peru "the farthest western." See *Five Miscellaneous Essays by Sir William Temple*, ed. by Samuel Holt Monk (Ann Arbor: University of Michigan Press, 1963), p. 107.

[54] *The Prelude*, ed. by Ernest de Selincourt (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1959), VIII, 76-87.

Old China had fuelled the imagination since the eighteenth century. John Gay (1685-1732) wrote a poem "To a Lady, on her passion for Old China" in 1725. In Charles Lamb's essay "Old China" (1823, included in *The Last Essays of Elia*, 1833) the character was so charmed by the figures painted on a set of chinaware that he roamed freely in their world, a fairyland, while the present and past cut into the Chinese dream, showing a romantic fascination with time and distance. He wrote to Thomas Manning (1772-1840), who was leaving for Canton, about his wish, "I should like to have my name talked of in China."[55]

Lord Macartney kept a journal of his first trip to China, which shows a strong sense of romantic enchantment, and the account of his experience in seeing the Emperor Qian Long (Ch'ien-lung, K'ieng Long)[56] 乾隆 reveals a romantic feeling that may well have conditioned responses to Chinese poetry: "I could have wept through strangeness of sensation." He states elsewhere that "the Chinese character seems at present inexplicable,"[57] and that "nothing could be more fallacious than to judge of China by any European standard."[58] The first time Macartney saw a Chinese city with its numerous people he was so struck with its splendour that he cried out with Shakespeare's Miranda in *The Tempest*.[59] China was a place of fantasy and the unknown. In the twentieth century the same old China-- Chinese poetics and poetry-- was brought again into the English tradition, only to repel the residue of Romanticism this time. The pre-conceived notion of an ancient China with a sense of remoteness and strangeness, however, was deeply rooted and still echoed in many translators' works, including Waley and Pound's.

---

[55] *The Letters of Thomas Manning to Charles Lamb*, ed. by G. A. Anderson (London: Martin Secker, 1925), p. 104.
[56] Waley wrote that he was the only Chinese Emperor whose name was a household word in the West. Waley, *Yuan Mei: Eighteenth Century Chinese Poet* (London: George Allen & Unwin Ltd., 1956), p. 26.
[57] J. L. Cranmer-Byng, ed., *An Embassy to China* (London: Longmans, 1962), p. 98.
[58] Cranmer-Byng, *An Embassy to China*, p. 219.
[59] The lines he quoted were: "Oh, wonder!/ How many goodly creatures are here!/ How beauteous mankind is! Oh, brave new world/ That has such people in it!" See Cranmer-Byng, *An Embassy to China*, p. 74.

One of the earliest translations of Chinese poetry in the nineteenth century was by John Francis Davis, of the earliest Chinese work *Shijing*. James Legge (1814-1897) attempted to translate the same work,[60] while William Jennings published his version, *The Shi King: the Old "Poetry Classic" of the Chinese*, in 1891.[61] Herbert Giles' *Chinese Poetry in English Verse* came out in 1898.[62] John Francis Davies, one of the earliest governors of Hong Kong, whose *The Poetry of The Chinese* came out in 1829,[63] wrote, almost as prophecy:

> As our gardens have already been indebted to China for a few choice flowers, who knows but our poetry may some day lie under a similar obligation?[64]

But it was Pound and Waley who together formed a water-shed in the translation of Classical Chinese poetry. As James Dunn remarks:

> Chinese poetry had little or no audience in English before 1915-1920, and that pre-modernist poetic technology is related to this phenomenon, Chinese poetry did not conform to the rules current in English, making the transfer difficult. What brought about an increase in the number of translations was the popularization of a new poetic idea, which itself used translation of Chinese poetry as an argument for change in the English poetic system.[65]

Sinologists, professional translators, and even poets who know little Chinese, have tried their hand at translating. Some take the Chinese source as object for anthropological study, cultural transfer, and literary scholarship. In some cases the originals are placed on facing pages or at the end of the book, either to show their proximity or to give the reader

---

[60] *The She King, or the Book of Ancient Poetry* (London: Trubner, 1871); Reprint: *The Book of Poetry* (New York: Paragon Book Gallery, 1967).

[61] William Jennings, *The Shi King: the Old "Poetry Classic" of the Chinese* (London: Routledge, 1891).

[62] Herbert Giles, *Chinese Poetry in English Verse* (London: Bernard Quaritch, 1898) Reissued as *Gems of Chinese Literature*, II (Shanghai: Kelly and Walsh, 1923); (New York: Paragon Reprint, 1965).

[63] Henri Cordier, ed. *Bibliotheca Sinica: Dictionnaire Bibliographique des Ouvrages Relatifs a L'Empire Chinois* (New York: Burt Franklin, 1922; rpt. 1968), pp. 3942-3948.

[64] Arthur E. Christy, "*Chinoiserie* and *Vers Libre*," *Open Court* 43 (April 1929), 209-218 (p. 210).

some sense of the structure of the original. Scholars like David Hawkes, Stephen Owen and James Liu, and Waley tend to treat the source texts in this way.[66] Some translators, like Ezra Pound,[67] Amy Lowell,[68] Kenneth Rexroth,[69] and Gary Snyder,[70] on the other hand, are more inclined to take the Chinese source as inspiration for aesthetic reconstruction or manipulation.

A brief account of trends in translating Chinese poetry since Pound and Waley could give a better idea of the development. Arthur Waley was a crucial figure, his works may be divided into three main categories. The first is the translation of an entire Chinese anthology, for example, *The Book of Songs* (1937); the second is an anthology selected by the translator, such as *A Hundred and Seventy Chinese Poems* (1918), *More Translations from the Chinese* (1919), and *The Temple and Other Poems* (1923); the third is the

---

[65] Dunn, "Translation and Poetics: Reciprocal Technologies in the History of Chinese-to-English Transfer," pp. 389-390.

[66] These translators, except Waley, were professors of Chinese Literature, and their works are usually associated with academic research. Among works that are translated by Waley are *A Hundred and Seventy Chinese Poems* (London: George Allen & Unwin Ltd, 1918), *More Translations from the Chinese* (London: George Allen & Unwin Ltd, 1919), *The Temple and Other Poems* (London: George Allen & Unwin Ltd, 1923). Works that give detailed account of the poets' life, while incorporating their poems in the narration, include *The Life and Times of Po Chu-i* (London: George Allen & Unwin Ltd, 1949), *The Poetry and Career of Li Po* (London: George Allen & Unwin Ltd, 1950), and *Yuan Mei: Eighteenth Century Chinese Poet* (London: George Allen & Unwin Ltd, 1956). Waley on many occasions tries to re-construct these poets' life with their poems. In *Ch'u Tz'u: The Songs of the South* (Boston: Beacon, 1959), and *A Little Primer of Tu Fu* (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1970), David Hawkes rendered the Chinese poems into prose, and placed the Chinese originals side by side with his translations. James Liu translated the Chinese poems into verse, while placing the Chinese texts alongside. Examples are *Major Lyricists of the Northern Sung* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1974), and *The Poetry of Li Shang-yin: Ninth-Century Baroque Chinese Poet* (Chicago: Chicago University Press, 1969). Stephen Owen also provided Chinese texts in his translations. See *The Poetry of Early T'ang* (New Haven: Yale University Press, 1977), *The Great Age of Chinese Poetry: The High T'ang* (New Haven: Yale University Press, 1981), and *The Poetry of Meng Chiao and Han Yu* (New Haven: Yale University Press, 1975).

[67] *Cathay* is a famous example. Pound did not know any Chinese when he did the translation. Though he learned some Chinese when he translated the Confucian *Odes*, he was more interested in juxtaposing the component parts of the character.

[68] Amy Lowell did not read Chinese, and translated with an informant, Florence Ayscough. See Florence Ayscough and Amy Lowell, *Fir-Flower Tablets* (Boston: Houghton Mifflin, 1921).

[69] Rexroth uses French and other English texts as references. He also co-translated with an informant Ling Chung. See the discussion of Rexroth in Chapter 7.

translation of a certain poet, usually a mixture of biography and poems, like his *The Life and Times of Po Chu-i (1949)*; *The Poetry and Career of Li Po* (1950) , and *Yuan Mei: Eighteenth Century Chinese Poet* (1956). Most succeeding translators' works follow a similar pattern.[71] It is interesting to note, for example, Pound published his *Cathay* in 1914,

---

[70] Snyder reads a little Chinese; he has described how he brought his experience in the Rocky Mountains into his translation of Cold Mountain, revealing that he is more concerned with constructing the image of a poet in the target system. See Orr, "Chinese Poetry and American Imagination," 11-21; 38-51.

[71] Some are translations from an entire Chinese anthology, such as Arthur Waley's *The Book of Songs* (London: Allen & Unwin, 1937). Soame Jenyns' *Selections from the 300 Poems of the T'ang Dynasty* (London: Murray, 1940), and *A Further Selection from the 300 Poems of the T'ang Dynasty* (London: Murray, 1944) are, as the titles suggest, selections from the most popular anthology of poems in China in the past few centuries, *The Three Hundred Poems of the T'ang Dynasty* 唐詩三百首. Bernhard Karlgren's *The Book of Odes* (Stockholm: Museum of Far Eastern Antiquities, 1950) is a literal, almost word for word translation. Ezra Pound's *The Classic Anthology as Defined by Confucius* (Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 1954), on the other hand, shows more tendency in writing poems in the English language. Other anthologies are David Hawkes' *Ch'u Tzu: The Songs of the South* (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1959), Lenore Mayhew and William McNaughton's *A Gold Orchid: The Love Poems of Tzu Yeh* (Rutland, Vermont: Charles Tuttle, 1972), and Lois Fusek's *Among the flowers: The Hua-chien Chi* (New York: Columbia University Press, 1981).

Some are selections made by the translators, and, in the study of rewriting, image-making, and canon-forming (in the West), this kind of anthologies is perhaps most worthy of our attention. In this case the translators could well be the powerful people, at present. There are, for example, Florence Ayscough and Amy Lowell's *Fir-Flower Tablets* (Boston: Houghton Mifflin, 1921), Witter Bynner and Kiang Kang-hu's *The Jade Mountain* (New York: Knopf, 1929; New York: Doubleday reprint, 1964; Vintage reprint, 1972), Ts'ai Ting-kan's *Chinese Poems in English Rhymes* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1932), Clara Candlin's *The Herald Wind* (Wisdom of the East Series, London: Murray, 1933), Henry Hart's *A Hundred Names* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1933), Ch'u Ta-kao's *Chinese Lyrics* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1937), Henry Hart's *A Garden of Peonies* (Standford: Standford University Press, 1938), Robert Payne's *The White Pony* (New York: John Day, 1947), Mabel L. Ives' *Chinese Love Songs* (Upper Montclair, New Jersey: B. L. Hutchinson, 1949), Wong Man's *Poems from the Chinese* (Hong Kong: Creation Books, 1950), Kenneth Rexroth's *One Hundred Poems from the Chinese* (New York: New Directions, 1959), Ch'en C. J. and Michael Bullock's *Poems of Solitude* (London: Abelard-Schuman, 1960), Robert Kotewall and Norman L. Smith's *The Penguin Book of Chinese Verse*, ed. by A. R. Davis (Harmondsworth: Penguin, 1962), Alan Ayling and Duncan Mackintosh's *A Collection of Chinese Lyrics* (London: Routledge & Kegan Paul, 1965), Liu Shih Shun's *One Hundred and One Chinese Poems* (Hong Kong: Cathay, 1967), Eric Sarkeim's *The Silent Zero, in Search of Sound: An Anthology of Chinese Poems from the Beginning Through the Sixth Century* (New York: Grossman Publishers, 1967). *A. C. Graham's Poems of the Late T'ang* (New York: Penguin, 1967), and J. D. Frodsham and Ch'eng Hsi's *An Anthology of Chinese Verse: Han Wei Chin and the Northern and Southern Dynasties* (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1967), on the other hand, focus on specific periods. Other collections include Alan Ayling and Duncan Mackintosh's *A Further Collection of Chinese Lyrics* (London: Routledge & Kegan Paul, 1969), Kenneth Rexroth and Ling Chung's *The Orchid Boat: Women Poets of China* (New York: McGraw-hill, 1972), John Scott's *Love and Protest: Chinese Poems from the Sixth Century B. C. to the Seventh Century A. D.* (New York: Harper Colophon Books, 1972), John C. H. Wu's *The Four Seasons of T'ang Poetry* (Rutland, Vermont: Tuttle, 1972). Liu Wu-chi and Irving Lo's *Sunflower Splendor: Three Thousand Years of Chinese Poetry* (New York: Anchor Press, 1975), which is so far the most ambitious attempt and the largest anthology, ranging, as its title suggests, from almost the earliest times to the last few decades. John Turner's *A Golden Treasury of Chinese Poetry* (Hong Kong: Renditions Book, 1989) adopts traditional metres, as opposed to the

while Waley his *170 Chinese Poems* in 1915; Waley's *Book of Songs* was published in

---

mainstream of free verse translation since the 1920s. Different in size though the two works may be, they both cover a large span of time.

The history-biography approach gives detailed annotation and explication. This not only makes a move towards a larger audience, but also addresses the problem of the audience that requires more than just the poems. Works of this kind include Shigeyoshi Obata's *The Works of Li Po* (New York: Dutton, 1922), Florence Ayscough's *Tu Fu: The Autobiography of a Chinese Poet*, Vol. I, A. D. 712-759 (Boston: Houghton Mifflin,1929), Florence Ayscough's *Travels of a Chinese Poet: Tu Fu, Guest of Rivers and Lake*, Vol. II, A. D. 759-770 (Boston: Houghton Mifflin, 1934), Gerald Bullett's *The Golden years of Fan Ch'eng-ta* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1946), Clara M. Candlin's *The Rapier of Lu* (London: Murray, 1946), Liu Yih-ling and Shabid Suhrawardy's *Poems of Lee Hou-chu* (Bombay: Orient Longmans, 1948), Arthur Waley's *The Life and Times of Po Chu-i* (London: Allen & Unwin, 1949), Arthur Waley's *The Poetry and Career of Li Po* (London: Allen & Unwin, 1950), William Hung's *Tu Fu: China's Greatest Poet* (Cambridge, Massachusetts: Harvard University Press, 1952), William Acker's *T'ao the Hermit: Sixty Poems by T'ao Ch'ien* (London: Thames & Hudson, 1952), Hans Frankel's *Biographies of Meng Hao-jan* (Chinese Dynastic Histories Translations, No. 1, Berkeley: University of California Press, 1952, 1961), Lily Pao-hu Chang and Karjorie Sinclair's *The Poems of T'ao Ch'ien* (Honolulu: University of Hawaii Press, 1953), Arthur Waley's "27 Poems by Han-shan," *Encounter*, 3:3 (1954), 3-8. Gary Snyder's "The Cold Mountain Poems of Han-shan," *Evergreen Review*, 2.6 (1958), 69-80. Chang Yin-nan and Lewis C. Walmsley's *Poems by Wang Wei* (Rutland, Vermont: Turtle, 1958), Burton Watson's *Cold Mountain: 100 Poems by the T'ang Poet Han-shan* (New York: Columbia University Press, 1962, 1970), Rewi Alley's *Tu Fu: Selected Poems* (Peking: Foreign Language, Press, 1962), F. W. Mote's *The Poet Kao Ch'i, 1336-1374* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1962), Hu P'in-ch'ing's *Li Ch'ing-chao* (New York: Twayne Publishers, 1966), Liu Wu-chi's *An Introduction to Chinese Literature* (Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 1966), J. D. Frodsham's *The Murmuring Stream: the Life and Works of Hsieh Ling-yun* (Kuala Lumpur: University of Malaya Press, 1967), Dorothy B. Walmsley's *Wang Wei, the Painter-Poet* (Rutland, Vermont: Tuttle, 1968).

Similar attempts include James Liu's *The Poetry of Li Shang-yin: Ninth-Century Baroque Chinese Poet* (Chicago: Chicago University Press, 1969), which is also an example of a scholar's work aiming at close rendition, George W. Kent's *Works of Dust and jade: 47 Poems and Ballads of the Third Century Chinese Poet Ts'ao Chih* (New York: Philosophical Library, 1969), J. D. Frodsham's *The Poems of Li Ho* (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1970), David Hawkes' *A Little Primer of Tu Fu* (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1970), and Robert Hightower's *Poetry of T'ao Ch'ien* (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1970), Howard S. Levy's *Translations from Po Chu-i's Collected Works*, 2 vols. (New York: Paragon, 1971), Irving Yucheng Lo's *Hsin Ch'i-chi* (New York: Paragon, 1971), Burton Watson's *Chinese Lyricism: Shih Poetry from the Second to the Twelfth Century* (New York: Columbia University Press, 1971), Arthur Cooper's *Li Po and Tu Fu* (Harmondsworth: Penguin, 1973), William H. Nienhauser's *Liu Tsung-yuan* (Twayne world Authors Series, New York: Twayne Publishers, 1973), Wai-lim Yip's *Hiding the Universe: Poems by Wang Wei* (New York: Grossman Publishers, 1972), G. W. Robinson's *Poems of Wang Wei* (Harmondsworth: Penguin, 1973), Burton Watson's *The Old Man Who Does as He Pleases* (New York: Columbia University Press, 1973), *Liu's Major Lyricists of the Northern Sung* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1974), Jonathan Chaves' translation of the Song poet Yang Wan-li, known as *Heaven My Blanket, Earth my Pillow* (New York: Weatherhill, 1975), and Donald Holzman's *Poetry and Politics: The Life and Works of Juan Chi* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1976). Stephen Owen's *The Poetry of Meng Chiao and Han Yu* (New Haven: Yale University Press, 1975) gave, besides the poems and biography, a detailed analysis of the poetic movement of the time. Other similar works include Jonathan Chaves' *Mei Yao-ch'en and the Development of Early Sung Poetry* (New York: Columbia University Press, 1976), Hans Frankel's *The Flowering Plum and the Palace Lady* (New Haven: Yale University Press, 1976). Some works deal with particular topics, periods, or movements, but include translations as well, such as Stephen Owen's *The Poetry of Early T'ang* (New Haven: Yale University Press, 1977), and *The Great Age of Chinese Poetry: The High T'ang* (New Haven: Yale University Press, 1981), Pauline Yu's *The Poetry of Wang Wei: New Translations and Commentary* (Bloomington: Indiana University, 1980). and Pauline Yu's *The Reading of Imagery in the Chinese Poetic Tradition* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1987).

1937, whereas Pound's attempt at the same work came out in 1954. The order of appearance is reversed in the latter case. It is highly unlikely that they did not read the other's work when they did their own translations.

Works by scholars and specialists usually involve literal translation. On some occasions the translators provide the original texts, transliterations, annotations, word-for-word translations, together with their own versions of the poems. They sometimes even approximate the Chinese syntax, including reproducing parataxis, antithesis and parallelism. In this particular aspect, ironically, they may come close to translators like Pound, Rexroth and Snyder, whose strategies were not to stay close to the original, and there is a convergence of styles at times. Professional sinologists who have the support of educational institutes almost invariably aim at informing students of what they see as the original meanings.[72] If the first generation of translators of Chinese poetry mainly consisted of missionaries and diplomats, later generations have tended to be mostly poets and scholars. Their identity as Orientalists may not be different from their predecessors, but their attitudes towards Chinese poetry are more appreciative and sympathetic, as shown in the ensuing chapters; different strategies are therefore brought into play.

---

[72] There are, on the other hand, translators who incorporate their own poetic feelings, or re-write on a large scale to ensure that the texts are more acceptable to the general public. In this category one may place Pound's *The Classic Anthology Defined by Confucius* (1954), Gary Snyder's *Cold Mountain Poems* (1958), Kenneth Rexroth's *One Hundred Poems from the Chinese* (1959), and Kenneth Rexroth's *The Orchid Boat: Women Poets of China* (1972). It is both interesting and arresting that it is these translators' works that attract more attention in the target system. Their Chinese translations are often anthologized in collections of English poetry. There is not much research done on the translations by scholars like William Hung, Hans Frankel, or Stephen Owen, while scholarship that deals with the translations of Waley, Pound, Rexroth and Snyder abounds. Scholars' literal translations, on the other hand, are quite often used as inter-texts in the discussions of Waley, Pound, Rexroth and Snyder's works. See, for example, Wai-lim Yip's *Ezra Pound's Cathay* (Princeton: New Jersey, 1969), and Hugh Kenner's *The Pound Era* (London: Faber and Faber, 1971). For discussions of Snyder's Cold Mountain poems, see, for example, Xi Mi 奚密, *Hanshan yishi yu qiaoda ji-- yi ge wenxue dianxing de xingcheng* 寒山譯詩與敲打集-- 一個文學典型的形成 , in *Zhongmei wenxue yinyuan* 中美文學因緣 ed. by Zheng Shusen 鄭樹森 (William Tay), (Taibei: Dung Da, 1985), pp. 165-193.

Chapter 2

The Constraints of the Target System

a) Language and Poetics

Lefevere has outlined some of the constraints that affect the production of translated works in the target culture, such as ideology, poetics, language, and universe of discourse. I propose here to re-group them into two main categories, starting with language and poetics, for the sake of convenience, and discuss the issues in connection with translating classical Chinese poetry.

One of the most famous comments on Pound's translation of *Cathay* by T. S. Eliot states that Pound was "the inventor of Chinese poetry." But he also says that "through his translation we really at last get the original."[1] If one considers the two remarks together, one may deduce a statement somewhat like this: "Pound is the inventor of the original." To most people the appropriate word would probably be "discoverer." Since T. S. Eliot did not know Chinese, nor did he pretend to know any, his assessment, one may therefore assume, was based on the target system. Hence Pound gave the "real China" to the target audience, which was all that mattered. So Pound was making up, in a way, an original, according to T. S. Eliot.

The important point to note here is that, on the one hand there was an ancient China somewhere out there; on the other hand there was an English audience in the here and now. If Pound had simply written English poems, he could not have invented a China. But if he had presented a picture of China very close to the original (which Eliot would not have known anyway) he still could not be said to have invented anything. There are some embedded conditions in Eliot's statement: not only are Pound's translations regarded by the English audience as Chinese poems, they are also read as English poems. If they were not, they would just be regarded as some translated Chinese poems, not invented ones, nor

[1] "Introduction" to *Ezra Pound: Selected Poems*, ed. by T. S. Eliot (London: Faber & Gwyer, 1928), p. 14.

could one, strange it may sound, "really at last get the original." First, it is a "China" that Pound is writing about, hence the impression that it is an "original;" second, it is not necessarily a "genuine" one, hence the understanding that it is but an invention. Pound's effort, in other words, is regarded by T. S. Eliot as translations as well as inventions that could enter the target system. Another ironical thing about T. S. Eliot's statement is, translations before Pound, like James Legge and Herbert Giles', no matter how close to the original in the traditional sense they may be, did not lead T. S. Eliot to the original. It is the reception in the target system, or specifically poems like Pound's *Cathay* that are "things of a beauty," that help one at last to get the original.

The comparative lack of enthusiasm for the translation of Chinese poetry before the second decade of this century, in fact, according to David Lattimore, is a matter of poetic tradition:

> A rather astonishing thing about the history of translating Chinese poetry into English is that it was not really done so successfully down to about the second decade of 20th century. There were marvelous translations, for example, from Persian poetry in the 18th and 19th centuries. Chinese poetry could not be translated into English until the writers of English were willing to give some grounds in changing their own idiom into something that could catch the Chinese as it came.[2]

It is not that the translators of Chinese poetry before the 1910s did not have the target culture in mind. Quite the contrary, they were too constrained by the conventions of the target culture, which did not have room, or the intellectual atmosphere, to accommodate an alien poetry-- the poetics or the language. Fenollosa's famous essay on Chinese characters (written between 1904 and 1908) revealed a similar problem, which, he thought, was:

> Some lack of aesthetic sympathy and of poetic feeling in the accepted methods of presenting poetry of China [...][3]

---

[2] David Lattimore, "Chinese Poetry and the American Imagination," ed. by Gregory Orr, 17 *Ironwood* (1981), 11-54 (P. 38). Quoted also in James H. Dunn, "Translation and Poetics: Reciprocal Technologies in the History of Chinese-to-English Transfer," *Tamkang* Review, 16.4 (Summer 1986), 383.

[3] Ernest Fenollosa, *The Chinese Written Character as a Medium for Poetry*, ed. by Ezra Pound (San Francisco: City Lights, 1936), p. 5.

A new poetics takes time to develop and sustain. Fenollosa observes that the general public has the conviction that except for linguistics professionals, Chinese poetry was so remote that it was not worth learning. In such an environment it is not surprising that most translators of Chinese poetry before the 1910s used traditional forms. The language and the poetics of the age simply did not allow them to do otherwise.

Chinese poetry prides itself on reflection, calm beauties and unstated relationships of simple things. Before imagism, however, English poetics concerns itself with form and discursive statement. The English poetic technology did not accommodate well the characteristics of Chinese verse, which, with a syntax that allows images to show themselves without commenting or intellectual interference, could carry multi-signification.[4] Imagistic poetics upholds the belief that the object world should be presented directly, and with its syntactic freedom and ambiguity, a more favourable medium for the translation of Chinese poetry gradually developed.[5]

The lukewarm reaction to early translations of Chinese poetry, however, may also be due to the strength of the English literary system. As Gentzler puts it:

> In strong systems such as the French or Anglo-American, with well-developed literary traditions and many different kinds of writing, original writing produces innovations in ideas and forms independent of translation, relegating translations to a marginal position in the overall functioning of the dynamic system. In this historical situation, translation often (but not

[4] James Liu, on the other hand, wrote of the multi-signification of the Chinese character: "A word in Chinese does not always have one clear-cut, fixed meaning, but often covers different meanings, some of which may be mutually exclusive [...] The poet can compress several meanings into one word, and the reader has to choose the meaning that seems most likely to be uppermost in the poet's mind, as well as probable subsidiary meanings [...]" James Liu, *The Art of Chinese Poetry* (Chicago: The University of Chicago Press, 1962), p. 8. Here James Liu also touches upon the participational nature of the Chinese language.

[5] James Dunn wrote that "because imagist poetics have accustomed us as readers to accept the unexplained presentation of the object world as charged with multiple meanings." Dunn, "Translation and Poetics: Reciprocal Technologies in the History of Chinese-to-English Transfer," 389. The notion of ambiguity seems to be against Pound's belief in precision and concreteness, but as Pound rightly clarified: "You must distinguish between the inclusive and the ambiguous. Ambiguity and inclusiveness are far from the same. The specialist will often want a more particular statement inside the inclusive one, but the including statement can be perfectly categoric, in the sense of having its frontiers clearly defined." *Impact: Essays on Ignorance and the Decline of American Civilization*, ed. by Noel Stock (Chicago: Henry Regnery, 1960), p. 121.

> necessarily always) assumes forms already established as a dominant type within a particular genre, and the translated literature tends to remain fairly conservative, adhering to norms which the "higher" forms have already rejected.[6]

That the style of translated Chinese poetry mainly corresponded to that of the time, be it formal verse patterns earlier or free verse later on, is not coincidental. The development of English translations of classical Chinese poetry in the early twentieth century, mainly after Waley and Pound, intertwined and interacted with the metamorphosis of literary conventions in the target system.

Lefevere suggests that translators often try to recast the original in terms of the poetics of their own culture, to make it pleasing to a new audience and to ensure that the translation will actually be read.[7] One should be reminded that the warm welcome given to Pound and Waley's Chinese translations in the second decade of this century was not only because they greatly adapted the source texts, but may also have been the retention of foreign elements that made the works more attractive to English audiences. It was also the use of a new poetic language which tolerated greater flexibility that facilitated the foregrounding of images and the presenting of simple objects,[8] which are a salient feature of Chinese poetry.

One of Waley's characteristics is his unruffled and flowing English, read easily yet calling the reader's attention to the images through its strange rhythm. His language has since become a mainstream model for translating Chinese poetry, straining and stretching the English language yet not disrupting the syntax altogether. But these characteristics only came after a series of experiments. Waley gives an example to illustrate the restriction of using rhymes. Someone rendered the following lines:

---

[6] Edwin Gentzler, *Contemporary Translation Theories* (London: Routledge, 1993), p. 118.

[7] André Lefevere, ed. *Translation/History/Culture/: A Sourcebook* (London: Routledge, 1992), p. 26.

[8] One may also consider Donald Davie's remark on Pound's work on the verse-line: "The breaking of the pentameter made possible, indeed it enforced, the breaking down of experience into related but distinct items." He also wrote that "what has been reinstated as the poetic unit is the verse-line-- continually dismembered, but never disintegrated." Donald Davie, *Ezra Pound: Poet as Sculptor* (London: Routledge & Kegan Paul Ltd., 1965), pp. 123-124.

> This little grandchild, five years short of twelve,
> As yet can neither spin nor deeply delve.

But he points out, "believe it or not, all that the original says is:"

> The little children cannot yet help with the ploughing or weaving.[9]

Though the original is not revealed, the meaning in Waley's line is significantly different from the nameless translator's, whose first line seems to provide details that are made up for no other reason other than rhyming. Waley also points out why he did not use rhyme in translating Chinese poetry:

> At the time when these translations first appeared (1917) [*One Hundred and Seventy Chinese Poems*] rhyme was considered the hall-mark of poetry, and there are still people who consider that a translator of poetry who does not use rhyme has not done his job. But rhymes are so scarce in English (as compared with Chinese) that a rhymed translation can only be a paraphrase and is apt to fall back on feeble padding.[10]

His unrhymed free verse did not receive an immediate warm welcome from his contemporaries. The most severe attack came from his famous predecessor, Herbert Giles, an authority in the field. Giles accused him of calling his rendering of Qu Yuan's "The Great Summons" a "translation."[11] In refuting Giles' criticism Waley demonstrated not only his knowledge of Chinese language and culture,[12] but also how he applied such

---

[9] Arthur Waley, "Notes On Translation," in *Madly Singing in the Mountains: An Appreciation and Anthology of Arthur Waley,* ed. with a preface by Ivan Morris (London: George Allen & Unwin Ltd, 1970), pp. 152-164 (p. 159). Waley did not specify the name of the translator and the poem.
[10] Arthur Waley, "Introduction" to *A Hundred and Seventy Chinese Poems* (London: George Allen & Unwin Ltd, 1918), p. 137.
[11] See Arthur Waley, "Notes on the 'Lute-Girl's Song'" in *Madly Singing in the Mountains*, pp. 297-302 (p. 300, note 1).
[12] Waley, "Notes on the 'Lute-Girl's Song'" in *Madly Singing in the Mountains*, pp. 297-302.

knowledge to the practical aspect of translation. Giles attacked Waley on the following grounds:

> A version of this ["Great Sermons"] [...], as "Translated by Arthur Waley" [...] was a bold attempt and a free, too free paraphrase--without the excuse of rhyme--it would have had a chance of escaping criticism but as a translation, in justice to the poet and to the readers who cannot verify from the original text, a good deal of amendment is necessary.[13]

Waley was challenged by Giles on the classic issue, that is, the problem of language-- too free and no rhyme. Free and unrhymed verse, ironically, was to be the dominant convention for translating Chinese poetry for a century to come.[14]

James Liu observes that there are two basic approaches in translating Chinese poetry:

> We can discern, I think, two opposite tendencies: the one toward what may be called "naturalization," the other toward what may be called "barbarization." By "naturalization" I mean attempts to turn Chinese poetry into English verse within the existing conventions of the English language, and by "barbarization" I mean attempts to reshape the English language so that it would conform to the structure and idiom of Chinese.[15]

Most translators of Chinese poetry, according to him, "from H. A. Giles through Arthur Waley to David Hawkes and Burton Watson, have aimed at naturalization, even though they have chosen different verse forms and styles."[16] What is more significant is that "historically, most successful English translators of poetry, from any other language, have

---

[13] Morris, *Madly Singing in the Mountains*, p. 300, note 1.
[14] Most translators mentioned in the introduction of this thesis, with few exceptions (like Father Turner), use the free and unrhymed verses in their translations.
[15] James Liu, "Polarity of Aims and Methods: Naturalization or Barbarization?" *Yearbook of Comparative and General Literature*, 24 (1975), 60.
[16] Liu, "Polarity of Aims and Methods: Naturalization or Barbarization?" pp. 60-61.

been naturalizers, from Chapman through Dryden and Pope to Fitzgerald, in theory and in practice."[17]

The sinologist A. C. Graham suggests that in his experience, when it is possible to approximate to Chinese word-order, it is fairly common to find the one nearest to the Chinese makes the strongest English.[18] Whether such a happy medium could always be achieved depends on individual translators, but this idea seems to ease the tension between the old controversy between barbarization and naturalization, and blurs the distinction between poets like Pound who often break up the line unit and sinologists whose aim is to keep a close rendition, including the original syntax.

In practice the distinction between different strategies is not that clear, as Susan Bassnett remarks:

> all kinds of different criteria come into play during the translation process and all necessarily involves shifts of expression, as the translator struggles to combine his own pragmatic reading with the dictates of the TL cultural system.[19]

A case in point is Du Fu's long poem "Journey North" as translated by Hugh M. Stimson:

> Chrysanthemums hang blossoms of this autumn
> rocks carry ruts of ancient chariots
> blue clouds move me to elation
> secluded things are, after all, a joy[20]

---

[17] Liu, "Polarity of Aims and Methods: Naturalization or Barbarization?" p. 60.
[18] A. C. Graham, "A New Translation of a Chinese Poet: Li Ho," *Bulletin of the School of Oriental and African Studies, University of London*, 34 (1971), 560-70 (p. 566).
[19] Susan Bassnett, *Translation Studies*, revised edn. (London: Routledge, 1991), p. 104.
[20] Liu Wu-chi and Irving Lo, ed., *Sunflower Splendor: Three Thousand Years of Chinese Poetry* (New York: Anchor Press, 1975), p. 123. A word-for-word translation of the original is:

菊	垂	今	秋	花
chrysanthemums	hang	this	autumn	flowers

石	帶	古	車	轍
rocks	carry	ancient	chariot	track

His stated intention was to mark the caesura of the original, but the poem reads somewhat like Pound's lines in the early version of his Metro poem and in the *Cantos*. Meanwhile, Wai-lim Yip's theory and practice also intended to approximate the original syntax. He is very much against the conventional way of adding words such as connectives and intellectual pointers to make the original presentation more explicit. He laments that many translators

> must have been led by the sparseness of syntax in the original to believe that they are shorthand signs for a longhand message-- and so they took it as their task to translate the shorthand into longhand, poetry into prose, adding commentary all along to aid understanding, not knowing that these are 'pointers' toward a finer shade of suggestive beauty which the discursive, analytical, longhand unfolding process destroys completely. The fact is: these images, often coexisting in spatial relationships, form an atmosphere or environment, an ambience, in which the reader may move and be directly present [...][21]

One can see that, according to this comment, not only would he object to traditional metres and rhymes, but he would oppose to the use of smooth and grammatical lines that depart from the Chinese mode of presentation also. His own translations as well as works that are done in accordance with this conception are similar to the disrupted syntax of some of Pound's lines in *Cathay* and *Cantos*, though the latter may be aiming at juxtaposing the images, not keeping the Chinese structure intact as such. The result is, there is a convergence of styles at times, as scholars and poets translated for different purposes and with different strategies. But the use of traditional metres has exerted such a restriction on the syntax and diction of the target language that most of the strategies mentioned above,

---

青	雲	動	高	興
blue	clouds	move	high	joy
幽	事	亦	可	悅
secluded	things	also	can	pleasing

[21] Yip Wai-lim, *Chinese Poetry: Major Modes and Genres* (Berkeley and Los Angeles: University of California Press, 1976), pp. 8-9.

such as breaking up the line into different units, or having a close approximation of the original structure, could hardly be adopted.[22]

A. C. Graham observes that several lines of a Chinese poem often "translated themselves,"[23] and one can hardly resist translating the whole. He gave the following example:

> A Tatar horn tugs at the north wind,
> Thistle Gate shines whiter than stream.
> The sky swallows the road to Kokonor:
> On the Great Wall, a thousand miles of moonlight.[24]

and it is possible, according to him, to translate the lines "more literally," since Chinese and English word-order are similar. There are two points, however, worth our attention. One is the fact that perfect literalness has to give way to idiomatic smoothness, rhythm, and immediate intelligibility, as the Chinese character *han* 含 (hold-in-mouth) above being substituted by "swallow," which is not quite the same, according to A. C. Graham. Another notion is, despite the syntactical similarity that sometimes makes translation easier from Chinese than from Latin or French, the associations of Chinese words are far from similar; "fidelity to the image" is impossible without a complete disregard of the verse form of the original.

Waley notes that his translations were viewed by some as having had an impact on English poetry in terms of metre. He recalled once he was introduced to the poet and critic

---

[22] Donald Davie, for example, observed, "It was only when the line was considered as the unit of composition, as it was by Pound in *Cathay*, that there emerged the possibility of 'breaking' the line, of disrupting it from within, by throwing weight upon smaller units within the line." Donald Davie, *Ezra Pound: Poet as Sculptor*, p. 45.

[23] A. C. Graham, "The Translation of Chinese Poetry," in *Poems of the Late T'ang* (New York: Penguin, 1967), p. 14.

[24] Graham, "The Translation of Chinese Poetry," p. 14. The word-for-word translation that he put down is:

Tartar	horn	tug	North	wind,
Thistle	Gate	white(r)	than	water,
Sky	hold-in-mouth	Kokonor		road,
Wall	top	moon	thousand	mile.

Edward Shanks at a party, but Shanks turned away, saying, "That man has done more harm to English poetry than anyone else."[25] Shanks was referring to Waley's use of sprung rhythm which he felt violated traditional English metre. According to Waley,

> I had invented the sort of Sprung Rhythm that I used in translating Chinese poetry several years before the poems of Hopkins were printed, so that [...] Hopkins had no influence on the metric of my translations from Chinese.[26]

Waley innovated a style not only to be followed by many translators of Chinese poetry in the decades to come, but a rhythm that also echoed the poetic language of an age, which gradually saw the breaking down of the power of the iambic pentameter initiated by Ezra Pound. Sprung rhythm came in Waley's translations spontaneously and he claims he only noticed its existence in his own works six years after he had been unconsciously using it.[27] He used one stress for every Chinese syllable, and the stressed syllables could come side by side or "separated by anything up to three unstressed syllables." The classical Chinese poems that Waley translated are usually in strict regulated forms; the rendering of them in a highly stylized tempo gives a sense of immediacy yet uneasiness that helps to continue their life in the new culture.

While Waley was accused of having done "damage" to English poetry because of his translation, interestingly enough, Pound considered himself as having ruined his own prose, also because of translation:

> I ruined my English prose for five years, trying to write English as Tacitus wrote Latin. *Very bad.* However, I may have learned something by it. I now know that the genius of the two languages is not the same.[28]

---

[25] Arthur Waley, "Introduction" to *A Hundred and Seventy Chinese Poems* (London: George Allen & Unwin Ltd, 1918), p. 136.
[26] Waley, *A Hundred and Seventy Chinese Poem*, p. 137.
[27] Waley, "Notes On Translation," in *Madly Singing in the Mountain*Morris, p. 158.
[28] *The Letters of Ezra Pound 1907-1941*, ed. by D. D. Paige (London, Faber and Faber, 1971), p. 87.

The tales the two translators tell show that, in different ways, translated literature could subvert conventional styles in the target language. Though Pound confessed his sin in the case of prose style, he was not so repentant in his guilt in the subversion of poetic syntax,[29] and it is evident that he had done far greater "damage" to the iambic pentameter in his imagist poems, including the *Cathay* pieces. But then over a hundred years ago Victor Hugo, in his introduction to the Shakespeare translations made by his son, pointed out:

> to translate a foreign poet is to add to one's own poetry; yet this addition does not please those who profit from it. At least not in the beginning; the first reaction is one of revolt. A language into which another idiom is transfused does what it can to resist.[30]

For poets like Pound and Snyder, the language they used in the translated texts-- which approximated Chinese syntax-- was carried over to poems of their own, which have been well received in the English speaking world, thus proving as Lefevere argues that translation may force a language to expand.[31]

But scholars who seek precise equivalents and try to reproduce a similar syntax in the target language are bound to run into problems. Hans H. Frankel, a professional sinologist, laments the limitations in the conclusion of his article on the translation of classical Chinese poetry:

> Those who insist on rhyme and/or perfect poetic rhythm have to compromise on fidelity of diction and order; those who reproduce the syllable count or the relative line length on the printed page have to shift, cut, and expand here and there; those who wish to mark the caesura find that they cannot always break the English line at the same places as the Chinese line; those who are eager to preserve the original word order come up against stubborn differences in Chinese syntax; those who ignore or reshape English syntax run the risk of becoming unclear, incomprehensible, or awkward; those who stick too closely to Chinese patterns of parallelism and

---

[29] Pound wrote, for example, in Canto 81, "To break the pentameter, that was the first heave." See *The Cantos* (New York: New Directions, 1970).

[30] Victor Hugo, "Preface de la nouvelle tradition de Shakespeare," in *Oeuvres completes de William Shakespeare*, trans. by Francóis Victor Hugo, 15 vols (Paris: Pagnerre, 1865), p. xv.

[31] Susan Bassnett and André Lefevere, *Translation, History and Culture* (London and New York: Pinter Publishers, 1990), p. 24

> repetition are in danger of sounding monotonous and dull; but those who neglect those patterns mutilate the original poem.[32]

The poetics and language constraints of the English system are not fully addressed by such translators.

Pound wrote, as early as 1908, in a letter to William Carlos Williams that he was seeking:

> 1. To paint the thing as I see it.
> 2. Beauty.
> 3. Freedom from didacticism [...][33]

The idea of imagism was there already. The three notions express the desire to shake off formal and pedantic restrictions on the lines, while pointing to the use of a language close to everyday speech. The first two points also dwell on the notion of images-- not only the "thing," but also the way it is perceived by the individual. Allusions and unnecessary details that come in between would not be desirable. Pound wrote about how imagism came along and what it was all about in greater detail many years later. He claims it happened before he received the Fenollosa notes:

> In the spring or early summer of 1912, "H. D.", Richard Aldington and myself decided that we were agreed upon the three principles following:
> 1. Direct treatment of the "thing" whether subjective or objective.
> 2. To use absolutely no word that does not contribute to the presentation.
> 3. As regarding rhythm: to compose in the sequence of the musical phrase, not in the sequence of a metronome.[34]

Traditional metres, according to these principles, were no longer acceptable. This poetics was ready for a new kind of poetry, only it had not been fully realized yet, and how to get there was still a little sketchy. The Fenollosa notes he received soon after could be said to

---

[32] Hans H. Frankel, "English Translation of Classical Chinese Poetry Since the 1950s: Problems and Achievements," *Tamkang Review*, 15.1-4 (Autumn-Summer 1984-5), 314.
[33] Paige, *The Letters of Ezra Pound, 1907-1941*, p. 6.
[34] Ezra Pound, *Make It New* (New Haven: Yale University, 1935), p. 335.

have been the right kind of poetry in the right place at the right time. Wai-lim Yip wrote about Pound's stylistic change around that time:

> As Pound moved toward 1914 (at about which time he actually started translating Chinese poems from the Fenollosa notebooks), he was obsessed with the effort to use no involved syntax, no archaic diction, and no inversions.[35]

Furthermore, the Chinese syntax is such that even words that are usually not considered superfluous, such as connectives, could be omitted. Not only was the second principle pushed even further, the mode of presentation-- juxtaposition of images, the concept of simultaneity and super-pository technique-- was also enhanced. It is not that Herbert Giles and scholars of his time were not aware of the conciseness of the Chinese language, but that they relied heavily on a system that did not accommodate well such a language and poetics. Giles wrote, for example, "Brevity is indeed the soul of a Chinese poem, which is valued not so much for what it says as for what it suggests."[36] The compression of meaning in the Chinese poem, however, could hardly be accommodated by a predetermined structure in the target system.[37] It is not until the advent of a new poetic language and new poetics that the juxtaposition of images was implemented.[38]

Pound had been working on the notion of concreteness since 1908. His effort was shown in a few poems he re-wrote before 1913, that is, before he received Fenollosa's

---

[35] Wai-lim Yip, *Ezra Pound's Cathay* (Princeton: Princeton: University Press, 1969), p. 56.
[36] Herbert A. Giles, *A History of Chinese Literature* (New York: F. Ungar Publishing Co., 1967), p. 145.
[37] For more discussions of the restriction imposed by the traditional metres see James Dunn, "Translation and Poetics: Reciprocal Technologies in the History of Chinese-to-English Transfer," *Tamkang Review* 16.4 (Summer 1986), 381-394 (p. 389).
[38] While Giles points out that the essence of Chinese poetry is in its brevity and suggestiveness, Kenneth Rexroth asserts that poets in English were unable to use Giles' 1898 collection, because his translations were doggerel verse. See Orr, "Chinese Poetry and the American Imagination," p. 11.

notes from his widow.[39] One of them is the poem "Liu Ch'e" originally translated by Giles.[40] The last line of Pound's version, "A wet leaf that clings to the threshold," was made to intimate the emotion suggested throughout the poem. Pound changed the lines drastically, and focused on the image of the leaf. The leaves first "scurry into heaps and lie still," from a strong motion to a motionless state within the same line, then comes the end, with the leaf still being quiescent, but it is wet now, clinging to something.

The wet leaf also clings to the notion of *xing*.[41] It parallels the human world.[42] Pound's effort demonstrated his attempt to juxtapose images while eliminating connectives. As Pound commented later, he wanted to write in a way that makes "the reader to think."[43] This technique of placing a human situation and a natural scene side by side bears similarity with *xing*, yet not quite the same, for the rational mind here steps in more obviously. In another poem, "The Fan Piece, for her Imperial Lord," Pound again presented a deserted woman: "O fan white silk, /clear as frost on the grass-blade, /You also are laid aside."[44] Pound was likening the fairness and freshness of the fan to the quality of

---

[39] The "Metro" piece is a famous example. Another example is "The Fan Piece, for her Imperial Lord." See *Personae* (New York: New Directions, 1990), p. 111.

[40] *Personae*, p. 110. For more discussion of this poem see also Chapter 5 and Chapter 6.

[41] The concept of *xing* will be discussed in the next two chapters.

[42] Michael Alexander, in discussing "Poem by the Bridge at Ten-Shen," one of the *Cathay* poems, points out that

> Quite apart from the views he later formed of ideogram, Pound took readily to Chinese poetry for other reasons, chief of which was perhaps that he found in it an habitual and instinctive use of the natural world as an expressive analogy for the human. Such a use may be universal, but the unallegorical directness of the old Chinese conventions caught Pound's imagination.

Michael Alexander, *The Poetic Achievement of Ezra Pound* (London & Boston: Faber and Faber, 1978), pp. 25-26.

[43] "Pastiche. the Regional. XIV," *New Age* 25 (October 23, 1919), 432.

[44] *Personae*, p. 111. Pound did not know the source, and comparison with the original is not relevant here. Giles' version is:

> O fair white silk, fresh from the weaver's loom,
> Clear as the frost, bright as the winter snow--

the abandoned woman. It was the opening exclamation that betrays the speaker's thought that comes immediately after. The word "also," meanwhile, shows a clear sign of comparison, as opposed to the implicit correlation between the natural scene and the human world in Chinese poetry. In 1914, shortly before he published *Cathay*, Pound already observed that taking away the word "like" could enhance the effect of juxtaposition. He gave a *haiku* to illustrate his finding:

> The footsteps of cat upon the snow:
> (are like) plum blossoms.

and pointed out that the words "'are like' would not even have occurred in the original."[45]

Pound frequently theorized his own strategies of translation. From 1908 up to the publication of *Cathay* in 1915, he had written a series of articles and letters expressing his concepts of concreteness, precision, suggestion and juxtaposition.[46] He wrote, for example:

> See! friendship fashions out of thee a fan,
> Round as the round moon shines in heaven's above,
> At home, abroad, a close companion thou,
> Stirring at every move the grateful gale.
> And yet I fear, ah me! that autumn chills,
> Cooling the dying summer's torrid rage,
> Will see thee laid neglected on the shelf,
> All thoughts of bygone days, like them bygone.

See Giles, *A History of Chinese Literature* (New York: F. Ungar Pub. Co., 1901), p. 101.

[45] Pound, *Fortnightly Review*, 96 (Sept. 1, 1914), 471.

[46] The various articles first appeared in *New Age* (December 7, 1911- February 15, 1912), and are included in *Selected Prose* 1909-1965, ed. by William Cookson (New York: New Directions Book, 1973). Some of the important works related to the topic are also listed below:

> "I Gather the Limbs of Osiris," *The New Age*, 10 (November 1911-February 1912).
>
> "Prolegomena," *Poetry Review*, 1 (February 1912), 72-76. In *Literary Essays of Ezra Pound*, ed. and with an introduction by T. S. Eliot (London: Faber & Faber, 1954), pp. 8-12.
>
> "A Few Don'ts by an Imagiste," *Poetry*, I (March 1913), 200-206. In *Literary Essays of Ezra Pound*, pp. 4-8.
>
> "How I Began," *T. P.'s Weekly*, 21 (June 6, 1913), 707.

"The artist seeks out the luminous detail and presents it. He does not comment."[47] He told William Carlos Williams that the kind of poetry he was writing "is the poetic part of a drama the rest of which (to me the prose part) is left to the reader's imagination or implied or set in a short note."[48] In 1918, after translating *Cathay*, Pound wrote:

> It is because Chinese poetry has certain qualities of vivid presentation; and because certain Chinese poets have been content to set forth their matters without moralizing and without comment that one labours to make a translation, and that I personally am most thankful to the late Ernest Fenollosa for his work in sorting out and gathering many Chinese poems into a form and bulk wherein I can deal with them.[49]

The Fenollosa notes he received reinforced his concept of concreteness, crystallizing what he had been thinking and practicing since 1908.[50]

Chinese poetry often presents images as they are without conceptualizing or commenting on them; it is inclined to be imagistic, not narrative, which is also what Pound and the imagists found so fascinating; Small wonder that the rise of imagism after 1910 coincided with a sudden enthusiasm for Chinese poetry. As Kenneth Rexroth puts it:

> It [the job of translating Chinese poetry] purges so many of the vices of occidental poetry. It accomplishes in one blow the various programs of the twentieth-century revolutions in poetry-- all the manifestoes of the imagists and objectivists and so forth have to be fulfilled if you are going to write decent translations of Chinese verse.[51]

"Vorticism," *Fortnightly Review*, 96 (September 1, 1914), 461-471. In *Gaudier-Brzeska: A Memoir* (London: Bodley Head, 1916), pp. 94-109.

[47] See "I Gather the Limbs of Osiris," *New Age*, 10. 6 (December 7, 1911), 130.
[48] Paige, *The Letters of Ezra Pound*, pp. 3-4.
[49] Ezra Pound, "Chinese Poetry," *To-day*, 3 (April 1918), 54.
[50] Donald Davie observes, "The work that Pound did on Fenollosa's manuscripts about Chinese literature introduced him to what was to be an abiding interest of his life, and one of the causes he was to serve most zealously-- the Chinese [...]" Davie, *Ezra Pound: Poet as Sculptor*, pp. 47-48.
[51] Kenneth Rexroth, "The Poetry of the Far East in a General Education," in *Approaches to the Oriental Classics: Asian Literature and Thought in General Education*, ed. by Wm. Theodore de Bary (New York: Columbia university press), pp. 199-200.

It was both the pull of a new rhythm and new mode of presentation, mainly directness and concreteness, that brought Chinese and English poetics together.

b) The Universe of Discourse

When speaking about the "translation of exotic texts" David Hawkes expresses concern that a reader may have no mental framework to place them in.[52] Lefevere also writes that:

> Translators have to strike a balance between the Universe of Discourse (i. e. the whole complex of concepts, ideologies, persons, and objects belonging to a particular culture) as acceptable to the author of the original, and that other Universe of Discourse which is acceptable and familiar to the translator and his or her audience. It happens not infrequently that translators decide [...] that foreign authors are "not always models of taste," resolving, therefore, to "assimilate all that is good in our neighbors and reject the bad we have no need to read or know of."[53]

So there are two "universes," one in the source culture; the other in the target culture. It is the translator's job to "make both ends meet," but more often one end is given more weight and thought, depending on the translator's strategy.

The question of ethics was an important consideration for some early translators. At the end of his introduction to the *Odes*, entitled *The Shi King: The Old "Poetry Classic" of the Chinese*, William Jennings, a nineteenth century British missionary stationed in Hong Kong, praised the high morality demonstrated in this work. His statement may reflect some opinions of his time, and more specifically his own strategy:

> Decidedly the best European metrical translation of the *Shi King* has been made by Victor von Strauss [...] and my hope and ambition in publishing the present version is to have done as far as I can in the way of

[52] David Hawkes, "From the Chinese," in *The Legacy of China*, ed. by Raymond Dawson (London: Oxford University Press, 1964), p. 244.
[53] Lefevere, *Translation/ History/ Culture*, p. 35.

> accuracy (though it may often have led to a little awkwardness of style) for English readers what he has done for Germans.
>
> If it will detract in any degree from the apathy shown by English people towards the literature of the Far East, let me say in conclusion that though the "Poetry Classic" of the ancient Chinese may be despised as poetry, and may be looked upon only as rhymed prose, yet it has at least the merit of its age, and in one important respect it surpasses such poetry as that of Burns, and Byron, and Heine, and many other popular balladists: it has the merit of a greater morality.[54]

He admits that there had been apathy towards Chinese poetry, pointing out apologetically that the *Odes* may be despised as poetry, and may be looked upon only as rhymed prose. He gives no reasons, but presumably because such poetry was seen as lacking imagination and conceits-- even though formal metrics was used in the translation-- and any poetry short of that might be despised or deemed to be rhymed prose. What he has in mind about the translation is "accuracy," for which awkwardness of style has to be compromised. He was not too happy with earlier poets because of the ethical standards of their work, and what was so good about the poems he was translating was that, as he suggests:

> "I may assure the reader," remarks Professor von de Gabelentz, of Leipsic, in a discussion on these poems, "that in this whole collection of *Odes*, and indeed in the whole canonic and classical literature of the Chinese, so far as I know it, there is not a line to be found which might not be read aloud without any hesitation in the most prudish society. I know no other literature, of the East or West, on which similar praise could be bestowed."[55]

The translation of *Shijing*, perhaps influenced by the allegorical tradition in its original culture, reminds one of Rufus Griswold's words in his preface to *The Poets and Poetry of America* in 1842 that American Poetry "is of the purest moral character" and the publication "effectively controlled the moral and intellectual range of subject matter in canonical poetry."[56] When Pound later tried his hand at the *Odes* he also considered the

---

[54] William Jennings, "Introduction," *The Shi King: The Old "Poetry Classic" of the Chinese, A Close Metrical Translation, with Annotations* (London and New York: George Routledge and Sons, 1891), pp. 21-22.

[55] Jennings, p. 22.

[56] Alan C. Golding, "A History of American Poetry Anthologies," in *Canons*, ed. by Robert von Hallberg (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1984), pp. 279-308 (p. 289).

work as an exponent of Confucianism, as the subtitle he gave suggests-- "As Defined by Confucius." Definition sounds more like a term used in science or philosophy, and the phrase "defined by Confucius" in particular gives a sense of ethical deliberation. Lefevere argues that different attitudes that develop towards the original give rise to different translational strategies.[57] Attitudes here do not necessarily refer to those among different translators, but even of the same individual. A case in point is Pound, whose attitude towards the original changed over the years, and those changes have bearings on the difference between his early work *Cathay* and his much later endeavour, *The Odes As Defined by Confucius*. In the former case his manipulation of the text to suit his developing imagist theory dominated, whereas by the time he translated the *Odes*, he seems to show much more discretion in preserving what he saw as the original meanings, and his syntax is more traditional (mostly in ballad forms).[58] This was done, after all, at a time when he had developed a strong feeling towards Confucianism, and took the *Odes* as defined by that ancient sage and as a vehicle to convey mainly his own political and social ideology, rather than poetics.

Waley's book on Li Bo concludes that Li "appears in his Works as boastful, callous, dissipated, irresponsible and untruthful,"[59] The ancient Chinese appreciation of art and other aspects of life had a strong moral dimension, but they would hardly have thought of Li Bo as such a despicable person. Criticism of his integrity did appear, even during his life time, but mainly about his loyalty to the emperor, since Li Bo had joined a rebel army and was punished by exile as a result. The Chinese mainly think of Li Bo as an unparalleled genius. His light-hearted attitude towards his wife, or wives, did not have any negative influence on his reputation as an individual or a poet. His drunkenness and nonchalance

---

[57] André Lefevere, *Translation, Rewriting, & the Manipulation of Literary Fame* (London and New York: Routledge, 1992), p. 91.
[58] More discussions of Pound's strategies could be found in Chapter 6.
[59] Arthur Waley, *The Poetry and Career of Li Po 701-162 A. D.* (London: George Allen and Unwin Ltd, 1958), p. 102.

were even regarded as a kind of charisma, an attainment of Taoist liberation of mind and a disdain of worldly troubles.

Throughout history, it seems that not only have Chinese readers found Li Bo's conceit of comparing his long hair with the length of his sorrow acceptable, they actually find it very powerful and vivid. Waley first put down the "prose sense" as this:

> My white hair--thirty thousand feet! because of my sorrows it has grown as long as this. But I cannot understand what I see in my bright mirror; from what place did it get its autumn frost?

He then expresses his dissatisfaction:

> The poem has been greatly admired [...] But I cannot help sympathizing with the little boy in 18th century Japan who said, after reading the poem: 'Surely the line about his hair being thirty thousand feet long is the most unmitigated lie[...]'[60]

It is interesting to note that Waley finds someone who shares his view, who, however, also happens to be a non-native reader. I am by no mean suggesting that there was any thing wrong with Waley and the Japanese boy's ability of appreciation, but just seeking to show that different readings are likely to occur because of the cultural backgrounds. Waley may have been accustomed to ingenious conceits, but not to such a gross exaggeration, or perhaps a blatant lie. He was, in other words, very much under the influence of his own tradition, despite his tremendous efforts to enter into the worlds of Li Bo and that of the Tang Dynasty.

Lefevere writes that a "cultural script" could be defined as the accepted pattern of behaviour of people who fill certain roles in a certain culture.[61] The problem was that Li Bo's behaviour did not fit the role of a great poet. He did not fit into the cultural script of the English tradition, and, one may think, there was little reason why he should have fitted

---

[60] Waley, *The Poetry and Career of Li Po*, p. 72.
[61] Lefevere, *Translation, Rewriting, and the Manipulation of Literary Fame*, p. 89.

into Confucian society either. Actually, the ancient Chinese were much more tolerant and reconciliatory when it came to the conflicts between say, Confucian loyalty and Taoist nonchalance.

But Waley was already conscious of the Chinese cultural background in relation to the English tradition. It is important to note that when Waley first tried his hand at translating Chinese poetry he received quite unsympathetic criticism: "I can't get much from your translations. I don't need a Chinese poet to tell me that rivers don't turn back in their courses."[62] But it is exactly this kind of mundane wisdom presented in an unsophisticated language, paradoxically mixed with a sense of remoteness and exoticism, that made a great change to the Chinese translations before him. In a concluding paragraph in his book on Yuan Mei in 1956, Waley writes apologetically about his translations. It is also like a summary of his efforts in translating Chinese poetry:

> Despite their imperfections my translations have in the past done something towards inspiring a number of people with the idea that, for lovers of poetry, Chinese is a language worth learning. I hope that this book may serve the same purpose and in particular do something to dispel the common idea that all good Chinese poetry belongs to a remote antiquity.[63]

Behind Waley's statement there is the tenet that a literary work is always rooted in a cultural background, and the ultimate aim of a translator is to introduce that heritage to the reader in the target language. What he has translated, and what the reader has read, is only a small part of that heritage. The translator could hardly explain enough that foreign realm of knowledge to his readers, and he should, if possible, motivate them to go all the way to the source text.

One should also be reminded that traditions, including those of the source culture, are often constructed by translators. They choose what to translate, how to translate, and consciously make up a consistent image of a poet or a source culture for the target reader,

---

[62] Waley, *A Hundred and Seventy Chinese Poem*, p. 134.
[63] Arthur Waley, *Yuan Mei: Eighteenth Century Chinese Poet* (London: George Allen & Unwin Ltd, 1956), p. 204.

sometimes conforming or re-confirming his age old beliefs which have been established by earlier translators. Waley's Bo Juyi (Po Chu-i), Pound's Li Bo (Rihaku; Li Po), Rexroth's Du Fu (Tu Fu), and Snyder's Cold Mountain are chosen carefully by the translators to fit into their purposes, ideological or poetic, or the universe of discourse. The translators discussed in this thesis, Waley, Pound, Rexroth and Snyder, chose poets sometimes simply because they like them, because they reflect their own temperaments, or fulfill the requirements of a pre-conceived notion, like "the Chinese rule" in the case of Rexroth's Du Fu. Not only do they choose the poets, they also choose the poems, among hundreds, to translate.

One may go one step further to say that Waley's comment quoted above reveals his concern for the readers in the target culture, and his aim was pedagogical. He was trying to say that his book was to educate readers by arousing their interest in what he thought would be worth their attention. The significance of the second part of his suggestion is twofold. On the one hand it is aimed at English readers, for he once again intended to clarify the long misunderstanding in the West that good Chinese poetry had to be ancient. On the other hand he stressed that Yuan Mei lived in an age in which the British and other Western people, mainly missionaries and merchants, had already come to the East. Such a connection not only brings Yuan Mei closer to modern Western readers, but also establishes some kind of linkage between the whole genre of Chinese Classical poetry and that of the West in historical terms. A living relationship is thus established. By showing that good Chinese poetry does not necessarily belong to a remote past, Waley is actually trying to bridge a supposedly impassable gap between his life-long and private obsession with the intended Western audience in the twentieth century.

The second point Waley makes, on the other hand, that Yuan Mei's poetry is good and that he is much closer to our time, tells us also part of the motivation behind Waley's enterprise in translating a poet who was relatively unknown even to his own countrymen. It was Yuan's contemporariness, in other words, that gave him credit. Yuan Mei lived in the

period of Qian Long, probably one of the most famous Chinese Emperors in the West (because it was mainly during his reign that the Western missionaries and merchants started their business campaigns, successful or not, in China). When Waley or Pound translated Chinese poetry, they had to assume that their readers knew little about the background, so one of their strategies was to inform, and the information value in the translated texts is high.

The intended audience is one of the most important determinants of translation strategies. On the one hand translators may seek to propagate Chinese cultural values, retaining or exaggerating the exotic characteristics, whilst on the other hand they may focus on different aspects of the cultural scripts. Li Bo mentioned above is an example. Though a great poet in the Chinese tradition, he did not have much respect from Waley, who was more concerned with humanism and the role of a great poet.[64] As Lefevere observes, a text that is central in its own culture may rarely occupy the same position in another culture.[65] Pound, however, chose to translate more of Li Bo (Rihaku)'s poems than any other poets' in *Cathay* for aesthetic purposes. He was preaching a new poetics to his audience, and his fascination for the suggestiveness of a poem like the "Jewel Stairs' Grievance" is a case in point:

> The jewelled steps are already quite white with dew,
> It is so late that the dew soaks my gauze stockings,
> And I let down the crystal curtain
> And watch the moon through the clear autumn.[66]

---

[64] Waley discusses extensively the kindness and humanity shown by Bo Juyi and Yuan Mei, while criticizing Li Bo for his callousness. Waley wrote, for example: "If Po [Bo Juyi] had been a Western European he would no doubt have salved his conscience by subscribing to humanitarian societies, holding meetings, writing to the Press, and so on." Waley, *The Life and Times of Po Chu-i* (London: George Allen & Unwin Ltd, 1949), p. 160. He pointed out to the reader, meanwhile, that "there are many anecdotes about the humanity and common sense displayed by Yuan Mei." *Yuan Mei*, p. 41.

[65] Lefevere, *Translation, Rewriting, and the Manipulation of Literary Fame*, p. 86.

[66] Pound, *Personae*, p. 136. A word-for-word translation of the original is:

玉	階	生	白	露
Jade	steps	grow	white	dew

What interested Pound most about this poem, he claims, is not what it is about, but how it is told, or, more precisely, how it is shown. He attached the famous note to this poem telling his reader what he found so fascinating about it:

> Note: Jewel stairs, therefore a palace. Grievance, therefore there is something to complain of. Gauze stockings, therefore, a court lady, not a servant who complains. Clear autumn, therefore he has no excuse on account of weather. Also she has come early, for the dew has not merely whitened the stairs, but has soaked her stockings. The poem is especially prized because she utters no direct reproach.[67]

It is the suggestiveness of this poem that Pound tries to underline ("she utters no direct reproach"). The selected details-- "luminous details" in Pound's terminology[68]-- evoke a human situation, a tragic atmosphere, which is not stated overtly. Though the act of explaining defeats the very purpose of it, Pound cannot help doing so because he is not just translating a poem, but preaching a new poetics, creating a poetry that needs to be puzzled over and requires the reader's participation. It is important to note that Pound's explanatory note was not unnecessary-- a fellow imagist poet, John G. Fletcher, for example, criticized Pound's Metro poem because the connection between the pretty faces and the "petals on a wet, black bough" was "not absolutely clear."[69] The criticism seems to miss the whole point about this poetics, for the idea is not to make it "absolutely clear." But the comment

---

夜	久	侵	羅	襪
Night	late	attack	gauze	stockings
卻	下	水	晶	簾
Let	down	water	crystal	blind
玲	瓏	望	秋	月
(Crystal-clear)		watch	autumn	moon

[67] Pound, *Personae*, p. 136.
[68] Ezra Pound, *New Age*, 10. 6 (December 7, 1911), 130.
[69] John G. Fletcher, "The Orient and Contemporary Poetry," in *The Asian Legacy and American Life*, ed. by Arthur E. Christy (New York: John Day, 1945), p. 158.

also revealed that the intellectual temperament at that time was still not accustomed to Pound's method.[70] All the information given by Pound is actually implied in the poem, which speaks for itself through the images.

Pound observed a few years later that "The first great distinction between Chinese taste and our own is that the Chinese like poetry that they have to think about, and even poetry that they have to puzzle over," and though the latter taste has occasionally broken out in Europe, "it has regretfully never held its own for very long."[71] So what he sees as the essence of Chinese poetry coincides with his poetic theory of suggestiveness, and small wonder that he singles out "The Jewel Stairs' Grievance" to translate, to proselytize his poetics to the unaccustomed reader for its suggestiveness.[72]

The original of "The Jewel Stairs' Grievance," a quatrain with five words to a line, is the shortest form of Tang poetry, and this form was particularly valued for presenting ineffable emotions, almost testing the function of language to the extreme, by saying as little as possible to achieve a state of silence, to "tell" the reader that nothing is said. It has a component of scene (or *jing* 景 in Chinese poetic terminology), a touch of Chan (Zen), and a touch of Taoism. And Pound the young translator singled out this poem in particular

---

[70] It is interesting to note that John G. Fletcher was very much aware of the difference in poetics and the universe of discourse between China and the West at that time. He wrote:

> It is difficult for me to say just how deeply I was affected by the first Chinese poems I thus read in European translations [Giles' *A History of Chinese Literature* (1901); Judith Gautier's *Le Livre de Jade* (1867); Cranmer-Byng's *A Lute of Jade* (1909); Marquis d'Hervey-Saint-Denys' *Poesies de l'Epoque des Thang* (1862)][...] they acted on me as a revelation. In common with all advanced poetry writers of that period, I was in full revolt from the Victorians [...] it seemed to me that all the English poets, from Shelley and Wordsworth onward, had tried too hard to make poetry teach something, preach something, bear the abstract connotation of a general moral lesson-- when the real business of poetry was to state, and state concretely, just what had moved the poet, and to leave the reader to draw his own conclusions.

John G. Fletcher, "The Orient and Contemporary Poetry," pp. 149-150.

[71] Ezra Pound, "Chinese Poetry," *To-day*, 3 (April 1918), 54-55.

[72] To the reader accusing him of writing "in cypher," and of writing poetry that "merely skips from one point to another without connection or sequence," Pound answers: "The statement is nevertheless complete. All the elements are there, and the nastiest addict to crossword puzzle shd. be able to solve this or see this." Pound, *Guide to Kulchur* (Norfolk, Conn.: New Directions, 1952), p. 48.

for his readers.[73] A contemporary of Li Bo, Wang Wei wrote many poems in this particular form with a touch of Chan Buddhism, or conveying a sense of nothingness, by focusing on a scene, which is quite often static, hardly showing any action or even emotion. The emotion, of course, is embedded in the scene itself.

It is important to note that translators' strategies are influenced by their overall translation conception as well as their feelings for the source cultures or individual poets, and the two factors are inseparable. Lefevere writes that

> When the image of the original is no longer uniformly positive in the target culture, more liberties are likely to be taken in translation, precisely because the original is no longer considered a "quasi-sacred" text [...][74]

---

[73] Pound's method, a suppression of explanatory words or connecting links, is in line with the poetics that was to flourish a little later. Max Nänny's idea of arts as co-creation is relevant here. In talking about the ideogram as an inclusive icon, Nänny argues that:

> Its [the ideogrammic method's] high degree of semantic, grammatical and partly etymological comprehensiveness or inclusiveness, however, is actually due to a radical omission or suppression of connective or explanatory links. Thus whereas the explicit connectedness proper to Western literate modes of thought and expression has fostered a passive and detached attitude in the reader, the absence of connections and implicitness natural to the oral modes of the East, be it in Zen, Confucianism, oriental art or the ideogram, compels the reader into active completion and participation and involves him in the very act of creation.

Nänny then quotes McLuhan's words for explanation, that these oral modes create involvement

> by means of the interval, not by the connection used in the visually organized Western world. Spectator becomes artist in oriental art because he must supply all the connections.

See Max Nänny, *Ezra Pound: Poetics for an Electric Age* (Bern and Munich, Francke Verlag, 1973), p. 108; and Marshall McLuhan, *Understanding Media* (New York: McGraw-Hill, 1960), p. vi.

One may also consider Walter Sutton's comment on Pound's juxtaposition technique in connection with the present discussion. Sutton writes that the lack of apparent relationship between the presented images

> reflects the intellectual concern of the modern poet for logical relationships that are difficult to establish. What syntax the poem has is implied by the poet and must be inferred by the reader, who recognizes the tacit comment, and judgement, of the poet upon the world he sees and represents in a carefully ordered structure of apparently dissociated images. The writer of this poetry poses an intellectual challenge to his reader, and the reader must learn, in time, to read the poem.

Walter Sutton, "The Literary Image and the Reader," *Journal of Aesthetics and Art Criticism*, 16. 1 (Sept. 1957), 112-123 (p. 116).

When "The Jewel Stairs' Grievance" first appeared, the reader was not familiar with its tacit comment. The reader learned to read it in time, and with the help of Pound's note.

[74] Lefevere, *Translation, Rewriting, & the Manipulation of Literary Fame*, p. 91.

Even though Waley did not have high esteem for Li Bo as a great poet, he only expressed his opinions in commentaries. He still produced a close translation of Li's poems notwithstanding, without totally replacing one text by another. While Pound made Li Bo the dominant figure in his *Cathay*, paradoxically he made far more alterations to Li's poems than Waley.

Chapter 3

Xing: Encoding and Decoding

a) X*ing* in the Encoding Process

Xing 興 is not just one of the Chinese poetic devices, but probably the most essential one. The myths and mysteries surrounding the meanings of x*ing* have never been totally cleared. This study, which mainly concerns itself with translation, does not attempt to arrive at any proscriptive definition. The main task is to discuss the major traits of x*ing*, and for that matter the characteristics of Chinese poetry, in connection with translation.

Xing is inextricably related to the creative process.[1] It is nature that is the stimulant, and one of man's responses to it is to write song, or poetry. The essence of x*ing* is in its power to trigger the feelings of the poem, and much of the resonance in Chinese poems is related to the use of x*ing*. The Qing critic Li Zhonghua 李重華 singles out *xing* as the most important literary technique for it gives life to a poem:

> The poet depends fundamentally on *xing*. In an uncalculated manner, the poet talks about birds, animals, and plants; yet somehow the season, climate, the locale, and the human situation are revealed without being explicit. Only when there is *xing* can the very life and spirit of poetry radiate.[2]

---

[1] A famous critic in the Liang Dynasty (502-557), Zhong Rong 鍾嶸 (? 483-513), writes in the opening paragraph of his *Preface to the Poets Systematically Graded (Shipin)* 詩品 about the origin of literary creation:

> The spirit of Nature influences the particular objects in Nature, and the particular objects in Nature affect men. Men, having their natural attributes and feelings moved and swayed, give them defined expressions in dance and songs. As an illumination of Heaven, Earth and Man, a beautification of All Things, as a means whereby the gods are properly honoured, and the spirits of darkness make their gloomy destinies clear, Poetry outstrips [all human endeavours:] for it moves Heaven and Earth, and affects the gods and spirits.

The first two sentences may summarize the meaning of x*ing*. See *Early Chinese Literary Criticism*, ed. and trans. by Siu-kit Wong with a preface by David Hawkes (Hong Kong: Joint Publishing Co., 1983), p. 90.

[2] See the Ching critic Li Zhonghua 李重華, *Zhenyizhai shishuo* 貞一齋詩說 no. 43, in *Qing shihhua* 清詩話, p. 930. The translation is mine.

Both *bi* 比 (literally to compare) and *xing* contain comparison. When comparison is viewed in the context of Chinese poetry, it usually means a parallel or contrast between natural phenomenon and the human world. The difference between *bi* (comparison) and x*ing* is, "*Bi* involves reasoning by analogy, and *xing* responds to a stimulus."[3] Therefore, *bi* is more the work of the intellectual capacity, while the nature of *xing* is emotive spontaneity.

What is more important about the notions of *bi* and *xing* is that their difference is related to their roles during the creative process. If one looks at *xing* from this particular stand-point, one will realize that it is the catalyst of literary creation. Liu Xie 劉勰 (ca. 465-523), Zhong Rong's contemporary, says that:

> Man is endowed with seven emotions. When stimulated by external objects, these emotions rise in response. In responding to objects one sings to express his sentiments. All this is perfectly spontaneous.[4]

In the closing poem from the chapter on "The Physical World," Liu Xie speaks about the interaction between the physical world and the poet's mind:

> Mountains rise one behind another, and waters meander and circle;
> Trees interlace and clouds mingle.
> Such sights before the eyes
> Stir the mind to express itself.
> "Spring days pass slowly,"
> And autumn wind "soughs mournfully."
> The access of feeling for something is described as the giving of a gift,
> And the coming of inspiration [*xing*] as a response.[5]

---

[3] See "An Exegesis of Poetry," in *The Literary Mind and the Carving of Dragons: A Study of Thought and Pattern in Chinese Literature*, trans. and annotated by Vincent Yu-chung Shih (Hong Kong: The Chinese University Press, 1983), p. 276.
[4] Shih, *The Literary Mind and the Carving of Dragons*, p. 61.
[5] Shih, *The Literary Mind and the Carving of Dragons,* pp. 483-485.

The Chinese character 興 *xing* in the last line refers to the creative impulse. Prior to both Zhong Rong and Liu Xiu, Lu Ji 陸機 (261-303) in his "Essay on Literature," *Wen fu* 文賦 also remarks that literary creation is related to the writer's sensitive response to nature:

> Responding in deep sympathy to the change of seasons,
> Surveying, with feelings coming and going in rapid succession, the world,
> Sorrowing for the fallen leaves in autumn,
> Gladdened by the pliant branches of soft spring,
> The poet is chilled at heart by the thought of frost's severity,
> And elated by the sight of clouds.[6]

In yet another passage by Zhong Rong, various objects in the seasons also play a crucial role in the creative process:

> Birds and the [gentle] breeze of spring, cicadas and the moon of autumn, summer's showers, summer's clouds, the moon and the bitter cold of winter are the affective stimuli of poetry in the four seasons.[7]

The essence of *xing* is the idea of stimulation and response, and *xing* is related to the moment of feeling and responding to creation when the heart is touched. The union of "scene" and "feeling" which characterizes the *xing* device embodies the poet's response to the outside world in a poetic experience: the "feeling" in the verse is a response to the "scene" that comes before it, and the notion of coming before is of the utmost importance, while the correlation between the scene and the feeling is not supposed to be spelled out.[8]

Lu Zhiwei 陸志韋 considered Arthur Waley the best translator so far, and recounted an anecdote by way of introduction. An American missionary once asked her friend to read her some Chinese poetry. It happened her friend was reading:

---

[6] Wong, *Early Chinese Criticism*, p. 40.
[7] Wong, *Early Chinese Criticism*, p. 93.
[8] Scholars have written on *xing* and related concepts. Important works include: Michelle Hsi Yeh, "Metaphor and Metonymy: A Comparative Study of Chinese and Western Poetics" (unpublished doctoral dissertation, University of South California, 1982); Michelle Hsi Yeh, "Metaphor and '*Bi*': Western and Chinese Poetics," *Comparative Literature* 39.3 (1987), 237-54; Ying-hsiung Chou, "The Linguistic and Mythical Structure of *Hsing* as a Combinational Model," *Chinese-Western Comparative Literature: Theory and Strategy* (1980), 51-78. For more discussions see also Cecile Sun, *A Sense of Scene: Depictions of Scene as Expressions of Feeling in Chinese and English Poetry* (unpublished doctoral dissertation, Bloomington, Indiana University, 1982).

The spring-tide, with rain in its wake, comes rushing in twilight.
At the deserted country ferry the boat swings over.

The missionary was a little impatient, and asked her friend to go on. But the friend said that was all.[9] Lu then commented: "They looked at each other and there lies Chinese poetry."[10] The poem, as a matter of fact, should be a little longer, but these two lines are always singled out, for their representation of a scene without human trace, yet suggestive of life and motion.[11] The Chinese have the habit of taking out a line or two depicting a scene from a poem and regarding them as an entity, which may not mean too much if one does not take into consideration the feeling and atmosphere implicitly contained in the scene. Over a thousand years later and a thousand miles away, Kenneth Rexroth considered the essence of Chinese poetry as "the poetic situation," "the Chinese rule," or "the Chinese scene."[12] With this notion in mind one may not need to ask the "story-teller" to go on. John Fletcher, who translated Chinese poetry two decades before Rexroth, observed that Chinese poets

---

[9] Lu Zhiwai, *Five Lectures On Chinese Poetry* (Beijing: The Foreign Language Teaching and Research Press, 1935), p. 116.
A word-for-word translation of the original is:

春	潮	帶	雨	晚	來	急
Spring	tide	brings	rain	evening	come	rush
野	渡	無	人	舟	自	橫
Wilderness	pier	no	man	boat	self	swing

[10] Lu, *Five Lectures On Chinese Poetry*, p. 116.
[11] There are stories about an Emperor using the two lines as a title, asking students of the Royal Academy to do a painting. The original of the second line should read something like "Deserted ferry without human trace: boat swings over by itself." The difficulty is to bring out the idea of "by itself" and the sign of life in nature.
[12] See the discussions on Rexroth in chapter 7.

used their imaginations to identify themselves with the objects they wrote about.[13] The objects and the feelings, in Chinese poetics, are not separate things.

A western reader of Chinese poetry may find the world presented there quite unfamiliar, as Stratchey observes about the essence of Chinese poetry:

> Different, indeed, is the effect of the Chinese lyric. It is the very converse of the epigram; it aims at producing an impression which, so far from being final, must be merely the prelude to a long series of visions and of feelings. It hints at wonders; and the revelation which at last gives us is never a complete one-- it is clothed in the indefinability of our subtlest thoughts.[14]

Chinese poets tend to be more reflective, dwelling on simple objects and commonplace emotions:

> Its poets are the poets of reflection, preoccupied with patient beauties and the subtle relationships of simple things. Thus, from one point of view, they are singularly modern, and perhaps the Western writer whose manner they suggest most constantly is Verlaine. Like him, they know the art of being quiet in verse.[15]

This kind of quiet poem is usually related to the use of x*ing*, which enables seemingly tranquil and simple things to be charged with emotions, and requires the reader to participate in the poet's experience.

Arthur Waley was aware of *xing*, and he used the following English folk song to demonstrate:

> I lean'd my back against an oak;
> I thought it was a trusty tree.
> But first it bent and then it broke;

---

[13] John Gould Fletcher, "The Orient and Contemporary Poetry," in *The Asian Legacy and American Life* (New York: John Day, 1945), pp. 145-174 (p. 151).
[14] Lytton Strachey, "An Anthology," in *Characters and Commentaries* (New York: Harcourt, Brace and Co., 1933), pp. 138.
[15] Strachey, "An Anthology," p. 140.

My true love has forsaken me.[16]

The relation between the last line and the previous ones is unstated, but it seems the scene described and the feeling expressed correspond to each other. Without the other each may not mean too much. The scene and the feeling are mutually engendering. Waley notes that this is also the way images are used in early Chinese songs. He observes that English folk songs often use "images" which are similar to the *xing* device in *Shijing*.[17]

When introducing English readers to the *xing* characteristic, David Hawkes quoted a verse from *Shijing*, translated by Waley:

Unsteady is that cypress boat
In the middle of the river.
His two locks looped on his brow
He swore to me that he was my comrade
And till death would love no other.
Oh, mother, ah, Heaven,
That a man could be so false![18]

---

[16] "Introduction," *The Book of Songs*, trans. by Arthur Waley (London: George Allen & Unwin Ltd., 1937), p. 13.

[17] Waley, *The Book of Songs*, p. 13.

Like Waley, Burton Watson equates *xing* with images. *Xing* is different from western figures of speech, however, in its spontaneity and its intuitively arrived at insights. Watson's observation nonetheless throws light on the essence of Chinese poetic tradition:

> Nature imagery plays an important part in Chinese poetry from the time of the *Books of Odes* on. Since many of the songs in the *Odes* have to do with hunting or farm chores, the nature images pertain, understandably enough, to the beasts and plants involved in these pursuits, or to the other tasks such as sericulture or the gathering of wild food plants [...] there are those nature images that seem to be symbolic [...] they represent either an analogy or a contrast to the speaker's condition. But these "symbolic" images are difficult to identify and interpret [...]
>
> These nature images customarily occur in the opening line or lines of a stanza, followed by a description of the human events or emotions to which they presumably form a parallel of some kind. Scholars of the Han, employing an older terminology of uncertain meaning, referred to this device as a *hsing*. The word means literally "to begin," "to lift up" [...] The exact relationship between the images drawn from nature in the opening lines, and those that pertain to human affairs in the lines that follow, is left unexplained [...]

Burton Watson, *Chinese Lyricism: Shih Poetry from the Second to the Twelfth Century, with Translations* (New York: Columbia University Press, 1971), pp. 122-123.

Hawkes argues that the correlation between the unsteady boat and the unreliable lover in the *Shijing* poem is similar to what happens in an English lyric of the fifteenth century, "The Western Wind."[19] In that lyric, the relationship between longing for the West wind as well as the rain and the poet's longing to embrace his beloved is also implicitly presented. Hawkes argues that the stark juxtaposition of images challenges the mind and compels it to take their relationship more seriously.[20]

---

[18] Waley, *The Book of Songs*, p. 53. See also the discussion in David Hawkes, "Chinese Poetry and the English Reader," in *The Legacy of China*, ed. by Raymond Dawson (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1964), p. 111.

[19] See David Hawkes, "Chinese Poetry and the English Reader," p. 112. Hawkes refers to "The Western wind" to illustrate *xing*:

> Western wind, when wilt thou blow,
> That the small rain down can rain?
> Christ, if my love were in my arms,
> And I in my bed again!

The spontaneous association between the Western wind, the small rain, and the thoughts of the lover indicates some kind of relationship between the stirring of nature and the responsive mind. Western critics such as Josephine Miles, Cleanth Brooks, and Archibald MacLeish are impressed by the special quality of this short lyric. See Josephine Miles, *The Poem: A Critical Anthology* (Englewood: Prentice-Hall, 1959), p. 3; Cleanth Brooks, *Understanding Poetry* (New York: Holt, Rinehart and Winston, 1950), pp. 245-246, and Archibald MacLeish, *Poetry and Experience* (Cambridge: Riverside Press, 1961), p. 60.

Trying to clarify the charm of "The Western Wind," Archibald MacLeish also refers to a poem in *Shijing*. He quotes the piece about the dead doe to discuss:

> In the wilds, a dead doe;
> White rushes to wrap it.
> A girl harboring spring lust;
> A fine man to seduce her.
>
> In the woods, bushes grow;
> In the wilds, a dead deer.
> White rushes in bundles;
> A girl like jade.
>
> Gently, take it easy and slow;
> Don't tug at my sash.
> Don't make the dog bark.

MacLeish commented on the poem: "That dead doe under the white rushes in the ancient Chinese poem, and the living girl who lies with her lover in the place beside, seem not only to be together but to mean together--so much that one's first impulse is to make them one." MacLeish not only points out the notion of the dead doe and the girl being together, but also the role of the reader to bring them together. It is one's "first impulse" to do so. See MacLeish, *Poetry and Experience*, p. 60.

[20] Hawkes, "Chinese Poetry and the English Reader," p. 112.

"Chinese poetry," Hawkes writes, "habituated from its infancy to this method of using natural imagery, developed it in the course of centuries to a wonderful degree of suppleness."[21] Hawkes feels it necessary to qualify the statement by saying that the Chinese poet is not unnecessarily passionate:

> Chinese verse generally strikes the Western reader as somehow quieter and more detached than his own poetry [...] In China [...] the poet was seldom an outsider, as he so often has been in Europe, and very few Chinese poets felt that they had to be mad or bad in order to assert their individualism and *epater le bourgeois*. This in itself was enough to make Chinese poetry on the whole more restful than ours. But there is another reason. If we consider the history of poetic inspiration in the West, we find that in the early stages it was thought of as a kind of demonic possession in which the poet abandoned himself to the Muse.[22]

While his observation about the comparative quietness of Chinese poetry is insightful, his statement seems to miss the role that *xing* plays in this connection. It is exactly the concept of *xing* that gives the scene a fully charged power. It is also why Pound and Rexroth, as practicing poets, find the suggestiveness in the scene of Chinese poems so striking.[23] The great Chinese poets, Qu Yuan, Li Bo and Du Fu all excel in presenting a scene full of emotions.[24] In many of their poems, which may be easily taken as "quiet," there is a force that makes the scene internally quite unstable-- because of *xing*.[25]

---

[21] Hawkes, "Chinese Poetry and the English Reader," p. 112.
[22] Hawkes, "Chinese Poetry and the English Reader," p. 113.
[23] I am going to discuss the notions of suggestiveness and the quiet scene in Chinese poetry in the chapters on Pound and Rexroth.
[24] Zhu Guangqian observes that the quiet scene in Chinese poetry implicitly contains emotions, and that Chinese poets often subtly change a static scene to one that suggests action. See the discussion in Zhu Guangqian 朱光潛, *Shi Lun* 詩論 (Hong Kong: Shan Lian Bookstore, 1984), pp. 125-141. Qian Zhongshu, on the other hand, has pointed out that the description in Li Bo and Du Fu's poems is full of action. He also describes different standards of evaluating poetry and painting in traditional Chinese arts criticism. In painting one treasures the void presentation more-- for there is an attempt on the part of the painter to transcend the confinement of his medium. The order of Li Bo and Du Fu's poems is considered higher than that of Wang Wei, for Li and Du's vivid and lively representation has pushed the power of language to its limit, aspiring to the inherent vividness of painting, while Wang Wei's withdrawn and ethereal style in painting is considered the highest achievement in arts history. See Qian Zhongshu 錢鍾書, "Chinese Poetry and Chinese Painting," *Qijue Ji* 七絕集 (Shanghai: Shanghai Classical Books Press, 1985), pp. 1-28.
[25] In the following poem, "Climbing in the *Yueyang* Tower" by Du Fu, the scenes depicted in the two middle couplets evoke the feelings in the lines which follow:

A scene charged with emotions does not necessarily appear in the beginning of a poem. It is also common that a Chinese poem ends with a scene, as in this poem by Wang Changling 王昌齡 (?-- 756 A. D.):

昔 In the past	聞 hear	洞 *Dong*	庭 *Ting*	水 water
今 Now	上 climb	岳 *Yue*	陽 *Yang*	樓 Tower
吳 *Wu*	楚 *Chu*	東 East	南 South	拆 split
乾 (World)	坤	日 Day	夜 Night	浮 float
親 Relatives	朋 friends	無 without	一 one	字 word
老 Old	病 ill	有 with	孤 lonely	舟 boat
戎 Barbarians	馬 horses	關 gate	山 mountain	北 north
憑 Lean	軒 window	涕 tears	泗 overflow	流 flow

The following is my translation:

> I have heard of Lake *Dongting* before,
> Today I climb the *Yueyang* Tower.
> The lake severs the lands of Wu and Chu to east and south,
> The earth is set afloat day and night.
> I have received no word from friends and relatives
> Old and sick, I have only my solitary boat with me.
> Barbarians are still attacking north of the distant mountains,
> Tears gush down as I lean against the balustrade.

Du Fu relates the third line to the fifth line as well as the fourth line to the sixth line through the device of x*ing*, in the sense of using scene to evoke feeling. The third and the fourth lines are about the vastness of the lake; it is the split lands (the third line) that remind the speaker that he has also been separated from his friends and relatives (the fifth line). And the floating of sky and earth in the waters (the fourth line) makes him aware of his life as a lone exile (the sixth line). Meanwhile, the words 拆 (split) and 浮 (float) respectively in the third and fourth line describe not only the land but also the human situation.

Wang Fuzi, a Qing (1644-1911) critic, also noticed that in these two couplets, the scene and the feeling are closely correlated. See Siu-kit Wong,, "*Ch'ing* and *Ching* in the Critical Writings of Wang Fu-chih," in *Chinese Approaches to Literature from Confucius to Liang Ch'i-ch'ao*, ed. by Adele Austin Rickett (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1977), p. 130.

琵	琶	起	舞	換	新	聲
Pi (instrument)	*Pa*	rises	dance	change	new	song
總	是	關	山	離	別	情
Still	is	pass	mountain	leave	separation	feeling
撩	亂	邊	愁	彈	不	盡
(Confusing)		border	sorrow	play	without	end
高	高	秋	月	照	長	城
High	high	autumn	moon	shine	great	wall[26]

While the sound of music tells of the sorrows, the soundless autumn moon, plus the fact that it is high above the Great Wall, tells of even more feelings. But to scrutinize what exactly it is telling us is to defeat the very purpose of *xing* and scene. Yet one can say altogether the scene at the very end of the poem not only corresponds to the atmosphere of the previous lines but also gives a *gestalt* entity, a unifying force, to the whole poem. What exactly is the relationship between the autumn moon that shines above the Great Wall and the frontier sorrows? To say there is no relationship of course is not a satisfactory answer. But what then is it? The truth lies in the magic of *xing*, and the merging of scene and feeling in a spontaneous manner. If it is not unpremeditated, or can be identified by words, it would become more of a comparison.

The early Qing critic Wang Fuzi 王夫之 (1619- 1692) wrote that feeling and scene engender each other and dwell in each other,[27] and the language of "scene" is also the

---

[26] The following is my translation:

Soldiering Song

Starting a dance the *pipa* changes to a new tune.
Always the same sorrows of separation by the mountain passes.
On and on the music tells of the frontier sadness;
High and above the Great Wall shines an autumn moon.

language of "feeling." He explained: "*Ching* [*jing*, scene] is assembled by the agency of *ch'ing* [*qing*, feeling], and *ch'ing* is given life by *ching*; basically the two are not separate, as they simply go the direction the [poet's] state of mind tends. If you sever *ch'ing* and *ching* into two halves, the *ch'ing* will no longer be good enough for arousing the [reader's] feelings, and the *ching* won't even be what one means by *ching* any more." Wang Fuzi commented elsewhere, "In the best poetry, they [*ching* and *ch'ing*] subtly conjoin, allowing no barrier. Good poets include *ching* in *ch'ing* and *ch'ing* in *ching*."[28] According to Wang's notion, the tress, rivers and mountains in Chinese poetry do not exist as separately identifiable entities.

Yuan Zhen 元稹 (779-831) , a close friend of Bo Juyi (772-846), expressed his admiration for Du Fu's narrative poems, which are almost by their very nature longer pieces. His attitude was ridiculed by Yuan Haowen (1190-1257) in a poem.[29] It should be pointed out that in the mid-Tang Dynasty there was a movement, perhaps influenced by the

---

[27] Wang Fuzhi (Wang Fu-chih), *Jiangjai shihua*, 薑齋詩話 II, no. 14, in *Qing shihhua* 清詩話. The translation is done by Siu-kit Wong. Wong, "*Ch'ing* and *Ching* in the Critical Writings of Wang Fu-chih," p. 130.

[28] Wong, "*Ch'ing* and *Ching* in the Critical Writings of Wang Fu Chih," 125, 131.

Wang Fuzi also wrote that, "If you can't handle the language of *ching*, can you possibly handle the language of *ch'ing*? The ancients often give us lines of *ching* in their sweetest lyricism [...]" Wang then gave examples, and explained, "Feeling (*ch'ing*) resides in those lines: it is only by expressing your feelings in the spirit of writing descriptions of scenery that you can succeed in bringing out without effort the particularised experience of body and mind." See Wong, "*Ch'ing* and *Ching* in the Critical Writings of Wang Fu Chih," p. 124.

[29] Yuan's poem is:

排比鋪張特一途, 藩籬如此亦區區, 少陵自有凌雲筆, 爭奈微之識碔砆

John Timothy Wixted's translation is:

> Arrangement and layout are but one approach to poetry;
> Confinement of this sort is trifling indeed!
> Tu Fu's verse is a priceless gem--
> Hopeless that Yuan Chen had eyes but for imitations.

John Timothy Wixted, *Poems On Poetry: Literary Criticism by Yuan Hao-wen* (Wiesbaden: Steiner, 1982), p. 10.

rising of the vernacular style as well as the story-telling practice (a genre like novels which was influenced in turn by the Buddhist stories in the large quantity of translation from Sanskrit scriptures) at the time. Yuan Zhen and Bo Juyi are the two leading figures of this poetic movement. Yuan Haowen's criticism of Yuan Zhen actually reveals two main approaches to poetry, with one that emphasizes the use of images and the *xing*-mode presentation, while the other is what Yuan Zhen praises about Du Fu, and presumably practiced by Bo Juyi and Yuan Zhen himself, which is the more prosaic and narrative style. Yuan Haowen's criticism, and for that matter his position, appears to represent the main tradition of Chinese poetry from *Shijing* onwards, which also explains why Chinese poetry is usually short and occasional.[30] This is also perhaps the reason why Qian Zhongshu teases Waley, almost like Yuan Haowen did to Yuan Zhen, for his inability to discern the good from the bad, when Waley seems to make Bo Juyi a hero among the numerous Chinese poets he translated.[31]

The famous late Ching poet and critic Wang Guowei 王國維 (1877-1927) in his *Renjian cihua* 人間詞話 (*Jen-chien Tz'u-hua*) criticized the *ci* (*tz'u*) poetic style of the Southern Song Dynasty yet praised the achievement of *ci* in the Northern Song Dynasty:

> Yen Yu in his Ts'ang-lang shih-hua said: 'The poets of the Golden T'ang period were concerned only about inspiration and interest (*hsing-ch'u*) [*xingqu*]. Like the antelope that hangs by its horns leaving no discernible traces on the ground, their excellence lay in their crystal-like transparency, no more to be grasped than sound in empty space, changing colour in the face, moon in the water, or an image in a mirror. The words had a limit, but the meaning went on forever.' It is my opinion that the tz'u of the Northern Sung and before were also like this. However, what Yen Yu called inspiration and interest and what Wang Shih-chen called spirit and tone

[30] Pound noticed these characteristics of Chinese poetry, and wrote that, in China, "if a man can't say what he has to say in twelve lines he has better keep quiet." Pound, *Gaudier-Brzeska: A Memoir* (New York: New Directions, 1960), p. 88.

[31] See Qian Zhongshu 錢鍾書, *Tan Yi Lu* 談藝錄 (Hong Kong: Guoguang Sujue, 1979), pp. 230-231.

> (*shen-yun*) only seem to touch the surface, while the two characters which I have chosen, *ching-chieh*, really probe the fundamental aspect of poetry.[32]

This paragraph, by using abstract terms as his criteria of judgement and concrete images as comparisons to literary style, in a way represents the approach of traditional Chinese literary criticism. What is more important, here Wang Guowei, and for that matter the critics that he mentions, despite their difference in terminology, are actually talking about *xing* (the term *hsing-ch'u* 興趣, in which there is the character *xing* 興, was used by one of them). *Xing* (*hsing*), in other words, is what Wang Guowei values most. Works without it or which do not show strong traces of it are considered to be less superior. Wang says, for example, "The poem '*Chien chia*' [蒹葭] in the *Shih Ching* has merited the deepest appreciation of poets (*feng-jen* 風人)."[33] "*Chien chia*" is noted throughout the ages for its evocation of feelings by the opening lines-- which describe an autumnal scene. Wang Guowei also writes:

> Li Po was a master of imagery (*ch'i-hsiang*).
>
> West wind, evening glow
> On tombs of Han.
>
> These eight lonely, desolate words have closed the lips of travellers forever after [...][34]

On her translation of the term *ch'i-hsiang* as "imagery," Rickett writes in the footnote:

> The compound *ch'i-hsiang* is well known as a technical term for weather, meaning the physical aspect [...] of the climate [...] In more general terms it may refer to a natural scene or the elements that constitute scenery, and as such is sometimes translated 'atmosphere.' *Ch'i* can mean the vital force of a person or object, the breath that is the source of life, a spiritual essence that is natural and unique in all phenomena. *Hsiang* is a reflection, image, or representation of something. *Ch'i-hsiang* in literary criticism, therefore,

---

[32] *Wang Kuo-wei's Jen-chien Tz'u-hua: A Study in Chinese Literary Criticism*, trans. by Adele Austin Rickett, (Hong Kong: Hong Kong University, 1977), p. 43.
[33] Rickett, *Wang Kuo-wei's Jen-chien Tz'u-hua*, p. 49.
[34] Rickett, *Wang Kuo-wei's Jen-chien Tz'u-hua*, p. 43.

> means the tangible representation of an intangible force. In this sense, then, the English word 'imagery' seems appropriate.[35]

Though I would hesitate to call *ch'i-hsiang* imagery (*hsiang*, as Rickett remarks, means image, but the compound *ch'i-hsiang* means magnificent force or atmosphere), her descriptions fall into the category of *xing*, which is a more inclusive term.

What makes poetry of the "Golden Tang" ("High T'ang" as called by Stephen Owen) so remarkable, if one examines the examples Wang mentioned elsewhere, is the use of *xing*, while poetry of the Southern Song which is not appreciated by Wang usually shows a lack of *xing*. *Ci* in the Southern Song Dynasty is usually longer, shows more intellectual sign, or, to use Yuan Haowen's terminology, *paibi puzhang* 排比鋪張 (arrangement and comparison in grandiose style). It is in the importance of *xing* as an integral component of good poetry that Wang Guowei's attitude resembles Yuan Haowen's, and for that matter Qian Zhongshu's when Qian criticized Waley's favour for Bo Juyi, though Qian did not say explicitly why. It is not a coincidence that Bo Juyi and Yuan Zhen's poems are more narrative, and are usually much longer than other Tang poets'. By the same token most Chinese poems are short, focusing on a scene, depending on it for the evocation of feelings. When a Chinese poet depicts a scene and dwells on it in the poem which consists of only a few lines, it may not be so much the "scene" *per se* that he is presenting. It is this tradition that is worth our attention more in studying translation strategies.

The rapport between man and nature is sometimes manifested in the direct narration of the poet himself. For example, in Li Bo's "Sitting Alone at *Jingting* Mountain:"

眾	鳥	高	飛	盡
Flock	bird	high	fly	end

[35] Rickett, *Wang Kuo-wei's Jen-chien Tz'u-hua*, p. 43.

孤	雲	獨	去	閒
Single	cloud	alone	go	leisure
相	看	兩	不	厭
Mutual	look	both	not	tired
祇	有	敬	亭	山
Only	with	*Jing*	*Ting*	Mountain[36]

The union between the mountain and the man, not really a mystic one, comes after a description of nature. The birds and the cloud respectively have their own ways, which are not at odds with each other. So is the man and the mountain. Mountain, in fact, seems to share feelings with man, as Xin Qiji 辛棄疾 (1140-1207) writes:

我	見	青	山	多	嫵	媚
I	see	green	mountain	so	(charming)	
料	青	山	見	我	應	如	是
Expect	green	mountain	see	me	probably	the	same[37]

If one applies the concept of intentionality of consciousness in phenomenology to study these lines, it could be said that the consciousness goes from the poet to the mountain and then comes back from the mountain to the same individual, almost like a boomerang. All this, however, only takes place quietly in the mind of the poet himself. In both Li Bo and Xin Qiji's poems, the poets feel something about nature, and then this feeling immediately

---

[36] Sitting Alone at *Jingting* Mountain

The flocks of birds have flown away,
The lonely cloud goes and comes.
For looking at each other without feeling tired
Only *Jingting* Mountain and me.

The translation is mine.

[37] I find the Green Mountain is really nice,
I guess it thinks the same of me.

The translation is mine.

shift to that of nature itself, and the poets view themselves from the other side, namely, from nature's point of view as well.

Here I would like to borrow two lines from the Tang poet Wen Tingyun 溫庭筠 (813-870) to illustrate such an endless and reciprocal relationship:

照	花	前	後	鏡
Reflection	flower	front	back	mirror
花	面	交	相	映
Flower	face	across	mutual	reflection[38]

The poet is talking about a girl doing her makeup in front of a mirror while holding another mirror facing the back of her head at the same time. The image of mirrors is probably derived from Buddhism, in which there is such a comparison between the influences among individuals:

> As if myriad of mirrors facing one another. The images of the countless mirrors are seen in one mirror, and reflections are reflected in the reflections; every reflection shows all the reflections, and reflections on reflections, thus becoming endlessly an endlessness.[39]

Nature and man are thus reflected indefinitely in each other's consciousness. And this is similar to the underlying principle of the *xing* phenomenon in terms of man's relationship with nature.

Phenomenology is by no means related to *xing*. But the very concept of it, especially the encoding of a literary text, may help to illustrate the way how *xing* should be

---

[38] The following is a translation of the two lines:

> A mirror, front and back, frames a flower:
> Twin beauties dazzle each other.

"Deva-like Barbarians," trans. by Eugene Eoyang, in Liu and Lo, *Sunflower Splendor: Three Thousand Years of Chinese Poetry* (New York: Anchor Press, 1975), p. 248.

[39] 猶如眾鏡相照, 眾鏡之影, 見一鏡中, 如是影中復現眾影, 一一影中復現眾影, 即重重現影, 或其無盡復無盡也. "*Lun fajie yuanqi*," *Huayan jing* 論法界緣起, 華嚴經. Quoted in Ye Jiaying (Chia-ying Yeh Chao), *Tangsongci shiqijiang* (Taibei: Guoguan Tushugongsi, 1992), p. 53. The translation is mine.

viewed. According to Iser, a literary text is always constructed with a sense of its potential audience, including an image of whom it is written for: every work encodes within itself what he calls an "implied reader," intimates in its every gesture the kind of "addressee" it anticipates. And a certain kind of reader is already included within the very act of writing itself, as an internal structure of the text.[40] When *xing* is employed in a Chinese poem, one can say the same is true about its intention for the implied reader, who is expected to read the separate incidents as a whole, or to look at the images with the understanding that these are not just objects *per se*, but are part of the total experience of the poet in its crudest form at that moment.

Husserl's idea of intentionality of consciousness sheds more light on the Chinese reading of *xing* poems. He holds that the text itself should be reduced to a pure embodiment of the author's consciousness: all of its stylistic and semantic aspects are grasped as organic parts of a complex totality, of which the unifying essence is the author's mind. Aspects of the poet's consciousness are said to manifest themselves in the work itself. Moreover, he is concerned with the "deep structures" of the mind, the way the writer "lived" his world, the phenomenological relations between himself as subject and the world as object. According to Husserl, the "world" of a literary work is not an objective reality, but what in German is called *lebenswelt*, reality as actually organized and experienced by an individual subject. His phenomenological criticism focuses upon the way an author experiences time or space, on the relation between self and others or his

[40] Wolfgang Iser, "The Reading Process: A Phenomenological Approach," in *The Implied Reader* (Baltimore: Johns Hopkins University Press, 1974), pp. 274-294 (pp. 274-275).

perception of material objects.[41] *Xing* therefore could be seen as reflecting a total experience of the poet.

b) *Xing* in the Decoding Process

James Wright in a panel discussion on Chinese poetry made this observation:

> Robert Bly said in his comment something about how in Chinese poetry there seems to be a kind of space around the words, and it's occurred to me that in the best translations of Chinese poetry that I've read-- that is, the translations that, for whatever reason, I can feel are real poems, it's not only that there seems to be some kind of space around the words, but that space somehow makes it possible for me to enter the poem, and live there if I feel that I want to do so.[42]

The space that enables him to enter the poem and live there, and for that matter for the reader and translator alike to move around, is related to the power of *xing*, in the decoding process. In Chinese tradition *xing* is supposed to be the way how a poem is read as well.

There is a common Chinese expression: "It [the wind] blows and wrinkles a pond of spring water, but what does that have to do with you?"[43] The saying is used in a similar way to the saying "a storm in a teacup," except that it emphasizes more the reaction, or over-reaction, of someone. The expression is from the opening lines of a *ci* poem by Feng Yansi 馮延巳 (903-960). There is an anecdote about these lines, which says that Feng, the prime minister of the provincial government, the Southern Tang Dynasty (937-975), one day had a casual conversation with the King, Li Jing 李璟 (916-961), who grew up with

---

[41] See Edmund Husserl, *Experience and Judgement: Investigations in a Genealogy of Logic*, rev. and ed. by Ludwig Langgrebe, trans. by James S. Churchill and K. Ameriks (London: Routledge and Kegan Paul, 1948), pp. 77-79, 166-168, and 278-310. For more details see also Husserl, *The Idea of Phenomenology* (The Hague: Nijhoff, 1964).

[42] Gregory Orr, ed., "Chinese Poetry and the American Imagination," *Ironwood* 17 (1981), 20.

[43] *Chuizhou yichi chunshui, ganqing dishi* 吹皺一池春水, 干卿底事?

him. Li said: "'It wrinkles a pond of spring water.' What does it have to do with you?" (Li's question actually shows his appreciation of Feng's lines, probably for their sensitivity and delicacy.) Feng replied, "It is not as good as your highness' lines 'In the fine rain my dreams return from faraway Chi-sai;/ Through a low tower blows the cold sound of jade pipes.'"[44] The story reflects the poets' mutual admiration of each others' work. Feng's description inadvertently identifies the trace of *xing* in the creative process. The wind blows, the spring pond responds, so the poet Feng's fine and sensitive mind reacts to some slight movement in nature. This is also how a traditional Chinese poem is born.

But what is more pertinent in connection with the present discussion on the decoding process on the part of the reader is, the response is not restricted to the poet himself. The King, to begin with, responds to the lines by jokingly yet commendatorily asking a question, which also shows that he, at least for the time being, is looking from a more practical point of view. When the modern Chinese quote these two lines, with the first line from Feng's poem, and the second line from the King's query ("What does it have to do with you?"), to dismiss a case of over-reaction, they also show their judgement of how one should react to a phenomenon as well. In the present example the King's reaction can be said to be ambivalent. While regarding the lines as very fine poetry, he also takes them as a little exaggerating. If Feng's lines show *xing* in response to a natural phenomenon, the King's comment is the response to a response, that is, the response of a reader to a line. This kind of response, which is first stimulated by a poetic line, is also known as *xing*.

Xing therefore refers to: first, the creative process when the mind meets an object, more often than not an object in nature, unexpectedly, and the individual then immediately

---

[44] "Sand of Silk-washing Stream," trans. by Daniel Bryant, in Liu and Lo, *Sunflower Splendor*, p. 300. A word-for-word translation of the original is:

細	雨	夢	回	雞	塞	遠
Small	rain	dream	back	Ji	Sai	far
小	樓	吹	徹	玉	笙	寒
Little	tower	blows	through	jade	pipes	cold

conjures up some feelings, which have no obvious connection with the natural object; second, it refers to the reading process, in which the reader is stirred by a piece of work. It is the reader's response, hence the translator's reading, that I am dealing with here. In fact, *xing* as an igniting power to people's emotion has been pointed out by Confucius, who, on discussing the functions of poetry, observes:

> For the Songs will help you to incite people's emotions, to observe their feelings, to keep company, to express your grievances. They may be used at home in the service of one's father; abroad, in the service of one's prince. Moreover, they will widen your acquaintance with the names of birds, beasts, plants and trees.[45]

The key phrase, "to incite people's emotions," is actually the word "*xing*" in the Chinese original.

The importance of the reader's role is also demonstrated in the following two conversations between Confucius and his disciples:

> Tzu-kung [Zigong in Pingying System] said, 'Poor without cadging, rich without swagger.' What of that? The Master said, Not bad. But better still, 'Poor, yet delighting in the Way; rich, yet a student of ritual.' Tzu-kung said, The saying of the Songs,
>
> > As thing cut, as thing filed,
> > As thing chiselled, as thing polished
>
> refers, I suppose, to what you have just said? The Master said, Ssu [Tzu-kung], now I can really begin to talk to you about the songs, for when I allude to sayings of the past, you see what bearing they have on what was to come after.[46]

Here Zigong 子貢, one of Confucius' distinguished disciples, associates the love of virtue with two lines from *Shijing*. Virtue, according to Confucius, is something one should stick to whether one is poor or rich. The two lines in *Shijing* originally refer to the polishing of jade, which requires hard work in the refinement process, and this is also what needs to be

---

[45] Arthur Waley, *The Analects of Confucius* (London: George Allen & Unwin Ltd, 1938), p. 212.
[46] Waley, *The Analects of Confucius*, p. 87

done with virtue. What is most significant is the reason given by Confucius for his laudatory remark, which shows that Confucius does not really think the two lines originally mean what Zigong means, as indicated in the words "sayings of the past" as opposed to what "bearing they have on what was to come after." What Zigong does and what Confucius praises, therefore, is the application of a poetic line to a real life situation. In this particular case, to be more exact, the mind moves from a real life situation to a poetic line.

In the following dialogue the direction of association goes the other way round, that is, moving from a verse to a real life situation:

> Tzu-hsia [Zixia in Pingying System] asked, saying, What is the meaning of
>
> Oh the sweet smile dimpling,
> The lovely eyes so black and white!
> Plain silk that you would take for coloured stuff.
>
> The Master said, The painting comes after the plain groundwork. Tzu-hsia said, Then ritual comes afterwards? The Master said, Shang [Tzu-hsia] it is who bears me up. At last I have someone with whom I can discuss the Songs![47]

The lines from *Shijing* are about the beauty of a lady. Confucius' reply is about the process of painting, a moving away from the original description (The line about the plain silk is still a description of her simple charm). And Zixia 子夏's remark follows the direction initiated by Confucius, but goes even one step further by asserting the secondary position of ritual as compared to the more instinctive and genuine feelings.

In both cases Confucius praises a disciple for his insight into the appreciation of poetry. But the reason behind it may sound strange to unaccustomed readers. What Confucius is trying to say is, the right way to approach poetry is to regard it as either a starting point for some other purposes, or a reinforcement of an idea arrived at from some other origins, no matter how seemingly unrelated the two subjects concerned are.

---

[47] Waley, *The Analects of Confucius*, p. 95.

The approach that Confucius advocates, meanwhile, shows more inclination towards the attainment of "significance," rather than the "meaning," of the original. According to Wilheim Dilthey, every interpreter of a piece of work is restricted by his social and historical environments, so when he tries to make sense out of the work, he nonetheless returns to his starting point by bringing his background into the interpretation, which is only a kind of significance, not the original meaning.[48] The main difference between Confucius and hermeneutic interpretation is that Confucius does not bother too much to look for the original meaning, at least in some instances, and given there is such a thing as the original meaning. But rather, he goes straight to the "significance," and encourages his disciples to do so as well, as if this were the best way to approach poetry.

In the Qing Dynasty (1644-1911) there was a school of poetic criticism called Chang Zhou 常州, which advances the principle of applying *bi* and *xing* in the writing and interpreting of poetry. There are, however, basically two different attitudes towards the application of personal favour or ideas in interpreting poetry, even within the Chang Zhou school. The difference between significance and meaning in phenomenological terminology may also be viewed in this light. The first group considers that a poem should mean this or that, and believes such a reading restores the original meanings of the author. More often than not, this kind of attitude attributes allegories to the lines. The second approach, on the contrary, holds that everyone is entitled to assign imports to a poem, with the understanding that this is not necessarily the author's intention. This idea is very much in line with that of Confucius.[49] It follows that two more concepts need to be differentiated. To apply allegorical interpretation in a reading is not the same as the *xing* style of reading. It should be noted that, when the *xing* concept is applied to a reading, it emphasizes

---

[48] See *W. Dilthey: Selected Writings*, ed. and trans. by H. P. Rickman (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1976), pp. 233-242.

[49] Wang Fuzi also thinks that every poem presents a kaleidoscopic series of impressions, and that no poem contains a single, invariable "meaning." To Wang, the role a reader plays in the activity of poetry is crucial. In the interpretation of poetry, the utter openness of possibilities must be entertained. See the translation and comments in Wong, "*Ch'ing* and *Ching* in the Critical Writings of Wang Fu-chih," pp. 140-144. The theory of the Chang Zhou school, however, is more well-known, and probably more influential in the Qing Dynasty.

spontaneity and there should not be a fixed direction as to where the interpretation goes. It depends primarily on the reader, and the inspirational power of the text.

A representative scholar of the Chang Zhou school, Zhou Ji 周濟 (1781-1839), manages to demarcate the line between a *xing* approach in reading and an allegorical reading that claims to be the author's intention:

> The poet should use his imagination like a spiderweb to catch flying flower petals [...] Once he has put it into practice, the feeling he has to convey in his *tz'u*, where circumstances are comparable, will come through unimpaired, and centuries later there will be no missing his message [...] The reader of such a poem is like a man standing on the edge of a pool admiring the fish, who wonders whether it is a bream or a carp; or like someone exposed to a lightning flash in the dark, unable to tell whether it came from the east or the west.[50]

The comparison of the poet's ability to respond to things outside that of a spiderweb catching flying flower petals is vital in understanding the magic of *xing*, which allows nothing to escape, in a way, without taking it as a triggering force for poetic thoughts. This is related to the creative process. But it is precisely because the poet's feeling is stirred and he thus attributes meanings to things that the reader's emotion, on the other hand, may also be roused by the objects described, though not necessarily in the same manner. As the examples in the quotation above show, readers react in different ways to the images, as unrestricted and independent as the poet himself in responding to the outside world. The viewers look at the same phenomenon and see carp or bream, depending on their "eyesight," personalities or experience. Presumably, the more complex the images are, the more associations readers could have, and the more interpretations they could come up with. This kind of theory, allowing freedom for the reader yet upholding the inaccessibility of the original meaning, reminds one of the theories of Fish and Iser.

---

[50] Chia-ying Yeh Chao, "The Ch'ang-chou [Chang Zhou] School of *Tz'u* Criticism," in *Chinese Approaches to Literature from Confucius to Liang Ch'i-ch'ao* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1978), pp. 178-179. The passage quoted is Chia-ying Yeh Chao's translation. Chia-ying Yeh Chao gave an inspiring study on the similarity between the Chang Zhou school and Phenomenology, and I owe the idea for this comparison to her.

What is more important is that reading a text is not like seeing carp or bream that could be spotted at a glance. The reader has to go through a process that takes a period of time, no matter how short it is. As Iser observes:

> [...] the whole text can never be perceived at any one time. In this respect it differs from given objects, which can generally be viewed or at least conceived as a whole. The 'object' of the text can only be imagined by way of different consecutive phases of reading. We always stand outside the given object, whereas we are situated inside the literary text [...] instead of a subject-object relationship, there is a moving viewpoint which travels along inside that which it has to apprehend.[51]

The reader may, therefore, decide for himself whether it is a carp or a bream that he likes to see. The next time he sees it, moreover, the thing may become a different fish, or more than that meets the eye. Iser remarks in another article:

> With all literary texts, then, we may say that the reading process is selective, and the potential text is infinitely richer than any of its individual realizations. This is borne out by the fact that a second reading of a piece of literature often produces a different impression from the first.[52]

The process can never be called finished, and Iser talks of this inexhaustible nature of reading:

> These gaps have a different effect on the process of anticipation and retrospection, and thus on the 'gestalt' of the virtual dimension, for they may be filled in different ways. For this reason, one text is potentially capable of several different realizations, and no reading can ever exhaust the full potential, for each individual reader will fill in the gaps in his own way, thereby excluding the various other possibilities; as he reads, he will make his own decision as to how the gap is to be filled. In this very act the dynamics of reading are revealed. By making his decision he implicitly acknowledges the inexhaustibility of the text; at the same time it is this very inexhaustibility that forces him to make his decision.[53]

---

[51] Wolfgang Iser, *The Act of Reading* (London: Routledge, 1978) pp. 108-109.
[52] Wolfgang Iser, "The Reading Process," in *The Implied Reader*, p. 280.
[53] Iser, "The Reading Process," in *The Implied Reader*, p. 278.

When Iser writes about the process of reading, he emphasizes the blanks a reader has to fill in to make sense out of the text. He is not just passively seeing one thing for another, but actively involved in the process of making "meaning:"

> He is drawn into the events and made to supply what is meant from what is not said. What is said only appears to take on significance as a reference to what is not said; it is the implications and not the statements that give shape and weight to the meaning.[54]

On the other hand, the Chang Zhou school, which starts from advocating *bi* and *xing* interpretation, also ends up with upholding a policy of open reading. As Zhou Ji writes, again, on the reader's rights: "The important thing is that the reader can draw something from the poem that is right [...] if he [the poet] provides metaphors and similes that enable the reader, with the poem's help, to get to a truth, I am delighted to accept it [...]"[55] Here Zhou singles out the importance of "the poem," that is, the text, as a source for "meanings." Tan Xian 譚獻 ("T'an Hsien" in Rickett's translation 1832-1901), another Chang Zhou critic, pushes this theory even further by saying, "In the extreme case it does not matter what the author meant, the reader being free to interpret as he likes."[56]

In the twentieth century the famous critic Wang Guowei 王國維 (1887-1927) criticized the founder of the Chang Zhou school Zhang Huiyan (1761-1802) 張惠言's pedantic way of reading poetry and says:

> How absurd was Chang Hui-yen [Zhang Huiyan]'s treatment of *tz'u*. Wen T'ing-yun's *tz'u* to the tune of 'P'u-sa man,' Ou-yang Hsiu's *tz'u* to the tune of 'Tieh-lien-hua' and Su Shih's *tz'u* to the tune of 'Pu-suan-tzu' were all evocative expressions of sentiment with no hidden meaning implied, but they were given abstruse and involved interpretations by Chang.[57]

---

[54] Wolfgang Iser, *Prospecting* (Baltimore: John Hopkins University Press, 1989), pp. 33-34.
[55] Chao, "The Ch'ang-chou School of Tz'u Criticism," p. 183.
[56] Chao, "The Ch'ang-chou School of Tz'u Criticism," p. 183.
[57] Rickett, *Wang Kuo-wei's Jen-chien Tz'u-hua*, p. 78.

Wang himself, however, shows such an attitude in reading the *ci* poems.[58]

What makes Wang's arbitrary interpretations different from Zhang Huiyan's approach is that although like Zhang he takes a poetic line out of its context and uses it as a point of departure for far-fetched applications, he knows from the outset that this is not necessarily the original meaning, and the original authors "would have demurred" at such a reading, but he still does it this way nonetheless. After all, who is going to stop him? As seen above, one of the functions of poetry, according to Confucius, is *xing*, to arouse people's emotions.

---

[58] Wang wrote:

> Throughout the ages all those who have been highly successful in great ventures and in the pursuit of learning must of necessarily have [successively] experienced three kinds of *ching-chieh* [realms or worlds].
>
> Last night the west wind shrivelled the green-clad trees,
> Alone I climb the tower
> To gaze my fill along the road to the horizon.
>
> expresses the first stage (*ching*).
>
> My clothes grow daily more loose, yet care I not.
> For you am I thus wasting away in sorrow and pain.
>
> expresses the second state.
>
> I sought her in the crowd a hundred, a thousand times.
> Suddenly with a turn of the head [I saw her],
> That one there where the lamplight was fading.
>
> expresses the third state. Such words as these could not have been uttered by other than great *tz'u* writers. However, if we happened to use this idea [of ching-chieh] to explain the meaning of the poems themselves, I am afraid Yen Shu, Ou-yang Hsiu, and Hsin Ch'i-chi would have demurred.

See Rickett, *Wang Kuo-wei's Jen-chien Tz'u-hua*, p. 50.

The first stage is when the individual starts a career or something and finds that it is going to be a ong and lonely trip, while in the second stage the individual persists despite the odds. The third stage ignifies success, which comes unexpectedly after numerous set-backs and prolonged defeat.

Reception Theorists in general share similarities to Wang Guowei and the Chang Zhou school, except the inflexible attitude of Zhang Huiyen. Fish holds that reading is not a matter of discovering what the text means, but a process of experiencing what it does to you.[59] What the text does to us, however, is actually a matter of what we do to it, a question of interpretation; the object of critical attention is the structure of the reader's experience, not any "objective" structure to be found in the work itself. Iser argues that different readers are free to actualize the work in different ways, and there is no single correct interpretation which will exhaust its semantic potential.[60]

In the case of translation, however, there is always the original text that can be set against the translated version, and "mis-readings" here and there may be spotted. But then, according to Hirsch, the author's meaning is something private, something that cannot be obtained by the reader anyway.[61] Seen from this angle no reader can claim to have access to the author's original intention. The reader may produce various significances, but they are not to be equated with meanings, which belong to the original writer exclusively.

Although Gadamer holds quite a different view as to the accessibility of the intention of the original writer from Hirsch, he nonetheless arrives at a conclusion that the meaning of a work is not exhausted by the author.[62] The most pertinent argument Gadamer makes in connection with translation is that he sees new meanings generated when a work is transferred to another culture in spite of the original writer's intention, thus providing a theoretical basis for the translator's interpretations. The work therefore is an indefinite

---

[59] Stanley Fish, "Literature in the Reader: Affective Stylistics" in Jane Tompkins, *Reader Response Criticism* (Baltimore: Johns Hopkins University Press, 1980), pp. 70-100.
[60] See the discussions in Iser, "The Reading Process," in *The Implied Reader*, pp. 274-294.
[61] See E. D. Hirsch, *Validity in Interpretation* (New Haven: Yale University Press, 1976), pp. 10-23, 81-108, and 166-169.
[62] See the discussions in Hans-Georg Gadamer, *Truth and Method* (London: Sheed & Ward, 1975), pp. 269-337.

source of new readings. Gadamer puts great emphasis on tradition, and considers that only when our historical horizon meets with the one within which the work was written can we have an understanding of the work. But in the case of transferring a work from one culture to a totally different one, the historical perspective, hence the true understanding by Gadamer's definition, can never be obtained as such. It is therefore both in the Chinese tradition of *xing* and modern Reader Response theory that reading is only a generating of meanings, or significances to be more exact.

Chapter 4

Translating *Xing*

Adele Austin Rickett has linked her experience of teaching Chinese literature and the translation of it together. She found that by using ready-made materials the result is not all that satisfactory:

> The survey course of Chinese literature in translation for the Western student has been made immensely easier to teach since the publication from the early 1960's on of an increasing number of translations and general studies [...] the fact still remains, however, that the student can only see the poetry as the translator portrays it. The moment one English word or phrase is chosen, the other possibilities are inevitably barred from the reader's experience.[1]

In order to "involve the student directly in the reading of a Chinese poem," she designed some translation exercises. She wrote out the characters of the poem line by line, providing an English equivalent below each character.[2] She found that students who know some Chinese "tend to produce more literal translations," while those feel no such restrictions would let their minds wander freely. Sometimes they catch the original flavour with amazing insight.[3] And "by the end of the exercise they have all learned a great deal more about the poem than could have been possible if they had simply read one or another translation."

It is interesting to note that, be it a conscious effort or not, the two poems she used in class and gave as examples in her paper are very much related to *xing* presentation, and

---

[1] Adele Austin Rickett, "A 'Translation' Exercise in Chinese Poetry," *Journal of Chinese Language Teachers Association* 9.1 (April 1974), 4-12 (p. 4).

[2] By sticking to basic word equivalents she hoped to leave room for interpretations. For some poems she did not provide notes to clarify the images, because she had found that the images became more significant when their meaning was explained in the class in relation to "erroneous assumptions" coming out of Western patters of thought.

for that matter the reading of them also involved some kind of *xing* concept. It is also important to note that most of the students were not studying literature, and it is unlikely that they were conscious of the notion of *xing* in relation to the writing and interpreting of poems. The first poem she gave is from *Shijing* about the dead deer, and she noted that she selected this poem because she was struck by the wide divergence of interpretation displayed by the various translations in print.[4]

In the previous chapter it was suggested that the dead doe is a kind of *xing* that

---

[3] Rickett remarked that other times the students "must be brought back to earth in class." Rickett, "A 'Translation' Exercise in Chinese Poetry," p. 4.

[4] Rickett, "'Translation' Exercise in Chinese Poetry," p. 6. The first stanza, as it was given to students, is as follows:

野 Wilds	有 there is	死 dead	麕 doe	
白 White	茅 grass	包 bind	之 it	
有 There is	女 girl	懷 cherishing	春 spring (feelings)	
吉 Fine	士 gentleman	誘 entice	之 her	
野 Wilds	有 there is	死 dead	麌 deer	
白 White	茅 grass	純 wrap	束 bind	
有 There is	女 girl	如 like	玉 jade	
舒 Slowly	而 particle	脫 gently	脫 gently	兮 particle
無 Do not	感 move	我 my	帨 handkerchief	兮 particle
無 Do not	使 cause	尨 dog	也 particle	吠 bark

introduces the story.[5] Though Rickett does not mention the term *xing* in her paper, the discussion in the classroom was very much around the relation between the dead deer and the seduction of the girl. Rickett comments:

> Discussion of this poem move in circles unless one realized that this is not-- or not merely-- a narrative. These two like and unlike images lie side by side in time as well as place. Indeed, this is the whole point and meaning-- that they lie side by side: the girl beautiful as jade at the moment of most intense life [...] there beside it in the same scene, the same time, that other body slender as hers, soft as hers, but dead, not alive, and covered not with love but with white grasses. But what then is the emotion of the poem? Grief for the dead doe? Amusement at the giggling girl? Neither the one nor the other. The emotion is in the place between-- the place where they are together-- where they meet [...][6]

She summarized seven interpretations given by what she called the "pros" "in the field of Chinese studies" before she described her students' discussions in class and subsequent translation homework, which pointed to various directions as to the relations between the dead deer and the love scene. When the existing translations by the "pros" are finally distributed, the students "are always delighted to find that the wide range of interpretation represented by their own efforts is not at all strange."[7]

---

[5] The poem quoted in the previous chapter is as follows:

> In the wilds, a dead doe;
> White rushes to wrap it.
> A girl harboring spring lust;
> A fine man to seduce her.
>
> In the woods, bushes grow;
> In the wilds, a dead deer.
> White rushes in bundles;
> A girl like jade.
>
> Gently, take it easy and slow;
> Don't tug at my sash.
> Don't make the dog bark.

Archibald MacLeish, *Poetry and Experience* (Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 1961), p. 60.

[6] Rickett, "'Translation" Exercise in Chinese Poetry,' p. 6.

[7] Rickett, "'Translation' Exercise in Chinese Poetry," p. 7.

"One of the more unusual renderings" by the students, as Rickett writes, "was an attempt at a haiku:"

Tied doe lies on ice,
While girl of jade shines softly.
Have care! Do not move!

This is reminiscent of Pound's rendition of the "Fan-piece" by reducing the descriptions in the original into a few representing details. Yet it still betrays some intellectual deciphering by inserting the adverb "while" at the beginning of the second line. The following, as Rickett observes, is "a very Western-oriented rendition:"

A young couple wanders in the forest;
They stop to make love;
Her purity is violated--
She seeks true love;
He desires only physical pleasure.

The young girl lies still and silent;
Realizing what has just happened;
Praying that it is not so,
Not wanting him to leave her.

Here the dead deer disappears altogether, and the focus now is exclusively on the identity and relationship between the man and woman, rather than the relationship between natural and human scenes. The dead deer, in other words, is regarded as extraneous.

The relationship between the dead deer and the girl, however, is more an analogical one in William Jennings' 1891 rendition, and bears greater similarity to *bi* than *xing*. The title, "The Cunning Hunter," already reveals some kind of connection between the dead deer ("gazelle" in William Jennings' translation) and the girl:

In the wild there lies a dead gazelle,
With the reed-grass round it wrapt;
And a maid who loveth springtide well
By a winsome youth is trapped.

In the wood thick undergrowth is found,
In the wild the dead gazelle,
With the reed-grass round its body bound;--
And the maid she lookth well.

"Ah! gently, not so fast, good sir;
My kerchief, prithee, do not stir;
Nor rouse the barking of my cur."[8]

In the first two stanzas the "and's," which are inserted by the translator, betray a logical analogy. Furthermore, in the original the man who seduces the girl is not necessarily the one who killed the deer, let alone the "cunning hunter" mentioned in the title. Had MacLeish read this version instead of the one he quoted, he might not have found too much resemblance between the presentation of this poem and that of the "Western Wind."

In Ezra Pound's translation in 1955 the *xing* mode also cannot be found:

Lies a dead deer on yonder plain
whom white grass covers,
A melancholy maid in spring
is luck
for lovers.[9]

In the second stanza:

Where the scrub elm skirts the wood,
be it not in white mat bound,
as a jewel flawless found,
dead as doe is maidenhood.[10]

The translator has stepped in and done the job of linking the dead deer and the maiden for the reader. One of the crucial characteristics of *xing* is that the skeleton in the lines are left for the reader to concretize. As a reader Pound may have done his job well, but as a

[8] William Jennings, *The Shi King: The Old "Poetry Classic" of the Chinese* (London: Routledge, 1891), pp. 51-52.
[9] Ezra Pound, *The Classic Anthology Defined by Confucius* (London: Faber and Faber, 1955), p. 10.
[10] Pound, *The Classic Anthology*, p. 11.

translator he seems to leave little space for his own readers to fill in.

Chinese translators have done similar things in their translations. They may insert some logical connection between the natural object and the human feeling as well. These are the first two stanzas translated by Xu Yuanzhong in 1988:

> An antelope is killed
> And wrapped in white afield.
> A maid for love does long,
> Tempted by the hunter strong.
>
> He cuts down trees amain
> And kills a deer again.
> He sees the white-drest maid
> As beautiful as jade.[11]

While Pound rationalizes the relationship between the slain deer and lost maidenhood, Xu uses the created "hunter" as a pivotal figure to link the strength of a young man and the admiration by the young woman together. In the first stanza of the original there is no trace of a hunter. It only says there was a dead antelope. Nor is it mentioned that the deer was killed by anybody. It was simply lying there. What is altered most is the intrusion into the consciousness of the maid. The one who killed the deer (it might not have been "killed," to begin with) is not necessarily the same man who wooed the girl, and the so called temptation by the "hunter strong" immediately creates an ostensible connection between the deer hunting and the courtship, which disregards the *xing* mode.

The second stanza focuses on the consciousness of the young man. It is he who acts. After the fabricated heroic deed, he turns to something more romantic, and finds the lady. All in all, there is still the urge to provide some kind of connection between the two incidents that have no apparent connection in the poem. Translators east and west sometimes have similar "calling" to "make sense" out of the seemingly ambiguous.

Wu-chi Liu's translation published in 1975, on the other hand, seems to preserve

---

[11] Xu Yuanzhong,, *On Chinese Verse in English Rhyme* (Beijing: Peking University Press, p. 1992), p. 42.

the *xing* mode. These are his first two stanzas:

In the wilds there is a dead doe;
In white rushes it is wrapped.
There was a girl longing for spring;
A fine gentleman seduced her.

In the woods there are tree stumps;
In the wilds lies a dead deer,
Wrapped and bound with white rushes.
There was a girl fair as jade.[12]

The relationship between the dead deer and the girl remains to be intuited only.

James Legge's version of the first poem of *Shijing* (first published in 1871) runs like this:

Kwan-kwan go the ospreys,
On the islet in the river.
The modest, retiring, virtuous, young lady:-
For our prince a good mate she.

Here long, there short, is the duckweed,
To the left, to the right, borne about by the current.
The modest, retiring, virtuous, young lady:-
Waking and sleeping, he sought her.

He sought her and found her not,
And waking and sleeping he thought about her.
Long he thought; oh! long and anxiously;
On his side, on his back, he turned, and back again.

Here long, there short, is the duckweed;
On the left, on the right, we gather it.
The modest, retiring, virtuous, young lady:-
With lutes, small and large, let us give her friendly welcome.

Here long, there short, is the duckweed;
On the left, on the right, we cook and present it.
The modest, retiring, virtuous young lady:-
With bells and drums let us show our delight in her.[13]

---

[12] "In the Wilds There Is a Dead Doe," trans. by Wu-chi Liu, in *Sunflower Splendor: Three Thousand years of Chinese Poetry*, co-edited by Wu-chi Liu and Irving Yucheng Lo (Garden City: Anchor Press/ Doubleday, 1975), pp. 5-6.

[13] *Gems of Classical Chinese Poetry in Various English Translations*, ed. by Lu Shu-xiang and Xu

Yuanzhong (Hong Kong: Joint Publishing Co. Ltd., 1988), pp. 2-3. A word-for-word translation of the original is:

關	關	雎	鳩
Kwan	kwan	(osprey)	
在	河	之	洲
In	river	particle	islet
窈	窕	淑	女
(Beautiful)		virtuous	lady
君	子	好	逑
(Gentleman)		good	mate
參	差	荇	菜
(Uneven)		(duckweed)	
左	右	流	之
Left	right	flow	particle
窈	窕	淑	女
(Beautiful)		virtuous	lady
寤	寐	求	之
Sleeping	waking	seek	particle
求	之	不	得
Seek	particle	not	possible
寤	寐	思	服
Sleeping	waking	think	particle
悠	哉	悠	哉
Long	particle	long	particle
輾	轉	反	側
Turns		around	side
參	差	荇	菜
(Uneven)		(duckweed)	
左	右	采	之
Left	right	gather	it
窈	窕	淑	女
(Beautiful)		virtuous	lady
琴	瑟	友	之
(Lutes)		friend	her

This lyric is divided into several stanzas, and most of the stanzas begin with a natural scene which is followed up, without any overt logical or grammatical connectives, by a description of a specific human situation. In each stanza, besides the third, there seems to be an implied correspondence between the natural scene and the human situation. What is peculiar about the *xing* mode is that there should be a spontaneous reaction to the natural scene. The speaker is always struck by the scene, without being directed to it overtly. "Kwan-kwan," the sound of the birds, are exactly the opening words of the Chinese original. Any attempt in clarifying, explaining, or simply rationalizing the situation, especially in construing a relationship between the natural scene and the human situation would defeat the purpose of *xing*, and change the mode to *bi*.

In the first stanza of James Legge's version, there is no explicit link between the crying osprey in the first two lines and the description of the lady in the next two lines. The Chinese phrase *haoqiu* 好逑 in the fourth line, meaning "a good match," is rendered as "a good mate" by James Legge. "Mate," however, is reminiscent of "mating," thus echoing the crying ospreys in the opening lines. Though the link between the ospreys and the human affair here is more obvious than in the original, there is no explicit indication

---

參 (Uneven)	差	荇 (duckweed)	菜
左 Left	右 right	芼 catch	之 it
窈 (Beautiful)	窕	淑 virtuous	女 lady
鐘 Bells	鼓 drums	樂 gladden	之 her

that the two events are related. The only hint is from the double meaning of the word "mate," which, however, comes at the end of the stanza, not at the beginning nor in the transition between the two events.

In the second stanza of James Legge's version, the correlation between the natural scene and the human affair is also more apparent than in the original. In the original, the natural scene is less indicative of the troubled mind, because the Chinese phrase *cenci* 參差 simply means "uneven," whereas the lines "Here long, there short, is the duckweed,/ To the left, to the right, borne about by the current," tend to echo the yearning heart shown in the fourth line, "Waking and sleeping, he sought her." The *xing* mode, however, is basically preserved in the first two stanzas of James Legge's version. As in the original, there is no depiction of natural scene in the third stanza. In the fourth and fifth stanzas, the point of view of the speaker changes to that of a first person plural form without apparent reason, but the relationship between the natural scene and the human affair remains implicit, keeping the *xing* mode intact.

William Jennings gave the following version in 1891:

Waterfowl their mates are calling,
On the islets in the stream.
Chaste and modest maid! fit partner
For our lord (thyself we deem).

Waterlilies, long or short ones,--
Seek them left and seek them right.
'Twas this chaste and modest maiden
He hath sought for, morn and night.
Seeking for her, yet not finding,
Night and morning he would yearn
Ah, so long, so long!--and restless
On his couch would toss and turn.

Waterlilies, long or short ones,--
Gather, right and left, their flowers.

Now the chaste and modest maiden
Lute and harp shall hail as ours.
Long or short the waterlilies,
Pluck them left and pluck them right.
To the chaste and modest maiden
Bell and drum shall give delight.[14]

Each stanza also begins with a natural scene, but its relationship with the human situation, though unstated, is sometimes too explicit in view of *xing*.

There are three stanzas in Jennings' version. In the first stanza, the calling of the waterfowl mates and the yearning for the maid who is "fit partner/ For our lord" are so closely related that there is not much need for the reader to put them together, while the *xing* mode, which favours its subtlety, usually requires the active participation of the reader in associating the natural scene with the human situation. In the Chinese original the crying birds and the human event are only remotely linked, for it only says, after an initial depiction of the crying birds, that the fair lady will be a perfect match for the gentleman (instead of saying that the gentleman is chasing his lady too, like the crying birds).

In the second stanza, the word "seek" is repeated, suggesting that the human world correlates to the natural world: "Seek them left and seek them right/ [...] He hath sought for, morn and night/ [...] Seeking for her [...]" It is obvious that the seeking for the lady and the seeking for the waterlilies are meant to be parallel. The third line of the second stanza, "'Twas this chaste [...]" also hints that what was happening now in the human world is related to what was described earlier. The seventh line of the second stanza, "Ah, so long, so long [...]" is remotely reminiscent of the opening line of this stanza, "Waterlilies, long or short ones." The close tie between the natural scene and the human world is often suggested in this stanza.

The third stanza opens once again with the line "Waterlilies, long or short ones," implicitly reinforcing the sense of longing presented earlier in the poem, followed yet by

[14] Jennings, *The Shi King*, pp. 35-36.

another description in the fifth line, "Long or short [...]" There is an attempt to correlate the human world and the natural scene throughout the poem, although no explicatory details are given. The connection between the two worlds is more visible than that of the original, and there is less demand on the part of the reader to join them together.

Arthur Waley rendered the poem as follow in 1939:

"Fair, fair," cry the ospreys
On the island in the river.
Lovely is this noble lady,
Fit bride for our lord.

In patches grows the water mallow;
To left and right one must seek it.
Shy was this noble lady;
Day and night he sought her.

Sought her and could not get her;
Day and night he grieved.
Long thoughts, oh, long unhappy thoughts,
Now on his back, now tossing on to his side.

In patches grows the water mallow;
To left and right one must gather it.
Shy is this noble lady;
With great zithern and little we hearten her.

In patches grows the water mallow;
To left and right one must choose it.
Shy is this noble lady;
With gongs and drums we will gladden her.[15]

The sequence of events is still in the same order of the original: outside first and inside (the mind) second. The person is moved by a natural scene, as the *xing* mode always has it. But to assign "Fair, fair" as the sound of the birds, Waley is letting the cat out of the bag, revealing what will happen next (because of the meaning of the word "fair"), and is thus creating a connection between the first and third lines, that is, the sound of the bird and the fairness of the lady, and such a connection is little help to the construction of

[15] Arthur Waley, *The Book of Songs* (London: George Allen & Unwin Ltd, 1937), pp. 81-82.

xing.

The second line of the second stanza, "To left and right one must seek it," gives a sense of compulsion and determination, suggesting that one has to take action, which is absent in the original. The correlation of the natural scene and the human situation (that he was seeking her), is also implied. Lines showing similar resolve, "To left and right one must gather it," and "To left and right one must choose it," appear in the fourth and fifth stanzas respectively, hinting at the human desire. There are no explanatory words, however, to join the natural and human worlds throughout the poem.

Other translators may have paid even less attention to the *xing* presentation. C. F. R. Allen, for example, published the following version in 1891:

> They sent me to gather the cresses, which lie
> And sway on the stream, as it glances by,
> That a fitting welcome we might provide
> For our prince's modest and virtuous bride.
>
> I heard, as I gathered the cress, from the ait
> The mallard's endearing call to its mate;
> And I said, as I heard it, "Oh may this prove
> An omen of joy to our master's love!"
>
> Long, long for his bride has the prince been yearning,
> With such desire has his heart been burning,
> That his thoughts by day and his dreams by night
> Have had but her as his sole delight.
>
> But a doubt tormented his anxious brain,
> And sleep was banished by aching pain,
> As tossing in fear and distress he lay
> Till the long night watches had passed away.
>
> And how he has won her, this lady fair,
> With her modest mind and her gracious air.
> Let our lutes and our music and feasting show
> The love we to her and our master owe.[16]

The translator seems to have an inclination to account for the cause and effect of events,

[16] Lu and Xu, *Gems of Classical Chinese Poetry in Various English Translations*, p. 4.

to spell out the relationship between things clearly, and when there is insufficient information in the original, he does not hesitate to supply some of his own. This is precisely how *xing*, which requires spontaneity, is lost.

The first stanza is an example of the translator's rational mind at work. The event of gathering cresses is given a purpose, which is absent in the original. There are some people in charge of the wedding, and the speaker is only a person working for the ceremony, a well-designed scheme. The crying birds which appear in the first stanza in the original are now put in the second stanza. They are being heard at a time when the speaker has a clear goal in mind (to gather the cress for the wedding), and the speaker immediately links their presence to the occasion. He said to himself that he wishes their call might prove an omen of joy to his master's love. Things that happened are accounted for. They are given a clear function.

While there is no natural scene in the third stanza, C. F. R. Allen also tries to make the narration more logical by using the pattern "With such desire [...]/ That his thoughts [...]" to relate one thing to another. The cause-and-effect description is followed by the smooth transitional words in the fifth stanza, "But [...]/ And [...]/ As [...]/ Till [...]" The information in the last stanza is also presented in a smooth and logical manner, "And [...]/ Let [...]" The original simply provides factual statements without logical connectives.

Some translators eschew the *xing* style sometimes by the kind of language they use, sometimes by supplying extra information to connect the natural scene and the human situation. This is Witter Bynner's translation that came out in 1929:

> On the river-island--
> The ospreys are echoing us
> Where is the pure-hearter girl
> To be our princess?
>
> Long lotus, short lotus,
> Leaning with the current,
> Turns like our prince in his quest
> For the pure-hearted girl.

He has sought and not found her.
Awake, he has thought of her,
Asleep, he has dreamed of her,
Dreamed and tossed in his sleep.

Long lotus, short lotus,
Pluck it to left and to right,
And make ready with lutes and with harps
For the pure-hearted girl.

Long lotus, short lotus,
Cook it for a welcome,
And be ready with bells and with drums
For the pure-hearted girl.[17]

The prepositional phrase at the beginning points to a direction, which provides a sense of rationality to the background. What is striking about this poem is not so much the implicit correspondence between the sound of the bird (or the gathering of plants) and the lovesick scene, as the natural way in which such correspondence is achieved. Analogical language is absent in the original.

The ospreys are there to echo the human mind, as the speaker points out to the reader. In the second stanza the lotus is also likened to the human situation, and the translator adds some images to make the comparison meaningful. It is the lotus which "leans with the current" and "turns like our prince in his quest" for the lady, while in the original the plants just flow to the left and to the right. The alteration to the last stanza serves a logical purpose: the lotus, instead of just being there, is being cooked for the welcome ceremony.

Xu Yuanzhong gave the following version in 1988:

By riverside a pair
Of turtledoves are cooing;
There is a maiden fair
A good young man is wooing.

Water flows left and right
Of cresses here and there;
The youth yearns day and night

[17] Lu and Xu, *Gems of Classical Chinese Poetry in Various English Translations*, pp. 5-6.

For the maiden so fair.

His yearning grows so strong
That he can't fall asleep;
He tosses all night long,
So deep in love, so deep!

Now gather left and right
The cresses sweet and tender;
O lute, play music bright
For the bride sweet and slender!

Feast friends at left and right
On cresses cooked tender;
Let bells and drums delight
The bride so sweet and slender![18]

The prepositional phrase at the beginning shows a sense of deliberation, while the turtledoves are also described as "a pair" to suggest the "wooing." In the second stanza, the phrases "left and right" and "here and there" in the first two lines match with the phrase "day and night" in the third line, suggesting a parallel relationship between the natural and human world. In the third stanza, a sense of rationality is imparted in the structure "so [...] that [...]" In the last stanza the natural scene of gathering cress in the original is changed to a feast, and the gathered cress is cooked for the occasion. Not only is the natural scene, which is an integral part of *xing*, given up, there is also a fabricated reason for why the cress is gathered.

One can also look at the notion of *xing* from a slightly different angle-- the revelation of a *xing* process through the consciousness of a central figure. A poem by Wang Changling interestingly describes *xing* in operation demonstrated in a young woman's mind.[19] The poem begins with a young woman, who climbs up the stairs of a

---

[18] Lu and Xu, *Gems of Classical Chinese Poetry in Various English Translations*, p. 7.
[19] A word-for-word translation of the poem is:

閨	中	少	婦	不	知	愁
Chamber	inside	young	lady	not	knowing	sadness
春	日	凝	妝	上	翠	樓
Spring	day	gaily	makeup	climb	jade	tower

tower happily in her beautiful make-up in a fine spring day. In the first two lines the reader's attention is drawn to her consciousness, sharing her guileless joy. The third line is a turning point, for the reader, together with the innocent lady, suddenly sees the green willows. Then comes the last line, in which she regrets having sent her husband to the distance for fame and glory. It is the process from her innocent joy to the sudden understanding at the end that is the most striking part of this short poem. There is no explanation as to why she has this awareness after she has seen the green willow.

Some translators have altered the process of epiphany, in different degrees, and Giles' version in 1901 is one of the examples:

> See the young wife whose bosom ne'er
> has ached with cruel pain!--
> In gay array she mounts the tower
> when spring comes round again.
>
> Sudden she sees the willow-trees
> their newest green put on,
> And sighs for her husband far away
> in search of glory gone.[20]

The connective "and " links the sight and the "sighs" together, pointing to a logical connection, suggesting it is the willows that remind her of her husband and the joyful days in the past, hence the sudden sorrow at the end. The word "and" therefore spells out the cause-and-effect relationship between the third and fourth lines, and reveals the correlation between the natural scene and the human feeling.

W. J. B. Fletcher's version in 1918 changes the pattern of *xing* presentation in another way:

忽	見	陌	頭	楊	柳	色
Suddenly	see	field	side	(willow)		colour
悔	教	夫	婿	覓	封	侯
Regret	urge	(husband)		find	(glory)	

[20] Herbert Giles, *Gems of Chinese Literature* (Shanghai: Kelley and Walsh, 1922), p. 348.

Within her peaceful chamber, no care the maid oppressed;
Until the verdant Tower she climbed one springtide, gaily dressed.
The stir of sprouting foliage beyond the street she saw.
Regret she'd sent her love to fame rose swelling in her brest.[21]

The word "until" in the second line suggests that something undesirable is impending. The word "stir" at the beginning of the third line once again points out the relationship between nature and man to the reader. Meanwhile, the sense of suddenness towards the end is not clear, and the awareness of the lady comes smoothly, without showing a sudden illumination. It is the human mind which is suddenly struck by some scene in nature that characterizes *xing*.

Compared to the above versions, the *xing* mode in Witter Bynner's translation in 1929 is even less visible:

Too young to have learned what sorrow means,
Attired for spring, she climbs to her high chamber...
The new green of the street-willows is wounding her heart--
Just for a title she sent him to war.[22]

"Wounding her heart," which is added by the translator, establishes a clearly defined cause-and-effect relationship between what she sees and what she feels. This is more of a telling than a showing presentation. The sense of regret and sudden illumination at the end also disappears.

Turner's rendition reads:

A lady fair that nothing knows of care
In bright array
On a springtime day
Mounts to the tower of her leaf-emerald bower.

Sudden she sees the wayside willow trees
In light hues clad:

[21] W. J. B. Fletcher, *Gems of Chinese Verse* (New York: Paragon Book Reprint Corp., 1966), p. 150.
[22] Witter Bynner and Kiang Kang-hu, *The Jade Mountain* (New York: Knopf, 1929), p.180.

And her heart is sad--
She bade her lord win glory of the sword.[23]

The connective "and" in the last but one line suggests a correlation between the beauty of the willow and the lady's sudden illumination, and the sad feeling is directly stated. The punctuation, the colon and the dash in the second stanza, also betray a cause-and-effect connection.

Xing can be taken as practically non-existent in the version by Powys Mathers:

At the head of a thousand roaring warriors
With the sound of gongs,
My husband has departed
Following glory.

At first I was overjoyed
To have a young wife's liberty.

Now I look at the yellowing willow-leaves;
They were green the day he left.
I wonder if he also was glad?[24]

Not only is the sequence of an individual being stimulated all of a sudden by something in nature altered, the translator also makes up extra explicatory details. What is reversed completely are the green willow trees, which are supposed to serve as an igniting power to the human emotion. They are now changed to "yellowing" in order to suit the translator's narrative purpose. It is exactly the juxtaposition of the green willow leaves and the young and yearning heart of the woman that makes the original poem so poignant; it is not some logical deliberation about the contrast between the present and the past.

Waley's version in 1916 reads:

In her boudoir, the young lady, --unacquainted with grief.
Spring day, --best clothes, mounts shining tower.

---

[23] *A Golden Treasury of Chinese Poetry*, trans. by John Turner (Hong Kong: The Chinese University of Hong Kong, 1989), p. 36 .
[24] Powys Mathers, *Love Songs of Asia* (New York: Knopf, 1946), p. 62.

Suddenly sees at the dyke's head, the changed colour of the willows.
Regrets she made her dear husband go to win a fief.[25]

In this translation the process of revelation, hence the irony and the sense of suddenness, is basically retained. There is no verb in the first two lines, and two dashes are used instead. The brief syntax, which is more condensed than that of Waley's later works, also keeps explicatory details to the minimal. In the second line there seems to be an accentuation of her guileless joy. The fact that she is unaware of the impending sorrow is highlighted by the images "best clothes" and "shining tower." In the original it only says something like beautiful clothes and tower. The contrast between her joy and sorrow is also made sharper by saying that it is her "dear husband" that she misses, while in the original it just says "her husband."

The following poem, which is one of the most translated ones with many different attempts at it, also indirectly suggests how *xing* operates in the poet's mind. The earliest version was done by Lin Yutang in the 30s:

In my young days, I had tasted only gladness,
But loved to mount the top floor,
But loved to mount the top floor,
To write a song pretending sadness.

And now I've tasted sorrow's flavours, bitter and sour,
And can't find a word,
And can't find a word,
But merely say, "What a golden autumn hour!"[26]

---

[25] Arthur Waley, *Chinese Poems* (London: George Allen and Unwin Ltd, 1946), p. 62.
[26] Xu, *On Chinese Verse in English Rhyme*, p 425. A word-for-word translation of the original is:

少	年	不	識	愁	滋	味	
(Youth)		not	knowing	sorrow		(taste)	
愛		上	層	樓			
Love (to)		climb		(tower)			
愛		上	層	樓			
Love (to)		climb		(tower)			

The original poem functions through the remarkable twist at the very end: instead of saying he is sad, the speaker praises beautiful autumn. What is implicitly said, therefore, is that autumn is the source of sorrow, which is supposedly understood by the reader as well.[27]

The two "but's" in the first stanza, however, suggest that having "tasted only gladness" and having the desire to "mount the top floor" are related. In Chinese poetic tradition, going up the stairs and looking to the distance already suggests sadness, which also means a moment of *xing*, an occasion for poetry. Du Fu's poem on climbing the Yueyang Tower at Lake Dongting mentioned in Chapter 3 is one of the examples. Lin Yutang adds the connective "but" to link the two statements, so the implicit connection between knowing no sorrow and having the desire to mount to the top floor is made obvious. In the second stanza every line begins with a conjunction. There are three "and's" and one "but" altogether, suggesting a relationship among the various statements. In the original, at the end there is a deliberate attempt on the part of the speaker to praise

---

爲	賦	新	詞	強	說	愁
To	write	new	poems	deliberately	speak	sorrow
而	今	識		盡	愁	滋 味
(Now)		know		all	sorrow	(taste)
欲		說		還		休
Want		speak		then		stop
欲		說		還		休
Want		speak		then		stop
卻	道	天	涼	好	箇	秋
Merely	say	weather	cool	nice		(autumn)

[27] Autumn has always been associated with melancholy in Chinese literature. For more discussions of this topic, see Chen Peng-hsiang, "The Tradition and Variation of Autumnal Lamentation," *Tamkang Review* 11.2 (Winter 1980), 111-138; Chen Peng-hsiang, "*Ch'iu* [Autumn] and the Tradition of Literary Melancholy," *Asian Culture Quarterly* 8.3 (Autumn 1980), 59-81; Chen Peng-hsiang, *Thou Hast Thy Music Too: Autumn in Classical English and Chinese Poetry* (Taibei: Lucky Bookstore, 1981);Chen Peng-hsiang, "Autumn and Melancholy in Classical Chinese and English Literature," *Chinese Comparatist* 23.4 (December 1982), 75-85; Chen Peng-hsiang, "Thematology East and West: A Survey and Theoretical Exploration," *Tamkang Review* 14.1-4 (Autumn-Summer 1983-4), 63-84.

the nice autumn, showing an irony and surprising twist, while in Lin's translation the speaker's tone sounds more like having nothing else to say except the weather, as shown in the word "merely."

Chu Dagao's version in 1937 runs:

In my youth I had no idea of what sorrow was,
And loved to go up lofty buildings.
Upon the lofty buildings.
For composing new poems I was forced to talk of sorrow.

Now I know sorrow thoroughly well,
And am loath to talk of it.
Loath to talk of it,
I say instead: "What a chilly autumn day!"[28]

The second line begins with a connective "and," suggesting a connection between this statement and the previous one. In *xing*, the human response to nature always remains unstated. The irony of the original second stanza, on the other hand, lies in the fact that, having passed through the thick and thin in life, the speaker now says something positive on purpose, instead of lamenting the unpleasant weather. The last line in the above rendition is ambiguous as to whether it is an exclamation of joy or sorrow over the unbearable chilly autumn.

The ironic twist of praising the good and cool autumn is also missing in the rendition of Siu-kit Wong in 1984:

In youth I knew not the taste of sorrow;
I loved going up the pavillion,
I loved going up the pavillion,
To make a new poem I made up sorrow.

Now that the taste of sorrow I have known,
I would rather become taciturn,
I would rather become taciturn,
Or say, autumn, rather cool it has grown.[29]

---

[28] Xu, *On Chinese Verse in English Rhyme*, p 425.

The phrase "I would rather" shows a sign of analytical deliberation. In the original the speaker tries to say something but then stops. The action is spontaneous, not a calculating one. In the last stanza of the translation, the descriptive term "taciturn" may sound contradictory to the utterance in the next line ("autumn, rather cool it has grown."), so the translator adds the connective "or" to make the final statement come in a more natural manner. The *xing* mode, however, is altered in this way. There seems to be a trace of logical deliberation in the word "or." The irony of praising the fine autumn after knowing the taste of sorrow is also removed.

Ignoring the fully charged emotion in the season of autumn, John Cayley, fifty years after Lin's translation, rendered the poem in 1984 in this way:

> I am young,
> And much too much in love
> with pleasure
> To know anything of love;
> And yet I force myself to tell
> of "lyric" sorrows.
>
> You are old,
> And they say
> (you hold your peace)
> That you've been "through the mill"
> Strange, you never seem to speak
> of anything but weather.[30]

In the first stanza, the sentence structure, "much too much [...] to," shows a rational mind at work, while the phrase "And yet I force [...]" suggests a connection between this statement and the previous ones. Although there is no personal pronoun in the original, it is understood that the whole poem is narrated consistently from the first person point of view. In a classical Chinese sentence, what is omitted more often than not is the first

---

[29] Xu, *On Chinese Verse in English Rhyme*, p. 428.
[30] Xu, *On Chinese Verse in English Rhyme*, pp. 428-429.

personal pronoun. Omission of the second or third personal pronoun usually takes place when the person concerned has been mentioned, or when there is no ambiguity. The change to a second person narration in the second stanza above, moreover, loses much of the immediacy. But what is more important is the eradication of the autumn feelings related to the *xing* presentation. To speak of weather is just a general way of evading a subject, not exactly the kind of ironical play of praising autumn.

Chinese poems often end with a scene. The critic Zhong Rong (? 483-513) commented that *xing* is when "much has been said, more is left to be pondered over."[31] In the following *ci* poem by the Song poet He Zhu 賀鑄 (1063-1120), the ending, which manifests the essence of *xing*, is a vital part of the presentation of the whole poem; it gives strength, particularly a much larger perspective, not only to the last scene, but epitomizes the mood and atmosphere of the poem. By avoiding a direct statement or any verbal expression, the reticent speaker also manages to invite the audience to come to the front, to join in the creative process.

Chu Dagao gave the following rendition in 1937:

> [...]
> The blue clouds disappearing by degrees and the fragrant fields become
> dark,
> While I compose with my gifted pen heart-rending lines in vain.
> May I ask, "How much do your uneasy thoughts amount?"
> As much as a river full of hazy grass,
> A town full of wind-borne catkins,
> And a sky full of plum-ripening seasonal rain.[32]

---

[31] *Early Chinese Literary Criticism*, ed. and trans. by Siu-kit Wong with a preface by David Hawkes (Hong Kong: Joint Publishing Co., 1983), p. 92.

[32] Xu, *On Chinese Verse in English Rhyme*, p. 387. A word-for-word translation of the original is:

[...]

飛	雲	冉	冉	蘅	皋	暮
Flying	clouds	slowly	slowly	flagrant	field	dust

The poem closes by asking a question, only followed by a depiction of the scene. The answer is literally blowing in the wind, and the rain, and the haze. In this case the wind, the rain, and all are imbued with feelings. The translator uses the phrase "as much as" which is absent in the original to introduce the scene as an answer. Such an interference of the intellect, however, inevitably changes the *xing* mode to that of *bi*, a comparison.

Another translator Xu Yuanzhong ended the poem in a similar manner in 1988:

> If you ask me how deeply I'm love-sick,
> Just see a misty stream where weed grows thick,
> A town o'erflowed with willow-down that wafts on breeze,
> A drizzling rain that yellows all plum trees.[33]

The phrase "Just see" is added by the translator to make clear that this is the answer to the question. Here although there is not the term "as" or "like," the intention to compare, or to demonstrate something with yet another thing, that is, an abstract feeling with some concrete images, is implicitly shown. In the original passage the scene is presented immediately after the question, without any qualification as to what or where it belongs. It could well be a spontaneous encounter of a natural scene by the poet right at the

彩 Coloured	筆 pen	新 newly	題 wrote	斷 broken	腸 guts	句 lines
試 Try	問 ask	閑 idle	愁 feeling	都 all	幾 how	許 much
一 A		川 stream		煙 smoke	草 grass	
滿 whole		城 city		風 wind	絮 catkins	
梅 Plum		子 fruits	黃 yellow	時 time	雨 rain	

[33] Xu, *On Chinese Verse in English Rhyme*, pp. 387-388.

moment after the question is asked, and the answer therefore blends with the atmosphere, hence the feeling, in the way which *xing* is exactly supposed to be.

The *xing* mode usually defies intellectual deliberation, and the brevity and conciseness of the Chinese syntax enhance such a presentation. Translators who add information to connect images or ideas, to make them more intelligible to the target audience, may run the risk of telling too much, thus sacrificing the implicitness of *xing*. The use of regular metre and the poetics that cherished extended meaning before 1915, furthermore, could also impose restriction on the transferring of *xing*, and for that matter the rendering of Chinese poetic scene in general.[34]

[34] Lefevere laments that the use of rigid metre has been responsible for metrical contortions in translations between 1830 and 1930. Lefevere, *Translation, History and Culture*, p. 25. James Dunn also points out the restriction of metres on the translation of Chinese poetry. See James Dunn, "Translation and Poetics: Reciprocal Technologies in the History of Chinese-to-English Transfer," *Tamkang Review* 16.4 (Summer 1986), 381-394.

Chapter 5

The Waley Way

a) The Making of a Myth-Maker

Arthur Waley's achievements were not only in Chinese studies, but in Japanese literature too.[1] He is, however, best known as a translator of Chinese poetry.[2] He was involved in various kinds of academic research at different stages of his career, investigating Chinese art, Japanese drama and novels, but it is impossible to catalogue the exact period of his involvement in translating Chinese poetry for, starting from 1918, he

---

[1] Waley's longest translation, in fact, is the Japanese novel, *The Tale of Genji* (London: Allen & Unwin, 1935), consisting of six volumes.

[2] David Hawkes, for example, observes, "it is as a translator of Chinese poetry that he is justly most famous, and it was no doubt in recognition of this fact that he was awarded the Queen's Medal for poetry in 1953." See David Hawkes, "From the Chinese," in *Madly Singing in the Mountains: An Appreciation and Anthology of Arthur Waley,* ed. with a preface by Ivan Morris (London: George Allen & Unwin Ltd, 1970), p. 46.

The following is a list of Waley's publications and some of his major activities related to his Chinese studies (The sources are mainly from *Madly Singing in the Mountains*):

1917 "A Chinese Picture " in *Burlington Magazine* (first published article).
1917 "Pre-T'ang Poetry" in *Bulletin of the School of Oriental Studies* (first published translation).
1918 *A Hundred and Seventy Chinese Poems* (London: George Allen & Unwin Ltd). (first published book).
1919 *More Translations from the Chinese* (London: George Allen & Unwin Ltd).
1923 *The Temple and Other Poems* (London: George Allen & Unwin Ltd).
1934 *The Way and Its Power* (London: George Allen & Unwin Ltd).
1937 *The Book of Songs* (London: George Allen & Unwin Ltd).
1938 *The Analects of Confucius* (London: George Allen & Unwin Ltd).
1939 *Three Ways of Thought in Ancient China* (London: George Allen & Unwin Ltd).
1942 *Monkey* (London: George Allen & Unwin Ltd).
1946 *Chinese Poems* (London: George Allen & Unwin Ltd).
1948 Appointed Honorary Lecturer in Chinese Poetry at the School of Oriental Studies, London.
1949 *The Life and Times of Po Chu-i* (London: George Allen & Unwin Ltd).
1950 *The Poetry and Career of Li Po* (London: George Allen & Unwin Ltd).
1952 *The Real Tripitaka and Other Pieces* (London: George Allen & Unwin Ltd).
1955 *The Nine Songs: A Study of Shamanism in Ancient China* (London: George Allen & Unwin Ltd).
1956 *Yuan Mei: Eighteenth Century Chinese Poet* (London: George Allen & Unwin Ltd).
1958 *The Opium War through Chinese Eyes* (London: Dufour Editions).
1960 *Ballads and Songs from Tun-Huang: An Anthology* (London: George Allen & Unwin Ltd).
1966 "Colloquial in the Yu-hsien K'u" in *Bulletin of the School of Oriental Studies* (last published article).

showed a lifelong passion for Chinese poetry "that would wreck any [...] attempt at systematization."[3]

According to his own account, Waley went to work in the British Museum, which he had "at that time barely heard of," only because he could not find a better job after he graduated from Cambridge, and someone he happened to know knew there was a vacancy in the Print Room of the Museum. To his own surprise as well as his relatives', he passed the examination for the post, but later he found the job too boring, so when the Print Room was to be divided into European and Oriental Sections, he joined the latter department in order "to escape."[4] If it seems so far that things came in an accidental way, then what followed happened almost too easily:

> I soon found it was very difficult to do the work [...] without some knowledge of both Chinese and Japanese [...] So I got to work to learn both languages simultaneously [...] I soon discovered hundreds of volumes of [Chinese] poetry. I began to make rough translations of poems that I thought would go well in English [...][5]

This account tells us that he learned the source languages with little difficulty, and that his urge to translate, and to publish the translations, came when he was still learning the language. He immediately published-- printed and bound, to be exact, since no publisher was willing to issue it-- his first translations.[6]

Speaking of the "blind spots" of Orientalist studies, Edward Said argues,

> [...] the Orient studied was a textual universe by and large; the impact of the Orient was made through books and manuscripts, not, as in the impress of Greece on the Renaissance, through mimetic artifacts like sculpture and pottery. Even the rapport between an Orientalist and the Orient was textual,

---

[3] His books on Chinese art were published between 1922 and 1931; translations from Japanese were published between 1919 and 1935; 1934-39 were devoted to ancient China and 1956-58 to the 19th century, but his translations from Chinese poetry reveal a lifelong preoccupation. See David Hawkes, "From the Chinese," in *Madly Singing in the Mountains*, pp. 45-51 (p. 46).

[4] Arthur Waley, "Introduction" to *A Hundred and Seventy Chinese Poems* (London: George Allen & Unwin Ltd, 1918), pp 3-4.

[5] Waley, "Introduction" to *A Hundred and Seventy Chinese Poems*, p. 5.

[6] See Herbert Waley, "Recollections of a Younger Brother," in *Madly Singing in the Mountains,* pp. 123-128 (p. 127), and Waley, "Introduction" to *A Hundred and Seventy Chinese Poems*," pp. 5-6.

> so much so that it is reported of some of the early-nineteenth-century German Orientalists that their first view of an eight-armed Indian statue cured them completely of their Orientalist taste. When a learned Orientalist traveled in the country of his specialization, it was always with unshakable abstract maxims about the "civilization" he had studied; rarely were Orientalists interested in anything except proving the validity of these musty "truths" by applying them, without great success, to uncomprehending, hence degenerate, natives.[7]

Said suggests that Orientalists create their own fantasy world, which appears to have been the case with Waley. Having started as a clerk working on the section dealing with Chinese paintings in the British Museum, his first book was published in 1923, *An Introduction to the Study of Chinese Painting.* Many years later he studied Dunhuang literature and artifacts taken from China and published a book, *Ballads and Songs from Tun-Huang: An Anthology*, in 1960. Unlike some of his sinologist colleagues, he never attempted to set foot in China to prove "the validity of these musty 'truths,'" as Said puts it,[8] much less to apply them to the natives. He had, in short, direct access to the materials on the one hand, yet chose to distance himself from the "real place" on the other. The former background undoubtedly gave him a stronger grip of some kind of "reality," at least a certain perception of it, whereas the latter situation reveals his view that the "truths" cannot and are not to be proved.

From the start Waley belonged to institutes that had long traditions of Oriental Studies, and he never worked outside the British Museum and the School of Oriental Studies. According to Said,

> [...] all of Orientalism stands forth and away from the Orient: that Orientalism makes sense at all depends more on the West than on the

[7] Edward Said, *Orientalism: Western Conceptions of the Orient* (New York: Pantheon, 1978), p. 52.
[8] Said, *Orientalism,* p. 52; as to the reason why Waley refused to go to China, see Ivan Morris, "The Genius of Arthur Waley" in *Madly Singing in the Mountains*, pp. 67-87 (p. 80), in which Morris wrote "Raymond Mortimer is surely right when he says that Waley 'felt so much at home in T'ang China [...] that he could not face the modern ugliness amid which one has to seek out the many intact remains of beauty.' He carried his own images of China and Japan within himself and had no wish to dilute them by tourism." Peter Quennell wrote that "he [Waley] refused to visit the Far East, despite many urgent invitations-- presumably because he did not choose to destroy his visionary images of Japan and China-- so all the works of art that he required he carried around with him inside his own brain." See Peter Quennell, "A Note on Arthur Waley" in Morris, *Madly Singing in the Mountains*, pp. 88-92 (pp. 89-90).

> Orient, and this sense is directly indebted to various Western techniques of representation that make the Orient visible, clear, "there" in discourse about it. And these representations rely upon institutions, traditions, conventions, agreed-upon codes of understanding for their effects, not upon a distant and amorphous Orient.[9]

What is crucial is not the "truth," but the representation. The Orientalist makes the Orient speak, and deciphers its enigma to the West, from a distance. Waley also tried to make the Orient visible and clear "away from the Orient." One of the traditions and conventions of making the Orient distinctive and distant was to make it different, and the institutions upon which Western representations rely reinforce such conventions, which started with the first contacts between England and China in the seventeenth century.[10] The characteristic of Waley's effort was to represent, in response more to the needs of the target system than to the needs of the source culture.[11]

b) The Making of a Myth

Ivan Morris's essay "The Genius of Arthur Waley" opens with these words:

> When Arthur Waley's first translations of Chinese poems were privately printed in 1916, the literatures of China and Japan were the preserve of specialists and of dabblers in quaint exotica. Now, half a century later, they have become part of the main stream of intelligent reading in the West, so that a knowledge of classical Chinese poetry and [...] are as essential to any broad, humanistic education as Homer and Virgil. Without Waley's books

---

[9] Said, *Orientalism*, pp. 21-22.

[10] For details see the discussion in Chapter 1.

[11] That Orientalism stands forth and away from the Orient could be viewed in light of Waley's consistent effort to avoid seeing the "real thing," the China he was so familiar with through books and artifacts. Qian Zhongshu, a contemporary Chinese scholar, on the other hand, has ridiculed Waley's poor taste for choosing a poet (Bo Juyi) whose style is too simplistic and straightforward as a representative figure of Chinese poetry. Waley was aware of the lackadaisical reception of his translations in China, but attributed it to the fact that "they get rather cross in China at one translating their own poems and think that, if anybody does it, it ought to be themselves." See "Arthur Waley in Conversation: BBC Interview with Roy Fuller," in *Madly Singing in the Mountains*, pp. 138-151 (pp. 142-143).

> it is unlikely that the classics of the Far East would have become such an important part of our heritage.[12]

Two questions may arise out of these comments: firstly, whether Chinese literature has really been exalted to such a high position in the West as Homer; and secondly, if so, whether this was mainly due to Waley. The answers to both questions may perhaps not be a unanimous yes, but few could say, in response to the first, that the study of Chinese literature in the West has not increased greatly in the past half century; nor can it be denied that Waley played an important role.[13] Waley constructed and managed to sustain an image associated with ancient China, and to safeguard the entry of such a tradition to the English speaking world he established his own style for expressing Chinese sentiments.

Ivan Morris writes about Waley's language:

> [...] after he [Waley] had thoroughly understood a Chinese or Japanese text, to recast it entirely in supple, idiomatic, vibrant English, rather than stick to a phrase-by-phrase or sentence-by-sentence rendering, which might convey the surface meaning but would inevitably mar the artistry of the original. Without this literary talent all his scholarly and linguistic gifts would never have brought the Far Eastern classics alive in English.[14]

What concerns us most here is the aim to recast the texts entirely in a style that could enter the target culture, to bring the Far Eastern classics alive in English. This attempt went side by side with his endeavours to make the texts sound and feel distant and ancient. The nature of his work could perhaps be seen more in perspective in terms of André Lefevere's notion of rewriting, who argues that rewriting (either in the form of criticism or of

---

[12] Morris, "The Genius of Arthur Waley" in *Madly Singing in the Mountains*, p. 67.

[13] The amount of publications since 1920s, specifically translations from Chinese poetry as mentioned in Chapter 1, testifies to the fact that interest in this field has grown sharply. Meanwhile, the sinologists and scholars who contributed to the anthology *Madly Singing in the Mountains*, like J. M. Cohen, David Hawkes, Donald Keene, Ivan Morris, and Peter Quennell, have respectively mentioned the enormous influence of Arthur Waley on the study of Chinese literature. Ivan Morris, for instance, wrote: "Arthur Waley's writing swept away a mass of entrenched misconceptions and led to a new era in Western understanding of Chinese poetry." See Morris, *Madly Singing in the Mountains*, pp. 29-36, 45-51, 52-62, 67-87, 88-92.

translation) manipulates what is foreign to function in a given society in a given way.[15] Yet one may argue that the conventions of the receiving culture in the first place (or, eventually), that were forced upon the translator, made him change strategies accordingly. The fact that using predetermined forms in translating Chinese poetry attracted little attention in the nineteenth century, as opposed to later attempts, may testify to subtle and implicit social norms and conventions. Lefevere has also commented on the use of rigid metre that he deems responsible for all kinds of metrical contortions in translations made roughly between 1830 and 1930.[16] A similar situation could be found in the translation of Chinese poetry at the turn of the century. Chinese poetry did not have a clear character of its own, partly because it was translated into metrical monotony in English versions.[17]

In her discussion of Ezra Pound and Charles Kennedy's translation of the Anglo-Saxon poem *The Seafarer*, Susan Bassnett has compared and contrasted different criteria employed by the two translators, which are also useful in understanding in general the strategies of a translator.[18] Here I would like to borrow some of the points she has considered to look at the Chineseness Waley helped to create. Waley used free verse without rhymes, while creating an illusion of preserving Chinese stress counts in a line. Susan Bassnett points out that

---

[14] Morris, "The Genius of Arthur Waley," in *Madly Singing in the Mountains*, pp. 71-72.

[15] See André Lefevere, *Translation, Rewriting, & the Manipulation of Literary Fame* (London and New York: Routledge, 1992), pp. 88-106.

[16] Lefevere, *Translation, History and Culture*, p. 25.

[17] Some scholars have commented on the limitations of traditional metres on poetic expression in general and on the translation of Chinese poetry in particular. Lefevere, for example, laments that the use of rigid metre "has been responsible for all kinds of metrical contortions in translations made roughly between 1830 and 1930." He also writes that "Browning's insistence on the use of certain allowable constructions [...] is responsible for the fact that most Victorian translations of the classics read so monotonously alike." Lefevere, *Translation, History and Culture*, p. 25. See also James Dunn's article on the restriction of metres on the translation of Chinese poetry at the beginning of the century, "Translation and Poetics: Reciprocal Technologies in the History of Chinese-to-English Transfer," *Tamkang Review* 16.4 (Summer 1986), 381-394.

[18] Some of the criteria she uses are the employment of free-verse, attempt to modernize language, attempt to show individual in a world-system distanced in time, space and values, and attempt to reproduce elegiac mood of original. Bassnett, *Translation Studies*, revised edn. (London: Routledge, 1991), pp. 88-100.

> Any translator must first decide what constitutes the total structure [...] and then decide on what to do when translating a type of poetry which relies on a series of rules that are non-existent in the TL.[19]

One of the main problems with the translation of classical Chinese poetry is that the original relies heavily, linguistically and formally, on rules that are very different in the TL. Waley used a smooth syntax, sprung rhythm, and rhymeless verse to create a verisimilitude of the Chineseness and tempo (for Pound it was the manipulation of line-units to juxtapose the images or emphasize an impression).

Waley suggests that the tradition of not using rhyme seems to have become established: "people are used nowadays to poetry that does not rhyme or only uses rhyme as an occasional ornament, and I think lack of rhyme will not be generally felt as an obstacle."[20] In 1970 Donald Keene claims that he "cannot imagine anyone reading Giles' translations today except as a curiosity or a horrible example of the follies committed in the name of rhyme."[21] David Hawkes also writes that Waley's language "is by now so familiar and so much imitated (often very badly) that one frequently meets people who are under the impression that Chinese poetry in the original is itself written in a sort of rhymeless *vers libre*."[22]

In Waley's earlier attempts he tried to use rhymes, a method that he soon abandoned.[23] The reason for his giving up rhymes may be that it would bring one too far

---

[19] Bassnett, *Translation Studies*, p. 96.
[20] Waley, "Introduction" to *A Hundred and Seventy Chinese Poems*," p. 9.
[21] Donald Keene, "In Your Distant Street Few Drums Were Heard," in *Madly Singing in the Mountains*, pp. 52-62 (p. 56).
[22] David Hawkes, "From the Chinese," in *Madly Singing in the Mountains*, p. 47.
[23] This is his rhymed rendition, "Immeasurable Pain," published in 1923:

> My dreaming soul last night was king again.
> As in past days

away from the source text.[24] This might also bring the text too far into the target system, which might lessen the poignancy of the strangeness. Waley comments: "I did not use rhyme because I found that to do so carries one too far away from the original [...]"[25] In other words rhyme may be perceived as too "Anglicized" and the reader may for a moment read the poem as though it were English text. His strategy was to make the lines sound unlike lines in English poems. He was treading a thin line between exoticization and naturalization. He was also consciously fighting a war against convention; conspicuous remnants from the past should be transcended. Obviously not all the free and unrhymed verse used by subsequent translators of Chinese poetry was based on his initiative, but it is interesting to ponder what subsequent approaches would have been had Waley stuck to

---

I wandered through the Palace of Delight,
And in my dream
Down grassy garden-ways
Glided my chariot, smoother than a summer stream;
There was moonlight,
The trees were blossoming,
And a faint wind softened the air of night,
For it was spring.

Arthur Waley, *Chinese Poems* (London: George Allen & Unwin Ltd, 1946), p. 176. A word-for-word translation of the original is:

多	少	事				
(How many)		things				
昨	夜	夢	魂	中		
Last	night	dream	soul	in		
還	似	舊	時	遊	上	宛
Again	like	old	days	tour	(palace)	
車	如	流	水	馬	如	龍
Cars	like	running	water	horse	like	dragon
花	月	止	春	風		
Flowers	moon	right at	spring	wind		

[24] Waley, "Notes on Translation," in *Madly Singing in the Mountains*, pp. 152-164 (p. 158).
[25] Waley, "Notes on Translation," in *Madly Singing in the Mountains*, p. 158.

rhyme. But then, such a question may not even be asked in the first place, for it is exactly this free yet strained style that received attention and attracted followers.[26]

The lengths of the lines in Waley's "Immeasurable Pain" are more irregular than employed in his later translations. The lengths, however, do not correspond to the original, which means that he did not adjust the lengths to suit the source text, but perhaps in order to create a sonorous effect for the target reader, as opposed to his claim of having the number of stresses corresponding to those of the original. It seems a little odd, in fact, that he declared that the number of stresses in his lines match that of the original. It is neither more nor less "Chinese" one way or another, not to mention if anybody had ever counted the stresses and compared them with those of the original. The relevant notion is that he uses sprung rhythm, which creates a sense of strangeness purportedly echoing the Chinese original.

The syntax of his works, especially the early ones, shows clear sign of exoticization:

> Green, green,
> The grass by the river-bank,
> Thick, thick,
> The willow trees in the garden.
> Sad, sad,
> The lady in the tower.
> White, white,
> At the casement window.
> Fair, fair,
> Her re-powdered face.
> Small, small,
> She puts out her pale hand.
> Once she was a dancing man's wife.
> The wandering man went, but did not return.
> It is hard alone to keep an empty bed.[27]

---

[26] Most of the English translations of Chinese poetry since the 1920s have abandoned traditional regular metres, as shown in the works enumerated in the Introduction.

[27] Waley, *A Hundred and Seventy Chinese Poems*, p. 24. A word-for-word translation of the original is:

In his version, Waley roughly follows the Chinese order, particularly the duplication at the beginning of each line, which departs from the normal structure of English syntax. As in the original, there is no verb in the first ten lines, and every line constitutes a scene. The images are juxtaposed with each other while explicatory words are kept to the minimal.

The mystery is being piled up, one scene after another, to the moment when the identity of the lady is revealed. The description is moving, step by step, from outside to inside, from the river bank, to the garden with willows, to the woman in the tower, to her makeup, and to her hand. The narrator adopts an omnipresent point of view, reveals information little by little, or, suppresses information until the very end of the poem. The

---

青 Green	青 green	河 river	畔 side	草 grass
鬱 Abundant	鬱 abundant	園 garden	中 inside	柳 willow
盈 Sad	盈 sad	樓 tower	上 above	女 woman
皎 Bright	皎 bright	當 at	窗 window	牖 case
娥 Fair	娥 fair	紅 red	粉 powder	妝 makeup
纖 Delicate	纖 delicate	出 stretch	素 white	手 hand
昔 Before	爲 is	娼 prostitute	家 family	女 girl
今 Now	爲 is	蕩 wanderer	子 man	婦 wife
蕩 Wanderer	子 man	行 away	不 not	歸 return
空 Empty	床 bed	難 difficult	獨 alone	守 stay

awkward syntax helps to defamiliarize the text and foreground the various scenes. The reader's attention is drawn to the situation, waiting for the outcome, and the strange syntax, mainly the duplicates, serves this narrative purpose well. The lines "Green, green [...]/ Thick, thick [...]/ Sad, sad [...]/ White, white [...]/ Fair, fair [...]" help to increase the suspension, suggesting something more essential is going to be unfolded.

Even though Waley usually uses smooth and grammatical lines, he experimented with disrupted syntax reminiscent of Pound:

> Autumn wind rises: white clouds fly.
> Grass and trees wither: geese go south.
> Orchids all in bloom: chrysanthemums smell sweet.[28]

This early experiment retains the remote relations between the images, especially within the same line, following the multi-signification of the Chinese original. The colons serve as a link between the two images, a closer link than commas, suggesting one should not consider the two parts separately. Their relations, however, remain to be concretized by the reader.

Waley's famous sprung rhythm, which he consciously employed only after he "had been translating Chinese poetry for about six years,"[29] carries a sense of strangeness not found in more traditional English metres. There is an attempt to provide a flavour of

---

[28] Waley, *A Hundred and Seventy Chinese Poems*, p. 31. A word-for-word translation of the original is:

秋	風	起	兮	白	雲	飛
Autumn	wind	rise	particle	white	cloud	fly
草 木	黃	落	兮	雁	南	歸
Grass tree	yellow	fall	particle	wild geese	south	return
蘭	有	秀	兮	菊	有	芳
Orchids	have	bloom	particle	chrysanthemums	have	beauty

Chinese verses through the fiction of corresponding Chinese stress pattern in the target language. Whether the stresses in a line are the same as those in the original actually does not matter so much as the fact that the rhythm sounds strange and even strained, a make-believe Chinese rhythm. This is perhaps what he wanted to achieve, this sense of the poem being "from the Chinese." J. M Cohen writes:

> Dr. Waley uses 'sprung rhythm', therefore, in a far less emotionally congested way than did the discoverer of that medium [Gerald Hopkins]. To him it is as natural a measure as blank verse, and one that has the advantage of being free from 19th-century associations [...] Dr. Waley's 'sprung rhythms' have the virtue of freshness, and of a conversational ease which aptly renders the very restrained and direct emotion of such a reflective writer as Po Chu-i.[30]

The sprung rhythm, "natural" as it may be, therefore, is a carefully constructed rhythm intended to keep a distance from past prosody, as in the following example:

> On the high hills nó creature stirs

In this case "high hills no" are stresses. In the following example the stresses are separated by up to three unstressed syllables:

> I have still to travel in my sólitary bóat.

A sense of irregularity and strangeness is thus imparted, for the stresses are placed to depart from readers' expectation.

In Waley's early translation, subjects, connectives and the like tended to be removed:

---

[29] See the discussion in Waley, "Notes on Translation," in *Madly Singing in the Mountains*, p. 158.
[30] J. M. Cohen, "Dr Waley's Translation," in *Madly Singing in the Mountains*, pp. 29-36 (p. 33).

Entering the Hall, she meets the new wife;
Leaving the gate, she runs into former husband.
Words stick; does not manage to say anything.
Presses hands together: stands hesitating.
Agitates moon-like fan, sheds pearl-like tears,
Realizes she loves him as much as ever--
Present pain never come to an end.[31]

Here is the revised version that has been known to the public (the italics are mine):

Entering the Hall, she meets the new wife;
Leaving the gate, she runs into her former husband.
Words stick: *she* does not manage to say anything:
She presses her hands together *and* hesitates.
Agitates moon-like fan-- sheds pearl-like tears
Realizes she loves him as much as ever:
That her present pain *will* never come to an end.[32]

---

[31] Waley only agreed to have this old version reprinted in 1965 by F. A. Johns. See his "Notes" to *Chinese Poems*. See also the discussion in Wai-lim Yip, *Ezra Pound's Cathay* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1969), p. 27. A word-for-word translation of the original is:

入	堂	値	小	婦
Enter	hall	meet	little	wife
出	門	逢	故	夫
Leave	door	meet	former	husband
含	辭	未	及	吐
Hold	words	not	yet	say
絞	袖	且	踟	躕
Twist	sleeves	and	(hesitate)	
搖	茲	扇	似	月
Shake	this	fan	like	moon
掩	此	淚	如	珠
Cover	this	tears	like	pearl
今	懷	固	無	已
The present	feeling	surely	without	end
故	情	今	有	餘
Old	passion	now	(lingers)	

[32] Waley, *A Hundred and Seventy Chinese Poems*, p. 70.

The first version came out in the *Chinese Poems* in 1916, but when it appeared in *One Hundred and Seventy Chinese Poems* in 1918, the lines become smooth and grammatical. The title was also changed, from "The Ejected Wife" to "The Rejected Wife." The first version was never reprinted until shortly before he died, and was only available to a few people.[33] It is obvious that he was consciously departing from this disrupted syntax that he first embarked on.

Personal pronouns and possessive pronouns are added in the new versions, even in the case when there is no ambiguity, such as "her" is added in the second line. The difference between the second line of the two versions is that the second version sounds more natural and conversational, whereas the line in the first version may claim to be more laconic. The difference between the third line is more obvious. Even the punctuation signifies the different strategies adopted in the two versions. In the first version a semicolon is used to separate the two parts of the sentence, while a colon which suggests some kind of correlation between the two parts is used in the second version. Without a "she" the first version also reads as more abrupt and telegraphic, though there is no danger of misunderstanding.

The change in the fourth line is even more apparent. It has now become a grammatically smooth line, whereas in the previous version the subject and possessive pronoun are missing. While the phrase "presses hands together" may be more condensed, it also sounds more brusque. The last line in the modified version also aims at naturalizing the language. The "that" at the beginning makes the transition between this line and the previous one more natural. The present tense in the old version may give a sense of eternal sorrow, but the future tense in the modified version sounds more natural and more

[33] See also the discussions in Wai-lim Yip, *Ezra Pound's Cathay*, pp. 26-27, note 29.

conversational. This change of syntax could be said to herald the birth of what was to become a tradition. Images carrying a Chinese flavour, such as "moon-like fan" and "pearl-like tears," created a sense of exoticism. What Waley was groping towards was a new syntax, one that a contemporary reader might experience as strange at times but still consider acceptable.

Waley wanted to produce texts that were lively and contemporary. In an essay written in 1958 discussing the translation of prose and poetry alike, he criticized a line translated by Helen Hayes as "so far from being a banal formula" that it "is something that no one has ever said to anybody."[34] Although here Waley is mainly referring to dialogues, his notion of translating voices sheds light on his general strategy on poetry translation, since a great portion of Chinese poetry also focuses on a lyrical self speaking to himself or an imagined second person. Waley goes on to say:

> This brings us to the question of voices [...] one ought to make the characters say things that people talking English could conceivably say. One ought to hear them talking [...]
>
> One does not have to be a literary genius in order to avoid translators' pidgin [...] One simply has to develop the habit of hearing voices talk. The reader who cannot consult the original will of course tend to think "queer" English is the result of a praiseworthy fidelity to the author's idiom and may have a comforting sense that he is getting right inside the author's mind. I have even been told that translations which read well cannot possibly give a true idea of the original. But as a matter of fact when [...] one compares bits of queer translation with the text, one generally finds that the oddity is completely arbitrary and represents no native idiom at all.[35]

[34] Waley, "Notes on Translation," in *Madly Singing in the Mountains*, p. 156.
[35] Waley, "Notes on Translation," in *Madly Singing in the Mountains*, pp. 156-157.

The attempt not to produce "queer" English could be viewed as a principle guiding also Waley's poetry translation, for he gave up earlier versification such as rhymes and disrupted syntax for a smooth and relatively natural style approaching the conversational.

Susan Bassnett notes the complexities involved in the translation of poetry

> where there is a gulf between the SL and TL cultures through distance, time and space [...] in some cases modernization of language and tone has received priority treatment, whilst in other cases conscious archaization has been a dominant determining feature.[36]

A study of Waley's translation of a poem that has also been translated by Giles and Pound could shed light on Waley's translation strategies. Waley's version is entitled "Li Fu-jen:"

> The sound of her silk skirt has stopped.
> On the marble pavement dust grows.
> Her empty room is cold and still.
> Fallen leaves are piled against the doors.
> Longing for that lovely lady
> How can I bring my aching heart to rest?[37]

---

[36] Bassnett, *Translation Studies*, p. 101.

[37] *Waley, A Hundred and Seventy Chinese Poems*, p. 31. A word-for-word translation of the original is:

羅		袂		兮		無		聲	
Silk		sleeve		ah		no		sound	
玉		墀		兮		塵		生	
Jade		courtyard		ah		dust		grow	
虛		房		冷		而		寂	寞
Empty		room		cold		and		(lonely)	
落		葉		依		于		重	扃
Fallen		leaf		lean		on		doubled	door-bar
望	彼	美	之	女		兮		安	得
Look	that	beautiful	particle	woman		ah		how	find
感		余		心		之		未	寧
Feel		my		heart		particle		not	rest

Waley uses contemporary English, discarding the image of "jade" in the second line, a word full of Chinese associations, by using the word "marble," more familiar to the reader in the English-speaking world. The word "silk" in the first line, after all, already carries Chinese connotations. The factual sentiment in the last line of the original is changed to that of a rhetorical question, avoiding the prosaic statement. His strategy is to keep close to the original, using modern English while incorporating words with associations of the west ("marble"). The overall result is a translation from the Chinese mixed with contemporary and western elements. Though the sprung rhythm may sound strained at times, it is closer to the spoken style than the traditional metric, creating a sense of strangeness associated with images and the orient while striking a chord of resonance for the contemporary reader.

Giles uses archaic words like "stilled" and inversions like those in the second and last lines, conforming to the existing formal norms by using rhymes and iambics.[38] The last two lines are straightforward statement. The same poem in Pound's version becomes an imagist poem, ending with the line "A wet leaf that clings to the threshold."[39] Pound takes out the image of fallen leaves in the fourth line and ends the poem with it, thus departing

---

[38] This is Giles' version, "Gone:"

> The sound of rustling silk is stilled,
> With dust the marble courtyard filled.
> No footfalls echo on the floor,
> Fallen leaves in heaps block up the door...
> For she, my pride, my lovely one is lost,
> And I am left, in hopeless anguish tossed.

Herbert Giles, *Gems of Chinese Literature* (London: Quaritch, 1922), p. 304.

[39] The rustling of the silk is discontinued,
Dust drifts over the courtyard,
There is no sound of foot-fall, and the leaves
Scurry into heaps and lie still,
And she the rejoicer of the heart is beneath them:

A wet leaf that clings to the threshold.

Pound, "Liu Ch'e," *Personae* (New York: New Directions, 1926), p. 108.

considerably from the original, revealing also Pound's preoccupation with images and super-imposing techniques.[40]

Along with the attempt at exoticism, Waley also worked to relate the English world to that of the contemporary reader.[41] He tried to mix Chinese elements with more familiar elements. There is a line, for example, in a Bo Juyi (772-846)'s poem that he translated: "But you already are gone to the Nether Springs."[42] In the original it is the "Yellow Spring" instead, and Waley changed it to a term that carried Western associations. His translation of "The Szechwan Road" by Li Bo is an example of the same strategy; it begins with these lines:

> Eheu! How dangerous, how high!
> It would be easier to climb to Heaven
> Than walk the Szechwan Road.[43]

In facing the formidable mountain roads which are well-known for separating the north and south, the speaker exclaims over the wonder of nature at the very beginning. The term "Szechwan" which is used by Waley in the title as well as throughout the poem actually

---

[40] For more details of Pound's employment of super-imposing techniques in this period, see also Earl Miner, *The Japanese Tradition in British and American Literature* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1958), pp. 112-123.

[41] Susan Bassnett comments that in his translation of *The Seafarer* Charles Kennedy "attempts to relate Anglo-Saxon world to that of contemporary reader." Bassnett, *Translation Studies*, p. 99.

[42] "The Hat Given to the Poet by Li Chien (c. 821)" by Bo Juyi [Po Chu-i], in *Madly Singing in the Mountains*, p. 198.

[43] *A Hundred and Seventy Chinese Poems*, pp. 117-118. A word-for-word translation of the original is:

噫 (Exclamation words)	吁	戲		
危 Dangerous	乎 particle	高 high		哉 particle
蜀 Shu	道 road	之 particle		難 difficult
難 Difficult	於 than	上 go up	青 blue	天 heaven

does not appear in the original. Instead, Shu 蜀, a short form for the province of Szechwan, is used. The sound Shu, however, does not suggest the feeling of ruggedness, but rather, a sense of smoothness instead. The bringing in of the word "Szechwan" by Waley may serve two purposes. First, its cacophony coincides with the scene of jagged and craggy roads. Second, Waley translated most of Li Bo's poems in the late forties, and most Western readers were probably familiar with the name Szechwan, where Chunking, the temporary capital of China during the Second World War, was situated, mainly because of its inaccessibility. The repeated use of the term "Szechwan" which is not in the original is an example of his awareness of the cultural aspect of a noun. Only this time, ironically, he brings in a term that could suggest more associations to his own readers. In this way he is making, or helping to make, a modern Chinese heritage.

Omei, a huge mountain in Szechwan, appears in the original, but is also replaced by the broader term "Szechwan" 四川 referring to the whole province. Omei is one of the four great Buddhist mountains in China, where one can find hundreds of temples. It is a famous name to the Chinese reader, but this holy mountain may mean little to the target audience. Meanwhile, the term "Szechwan" in Chinese is not so rich in association as the word *Shu* 蜀 , which is much more ancient and legendary. Nor does the pronunciation "Szechwan" sound more rugged to a Chinese ear. This is probably an example of how the name of a place gains poignancy in translation, while another name loses it.

There are these lines in Waley's rendition:

> Above, high beacons of rock that turn back the chariot of the sun;
> Below, whirling eddies that meet the clashing torrent and turn it away.[44]

---

[44] A word-for-word translation of the original is:

上	有	六	龍	回	日	之	高	標
Above	there is	six	dragon	block	sun	particle	high	peak
下	有	衝	波	逆	折	之	回	川
Below	there is	rush	wave	(return)		particle	back	river

The "Six-Dragon" image, a familiar Chinese scene, became "the chariot of the sun," a classical image in the Western tradition. There are the imagined "six dragons," of course, in the original mountains. But it is the sun , rather than "the chariot" of it, that is blocked. Waley does not always emphasize or even create "Chineseness" in his translation, as the "six dragons" that he removed should conveniently strengthen such an impression. By using the chariot of the sun to replace the six dragons he is actually transferring the Chinese cultural background into the West for his own readers. Meanwhile, in the line about the turbulent waters Waley aims at using the sounds of the English words to create an atmosphere of ferocity. This can also be seen as a general strategy employed by him to approximate the overall sense of roughness in this poem.

James Legge made two versions of all the *Shijing* poems.[45] Behind this idea of rendering an explicatory prose version and then a poem with regular metre seems to be a belief that one precludes the other. The prose form was still regarded as something other then a poem, and it could only perform the function of explication. Giles' rendition is also in a predetermined structure.[46] Legge's prose rendering, with its Victorian inversions, also departs from the daily language. Waley tried to render the Chinese poem into verse which would appeal to the contemporary English reader with fluid language, sometimes in a conversational mode of discourse, but with a sense of the exotic:

> We thought you were a simple peasant
> Bringing cloth to exchange for thread.
> But you had not come to buy thread;
> As far as Beacon Hill.
> You had come to arrange about me.
> But you have no proper match-maker.

[45] See *The She King*, in *The Chinese Classics*, 5 vols (Hong Kong: Hong Kong University Press, 1960).
[46] See Giles, *Gems of Chinese Literature*.

You were escorted across the Ch'i
Please do not be angry;
Let us fix on autumn as the time.[47]

---

[47] Waley, *The Book of Songs*, pp. 96-97 (p. 96). This is the first stanza. A word-for-word translation of the original is:

氓	之	蚩	蚩
Lad	particle	simple	simple
抱	布	貿	絲
Bring	cloth	exchange	silk
匪	來	質	絲
Not	come	exchange	silk
來	即	我	謀
Come	for	me	plot
送	子	涉	淇
See off	you	ford	Qi
至	于	頓	丘
Arrive	at	Beacon	Hill
匪	我	愆	期
Not	I	delay	time
子	無	良	媒
You	do not have	good	match-maker
子	無	怒	
You	should not be	angry	
秋	以	爲	期
Autumn	is	as	the time

James Legge's rhymed version of the same stanza is:

A simple-looking lad you seemed,
When first you met my eye,
By most a travelling merchant deemed,
Raw silk for cloth to buy.
But your true aim was to propose
That I should go with you;
And through the Ch'i I went quite free,
Until we reached Tun-ch'iu.
'Twas then I said, "It is not I,
Who would the time delay;
Your go-between I have not seen,
I must not run away.
I pray, sir, do not angry be;
In autumn be the day."

The word "Ch'i," clearly a Chinese name, is followed by an English name "Beacon Hill." He gives a transliteration first, then shifts strategy immediately by translating the meaning of a name. The result is a mixture of foreign and indigenous elements. The term "match-maker" is specific, and evokes the association of arranged marriage, probably more so than Legge's "go-between," a term that may be used for other occasions, not to mention Giles' "friends," which does not clearly bring out the idea of an ancient and remote custom.

But what is more important in connection with Waley's version is that, while a traditional poetics might shape a reader's construction of the text, a new structure could provide him with a new framework, hence the generation and construction of new meaning. With no or little cultural interpretive framework of Chinese poetry before the early twentieth century, the English language reader had to rely on English conventions, and that is how Legge and Giles' translation came to be acceptable-- and to a great extent became unacceptable when a new framework came into existence.

The tradition of "Chinese sentiments" Waley established consists of a few essential elements. It retains or thickens the elegiac mood of the original. The emotions are strong,

---

See also Lu Shu-xiang and Xu Yuanzhong, ed., *Gems of Classical Chinese Poetry in Various English Translations* (Hong Kong: Joint Publishing Co. Ltd., 1988), pp. 13-14.

Giles' version is:

> You seemed a guileless youth enough,
> Offering for silk your woven stuff;
> But silk was not required by you:
> I was the silk you had in view.
> With you I crossed the ford, and while
> We wandered on for many a mile
> I said, "I do not wish delay,
> But friends must fix our wedding-day...
> Oh, do not let my words give pain,
> But with the autumn come again."

Herbert Giles, *Gems of Chinese Literature* (Shanghai: Kelley and Walsh, 1922), pp. 295-296.

and the speaker may directly pour out his feelings. It is important to note that Waley regarded emotion as the essence of Oriental literature. He writes, "There do of course exist texts in which only logical meaning, and not feeling, is expressed. But particularly in the Far East they are exceedingly rare. The appeal, even in philosophical texts, has always been to emotion rather than to logic."[48] It is natural that his perception of the crux of Chinese poetry reinforces his strategy to highlight the emotions.

There is often a sense of exoticism, sometimes even mystery or suspense in Waley's translations from the Chinese. Examples could be found in the lines mentioned above about a woman in the garden: the thick willow trees, the "sad" as well as "white" lady at the casement window of the tower, her repowdered face, and her small and pale hand. The exotic quality, however, is sometimes manifested in Waley's attempts to show individuals in a world-system distanced in time, space and values.[49] Gary Snyder once remarked, "For me, one of the most useful discoveries in Chinese poetry was that you don't have to be crazy to be a poet."[50] He also pointed out that:

> It is just that humaneness, that delicate-- I'm almost tempted to use the word sweet-- appreciation of the details of human life, families, the frustrations of employment with the government, and the frustrations of being a hermit, that we perhaps respond to most deeply in Chinese poetry, having a poetry ourselves which is so different in a way, so mythological, so political and so elevated [...][51]

This kind of mundane life, the commonplace feelings of common people, is often highlighted in Waley's translations, which also constitutes an important part of the Chineseness he helped to establish.

---

[48] Waley, "Notes on Translation," in *Madly Singing in the Mountains*, p. 158.
[49] These are words used by Susan Bassnett. See *Translation Studies*, p. 99.
[50] Gregory Orr, ed., "Chinese Poetry and the American Imagination," *Ironwood* 17 (1981), 11-54 (p. 51).

Waley has once mentioned that the theme of separation represents half the Chinese poems.[52] The following line is an example:

But it may remind him of the time that has past since he left.[53]

While the original mainly mentions the passing of time, Waley emphasizes its impact on the individual. Yet he is careful not to step in to talk explicitly the feeling of the person. The third person point of view (in Chinese the absence of a subject more often means a first person point of view) and the word "may" in Waley's line decrease the tension, avoiding sentimentalism, but the phrase "remind him of," which is added by Waley, strengthens the personal feeling.

Another line is:

Success is bitter when it is slow in coming.[54]

Heroic emotion is replaced by a sense of futility. Waley's line may be less direct ("slow in coming" instead of "early,") but it also adds a little twist (even if success comes, it will still be bitter). There is no fanciful imagination nor witty conceits, but commonplace emotions. Yet another example:

For ever it has been that mourners in their turn were mourned.[55]

---

[51] Orr, "Chinese Poetry and the American Imagination," p. 14.
[52] Waley, "Love and Friendship in Chinese Poetry," in *Madly Singing in the Mountains*, pp. 295-296 (p. 296).
[53] Waley, *Chinese Poems*, p. 43. A word-for-word translation of the original line is as follows:

但	感	別	經	時
But	feel	separate	pass	time

[54] Waley, *Chinese Poems*, p. 44. A word-for-word translation of the original is:

立	身	苦	不	早
Stand	body	bitter	not (negative)	early

[55] Waley, *Chinese Poems*, p. 46. A word-for-word translation of the original is:

In the cribs one can see there is no repetition of words. The pathos in Waley's line is strengthened in a few ways: the play on the words "mourners" and "mourned"; the reinforcement of meanings in the phrases "For ever it has been" and "in their turn". The mourners' mourning and their being mourned should happen at different times, but the scenes seem to be super-imposed on each other. The line seems to be a statement of law; human affairs have to be dictated by this rule of nature; no one can escape.

Kunitz comments that what attracts him to Chinese poetry is "the intimacy of its tone-- that conversational quality, that sense of a communication between friends [...] Accompanying that was a certain modesty of enterprise."[56] In "A Peacock Flew" there is this line that testifies to Kunitz's description about the intimate and modest tone, the warm and conversational quality:

> You would understand if only you knew.[57]

The original is a negative statement, while Waley turns it to a positive one, thus making the sense of isolation and alienation a little more definite and desperate. In these examples one can see a thickening of pathos (the Chinese poet is not embarrassed to admit that he is helpless, or that he feels very sad), yet paradoxically the sorrow is usually put in a controlled tone, and a sense of stoicism prevails, which may also testify to what Hawkes says about Chinese poetry being quiet. In a way the sadness is a little stronger than the original (like "For ever it has been that mourners [...]") but the overall style coincides with a very important tenet of belief in Chinese poetic tradition, that is, "To lament but not to

---

萬	歲	更	相	送
Thousands	years	again	mutual	seeing off

[56] Orr, "Chinese Poetry and the American Imagination," p. 21.
[57] Waley, *Temple*, p. 122. A word-for-word translation of the original is:

亦	非	君	所	知
Again	not	you, sir	what	knows

grieve; to complain but not to be angry." (*ai er bu sheng, yuan er bu nu* 哀而不傷, 怨而不怒) In Chinese poetry emotions are usually presented in a reflective and humble tone. The speaker does not avoid saying things sentimental; he is nostalgic, often reminiscent of a better day in the past. But the inescapable and inexplicable sorrow is presented in a controlled manner, sometimes showing an acceptance of fate.

The emotions presented in Waley's Chinese poems are more often those of friendship than romantic love, common men's feelings rather than heroic sentiments, as Waley himself observed:

> Accordingly we find that while our poets tend to lay stress on physical courage and other qualities which normal women admire, Po Chu-i is not ashamed to write such a poem as 'Alarm at entering the Gorges'. Our poets imagine themselves very much as Art has portrayed them-- bare-headed and wild-eyed [...] The Chinese poet introduces himself as a timid recluse [...][58]

Perhaps partly due to Waley's image-making, the characteristics of Chinese poetry being non-romantic have been well established.[59] The poem that Bo Juyi (Po Chu-i), and for that matter Chinese poets in general, was not ashamed to write, is:[60]

> Above, a mountain ten thousand feet high:
> Below, a river a thousand fathoms deep.
> A strip of green, walled by cliffs of stone:
> Wide enough for the passage of a single reed.
> At Chu-t'ang a straight cleft yawns:
> At Yen-yu islands block the stream.
> Long before night the walls are black with dusk;
> Without wind white waves rise.
> The big rocks are like a flat sword:
> The little rocks resemble ivory tusks.
> We are stuck fast and cannot move a step.
> How much the less, three hundred miles?

---

[58] Waley, "Love and Friendship in Chinese Poetry," in *Madly Singing in the Mountains*, p. 295.

[59] Roy Fuller, for example, said to Waley that "The irony, the relative avoidance of metaphor, the non-romanticism behind most of the poems-- all this you've obviously found congenial." See "Arthur Waley in Conversation: BBC Interview with Roy Fuller," in *Madly Singing in the Mountains*, p. 151.

[60] The speaker in Li Bo's "The Szechwan Road" discussed above may serve as another example of the image of a timid poet that lacks physical courage.

Frail and slender, the twisted-bamboo rope:
Weak, the dangerous hold of the towers feet.
A single slip-- the whole convoy lost:
And my life hangs on this thread!
I have heard a saying "He that has an upright heart
Shall walk scathless through the lands of Man and Mo".
How can I believe that since the world began
In every shipwreck none have drowned but rogues?
And how can I, born in evil days
And fresh from failure, ask a kindness of Fate?
Often I fear that these un-talented limbs
Will be laid at last in an un-named grave![61]

---

[61] "Written in A. D. 818, when he was being towed up the rapids to Chung-chou," in Waley, *Chinese Poems*, p. 164. A word-for-word translation of the original is:

上 Above	有 has	萬 thousands	仞 (measurement)	山 mountains
下 Below	有 has	千 thousands	丈 (measurement)	水 waters
蒼 Green	蒼 green	兩 two	崖 cliffs	間 between
闊 Broad	狹 narrow	容 fit	一 one	葦 reed
瞿 Qu	塘 Tang	呀 (yawn)	直 direct	瀉 pour
灩 Yen	澦 Yu	屹 block	中 middle	峙 stand
未 Not yet	夜 night	黑 black	岩 rock	昏 dark
無 Without	風 wind	白 white	浪 wave	起 rise
大 Big	石 rock	如 is like	刀 knife	劍 sword
小 Little	石 rock	如 is like	牙 teeth	齒
一 One	步 step	不 not	可 possible	行 walk
況 Let alone	千 thousand	三 three	百 hundred	里 (measurement)

This poem summarizes most of Waley's Chineseness: such as creating an illusion of Chinese stress patterns through the rhymeless sprung rhythm, modernizing the language, intimating a conversational tone, and attempting to show the individual in a world-system distanced in time, space and values. Like many other Chinese poems, it begins with a human situation, a scene, not a quiet one though, and ends with an expression of feeling, the fear and anxiety over one's fate in front of the overwhelming power of nature. The

---

苒 Slender	蒻 weak	竹 bamboo	蔑 (rope)	忿
欹 (Danger)	危	檄 (towers)	師	趾 toes
一 One	跌 fall	無 without	完 whole	舟 boat
吾 My	生 life	繫 depends	於 on	此 this
常 Often	聞 heard	仗 with	忠 loyalty	信 faithfulness
蠻 Man-Mo (barbarian place)	貊	可 could	行 travel (to)	矣 (exclamation)
自 Since	古 ancient	飄 drifting	沉 floating	人 men
豈 Are they	盡 all	非 not	君 (gentlemen)	子
況 Moreover	吾 my	時 time (luck)	與 and	命 fate
蹇 Bad	舛 luck	不 not	足 enough	恃 rely
常 Often	恐 fear	不 not	才 talented	身 body (myself)
復 Even	作 become	無 worthless	名 name	死 death

insignificant individual may end up in the same manner as everybody else, talented or not. The second rhetorical question at the end was added by Waley, probably to strengthen the sense of bewilderment and helplessness. The speaker is as vulnerable as any individual, not braver nor more romantic; he is not a hero, let alone being crazy.

The description in the first part of the poem is concrete and vivid, mingled with the unfamiliar and unknown, a touch of exoticism. Though the situation could well happen in any country, the names "Chung-chou," "Chu-t'ang" and "Yen-yu" make it clear that this is in China; terms like "Man-mo" and "twisted-bamboo rope" also give an Oriental flavour. The poet is but a common man, having common man's feeling and reaction, and ironically, this commonness, which is different from that western poetic tradition which emphasized the romantic at that time, serves as an important ingredient of the exotic Chinese tradition Waley helps to build.

Another feature of Chinese poetry that is manifested in the above translation is the use of concrete images. "A strip of green" is a modification on the two adjectives "*cang cang* " 蒼蒼 (literally "green green") of the original. In the phrases "walled by cliffs" and "walls are black with dusk" the image of walls is made up by Waley. The image "ivory tusks" in the seventh line is not in the original. All these images add to the concreteness and vividness of the poem. The rhetorical question "How can I" towards the end, after the detailed depiction of the terrifying scene, is repeated in Waley's translation to enforce the sense of dismay and apprehension. The last word in the original, "death," was changed to a concrete image "grave" in Waley's line.

According to Waley the reason why his book *One Hundred and Seventy Chinese Poems* "remained in fairly steady demand for forty years is that it appeals to people who do not ordinarily read poetry,"[62] and,

> The reason why they got on all right with Chinese poetry was, I think, that it mainly deals with the concrete and particular, with things one can touch and see-- a beautiful tree or lovely person-- and not with abstract conceptions such as Beauty and Love.[63]

Waley's emphasis of accentuating the particular and concrete in Chinese poetry, as opposed to the ideal and abstract, is similar to the effort of Pound and the imagists, which will be discussed in the next chapter. Waley explains:

> The English upper class, on the other hand, brought up at the universities in a tradition inspired largely by Plato, has reconciled itself to abstractions and even to the belief that the general is, in some mysterious way, truer and nobler than the particular [...] On the other hand, the view that something essential was lacking in Chinese poetry was expressed in 1919 by my friend E. M. Forster who said, when reviewing one of my books, that Chinese poems were 'lovely' but not 'beautiful'. As he spoke of Beauty having 'her head in the sky', he must, I think, have been expressing a demand for the ideal as opposed to the real.[64]

It was "the real" in Chinese poetry that Waley was trying to convey to his readers, as seen, for example, in the *One Hundred and Seventy Poems* and *Po Chu-i*, in which most of the poems deal with real life situations, with concrete images and objects.

---

[62] Waley wrote: "When in 1940 I was working in a Government office a number of young girl typists and clerks brought me copies of *Hundred and Seventy* to sign. Several of them said they did not ordinarily read poetry and had, before coming across my book, always supposed that it was something 'special and difficult'." Waley, "Introduction" to *A Hundred and Seventy Chinese Poems*, p. 7.

[63] Waley, "Introduction" to *A Hundred and Seventy Chinese Poems*," p. 7.

[64] Waley, "Introduction" to *A Hundred and Seventy Chinese Poems*," p. 7.

c) In Search of His Chinese Myth

In talking about the undesirability of having government-sponsored organizations to decide which works should be translated, Waley writes:

> I have a feeling that this system is not going to work very well. What matters is that a translator should have been excited by the work he translates, should be haunted day and night by the feeling that he must put it into his own language, and should be in a state of restlessness and fret till he has done so [...] let the translator read widely and choose the things that excite him and that he itches to put into English. If they are not scheduled as 'masterpieces' today, very likely they will be tomorrow.[65]

Waley's description of how he first came upon Chinese poetry and how he "itched" to put the things that excited him into English shows a preoccupation with some kind of Chinese world, be it a vanished one or a fictitious one. His passion for that ancient world continued till the very end of his life.[66] The ancient China of his translations was very much a product of his fascination.

Michael Sullivan comments on one of Waley's early works:

> Waley was not writing about an alien culture at all. The importance of friends, the rather rarefied standards, the delicate perception, the predominantly literary taste of the Chinese amateur, were all very much part of Waley himself. He had, in many ways, a very Chinese mind.[67]

Sullivan emphasizes that a naturalizing process of the Chinese elements was undertaken by Waley. Behind this was the interiorization of the Chinese characteristics which appeared clearly, yet in a way inconspicuously. The "Chinese mind" he was thought to have,

---

[65] Waley, "Notes on Translation," in *Madly singing in the Mountains*, p. 163.

[66] In his everyday life Waley would casually talk about things like the musical modes of ancient China, a ploughshare of the Han Dynasty, the use of the verb "to say" in the *Tao-te Ching*, which is never used transitively, or a kind of tea mentioned in *Shik-shuo hsin-ju* which should be drunk cold. Even shortly before he died, on hearing the words "You too" said by his wife he was reminded of the Chinese words that mean "road to the other world." His wife read him Chinese poems that he translated at his deathbed. At his funeral his favourite passage "Bull Mountain" was read. See Carmen Blacker, "Intent of Courtesy," in *Madly Singing in the Mountains*, pp. 21-28.

[67] Michael Sullivan, "Reaching Out," in *Madly Singing in the Mountains*, pp. 108-113 (p. 112).

however, may be based on the Chineseness he himself had constructed. It may also refer to his deep passion for Chinese history and culture, which may give the impression that he is not talking about something ancient and distant, but something that he has known well. But of course he did not. The China he presents and the tortuous roads he takes to get there are yet another example of the hermeneutic circle. Sullivan was speaking from a Westerner's point of view, not too far removed from Eliot's famous comment on Pound's invention of China.[68]

Commenting on a remark made by a Japanese scholar that "Waley was forever enjoying himself in the rich garden of Chinese and Japanese culture," Ivan Morris adds, "He plucked only the flowers that delighted him and truly appealed to his taste."[69] Two things here are worth noting: first, it was specifically an oriental garden, and the flowers there presumably were exotic; second, he enjoyed it. When defending Waley for his originality in using sprung rhythm, Roy Fuller remembered, "Waley himself has said that he made his sympathy with Chinese verse appear more close by choosing poems to translate that echoed his own cast of mind,"[70] while Waley admits that "I chose the Chinese poems I translated out of thousands of others, so that naturally makes the approximation still closer."[71] Waley's words confirm Ivan Morris and Roy Fuller's remarks, that he chose poems he enjoyed to translate, and revealed also the tight screening process. The China created is therefore also a reflection of his mind.

---

[68] There is some common ground between Waley, Pound and Rexroth. To begin with, they all showed extraordinary passion and imagination for the worlds represented in Chinese poetry. Pound and Rexroth took what they wanted and decided what to present as Chinese. So did Waley, though more cautiously, in that he would search for relevant information before he decided on what might give an authentic picture of the original, or appear to be authentic to the reader. The world he offered, therefore, was still only a world purportedly from China presented in the English language. T. S. Eliot called Pound "the inventor of Chinese poetry." See T. S. Eliot's "Ezra Pound: His Metric and Poetry" in *To Criticize the Critic* (London: Faber, 1965), p. 181.

[69] Ivan Morris, "The Genius of Arthur Waley," in *Madly Singing in the Mountains*, p. 69.

[70] Morris, "The Genius of Arthur Waley," in *Madly Singing in the Mountains*, p. 73.

[71] "Arthur Waley in Conversation: BBC Interview with Roy Fuller," in *Madly Singing in the Mountains*, p. 151.

Three of his books are devoted exclusively to individual poets, namely, *The Life and Times of Po Chu-i, The Poetry and Career of Li Po*, and *Yuan Mei: Eighteenth Century Chinese Poet*, besides other translations collected in anthologies.[72] To select poets to introduce on such a large scale and in such a great detail also reveals Waley the editor of Chinese literature and culture at work.[73] All three books are so structured that the poems and the men are strung together, that is, the narration is a mixture of the life history of the poets and their creative works. Waley's attitude towards the relationship between history and poetry needs to be made clear. David Hawkes notes:

> But Dr Waley's biographies of Chinese poets--*The Life and Times of Po Chu-i* (1949), *The Poetry and Career of Li Po* (1950), and *Yuan Mei* (1959)--though they appear to be structurally identical with, for example, a book like Mr Blunden's *Shelley*, nevertheless differ in that the biographical facts about the Chinese poets had mostly, for want of other sources, to be reconstructed from the poems themselves.[74]

Waley's method of studying the poems first while paying attention to the poet's life as well coincided with the way poems were read in ancient China. This similarity is yet another illustration of the Hermeneutic circle. One of the most important principles of how to study literary works in Confucianism is expounded in the following speech by Mencius:

> The best Gentleman of a village is in a position to make friends with the best Gentlemen in other villages; the best Gentleman in a state, with the best Gentlemen in other states; and the best Gentleman in the Empire, with the best Gentlemen in the Empire. And not content with making friends with the best Gentlemen in the Empire, he goes back in time and communes with the ancients. When one reads the poems and writings of the ancients, can it be right not to know something about them as men? Hence one tries to

---

[72] The three books are published respectively in 1949 (*Po Chu-i*), 1950 (*Li Po*), and 1956 (*Yuan Mei*). For publication data see note 1 above.

[73] David Hawkes wrote: "Dr. Waley seems early to have realized that translation of exotic texts is not enough if the reader has no mental framework to place them in. Hence were produced several delightful books in which he employed the arts of the historian and the biographer to convey to the western reader something of the milieu in which these poems were written." See David Hawkes, *Classical, Modern and Humane: Essays in Chinese Literature*, ed. by John Minford and Siu-kit Wong (Hong Kong: The Chinese University Press, 1989), p. 244.

[74] Hawkes, *Classical, Modern and Humane: Essays in Chinese Literature*, p. 244.

> understand the age in which they lived. This can be described as 'looking for friends in history.'[75]

The reader reads the poems, then wants to know the persons, which would in turn help him know more about the poems. The order was firstly to read the poems or works, then to examine the persons. The second should come naturally after the first. It was essential to put the emphasis on the works themselves, and the second ideally should come as a supplement. But it was also perhaps his "familiarity" with the persons, or desire to be familiar with them that enabled him to create a fictitious ancient world, establishing a living relationship with ancient people, looking for friends in Chinese history.

Waley, according to Jonathan Spence, was a humanist, along with the Bloomsbury group:

> [...] for they [people like E. M. Forster, Leonard, and Waley] were all educated in the same special area of pre-World War I Cambridge, and all lived well into the 1960's, shrewd observers of a cataclysmically changing scene. All three were very talented, and none of them was gregarious. They might meet occasionally [...] but they all defended their right to run their own lives. And all three [...] had an interest in Asia [...]
>
> Waley was a classicist; and he was also in King's College at the time when Goldsworthy Lowes Dickinson [...] still presided over young minds, inculcating the virtues of an esthetic humanism which are the heart of what people came to know as "Bloomsbury," virtues that were permanently captured in the essays and novels of E. M. Foster.[76]

Viewed in this light one may see more clearly the reason why he disliked Li Bo, a drunkard who was remembered in poems by friends far more than he wrote for them. By the same token Waley liked Bo Juyi and Yuan Mei because of their warmth and affability.[77] The former's close relationship with a fellow poet Yuan Zhen (Yuan Ch'an) is one of the most

---

[75] *Mencius*, translated by D. C. Lau (Hong Kong: The Chinese University Press, 1984), p. 219.

[76] Jonathan Spence, "The Explorer Who Never Left Home--Arthur Waley," *Rendition* 5 (Autumn 1975), 32-37 (pp. 32-33).

[77] In his books *Po Chu-i* and *Yuan Mei*, Waley praises the two poets respectively for their humanitarianism. Waley wrote, for example: "If Po had been a Western European he would no doubt have salved his conscience by subscribing to humanitarian societies, holding meetings, writing to the Press, and so on." *Po*

famous legends in Chinese literary history, and his concern for the down-trodden is equally well-known. Yuan Mei, meanwhile, was famed for his appeal for the return of genuine and instinctive nature of man, as opposed to yielding to social constraint. He is most well-known for his aversion to artificiality in poetry. His sympathy for women and the lower classes is also one of the main reasons why he is so famous and unusual among the Qing poets.

Goldsworthy Lowes Dickinson wrote in 1901, at a time when he had never visited China:

> In China [...] To feel, and in order to feel to express, or at least to understand the expression of all that is lovely in Nature, of all that is poignant and sensitive in man, is to us in itself a sufficient end. A rose in a moonlit garden, the shadow of trees on the turf, almond bloom, scent of pine, the winecup and the guitar; these and the pathos of life and death, the long embrace, the hand stretched out in vain, the moment that glides for ever away, with its freight of music and light, into the shadow and hush of the haunted past, all that we have, all that eludes us, a bird on the wing, a perfume escaped on the gale--to all these things we are trained to respond, and the response is what we call literature. This we have; this you cannot give us; but this you may so easily take away.[78]

These views represent a yearning for as well as a declaration of an ideal, and, in the meantime, in Spence's words, "a remarkable hymn to Chinese humanism." Some of his discussions concern the poetics of using concrete images, cherishing particularity over universality, and, in an implicit way, come close to the desire of concrete presentation initiated by T. E. Hulme and Ford Madox Ford, and to the idea of imagism expounded in

---

Chu-i, p. 160. He also wrote: "There are many anecdotes about the humanity and common sense displaced by Yuan Mei." *Yuan Mei*, p. 41.

[78] Jonathan Spence, "The Explorer Who Never Left Home--Arthur Waley," p. 33. The Bloomsbury group seems to have been very unhappy with the kind of social environment outside Cambridge, with its "ugliness and cruelty and insensitivity." The new Englishman, in Dickinson's words, was "Divorced from Nature but unreclaimed by Art; instructed, but not educated; assimilative, but incapable of thought." See *Rendition* 5 (Autumn 1975), 33. In such a world, it follows, the Athenian ideals could not be preserved. China, on the other hand, provided an ultimate solution, illusory though it may have been.

Pound's various works as well as Fenollosa's pamphlet on Chinese characters that were about to appear. This issue will be examined in more detail next chapter.

Waley's life-long dedication to the translation of Chinese literature created a China that was at once remote and contemporary. On many occasions his detailed biographical and geographical descriptions accompanying the translated poems offered his readers not only an experience of the literary works themselves, but also a close-up of the world in which the poets lived. As a result a network of Chinese situations and associations seems to have come into existence in English through Waley's hand. The settings of the poems plus the immediacy of the language became some kind of inspiration, for example, to the American poet James Wright, who found it quite natural to identify himself with the poetic experience of the ancient Chinese poet.[79]

From the three books respectively on Li Bo, Bo Juyi and Yuan Mei, one can see Waley was enthusiastic about two things: the descriptions of friendship,[80] and sites that are rich in association.[81] The emphasis on the former is in line with Waley's preoccupation with humanism, such as his conviction that the Chinese poet recommends himself not as a lover, but as a friend.[82] For the latter it is because historic sites are evocative of poetry

---

It is interesting to note that Pound, on the other hand, wrote that "this century may find a new Greece in China." *Literary Essays of Ezra Pound*, ed. by T. S. Eliot (London: Faber and Faber, 1960), p. 215.

[79] James Wright has written a poem likening his own situation in the mid-west with Bo Juyi's entering the Gorges, while using other Waley's translations as inter-texts as well. See James Wright, *Above the River: the Complete Poems* (New York: Farrar, Straus and Giroux, 1990), p. 119.

[80] See, for example, the detailed description of the friendship between Bo Juyi and Yuan Zhen from p. 28 up to the very end of the book *The Life and Times of Po Chu-i.*

[81] Waley often mentions historical sites and explains their exact locations. See, for example, *Po Chu-i*, p. 147, in which he gave a detailed description of the route Bo took to assume the duty of a government post. Similar attention to details about places and customs could be found in *Li Po* and *Yuan Mei.* Burton Watson, on the other hand, talks about historical places in Chinese literature: "In a country as old as China, place names naturally come to have rich historical or legendary associations [...] The poets of China [...] are fond of working place names into their poems [...] for the dramatic or nostalgic overtones that such names carry [...]" See Watson, *Chinese Lyricism: Shih Poetry from the Second to the Twelfth Century, with Translations* (New York: Columbia University Press, 1971), pp. 128-129.

[82] See Waley, "Love and Friendship in Chinese Poetry," in *Madly Singing in the Mountains*, pp. 295-296.

writing in Chinese tradition,[83] and, when the places are related to some historical incidents the poems become much more culture-oriented, while strengthening the sense of exoticism to the reader. Waley was very much obsessed with the names of ancient places, and always gives detailed account of the associations. In fact, the topics of friendship and travelling have occupied the main body of these three books.

The fact that Hawkes went to China while Waley refused to may suggest some differences between their approaches to the material, especially their attitudes towards the concept of "reality." When he turned down an invitation from Columbia University, Waley explained that he was "invincibly set against *deplacements* of any kind."[84] Commenting on this reply Ivan Morris wrote, "Yet until the very end he eagerly sought intellectual *deplacements*."[85] Waley praises Lin Shu (1852-1924) for his ability to "feel" the stories.[86] To Waley, the translator's technique of having a "feeling" was perhaps more fundamental in creating a sense of "realism" in the translated text than the actual experience of "seeing".

---

[83] A considerable amount of Chinese poetry was simply written on the occasion of visiting the historic sites. Du Fu, for example, has written the famous "Thoughts on Historical Sites" 詠懷古跡五首, among many others.

[84] Spence, "The Explorer Who Never Left Home--Arthur Waley," p. 81.

[85] Spence, "The Explorer Who Never Left Home--Arthur Waley," p. 81.

[86] Waley, "Notes on Translation," in *Madly Singing in the Mountains*, p. 160.

Chapter 6

Ezra Pound: And the Grandeur That is *Cathay*

Ezra Pound's theory of translation is manifested in his triple notion of *melopoeia*, *phanopoeia* and *logopoeia*. He thinks that it is impossible to translate *melopoeia*, the musical property that directs the bearing of the meaning of the words, from one language to another, while *phanopoeia*, a casting of images upon the visual imagination, can be translated. *Logopoeia*, the dance of the intellect among words, does not translate. While one cannot translate *logopoeia* "locally," Pounds says, one may be able to find a derivative or an equivalent, provided that one could determine the original author's state of mind.[1] Pound explains further:

> *Logopoeia* [...] employs words not only for their direct meaning, but it takes count in a special way of habits of usage, of the context we *expect* to find with the word, its usual concomitants, of its known acceptances [...][2]

It was the concept *logopoeia* that aroused most controversy when it first appeared.[3] Pound's remark in 1918 throws some light on the subject:

> [...] if a work be taken abroad in the original tongue, certain properties seem to become less apparent, or less important. Fancy styles, questions of local "taste," lose importance [...] almost the only technique perceptible to a foreigner is the presentation of content as free as possible from the clutteration of dead technicalities [...] This is perhaps the only technique that ever matters, the only *maestria*.[4]

---

[1] *Literary Essays of Ezra Pound*, ed. and with an introduction by T. S. Eliot (London: Faber & Gwyer, 1954), p. 25.
[2] *Literary Essays of Ezra Pound*, p. 25.
[3] William Empson takes it as verbal ambiguity; J. P. Sullivan thinks that it means a kind of irony. See J. P. Sullivan, *Ezra Pound and Sextus Propertius* (Austin: University of Texas Press, 1966), pp. 64-67.
[4] Pound, "French Poets," *Little Review* 4.10 (February 1918), [3]- 61. Pound, *Make It New* (New Haven: Yale University Press, 1935), pp. 159-60.

The pertinent notion here is to be "free" from the confinement of the "local" taste, and to work the text out, or make its way into the target system. The translator should take into account the time, place, and ideological restrictions of the source texts, and should be subjected by the mood, atmosphere, and thought processes of the text in time, while the mood and atmosphere in time and place are to be transposed to the present culture to become a contemporary text. To achieve this the translator is to create new connections in the present and to act as a living and creating subject.[5]

Pound's idea of the *maestria* is all the more clear if one examines what kind of translations he cherished, and what he denounced. When he criticized Milton and praised Arthur Golding, for example, he was thinking of the English tradition, mainly the language:

> Milton [...] tried to turn English into Latin; to use an uninflected language as if it were an inflected one, neglecting the genius of English, distorting its fibrous manner [...] Golding in the ninth year of Elizabeth can talk of "Charles his wane" in translating Ovid, but Milton's fields are "irriguous," or worse, and much more notably displeasing [...][6]

He even goes so far as to say that Arthur Golding's *Metamorphoses* is "possibly the most beautiful book in our language."[7] Although he also says apologetically that "Charles his wane," apparently meaning adding or improvising information to the translated text, is not the only way of translation, he nonetheless thinks it a practicable or even desirable approach:

> I am not insisting on "Charles his wane" as the sole mode of translation. I point out that Golding was endeavouring to convey the sense of the original to his readers. He names the thing of his original author, by the name most

[5] See also the summary of Pound's concept of *logopoeia* in Gentzler, *Contemporary Translation Theories* (London and New York: Routledge, 1993), pp. 24-25.
[6] Pound, *Make It New*, pp. 109-110.
[7] Pound, *Make It New*, p. 110.

> germane, familiar, homely, to his hearers. He is intent on conveying a meaning, and not on bemusing them with a rumble. And I hold that the real poet is sufficiently absorbed in his content to care more for the content than the rumble; and also that Chaucer and Golding are more likely to find the *mot juste* [...][8]

To convey to the reader a meaning by the most familiar and homely names is what a translator should aim at, according to this notion. But there are a lot of discrepancies between his theory and practice, especially in the translation of Confucian *Odes* later in his career.

Pound stated in the preface to *Cathay*:

> "Cathay, Translations By Ezra Pound, For The Most Part From The Chinese of Rihahu, From The Notes of The Late Earnest Fenollosa, And The Decipherings of The Professors Mori And Ariga."[9]

It is exactly the very term "translation" that may arouse controversy. Pound admits at the outset firstly, that the translations were only from the notes of another person, who was dead, and, in other words, not in a working relationship with the translator; secondly, that they were the decipherings of not one, but two other people. If the translator in this situation is triply removed from the original authors (they lived, one may add, over a thousand years ago, and their names did not even appear in the way they were pronounced in the original, but in yet another language, Japanese), the reader should be viewed as even further removed. What kind of China, called Cathay, could consequently emerge?

To a life-long dedicated professional like Arthur Waley, Pound's attempts were at best but a brilliant paraphrase.[10] It is interesting to note that Waley himself was once

---

[8] Pound, *Make It New*, p. 110.

[9] See Wai-lim Yip, *Ezra Pound's Cathay* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1969), p. 3. This short introduction could not be found in the *Cathay* poems anthologized in *Personae* (New York: New Directions, 1990).

accused of the same sin by Giles, especially in the use of a rhymeless free verse and call it poetry.[11] While Waley did not bother to enumerate Pound's numerous mistakes, many others did, perhaps not without some kind of delight. Pound's *Cathay*, ironically, has laid ground for scholarship in this area.[12] One of the most famous criticisms that may also represent how the traditional sinologist/ translator looks at the issue is Achilles Fang's "Fenollosa and Pound," in which he catalogues all kinds of mistakes in Pound's version.[13] Hugh Kenner, though not knowing Chinese himself, remarked that "there is virtually a canonical list" of the philological mistakes in *Cathay*.[14] Some of the notorious mistakes Pound made are: in "Separation on the River Kiang," "kiang" means "river" and is not the name of some river; "Ko-jin" was taken as a proper name, while it actually means "old friend," and Pound has him go west when he should go east; "The River Song," a famous "howler," consists of two Li Bo's poems representing opposite views of life, and the title of the second poem becomes the middle part that joins the two poems together. There is hardly a stone in *Cathay* that has not been turned. Some critics seem to be saying: You said this was translation; now look what you have done. Behind these attempts to point out mistakes is the belief that faithfulness is a rule that cannot be broken.

---

[10] See Arthur Waley, *The Poetry and Career of Li Po, A. D. 701-762* (London: George Allen & Unwin Ltd, 1950), p. 11.

[11] Like Pound, Waley did not use rhyme. Waley's argument is that rhymes may bring "one too far away from the original." See *Madly Singing in the Mountains: An Appreciation and Anthology of Arthur Waley,* ed. with a preface by Ivan Morris (London: George Allen & Unwin Ltd, 1970), p. 158. Pound's reason is: "I have no especial interest in rhyme. It tends to draw away the artist's attention from forty to ninety per cent of his syllables and concentrate it on the admittedly more prominent reminder. It tends to draw him into prolixity and pull him away from the thing." See "I Gather the Limbs of Osiris," *New Age* 10.16 (February 15, 1912), 370.

[12] Criticisms on the linguistic errors of *Cathay* include George Kennedy's article "Fenollosa, Pound and the Chinese Character," *Yale Literary Magazine* 36 (December 1958), 24-36; Pen-ti Lee and Donald Murray, "The Quality of *Cathay*: Ezra Pound's Early Translations of Chinese Poems," *Literature East and West* 10. 3 (September 1966), 264-277.

[13] Achilles Fang, "Fenollosa and Pound," *Harvard Journal of Asian Studies*, 20 (June 1957).

[14] Hugh Kenner, *The Pound Era* (London: Faber & Faber, 1971), pp. 203-204.

The culprit, however, received a much warmer welcome from critics who appreciated the work as poetry. Ford Madox Hueffer, for example, has this to say, "The poems in *Cathay* are things of a supreme beauty. What poetry should be, that they are."[15] Hugh Deane's comment is simple: "They are poems themselves."[16] These compliments, however, did not touch upon the issue of translation. T. S. Eliot believed that *Cathay* would be called "a magnificent specimen of XXth Century poetry" rather than a "translation."[17] Hugh Kenner put it bluntly, "*Cathay* is notable, considered as an English product rather than Chinese product."[18] As to how and why he came up with such a conclusion he did not elaborate. The work was nonetheless read as a representation of a China that is ancient, remote, and passionate, though ironically the speakers now speak with a modern style, with distorted syntax that is distinctly different from Giles and Legge's.

The *Cathay* poems helped to present an alternative poetics at that time, and managed to enter the mainstream of poetic convention in the English speaking world. Hugh Kenner observes, "*Cathay* encouraged subsequent translators of Chinese to abandon rhyme and fixed stress counts. It also inaugurated the long tradition of Pound the inspired but unreliable translator."[19] *Cathay* started a new approach to the translation of Chinese poetry that was to be followed by many, such as Rexroth and Snyder,[20] whose translations are not so much to bring Chinese literature into the English system as to write English poems that are purportedly from the Chinese. To these translators, having a good knowledge of the source language is not mandatory, whereas Waley and Giles would have

---

[15] T. S. Eliot, *Ezra Pound: His Metric and Poetry* (New York: Knopf, 1917), p. 26.
[16] Hugh Deane, "Ezra Pound's Chinese Translucencies," *Eastern Horizon* 20.4 (April 1981), 39.
[17] T. S. Eliot, *Ezra Pound: His Metric and Poetry*, p. 15.
[18] Hugh Kenner, *The Poetry of Ezra Pound* (London: Faber & Faber, 1951), p. 154.
[19] Kenner, *The Pound Era*, p. 199.

heated debates over the "true meaning" of a Chinese character.[21] But the significance of *Cathay* goes far beyond influencing a few prominent translators to try their hands in this field. It coincided, to say the least, an age of poetic movement. *Cathay*'s real achievement, Hugh Kenner observes, "lay not on the frontier of comparative poetics, but securely within the effort, then going forward in London, to rethink the nature of an English poem."[22]

The fourteen poems in the original *Cathay* were selections made from one hundred fifty in the Fenollosa notebooks.[23] Pound's selections testify to the fact that he was aware that, in Lefevere's words, the themes "must be relevant to society for the work of literature to be noticed."[24] It is the target system, or the entering into it, once again, which is the controlling factor. There are some unifying sentiments in *Cathay* that echo the temperament of the time.[25] Notice, for example, the sense of exile and estrangement in these lines ("Exile's Letter"), which was topical during World War I:

> And if you ask how I regret that parting:
> It is like the flowers falling at Spring's end
> Confused, whirled in a tangle.
> What is the use of talking, and there is no end of talking,
> There is no end of things in the heart.
> I call in the boy,
> Have him sit on his knees here
> To seal this,
> And send it a thousand miles, thinking.[26]

---

[20] For more details about Pound's influence on Gary Snyder and Kenneth Rexroth see the concluding chapter, James Wilson, "Ritual and Reception: Ezra Pound's Translations of Troubadour and Chinese Lyrics" (unpublished doctoral dissertation, University of California, Berkeley, 1987).

[21] See Morris, *Madly Singing in the Mountains,* pp. 297-302.

[22] Kenner, *The Pound Era*, p. 199.

[23] See Kenner, *The Pound Era*, p. 198.

[24] Theo Hermans, *The Manipulation of Literature* (London: Croom Helm, 1985), p. 229.

[25] Hugh Kenner summarized the themes of *Cathay* in this way "Its [Cathay's] exiled bowmen, deserted women, levelled dynasties, departures for far places, lonely frontier guardsmen and glories remembered from afar, cherished memories, were selected from the diverse wealth in the notebooks by a sensibility responsive to torn Belgium and disrupted London [...]" Kenner, *The Pound Era*, p. 202.

[26] *Personae*, p. 139. A word-for-word translation of the original is:

問	余	別	恨	今	多	少
Ask	me	separation	sorrow	now	how	much

The colon at the end of the first line suggests that the depiction of the falling petals in the second line is an answer to the question posed. Note that the words "is like" are added by Pound. The natural scene about the falling flowers is used to suggest the human feeling, a common technique in *Cathay*. The inexplicable sorrow becomes more acute with this natural correlation. But the mode of presentation is now changed, from *xing* to an obvious comparison.[27]

The juxtaposition of images in Pound's poems is related to his manipulation of line-units. In the lines quoted above Pound adds more details to the scene, making it a vivid description of motion, not just a static one, and the intensity of emotion is increased

---

落	花	春	暮	爭	紛	紛
Falling	flowers	Spring	end	bustle	confusion	confusion
言	亦	不	可	盡		
Words	also	not	possible	end		
情	亦	不	可	極		
Emotions	also	not	possible	end		
呼	兒	長	跪	緘	此	辭
Call	boy	long	kneel	seal	this	letter
寄	君	千	里	遙	相	憶
Send	you	thousand	miles	afar	mutually	remember

[27] In 1914, shortly before he published *Cathay*, Pound observed that in the *haiku*:

> The footsteps of cat upon the snow:
> (are like) plum blossoms.

the words "'are like' would not even have occurred in the original." Pound, *Fortnightly Review*, 96 (Sept. 1, 1914), 471. It was also discussed in Chapter 4 how a Chinese poem closes by asking a question, only followed by a depiction of the scene. The speaker invites the audience to join in the creative process in this way. The translator, however, uses the phrases "as much as," "just see," which are absent in the original, to make clear that this is the answer to the question. The intention to demonstrate something with yet another thing, that is, an abstract feeling with some concrete images, is implicitly shown. In the original passage the scene is presented immediately after the question, without any qualification as to what or where it belongs. It could well be a spontaneous encounter of a natural scene by the poet right at the moment after the question is

through the three-part structure of the sentence: "It is like the flowers falling at Spring's end/ Confused,/ whirled in a tangle." A similar device of piling up anxiety and frustration is found in the next sentence: "What is the use of talking,/ and there is no end of talking,/ there is no end of things in the heart." The structure of these lines departs from the original. There is a gushing and compelling mood, which is gathering strength as the poem moves on.[28]

The phrase "confused, whirled in a tangle" is added by Pound, most likely to strengthen, as the words themselves suggest, the confusion, in both the speaker's mind and the scene. It also matches in intensity with the lines followed. Pound's alteration shows a tendency to manipulate the line-units to intimate the emotion, to highlight the images, and to achieve a sonorous effect. There is a fluency of language and a quickening of rhythm (he slows down the tempo all of a sudden before the ending by using a comma to split the last word "thinking" from the rest of the line). The images of fallen petals "whirled in a tangle" substitute words, and the lines are followed by the lively, sweeping, and colloquial language (as opposed to the written, classical style of the original) of question and answer about the futility of talking and even feeling. The ponderous mood is authenticated by the

---

asked, and the answer therefore blends with the atmosphere, hence the feeling, in the way which *xing* is supposed to be.

[28] After Pound translated the "Exile's Letter, " Arthur Waley tried his hand also. This is the last stanza of Waley's version:

> And should you ask how many were my regrets at parting--
> They fell upon me thick as the flowers that fall at Spring's end.
> But I cannot tell you all-- could not even if I went on thinking for ever,
> So I call in the boy and make him kneel here and tie this up
> And send it to you, a remembrance from a thousand miles away.

Arthur Waley, *The Poetry and Career of Li Po, A. D. 701-762* (London: George Allen & Unwin Ltd, 1950), p. 15. The number of lines as well as the general structure of individual lines in Waley's version bear resemblance to the original. The lines are smooth, and the emotions restrained (The line "But I cannot [...]" sounds more like someone is trying to explain and convince another person in a calm tone, yet with sincerity), as opposed to Pound's emotional statements.

manipulation of the line units, with the weighty and isolated word "thinking" at the very end.

In "The City of Choan" Pound also restructures the line-units to foreground the details:

> The phoenix are at play on their terrace.
> The phoenix are gone, the river flows on alone
> Flowers and grass
> Cover over the dark path
> where lay the dynastic house of the Go.
> The bright cloths and bright caps of Shin
> Are now the base of old hills.
>
> The Three Mountains fall through the far heaven,
> The isle of White Heron
> splits the two streams apart.
> Now the high clouds cover the sun
> And I cannot see Choan afar
> And I am sad.[29]

---

[29] *Personae*, p. 142. A word-for-word translation of the original is:

鳳	凰	台	上	鳳	凰	遊
(Phoenix)		terrace	on		(phoenix)	play
鳳	去	台	空	江	自	流
Phoenix	gone	terrace	empty	stream	flow	alone
吳	宮	花	草 ·	埋	幽	徑
Wu	palace	flowers	grass	buried	dark	path
漢	代	衣	冠	成	古	邱
Chin	dynasty	robes	caps	become	old	mounds
三	山	半	落	青	天	外
Three	mountains	half	fall	blue	sky	beyond
二	水	中	分	白	鷺	洲
Two	waters	middle	split	White	Heron	Isle
總	爲	浮	雲	能	蔽	日
(Always)		floating	clouds	can	cover	sun
長	安	不	見	使	人	愁
Chang	An	unable	see	make	me	sad

The images in the third and fourth lines are re-arranged to give a sharp contrast between the present and the past. It is only in the last part of the triple structure, "where lay the dynastic house of the Go," that the stark reality is revealed. The bright cloths and bright caps of a previous dynasty, meanwhile, are but the base of old hills, and the truth is presented only at the end, almost as a surprise. Pound keeps the dynastic names "Go" and "Chin," as they are self-explanatory as well as giving an exotic flavour. In the next stanza, "the isle of White Heron" stands as an independent unit that graphically "splits the two streams apart." The last line, "And I am sad," is shorter than the original line (which becomes the last two lines in the translation). It is placed at the end of the poem to summarize the sense of loss and estrangement, and to juxtapose with the images in the previous lines.

Pound's strategy can be seen more clearly by comparing his translation with Bynner's.[30] While Pound mainly let the images speak for themselves, Bynner appeals more to narration, providing, for example, a cause-and-effect relation in the first line. The dramatic contrast of the past and present in Pound's lines is presented in a prosaic manner in Bynner's version, in which no ironical twist is found. Bynner seems to find the transition of scenes between the first and second stanzas too abrupt, and adds three dots in between to

---

[30] This is Bynner's version:

> On Climbing in Nanking to the Terrace of Phoenixes
>
> Phoenix that played here once, so that the place was named for them,
> Have abandoned it now to this desolate river;
> The paths of Wu Palace are crooked with weeds;
> The garments of Chin are ancient dust.
> [...] Like this green horizon halving the Three Peaks,
> Like this island of White Egrets dividing the river,
> A cloud has arisen between the Light of Heaven and me,
> To hide his city from my melancholy heart.

Witter Bynner and Kiang Kang-hu, *The Jade Mountain* (New York: Knopf, 1929), p. 58.

ease the tension created by the sudden shift. The two "like's" are added by Bynner, probably for explicatory purposes.

A Chinese line usually consists of two to three images. Pound may find it easy to break the line up, while Bynner follows the original structure, with one English line corresponding to one Chinese. Pound's line-unit arrangement, hence the juxtaposition of images, is done by reshuffling the component parts of the Chinese lines. The first and second Chinese lines, for example, provide images for Pound's first and second lines. The third and fourth Chinese lines, when re-composed, become the third, fourth, fifth, sixth, and seventh lines, or graphic units, of Pound's poem. The new language, therefore, is instrumental in juxtaposing the images.

The natural (or not so natural) scene which introduces the poem "Taking Leave of a friend," parallels the human feeling, in the original as well as in Pound's translation:

> Blue mountains to the north of the walls,
> White river winding about them;
> Here we must make separation
> And go out through a thousand miles of dead grass.
>
> Mind like a floating wide cloud,
> Sunset like the parting of old acquaintances
> Who bow over their clasped hands at a distance.
> Our horses neigh to each other
> as we are departing.[31]

---

[31] *Personae*, p. 141. A word-for-word translation of the original is:

青	山	橫	北	郭
Green	mountains	across	north	wall
白	水	繞	東	城
White	water	surround	east	city
此	地	一	爲	別
Here	place	once	as	separation
孤	蓬	萬	里	征
Lonely	grass	thousands	li's	wander
浮	雲	遊	子	意
Floating	clouds	(sojourner)		mind

The blue mountain creates a sense of sadness and an exotic atmosphere. It is "here," in these mountains and rivers, that the poet and his friend separate. The grass, and even the horse, seem to speak for the sadness. In the original the images are in paratactic relation. Neither the mind and the floating clouds, nor sunset and acquaintances, have any connection. They are presented in x*ing* fashion, in which a natural scene is placed side by side with the human feelings. Here Pound changed them to a comparison. But the evocative force of nature and its distant link with human affairs in the whole poem are basically kept intact.

The notion of foreigness is pervasive in the *Cathay* poems. When it comes to a scene that in itself is not so exotic, the sense of familiarity mixed with beauty makes the mood of foreignness that is hanging behind all the more acute:

> March has come to the bridge-head,
> Peach boughs and apricot boughs hang over a
> thousand gates,
> At morning there are flowers to cut the heart,
> And evening drives them on the eastward-flowing waters.
> Petals are on the gone waters and on the going,
> And on the back-swirling eddies,
> But to-day's men are not the men of the old days,
> Though they hang in the same way over the bridge-rail.
> The sea's colour moves at the dawn [32]

落	日	故	人	情
Sun	set	old	friend	feeling
揮	手	自	茲	去
Waving	hands	from	here	go
蕭	蕭	班	馬	鳴
Neign	neigh	departing	horse	noise

[32] "Poem by the Bridge at T'ien-Shin," in *Personae*, p. 135. A word-for-word translation of the original is:

天	津	三	月	時
Tian	Jin	third	month	time

One of Waley's critics demurred that he did not need a Chinese poet to tell him that rivers did not turn back in their courses.[33] The lines about the natural process that could not be reversed dwell on the same analogy, but the yearning and regretful sensations could still be powerful. The poignancy of the poem lies precisely in the interplay between the natural course and the human fate, in the fusion between man and nature. The reader is reminded, once again, that what he is watching is a foreign and ancient land, which, of course, may give a sense of universality to the scene as well:

> And the princes still stand in rows, about the throne,
> And the moon falls over the portals of Sei-go-yo,[34]

千	門	桃	與	李
Thousand	gates	peach	and	apricot
朝	爲	斷	腸	花
Morning	as	broken	guts	flowers
暮	逐	東	流	去
Evening	drift	east	flow	water
前	水	復	後	水
Gone	water	then	going	water
古	今	相	續	流
Ancient	present	(repeatedly)		flow
新	人	非	舊	人
Today	men	not	yesterday	men
年	年	橋	上	遊
Year	year	bridge	above	travel
雞	鳴	海	色	動
Cocks	crow	sea	colour	moves

[33] Morris, *Madly Singing in the Mountains*, p. 134.
[34] "Poems by the Bridge at T'ien-Shin," in *Personae*, p. 135.

謁	帝	羅	公	侯
Visit	emperor	line-up	(princes)	
月	落	西	上	陽
Moon	falls	west	Shang	Yang

Besides mixing the familiar with the exotic, this poem also shows an inter-cutting of planes of experience, a technique that one often finds in the *Cantos*. What is hanging above are not just the peach and apricot boughs, but nature as a whole, as opposed to the human world. Such kind of parallels reminds one of the Chinese notion of *xing*, when nature was seen as an evocative force which was not explicitly spelled out. In this poem the parallel is also implied. The poem opens with a depiction of scene, only followed by the seventh line of human affair, "But to-day's men are not [...]" Then after a glimpse of the sea's colour, one is shown the rows of princes. The sense of *xing* in the original, in which the human world parallels the natural one, is subtly retained.

One could find similar approaches, a natural world that creates resonance in the human world, in many of the *Cathay* poems:[35]

> The clouds have gathered, and gathered,
> and the rain falls and falls,
> The eight ply of the heavens
> are all folded into one darkness,
> And the wide, flat road stretches out.
> I stop in my room toward the East, quiet, quiet.[36]

---

[35] These are some more examples:

> By the North Gate, the wind blows full of sand,
> Lonely from the beginning of time until now!
> "Lament of the Frontier Guard," *Personae*, p. 136.

> The leaves fall early this autumn, in wind.
> The paired butterflies are already yellow with August
> Over the grass in the west garden;
> They hurt me. I grow older.
> "The River-Merchant's Wife: A Letter," *Personae*, p. 134.

[36] "The Unmoving Cloud," *Personae*, p. 146. A word-for-word translation of the original is:

靄	靄	停	雲
Cloudy	cloudy	still	clouds

The opening scene, with clouds, rains, darkness, eight ply of the heavens and the wide, flat road, parallels the human situation. The link between the two worlds is left unspoken, and the reader is drawn to supply the connection. The images here, as Hugh Kenner observes, "exist not as stage-dressing, as atmospheric props for a display of the writer's chagrin, but as a constellation intrinsically and inevitably related to the inherent mood."[37] To use Pound's words, poetry is "a sort of inspired mathematics, which gives us equations, not for abstract figures, triangles, spheres, and the like, but equations for the human emotions."[38] He also writes that great literature is simply language charged with meaning to the utmost possible degree.[39] Emotion embedded in things, it should be pointed out, is also the essence of *xing*, only *xing* puts emphasis on the intuitive aspect, and on the human emotions implanted in natural things.

The last line of "Song of the Bowmen of Shu" sums up the alienation sentiment of the poem, and to a great extent most of the *Cathay* poems:

Our mind is full of sorrow, who will know of our grief?[40]

濛	濛	時	雨
Misty	misty	seasonal	rain
八	表	同	昏
Eight	directions	all	dark
平	路	伊	阻
Flat	roads	particle	blocked

[37] Kenner, *The Poetry of Ezra Pound*, p. 67.
[38] Ezra Pound, *The Spirit of Romance* (Norfolk, Connecticut: New Directions, 1952), p. 14.
[39] Pound, *Literary Essays of Ezra Pound*, ed. by T. S. Eliot (London: Faber and Faber, 1960), p. 23.
[40] *Personae*, p. 131. A word-for-word translation of the original is:

我	心	傷	悲
My	heart	sad	melancholic
莫	知	我	哀
None	knows	my	sorrows

It is also this poem that fascinated the sculptor Gaudier-Brzeska, who wrote in the battlefield during World War I:

> I keep the book in my pocket [...] Indeed I use [the poems] to put courage in my fellows. I speak now of the "Bowmen" and the "North Gate" ["Lament of the Frontier Guard"] which are so appropriate to our case.[41]

He wrote in another letter that "like the chinese bowmen in Ezra's poem we had rather eat fern shoots than go back now."[42] Hugh Kenner summarizes the contemporaneous quality of the *Cathay* poems in this way: "Perfectly vital after 50 years, they are among the most durable of all poetic responses to World War I."[43]

Actually up to the present some scholars still think *Cathay* the best translations of Chinese poems into English.[44] There should be something in it, other than the war sentiments, that could appeal to audience for almost a century. Some critics view the reception of *Cathay* as the ability of Pound to make foreign elements familiar to the contemporary readers.[45] Besides the sense of familiarity, however, *Cathay* also gives a clear exotic look, exotic mood, exotic environment and even exotic tradition. Michael Alexander has put it cogently that "the charm of *Cathay* is to do with *chinoiserie*, the exotic colours, quaint customs and refined sensation of a world that is different-yet-the-same. This is in part a conscious exploitation: Pound's own sensuous enchantment with China [...]"[46]

---

[41] Kenner, *The Pound Era*, p. 202.
[42] Kenner, *The Pound Era*, p. 203.
[43] Kenner, *The Pound Era*, p. 202
[44] See Michael Alexander, *The Poetic Achievement of Ezra Pound* (London & Boston: Faber and Faber, 1978), p. 97.
[45] See, for example, A. J. Palandri, "'The Stone is Alive in My Hand"-- Ezra Pound's Chinese Translations,' *Literature: East and West* 10 (1966), 278-291 (p. 279), in which Palandri praises "the natural freshness and the modern temper" of *Cathay*. David Hawkes also writes, "One of Pound's real contributions as a translator is his knack of feeling for the mood of a poem and setting it in an analogous Western key." David Hawkes, "Translating from the Chinese," in *Classical, Modern and Humane: Essays in Chinese Literature*, ed. by John Minford and Siu-kit Wong (Hong Kong: The Chinese University Press,) p. 235.
[46] Alexander, *The Poetic Achievement of Ezra Pound*, p. 100.

The strangeness is sometimes manifested in the strange colours. These are lines from "Exile's Letter:"

> With the willow flakes falling like snow,
> And the vermillioned girls getting drunk about sunset,
> And the water, a hundred feet deep, reflecting green eyebrows
> -- Eyebrows painted green are a fine sight in young moonlight.[47]

There is a kind of sensuous and strange charm in these lines. Words like "willow," "snow," "vermillioned girls," "sunset," "water reflecting green eyebrows" and "moonlight" form a colourful yet exotic picture. The warm colours in the second line are in sharp contrast with the coldness suggested in other lines. The green eyebrows are foregrounded through repetition ("green eyebrows" and "eyebrows painted green"); they are reflected in the "hundred feet deep" water (the sense of greenness is thus strengthened), and are seen in young moonlight (the paleness and coldness are highlighted). Green eyebrows, particularly seen under moonlight, present a weird, mysterious, and even ghostly scene. The word "green" here, however, is but in the original an adjective qualifying the charm of jade, its refinement, fairness and brightness, and there is no eerie scene depicted.

"The Beautiful Toilet" begins with these lines:

> Blue, blue is the grass about the river
> And the willows have overfilled the close garden.[48]

---

[47] *Personae* , p. 139. A word-for-word translation of the original is:

其	若	楊	花	似	雪	何
It	is like	catkins	flowers	is like	snow	rather
紅	妝	若	醉	宜	斜	日
Rouge	makeup	seem	drunk	suitable	slanting	sun
清	潭	百	尺	寫	翠	蛾
Clear	pond	hundred	feet	reflect	jade eyebrows	
翠	蛾	嬋	娟	初	月	輝
Jade	eyebrows	fair	refined	early (crescent eyebrows)	moon	bright

[48] *Personae*, p. 132. For the word-for-word translation of the original see Chapter 5, note 26.

The blue grass gives a sense of strangeness. The Chinese word for the colour, *qing* 青, means green, blue, or colour of nature. Pound may have been misled by the Fenollosa notes to interpret it as blue, but it is even more likely that he preferred the strangeness of "blue grass" (and "blue mountain" in "Taking Leave of a Friend" cited above).[49] A sense of

---

[49] Some other strange colours could be found in "The River Song:"

> And I have joy in these words
> like the joy of blue islands.
> [...]
> I looked at the dragon-pond, with its willow-coloured water
> Just reflecting the sky's tinge,
> And heard the five-score nightingales aimlessly singing.
> [...]
> The purple house and the crimson are full of spring softness.
> South of the pond the willow-tips are half-blue and bluer
> Their cords tangle in mist, against the brocade-like palace.
> [...]
> The wind bundles itself into a bluish cloud and wanders off.
> [...]
> Five clouds hang aloft, bright on the purple sky,
> The imperial guards come forth from the golden house with their armour a-gleaming.

Personae, p. 133. A word-for-word translation of the original is:

詩	成	笑	傲	凌	滄	洲
Poem	done	laugh	proud	over	*cang*	coves
[...]						
(On the Dragon-Pond the willows are in their fresh green)						
[...]						
紫	殿	紅	樓	覺	春	好
Purple	palace	crimson	mansion	feel	spring	good
池	南	柳	色	半	青	青
Pond	south	willow	colour	half	green	green
縈	煙	裊	裊	拂	綺	城
Reeling	smoke	dangle	dangle	touch	brocade	city
[...]						
春	風	卷	入	碧	雲	去
Spring	winds	roll	into	blue	clouds	go
[...]						
五	雲	垂	暉	耀	紫	清
Five	clouds	hang	rays	brighten	purple	sky
仗	出	金	宮	隨	日	轉
Insignia	issue	golden	palace	follows	sun	turn

sentimentalism as well as uncanniness is also created. As a matter of fact, Pound is very much in line with Waley in this particular respect: pathos and strangeness are elements commonly found in their Chinese translations. The syntax of "Taking Leave of a Friend" and "The Beautiful Toilet," meanwhile, also reveals some kind of strangeness, as it departs from the normal structure, which usually would run somewhat like "There are blue mountains [...]" or "The blue mountains are [...]" and "Blue is the grass [...]" (instead of the "double blues") not to mention the inversion.

There are many proper names in *Cathay*. They were transliterations from, not the Chinese, but the Japanese, which were laid down by the late Fenollosa and his Japanese teachers. Pen-ti Lee and Donald Murray think that some of the names are unnecessary and presumptuous.[50] The fact that Pound used so many of them in the poems perhaps served to remind the reader of foreigness. The foreign names do not damage the overall meaning of the poems because the poems are full of concrete images. It is the images, or the juxtaposition of them, that give strength to the presentation. The exotic names were not meant to be fully recognized anyway, as in these lines:

> From them the yellow dogs howl portents in vain,
> And what they compared to the lady Riokushu,
> That was cause of hate!
> Who among them is a man like Han-rei
> Who departed alone with his mistress,
> With her hair unbound, and he his own skiffsman![51]

"Green" is almost invariably changed to blue in Pound's rendition, even when it is a plant that is being described. There are various colours: "blue islands," "the purple house," "the crimson," "the bluish cloud," "the purple sky," "the golden house, " "willow-coloured water," and "the willow-tips that are half-blue and bluer." There are audio, visual, and tactile images: "dragon-pond," "the sky's tinge," "the five-score nightingales," "the spring softness," "the mist," "the brocade-like palace," "the five clouds," and "the armour a-gleaming." They are juxtaposed with each other, forming an exotic picture of beauty and charm. Contrary to his claim that local taste is not to be translated, Pound on many occasions highlights the Chinese flavour to create an ancient and remote world.

[50] Pen-ti Lee and Donald Murray, "The Quality of *Cathay*: Ezra Pound's Early Translations of Chinese Poems," 268.

[51] *Personae*, p. 135. A word-for-word translation of the original is:

黃	犬	空	歎	息
Yellow	dog	in vain	(sighed)	

In other places, names like "Shi-yo" or "Riboku" (a general in the Han Dynasty; not the poet "Rihaku," Li Bo), which presumably exist in the cribs, one may understand why they are there in the poems. There are names, however, that may not be in the cribs as such, and one can never know whether Pound misunderstood the cribs or deliberately put down common nouns as proper ones.[52] And then when it comes to names by themselves would carry Chinese or foreign flavour, Pound does not hesitate to translate the meanings, not the sounds, such as in the line "They ride upon dragon-like horses" ("Poem by the Bridge at Ten-Shin"); "Yesterday we went out of the Wild-Goose gate" ("South-Folk in Cold Country").

Sometimes even when the details are not self-explanatory, Pound still does not avoid them, but provides more information to make it meaningful:

> The Dai horse neighs against the bleak wind of Etsu,
> The birds of Etsu have no love for En, in the North,[53]

綠 Green (Lady Luju)	珠 Pearl	成 became	讐 vengeance	讎 retribution
何 Why not	如 like	鴟 Chi	夷 Yi	子 sir
散 Loosen	髮 hair	掉 went	扁 (boating)	舟

[52] As mentioned above, for example, in the line "If you are coming down through the narrows of the river Kiang" ("River-Merchant's Wife," *Personae*, p. 134), "Kiang" means river, and what it says then becomes "River River."

[53] "South-Folk in Cold Country," *Personae*, p. 143. A word-for-word translation of the original is:

代 Dai (north)	馬 horses	不 not	思 think	越 Yue
越 Yue (south)	禽 birds	不 not	戀 love	燕 Yan

"Dai" (a Japanese pronunciation) refers to the north. The original of the first line actually means that the Dai horse does not think of "Etsu" ("Yu" in Chinese transliteration), and Pound's line just means the opposite. But what difference, to Pound and to the general reader, does it make anyway? In the second line, Pound adds the explanatory phrase "in the north" to make the meaning clear. One should be reminded that it is exactly the simple feeling and presentation of these two lines that earned the praise from the translator himself, who wrote that they were direct, without unnecessary adjectives and no sentimentalism.[54]

It is ironic that the foreign atmosphere in the eyes of the Chinese depicted in the poems also constitutes a *gestalt* of foreignness to the English reader:

> Surprised. Desert turmoil. Sea sun.
> Flying snow bewilders the barbarian heaven.
> Lice swarm like ants over our accoutrements.[55]

"Surprised" and "sea" in the original act as modifiers for "sands" and "sun" respectively. Pound split up the line into independent units, accentuating the sense of bewilderment by juxtaposing the images. Similar technique could be found in the last line below:

> I climb the towers and towers
> to watch out the barbarous land:
> Desolate castle, the sky, the wide desert.[56]

---

[54] "Chinese Poetry," *Today* 3 (April 1918), 54.

[55] "South-Folk in Cold Country." *Personae*, p. 143. A word-for-word translation of the original is:

惊	沙	亂	海	日
Surprise	sands	confuses	sea	sun
飛	雪	迷	胡	天
Fly	snow	bewilders	barbarian	sky

[56] Pound, "Lament of the Frontier Guard," *Personae*, p. 136. A word-for-word translation of the original is:

登	高	望	戎	虜
Climb	up	watch	(barbarians)	

Pound' conscious effort to exoticize the text can be seen not just in dealing with names, scenes, or moods, but also in the making of an image of a Chinese character, usually a woman. The opening lines of the "Ballad of the Mulberry Road," for example, are:

> The sun rises in south-east corner of things
> To look on the tall house of the Shin
> For they have a daughter named Rafu (pretty girl),
> She made the name for herself: "Gauze Veil,"[57]

The word "tall" cannot be found in the original. Meanwhile, in the original there is only the mention of the name "Lo-fu," one and only one name, but Pound made it two. The repetition of the name "Gauze Veil" (which probably comes from a wild association of the two characters "Lo-fu" by Pound) in the fourth line could not be a careless mistake. It is there perhaps because it sounds, or more specifically looks, pretty, mysterious, and oriental.

The girl "Rafu" was more "a portrait of a Chinese lady" by Pound, edited to present a certain image of a Chinese woman, for there are around fifty three lines in the original,

---

荒	城	空	大	漠
Desolate	castle	empty	vast	desert

[57] *Personae*, p. 144. A word-for-word translation of the original is:

日	出	東	南	隅
Sun	rises	east	south	corner
照	我	秦	氏	樓
Shine	my	*Qin*	family	tower
秦	氏	有	好	女
Qin	family	has	good	girl
自	名	爲	羅	敷
Self	call	as	Luo	Fu

and Pound only chose to translate the first fourteen lines. The remaining part of Pound's poem is:

> For she feeds mulberries to silkworms,
> She gets them by the south wall of the town.
> With green strings she makes the warp of her basket,
> She makes the shoulder-straps of her basket
> from the boughs of katsura,
> And she piles her hair up on the left side of her head-piece.
>
> Her earrings are made of pearl,
> Her underskirt is the same silk dyed in purple,
> And when men going by look on Rafu
> They set down their burdens,
> They stand and twirl their moustaches.[58]

---

[58] *Personae*, p. 144. A word-for-word translation of the original is:

羅	敷	善	採	桑
Luo	Fu	good at	pluck	mulberry
採	桑	城	南	隅
Pluck	mulberry	city	south	wall
青	絲	爲	籠	系
Green	strings	for	basket	warp
桂	枝	爲	籠	鉤
Cassia	bough	for	basket	handle
頭	上	倭	墮	髻
Head	on	(dangling)		plait
耳	中	明	月	珠
Ears	at	bright	moon	pearl
湘	綺	爲	下	裙
Shang	satin	for	low	skirt
紫	衣	爲	上	襦
Purple	satin	for	above	coat
行	者	見	羅	敷
(Passers-by)		see	Luo	Fu
下	擔	捋	髭	鬚
Put down	loads	twirl	(moustaches)	

The images "mulberries," "silkworms," her hair, "pearl earrings" and "purple silk skirt" altogether give the picture of a Chinese woman. The story about how Lo-fu turns down the suitors by saying she has a husband already in the rest of the poem is simply expunged. The family ethics gives way to the sheer appreciation of an exotic and lively young woman in ancient time. Pound focuses on the description of her clothes and appearance as well as the men's reaction to her charm, presenting the image of a Chinese woman to his own readers. The re-written work is now mainly a portrait of a young Chinese woman as seen by Pound, instead of a narrative poem as that of the original.

"The Beautiful Toilet" epitomizes the figure of a deserted woman. The last four lines are:

> And she was a courtesan in the old days,
> And she has married a sot,
> Who now goes drunkenly out
> And leaves her too much alone.[59]

Another translator, Giles, emphasizes the baser connotation of the original as well as the dissatisfaction on the part of the woman.[60] The "ultimatum" given by the speaker in Giles'

---

[59] *Personae*, p. 132. A word-for-word translation of the original is:

昔	爲	倡	家	女
Past	was	courtesan	family	girl
今	爲	蕩	子	婦
Now	is	play	boy	wife
蕩	子	行	不	歸
Play	boy	went	not	return
空	床	難	獨	守
Empty	bed	difficult	alone	keep

[60] Giles' rendition is:

> A singing-girl in early life,
> And now a careless roue's wife...
> Ah, if he does not mind his own,
> He'll find some day the bird has flown!

lines is a little unusual in that "the traditional Chinese women" (in a Western eye or according to the general conception of the Chinese reader) would not issue such a warning to a man. The cultural convention in ancient China was that society might be sympathetic to a deserted woman, but not a wanton one. Though the sexual overtone was there, the emphasis was on her loneliness and misery, which were also what Arthur Waley tried to convey, as mentioned in last chapter. One should also be reminded that eroticism has not been a common practice in classical Chinese poetry. In representing the frustration of the woman (more a sense of loneliness than a down-to-earth carnal lust in the original), Waley and Pound are in agreement.

There is no personal pronoun throughout the original, yet it is quite obvious that the poem is narrated in the third person, and so is Pound' approximation, in which the speaker subtly maintains a sympathetic tone ("And she has married a sot"). Pound changed the subject to that of the man (almost sounds like "Look what you have done"). In this way the woman's grievances, the sexual yearning, and the threat which is posed to the man, are all subtly subdued.

The exoticism in *Cathay*, however, is usually mixed with a sense of realism, perhaps an imagined one. Carl Sandburg said reading *Cathay* made him feel "the closeness of the Chinese soul as a next-door human neighbour,"[61] while Robert Fitzgerald wrote in 1941 that owning *Cathay* "you need no porcelains."[62] Though these words are somewhat like T. S. Eliot's famous comment about Pound being the inventor of Chinese poetry, which is based more on an imagined China in the target system, Pound has created a China

---

Giles, *A History of Chinese Literature*, p. 98.
[61] See Deane, "Ezra Pound's Chinese Translucencies," 39.
[62] Deane, "Ezra Pound's Chinese Translucencies," 39.

that makes people believe that this is the real thing, as tangible as a neighbour or porcelains. The opening lines of "The River-Merchant's Wife: A Letter," for instance, provide one of the most familiar Chinese scenes, showing Pound's achievement in transferring cultural associations, or, making the image of a culture:

> While my hair was still cut straight across my
> forehead
> I played about the front gate, pulling flowers.
> You came by on bamboo stilts, playing horse,
> You walked about my seat, playing with blue plums.
> And we went on living in the village of Chokan:
> Two small people, without dislike or suspicion.[63]

Her hair style is very Chinese. The game they play is Chinese. So is their relationship. Pound's description comes close to the normal haircut of a Chinese girl. Another question arises: Would an ancient Chinese girl, then, have her hair cut straight across the forehead, as presented by Pound (The original line only says her hair covered the forehead)? It is probable, as seen in some ancient paintings. But what is more important, while the

---

[63] *Personae*, p. 134. For the discussion of the girl's hair see also Wai-lim Yip, *Ezra Pound's Cathay*, pp. 88-90. My discussion here focuses on Pound's achievement in making a cultural image, not on the notion of fidelity. A word-for-word translation of the original is:

妾	髮	初	覆	額
My	hair	early	cover	forehead
折	花	門	前	劇
Break	flowers	door	front	play
郎	騎	竹	馬	來
Boy	rides	bamboo	horse	come
繞	床	弄	青	梅
Around	bed	play	blue	plums
同	居	長	干	里
Together	live	Chang	Gan	village
兩	小	無	嫌	猜
Two	small	without	dislike	suspicion

verisimilitude Pound creates looks Chinese on one hand, it reinforces the reader's expectation of what a Chinese girl should look like on the other. The confirmation of an experience, and that the confirmation itself is basically reliable, is something that Pound as a translator of culture sought to achieve. It is not surprising that some of the *Cathay* poems have already entered the English-speaking world and are read as English poems.[64]

In Canto 60 Pound praises Emperor Kang Xi for his project of translating history and other works into the Manchurian language, and Ling Chung comments on this attitude of Pound:

> For Pound, translating is in itself an act of "Cheng ming"-- putting ideas into action, into new contacts in life. Poetry is also an act of "cheng ming" to Pound, for the mission of poetry is to define a Paideuma for its own age. Pound sees Confucius as an editor of poetry and as a teacher who strives not only to define language, but also to define the meaning of life [...] Confucius, in the mind of Pound, is a man trying to save the world by means of giving new, living, correct definitions. This was Pound's aspiration, too, as he designated for himself the role of poet.[65]

If *Cathay* signifies the crux of Pound's early poetic concern, mainly imagism and free verse, then the translation of *Classical Anthology As Defined by Confucius* can be seen as a summary of Pound's preoccupation, both poetical and ideological, in later years. When he translated *Cathay*, he was as interested in making the texts familiar to the reader as retaining the exotic flavour. When he translated the Confucian *Odes*, he was already a Confucian convert, and thought that "Kung collected *The Odes* to keep his followers from abstract discussion. That is, *The Odes* give particular instances; they do not lead to exaggerations of dogma."[66] His attempts to familiarize as well as exoticize the texts, meanwhile, are similar to those in *Cathay*. Before he rendered the anthology, he had translated *Ta Hio* (*Ta Hsueh* or *The Great Learning*) in 1942. Legge's *Confucian Odes* was

---

[64] See the comments in T. S. Eliot, *Ezra Pound: His Metric and Poetry*, p. 26; Hugh Deane, "Ezra Pound's Chinese Translucencies," 39; Hugh Kenner, *The Poetry of Ezra Pound* (London: Faber & Faber, 1951), p. 154.

[65] Ling Chung ,"Ezra Pound's Interpretation of *Cheng Ming* and His Literary Theories," *International Comparative Literature Association* 73.2 (1979), 692.

[66] Ezra Pound, "Introduction" to his translation of the *Analects* (London: Peter Owen, 1956), p. 8.

one of the two books he brought with him to the Pisan cell. He called the mountain facing the prison Taishan (The mountain in the home country of Confucius). He did his own versions of *The Unwobbling Pivot* and *The Great Digest* in 1945. Slightly before the second World War, from 1934 to 1939, Waley also translated the *Analects* of Confucius, the Confucian *Odes* and many Taoist writings. It was believed that when Pound translated the *Odes* he worked with Karlgren, Legge, and Waley's versions.[67]

Early translators of the Confucian *Odes* were mainly missionaries who looked to the collection from Christians' point of view, while Pound, and perhaps to a lesser degree Waley and some others, no matter how different they were politically, looked to the *Odes* and the Confucian works in general with the hope that they might provide some kind of solution or redemption for their own society.[68] The missionaries' enthusiasm for the ethical values of the *Odes*, ironically, bears similarity with the way Pound and some of his contemporaries see the *Odes* in that they take them not just as literature but as some kind of treatise of traditional Chinese morality as well, only the latter group takes them much more seriously and looks at them with greater urgency and more personal involvement.[69]

Pound called the *Odes* "as defined by Confucius," in which the role of Confucius is underlined, and the word "defined" sounds like an ethical deliberation. As Hugh Kenner remarks, "the ideograms tend to become magic, and the translations from the Chinese not literary artifacts but rescripts of sacred writings."[70] Pound was obsessed with *Ching Ming*

---

[67] See Deane, "Ezra Pound's Chinese Translucencies," 40.
[68] See Kenner, "Ezra Pound and Chinese," p. 41, and Chung, "Ezra Pound's Interpretation of *Cheng Ming* and His Literary Theories," 692.
[69] Hugh Deane said that "in adversity after World War II" "Pound clung to China." See Deane, "Ezra Pound's Chinese Translucencies," 40.
[70] Kenner, "Ezra Pound and Chinese," p. 41.

(or *Cheng Ming*, rectified names), *Paideuma*, proper rites and righteousness that are supposed to be crystallized in the *Odes*.[71]

To examine the different approaches in his rendering of *Cathay* and the *Odes* an example one can look at is the poem entitled "Song of the Bowman of Shu" in *Cathay*, which became Ode 167 later.[72] It is interesting that critics are very divided in their opinions as to which version comes out better.[73] The following are the first two stanzas of both poems. The one in "Song of the Bowmen of Shu" is:

> Here we are, picking the first fern-shoots
> And saying: When shall we get back to our country?
> Here we are because we have the Ken-nin for our foremen,
> We have no comfort because of these Mongols.
> We grub the soft fern-shoots,
> When anyone says "Return," the others are full of sorrow.
> Sorrowful minds, sorrow is strong, we are hungry and thirsty.
> Our defense is not yet made sure, no one can let his friend return.[74]

---

[71] Ling Chung summarizes Pound's concept of *Paideuma* in this way:

> Pound borrowed the Greek term Paideuma from Leo Frobenius to mean "the gristly roots of ideas that are in action". Pound interprets Frobenius' definition as "the mental formation, the inherited habits of thought, the conditionings, aptitudes of a given race or time"[...] It [Paideuma] is a living culture with living language and living ideas. The first step to create a Paideuma is to define language with precision and to charge language with living thoughts. In this case, Pound has widened the scope of "cheng ming" from a Confucian term of political reformation, to the creation of a new culture for the future of mankind.

Chung , "Ezra Pound's Interpretation of *Cheng Ming* and His Literary Theories," 692.

[72] Pound, *The Classic Anthology as Defined by Confucius* (Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 1954), p. 87.

[73] See Kenner, *Gnomon* (New York: McDowell, 1958), p. 88. Kenner writes that the *Cathay* one is inferior. Dembo disagrees. See L. S. Dembo, *The Confucian Odes of Ezra Pound: A Critical Appraisal* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1963), pp. 89-90. Roy Teele, on the other hand, writes that "To my mind there is no doubt that the second translation Pound made is superior to the first [the *Cathay* piece], for he then knew what kind of poem he was working with." Roy Teele, "In Search of Cathay," *Delos* 6 (1971), 185-93 (p. 188). John C. Wang made a similar observation in his essay, "Ezra Pound as a Translator of Classical Chinese Poetry," *Sewanee Review* 73.3 (Summer 1965), 345-57 (p. 353).

[74] A word-for-word translation of the original is:

釆	薇	釆	薇
Pick	fern	pick	fern
薇	亦	作	止
Ferns	are	sprouting	particle

And Ode 167:

Pick a fern, pick a fern, ferns are high,
"Home," I'll say: home, the year's gone by,
no house, no roof, these huns on the hoof.
Work, work, work, that's how it runs,
We are here because of these huns.

曰 Particle	歸 return	曰 particle	歸 return
歲 Year	亦 particle	暮 dusk	止 particle
靡 No	室 house	靡 no	家 home
玁 (Huns)	狁	之 is	故 cause
不 No	遑 time	故 old	居 rest
玁 (Huns)	狁	之 is	故 cause
采 Pick	薇 ferns	采 pick	薇 ferns
薇 Ferns	亦 are	柔 soft	止 particle
曰 Particle	歸 return	曰 particle	歸 return
心 Hearts	亦 are	憂 sorrowful	止 particle
憂 Sorrow	心 hearts	烈 burn	烈 hearts
載 Particle	渴 hungry	載 particle	飢 thirsty
我 Our	戍 garrison	未 not	定 sure
靡 No	使 message	歸 (return)	聘

Pick a fern, pick a fern, soft as they come,
I'll say "Home."
Hungry all of us, thirsty here,
no home news for nearly a year.[75]

Cathay was a milestone of Pound's work in free verse. But, as the lines above show, Pound changed to the ballad form in the *Odes*. While the original was supposed to be chanted or sung, he tried to reproduce it with something similar, including "folk songs, ballads, panegyrics, and hymns, which are familiar to his Western audience."[76] As a matter of fact this process of familiarization managed to strike quite a few resonant chords.[77]

The *melopoeia* in the *Cathay* piece quoted above is obtained through the slow rhythm and the use of sonorous words, in which consonances and assonances abound. In the *Ode* the tempo is much quicker. Besides the lines quoted, the last stanza of each of them also shows this difference in tempo. The *Cathay* poem:

When we set out, the willows were drooping with spring,
We come back in the snow,
We go slowly, we are hungry and thirsty,
Our mind is full of sorrow, who will know of our grief?[78]

---

[75] Pound, *The Classic Anthology as Defined by Confucius*, p. 87.
[76] Angela Jung Palandri, '"The Stone is Alive in My Hand"-- Ezra Pound's Chinese Translations,' p. 290.
[77] William McNaughton wrote of his teaching experience: "Last year, I let students in an Oberlin Chinese Literature in Translation class set to music, instead of writing a term-paper, translations of Chinese poems. Pound's translations from the Confucian Odes were more often picked than the work of all other translators put together. This may indicate something about the extent to which Pound was successful in his studies of Chinese melopoeia. But with view to the variety of musical styles in the original Chinese poems, even more remarkable is the variety of musical styles which the composers used successfully to set Pound translations. They included classical blues, and jass, folk, and rock'n roll." See William McNaughton, "Pound's Translations and Chinese *Melopoeia*," *Texas Quarterly* 10.4 (1967), 52-56 (p. 56).
[78] A word-for-word translation of the original is:

昔	我	往	矣
Past	I	went	particle
楊	柳	依	依
(Willows)		dangling	dangling
今	我	來	思

and the one in the *Ode*:

> Willows were green when we set out,
> it's blowin' an' snowin' as we go
> down this road, muddy and slow,
> hungry and thirsty and blue as doubt
> (no one feels half of what we know).[79]

The lyrical principle observed by Hugh Kenner, "that words or names, being ordered in time, are bound together and recalled into each other's presence by recurrent sounds,"[80] is well demonstrated in the *Cathay* poem, with its back vowels (particularly the "o" sounds, though not all of them are assonantal) and the front vowels (mainly the "i" sounds). The *Ode* version, on the other hand, accentuates the sing-song quality, echoing the folk song tradition of the original. The lines are now shorter, thus also corresponding closer to the original short lines, while following in the meantime the ballad convention. But Pound now stops moulding the style on the text,[81] which is a structural principle of *Cathay*.

雨	雪	霏	霏
Rain	snow	misty	misty
行	道	遲	遲
Walk	road	slowly	slowly
載	渴	載	飢
Particle	thirsty	particle	hungry
我	心	傷	悲
My	heart	sad	melancholic
莫	知	我	哀
None	knows	my	sorrow

[79] Pound, *The Classic Anthology as Defined by Confucius*, p. 87.
[80] Kenner, *The Pound Era*, p. 199.
[81] This is a phrase used by Hsieh Wen Tung, See Hsieh, "English Translations of Chinese Poetry," *The Criticism: A Literary Review* 17.68 (April 1938), 403-423 (p. 423).

Pound's later creations, in particular the *Cantos*, bear the trace of his translations of *Cathay* and the Confucian *Odes* in syntax, poetic techniques and ideology. In these lines from *Cathay*, for example, he stresses simultaneity:

> Surprised. Desert turmoil. Sea sun.
>
> Desolate castle, the sky, the wide desert

The abandonment of connectives and intellectual pointers isolate the images, allowing them appear in their crudest forms, accentuating the visual effect, and inviting the reader to participate in the concretizing process. To achieve visual perspicuity through graphic arrangement seems to be something Pound benefits from for the rest of his career.[82] The famous ideogrammic method, by juxtaposing seemingly unrelated images in a paratactic manner, is based on the same principle of simultaneity.[83] Pound even goes so far as to say

---

[82] There are these lines, for example, in Canto 49:

> Rain; empty river; a voyage
> [...]
> Autumn moon; hills rise above lakes
> [...]
> Broad water; geese line out with the autumn.

Pound, *The Cantos* (New York: New Directions, 1970), p. 38. And Canto 54:

> Prayer: hands uplifted
> Solitude: a person, a Nurse
> plumes: is she angel or bird, is she a bird or an angel?

Pound, *The Cantos*, p. 101. Also Canto 79:

> Moon, cloud, tower, a patch of the battistero
> all of whiteness.

Pound, *The Cantos*, p. 62.

For more discussions on the language of the *Cantos* in connection with Pound's early work *Cathay*, see Yip, *Ezra Pound's Cathay*, pp. 158-164. See also William Tay, "The Poetics of Juxtaposition: Haiku, Chinese Poetry and Ezra Pound," in *Essays in Commemoration of the Golden Jubilee of the Fung Ping Shan Library* (Hong Kong: University of Hong Kong, 1982), pp. 306-316.

[83] For Pound's ideogrammic method see William Tay, "Fragmentary Negation: A Reappraisal of Ezra Pound's Ideogrammic Method," *Chinese-Western Literature: Theory and Strategy* (1980), 129-153. See also Ying Tai Shirley Walther, "A Re-Examination of the Ideogrammic Method of Ezra Pound" (unpublished doctoral dissertation, Kansas State University, 1983).

that language written in ideograms simply had to stay poetic, "simply couldn't help being and staying poetic in a way that a column of English type might very well not stay poetic."[84] Pound's strategy of translating poetry is inseparable from the ideogrammic method, which sees new meaning in the component parts of the Chinese character. The concept is summarized by Gentzler:

> Pound even suggested that "a preoccupation with syntax may get in the translator's way." Pound's writing on translation emphasized focusing on specific images, individual words, fragments, and luminous details. His method was modern combination, hoping that the new configurations would react chemically, combining into a new compound, and thereby give off energy. Rhythms, diction were more important than syntax. The translator and/or poet was viewed as the catalyst working with specific, individual words. Each word with its etymology, its way of combining, gave insight into new possibilities.[85]

Words can cut backward, sideways, historically and juxtapositionally. The traditional syntax, which puts information into a logical order, would obscure the precision and specific images Pound wished to preserve.[86]

In his more developed style Pound extends the juxtapositions from those of natural objects to historical facts, allusions, ideas, or simply a Chinese character that bears similar meaning or implication with the other images.[87] The character may act as a synopsis, bringing out the signification of other images. Behind all this is his early obsession of suggestiveness, of showing rather than telling, and his attempt to include the reader in the

---

[84] Ezra Pound, *ABC of Reading* (London: Routledge, 1934), p. 22.
[85] Gentzler, *Contemporary Translation Theories* (London and New York: Routledge, 1993), p. 28.
[86] See also Gentzler, *Contemporary Translation Theories*, p. 28.
[87] For a more detailed discussion of Pound's ideogrammic method and related concepts in the *Odes* see A. J. Palandri, '"The Stone is Alive in My Hand"-- Ezra Pound's Chinese Translations,' p.p. 278-291; L. S. Dembo, *The Confucian Odes of Ezra Pound: A Critical Appraisal* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1963). See also William Tay, "Between Kung and Eleusis: Li Chi, the Eleusinian Rites, Erigena, and Ezra Pound," *Paideuma* 4 (1975), 37-54; William Tay, "*Cheng Ming*: The New Paideuma of Ezra Pound, " *Tamkang Review* 6.1 (April 1975), 121-148; William Tay, "The Sun on the Silk: Ezra Pound and Confucianism" (unpublished doctoral dissertation, University of California, San Diego, 1977); William Tay, "Confucianism as Leitmotif: The *Four Books* in the *Pisan Cantos*," *Tamkang Review* 9.3 (Spring 1979),

creative process. But now he also thinks that translation is a kind of "Ch'ing M'ing," and like "Ch'ing Ming," it serves as a tool for didactic purpose.[88]

Another technique found in the *Odes*, the breaking down of a Chinese character to give a concrete presentation of abstract ideas, also resembles the ideogrammic method of the *Cantos*.[89] A few decades earlier Witter Bynner observed that it would be as erroneous to overemphasize the component radicals of a Chinese character as to overemphasize the component meanings of such words in English as daybreak, breakfast, nightfall or

---

235-268; Mary Paterson Cheadle, "Ezra Pound's Confucian Translations" (unpublished doctoral dissertation, University of California, Berkeley, 1987).

[88] Canto 60 could serve as an example:

> History translated into manchu. Set
> up board of translator
> Verbiest, mathematics
> Pereira professor of music, a treatise
> in chinese and manchu
> Gerbillon and Bouvet, done in Manchu
> revised by the emperor as
> to question of style
> A digest of philosophy (manchu) and
> current
> Reports on the memoires des academies
> des science de Paris.
> Quinine, a laboratory set up in palace.
> He ordered 'em to prepare a total
> anatomy, et
> qu'ils veillerent a la purete du language
> et qu'on n'employat que des termes
> propres
> (namely CH'ing Ming)
>
> 正名

Most of the activities here are related to translation, and they are juxtaposed with each other to bring out such a concept. The phrase "Ch'ing Ming" as well as its original Chinese characters at the end not only epitomizes the ideas of the whole passage, it also summarizes Pound's notion of language reform.

[89] His famous line in the *Odes*, for example, "Lady of azure thought," was derived from the character for "quiet," 靜 in the original, in which there is a component radical 青 that means "green," and the translation aims at concretizing an abstract description. Similar examples abound in the *Odes*. An "omen tree" was given instead of "peach," as the ideogram for peach 桃 in the original consists of a component part that could mean "omen"兆 . In another poem there is the ideogram 顯 which means bright or famous. It comprises of a "sun" at the top of the left and "silk" at the left bottom. Pound translated a line that runs something like "His virtue is well known" in this poem into "Tensile his virtue is." Basing on the same character 顯 he created a title "The Sun Spider" for the poem. The spider was obviously conjured up from the ideograph of the silk or spider under the sun.

landscape.[90] Bynner's comment shows his concern for the meaning of the whole line and the whole poem. Pound's method is exactly to overemphasize the component meanings, and behind the idea of this "pseudo-etymology" is a desire to concretize and to juxtapose images. Pound used this method extensively in the *Cantos*.[91] The Chinese characters are placed there to summarize and juxtapose. What is significant is that Pound's practice in *Cathay* and the *Odes* has basically laid the foundation of the techniques in the *Cantos*. The techniques found in his own writing are very much related to those of his "rewriting" (the juxtaposition of images in *Cathay* and the ideogrammic method in the *Odes*), whereas his "rewriting" not only foreshadowed his writings, but was done in a way as if it were his writing. The repertory of poetic language available to the translator, one may say, is similar to the inventory available to the poet in the target system.

---

[90] Witter Bynner, "Translating Wang Wei," *Poetry: A Magazine of Verse* 19 (Feb. 1922), 272-278 (p. 278).

[91] There are these lines, for example, in Canto 77:

> Their aims as one,
> directio voluntatis, as lord over this heart 志
> the two sages united.

In the Chinese character 志 there is a "lord" over a "heart." The first half of the second line quoted carries the meaning of the upper part of the Chinese character, while the second half simply spells out the two component parts.

Chapter 7

Kenneth Rexroth: Du Fu and the Truth

There are a few things in common between Ezra Pound, Kenneth Rexroth, Gary Snyder, and to a lesser degree Arthur Waley. To begin with, besides all being poets, they show an intense personal concern for the Chinese works they translate. Pound's preoccupation with imagism, and his dedication to Confucianism later on, all led him to establish a living relationship with the Chinese poetry he translated. Waley let a land distant in time and place infiltrate his everyday life, as is seen in his recorded conversations. Rexroth and Snyder also indicated their personal concern for the poets and poetic worlds which they translated. All are renowned for making the image of a certain Chinese poet, and the heroes they created, in turn, helped to build up their respective reputations as translators of Chinese poetry-- while Pound highlighted Li Bo, or rather, "Rihaku" in *Cathay*, Rexroth has made Du Fu more well-known in the English speaking world;[1] Gary Snyder, meanwhile, has discovered or invented Cold Mountain in the West. Through Arthur Waley's introduction, Bo Juyi made his way in the English speaking world. Yet there is another common feature among them which is even more significant: despite the differences in their style, they all attempt to modernize the language, using a contemporary diction to represent an old China.

The response to Kenneth Rexroth's Chinese translations,[2] particularly to Du Fu's poems, was in some ways similar to the reception of Ezra Pound's *Cathay*. The translations were regarded by some as second only to Ezra Pound's *Cathay*, among all

---

[1] Du Fu has been translated by David Hawkes and William Hung, but it was mainly Rexroth's translations that were selected in English anthologies.

[2] Rexroth's translations of Chinese poems include:

One Hundred Poems from the Chinese, trans. by Kenneth Rexroth (New York: New Directions, 1956).

Love and the Turning Year: One Hundred More Poems from the Chinese, trans. by Kenneth Rexroth (New York: New Directions, 1970).

The Orchid Boat: The Women Poets of China, trans. by Kenneth Rexroth and Ling Chung (New York: McGraw-Hill, 1973).

Li Ch'ing-chao: Complete Poems, trans. by Kenneth Rexroth and Ling Chung (New York: New Directions, 1979).

English translations of Chinese verse in terms of their superbly vital idiom as well as their popularity and extensive influence.[3] Since its publication in 1956, *One Hundred Poems from the Chinese* has been critically acclaimed for decades. William Carlos Williams, for example, remarked that he was fortunate to have read this book, and pointed out that among poems written in modern English language, these were the most sensitive ones. He went on to say that Rexroth's translation was so delicate and precise that no other translators could challenge it.[4] Witter Bynner, the translator of *Three Hundred Poems from the Tang Dynasty*, also observes that Rexroth's translations enable us to feel that our minds re-live the ancient landscape, as if we were communicating with ancient peoples and becoming one of them. Bynner goes on to exclaim: I was the ancient man, but where was he going? This ancient man was I, but where was I going?[5]

Rexroth points out in the "Introduction" to this book that he wanted to echo the original in spirit, but first of all it had to be in good English.[6] In fact, the versions upon which Rexroth based his translation were other people's translations, in English, French, or German, but hardly Chinese, although he learned a little of the language himself. What Rexroth was trying to do, judging from this, was to rewrite the poems in a way he felt will work in the target system, not to produce texts close to the source one.[7] Unlike Pound, Rexroth called his work "*from the Chinese*," without using the word "translation," thus exonerating himself (actually not totally) from critics looking for "fidelity." Even Ling Chung, who "co-translated" two books, *The Orchid Boat: The Women Poets of China* and *Li Ch'ing-chao: Complete Poems* with Rexroth, did not

[3] Ling Chung, "This Ancient Man Is I: Kenneth Rexroth's Versions of Tu Fu," *Renditions* 21-22 (Spring & Autumn, 1984), 307-330 (p. 307).
[4] William Carlos Williams, "Two New Books By Kenneth Rexroth," *Poetry* 90 (June, 1957), 180.
[5] Witter Bynner, "This Ancient Man Was I," *Chinatown News* (March 3, 1958), 11.
[6] "Introduction," *One Hundred Poems from the Chinese*, p. xi.
[7] Rexroth has translated thirty-six of Du Fu's poems, and many of them have been analysed by scholars. Ling Chung, for example, has written a few articles on Rexroth's Du Fu poems. My analyses aim more to study his translation strategies in light of his poetic concept, his effort to modernize the language and to work out texts that function in the target system, especially his attempt to create an image of Chinese poetry, rather than focusing on the notion of faithfulness.

seriously take *The One Hundred Poems* as a translation.[8] In the two books she did with Rexroth she seems to avoid the term "translation" in the titles as well. In her article on Rexroth's translation of Du Fu, she constantly came back to the issue of fidelity, and concluded that one should "approach his [Rexroth's] Tu Fu versions not as translation, but as creative interpretation" so that one would "not fall into the trap of all those deviations and distortions, and meanwhile can appreciate the creativity of an accomplished American poet."[9] Rexroth's Du Fu poems will here be considered as translations.

An anecdote about Rexroth and Ling Chung, meanwhile, may shed light on Rexroth's strategies of translation. When asked by a friend why she rendered the title of their book as "Orchid Boat," instead of "Magnolia Boat," since the former plant cannot be possibly used to build a boat, Ling Chung said that she knew it all along too, but it is just that Rexroth liked to use orchid better here and she could not help it.[10] It is obvious therefore that Rexroth's strategy was to emphasize the oriental flavour (the association of orchid in this particular case), while Ling Chung's was more to preserve the literal meanings of the source text.

The Chinese language has the same word for orchid and magnolia, *lan* 蘭. But when *lan* 蘭 is used to refer to magnolia, it is actually an abbreviation for *mu lan* 木蘭. Thus in the term *lan zhou* 蘭舟 (with the second character meaning boat) the missing word 木 *mu* in the front is understood. The word *lan* 蘭, which appears so often in Chinese literature, therefore, requires the reader to decode by the context, either orchid or magnolia. If Rexroth had not known Chinese at all he would not have thought of the other meaning, actually the even more common one, of the word *lan* 蘭. But had his

---

[8] Chung said, for example, "As with Ezra Pound's versions in *Cathay*, Rexroth's Tu Fu translations do not follow closely the source texts; instead, the source texts by and large only serve as a departure point from which his imagination soars freely." Chung, "This Ancient Man Is I," 308.

[9] Chung, "This Ancient Man Is I," 330.

[10] I heard it from a student of Ling Chung. The story interestingly testifies to Nienhauser's observation. When he talked about translation done in "a joint venture between English poet and Chinese scholar," Nienhauser noticed that "even in such a case cooperation may be a euphemism for domination by one or the other partner (witness Kenneth Rexroth and Chung Ling)." See William Nienhauser, "Thrice-Told Tales: Translating Japanese Translations of Chinese Poetry Into English," *Translation Review* 10 (1982), 27-33 (p. 28).

approach been more source-oriented, he probably would not have transgressed the "sanctity" of the original so readily.

While orchids have associations of the orient, magnolias have associations with the Southern States of America. To many Chinese the character *lan* 蘭 involves the meaning of "orchid" already, even in places where it should mean magnolia. To Chinese or to Western readers, orchid, with its slender leaves and fragrant flowers (the Chinese call it national fragrance or royal fragrance), may be more associated with the kind of women's poetry that Rexroth and Chung were translating.[11] In fact, "orchid" is more a cultural transfer in this connection, though it is not a formal equivalence in philological or botanical terms. But to allow the "double meaning" to exist in a text is something common both in the east and west. To use Paul Ricoeur's definition, a word can mean one thing while referring to another at the same time, but one does not exclude the other.[12] This is, in fact, what *lan zhou* 蘭舟, orchid boat, means to many Chinese readers.

Rexroth's idea of the essence of Chinese poetry includes these features:

> It is a certain place, at a certain time [...] A gong sounds far off among the pines: it is a monastery in the mountains. What this does is to put the reader in a poetic situation. It puts him in a place, just like putting him on the stage, makes him one of the actors [...] This is the fundamental technique of Chinese poetry.[13]

He called this kind of feature the Chinese rule, and says, "I wrote poetry mostly according to a kind of Chinese rule."[14] One may deduce from this, that he would try to present concrete images, or rather, let the concrete images present themselves with as little subjective interference as possible. He also adopted a similar approach in

---

[11] Orchids are often associated with women and femininity in Chinese tradition, probably because of their slender leaves. *Jinlan zimei* 金蘭姊妹 (literally golden orchid sisters), for example, means "blood sisters"; *huizhi lanxin* 蕙質蘭心 (literally orchid heart), means "the compassionate and delicate heart of women"; *lanhui fenfang* 蘭蕙芬芳 (literally orchid fragrance), means "the kindness, care and concern of women".

[12] Paul Ricoeur, *The Conflict of Interpretation* (Evanston: Northwestern University Press, 1974), p. 63.

[13] Chung, "This Ancient Man is I," p. 318.

[14] Chung, "This Ancient Man is I," p. 318.

translating Chinese poetry. The examples of poetic situations he gave, however, are more often found in Chinese landscape poetry, with nature imagery presented in its pure form, that is, with minimum discursive statements. Wang Wei, for example, is famous for this kind of style, not Du Fu.[15]

Rexroth altogether translated thirty six poems by Du Fu, and thirty five of them were collected in *One Hundred Poems from the Chinese,* while one was included in *Love and the Turning Year: One Hundred More Poems from the Chinese.* According to him, there were four sources of Du Fu's poems that he worked on: 1. William Hung's translations of Du's poems.[16] 2. Florence Ayscough's literal renderings.[17] 3. Erwin von Zach's German translation.[18] 4. Rexroth also discussed the Chinese originals with his Chinese friend C. H. Kwock.[19] Meanwhile, Ling Chung points out that Rexroth also used Hervey St. Denys's French translation of Du's poems, Lo Ta Kang's French translation, George Margoulies's French translation, and Robert Payne's English translation.[20] Among all these versions, Chung found out that Rexroth used Ayscough's English translation, William Hung's English translation, and the Chinese original most often.[21] It should be pointed out that Rexroth studied Chinese all by himself, and in his manuscripts one can still find some poems where he checked the Chinese dictionary word by word.[22]

---

[15] For Wang Wei's presentation of nature imagery in its pure form, see Wai-lim Yip's discussions and translations of Wang Wei in *Hiding the Universe: Poems by Wang Wei* (New York: Grossman Publishers, 1972).

[16] William Hung, *Tu Fu: China's Greatest Poet* (Cambridge: Harvard University press, 1952).

[17] Florence Ayscough, *Travels of a Chinese Poet: Tu Fu, Guest of Rivers and Lakes, 759- 770,* vol. I (London: Jonathan Cape, 1929). *Florence Ayscough, Travels of a Chinese Poet: Tu Fu, Guest of Rivers and Lakes, 759- 770, vol. II* (London: Jonathan Cape, 1934).

[18] Erwin von Zach, *Tu Fu's Gedichte* (Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 1952).

[19] See Rexroth, *One Hundred Poems from the Chinese*, p. xi.

[20] Hervey de Saint-Denys, *Poesies de l'epoque des Thang* (Paris, 1862). Lo Ta Kang, *Cent quatrains des T'ang* (Paris, 1947). Georges Margoulies, *Anthologie raisonnee de la litterature chinoise* (Paris: Payot, 1948). Robert Payne, *The White Pony: An Anthology of Chinese Poetry from the Earliest Times to the Present Day* (New York: The John Day Company, 1947). See also Chung, "This Ancient Man is I."

[21] See Chung, "This Ancient Man is I," 309. Some of the background information about Rexroth in this chapter is obtained from Chung's essay "This Ancient Man is I." Chung has co-translated two books with Rexroth.

[22] Chung, "This Ancient Man is I," 313. The dictionary he used, Ling Chung recorded, is *Mathew's Chinese-English Dictionary.* Under the character "籟" *lai* in Du's poem, for example, there is the number 3779, which is ascribed to the character by this dictionary.

As to the kind of poems he chose to translate, he put it clearly in one of the notes to *One Hundred Poems From the Chinese* that:

> I have chosen only those poems whose appeal is simple and direct, with a minimum of allusion to past literature or contemporary politics-- in other words, poems that speak to me of situations in life like my own. I have thought of my translations as, finally, expressions of myself.[23]

The poet he chose to translate most, the poet he claimed to like best, was also the poet who uses allusions and allegories most. Du Fu's style is known as "having not one single word that does not have an origin" (*wu yizi wu laili* 無一字無來歷), which is supposed to be the greatest compliment paid to a poet by Chinese critics. When one hears Haines' admission of his own simple and direct poetic style being influenced by Rexroth's translation of Du Fu,[24] one is reminded that it is Rexroth's translation that he is talking about. Du Fu is far from being simple.[25]

Rexroth maintains that in translating poetry the translator should be allowed as much freedom as possible, and should not be restricted in any way by the source text. Because the translator is translating for a particular time and for a particular audience, he should consider the problem of reception first.[26] He also points out that the reason why a great work of translation can last is that it belongs completely to its age.[27] He claims that when he is translating he tries to place himself in the world of ancient peoples to experience their feelings.[28] This statement, or confession, also puts him on the defendant stand-- Ling Chung, upon his admission, asks a series of questions on the

---

[23] Rexroth, "Notes," *One Hundred Poems From the Chinese*, p. 130.
[24] John Haines, "Homage to the Chinese," in *For Rexroth*, ed. by Geoffrey Gardner (New York: The Ark, 1980), p. 42.
[25] Du Fu has become more well-known among modern American poets. W. S. Merwin (1929-), for example, wrote in a letter dated 1979 that, one night, he picked up *One Hundred Poems from the Chinese* again, and read it from cover to cover without stopping. He was full of gratitude, and felt the life and vitality of the lines. He did not forget to point out that he had been very familiar with this book for years already. See Merwin, "From a Letter," in *For Rexroth*, p. 60. Another American poet John Haines (1924-) admits that his simple, clear and unmanneristic style is very much indebted to Rexroth's translation of Du Fu. Haines, "Homage to the Chinese," in *For Rexroth*, p. 42. See also Ling Chung, "This Ancient Man Is I," 307-330.
[26] Rexroth, "The Poet as Translator," in *The Craft and Context of Translation*, ed. by William Arrowsmith and Roger Shattuck (Austin: University of Texas Press, 1961), pp. 22-37.
[27] Rexroth, "The Poet as Translator," p. 22.
[28] Rexroth, "The Poet as Translator," p. 29.

faithfulness and reliability of his translations, such as: did he incorporate his subjective views or personal experience into the translations? Was his knowledge of Du Fu "comprehensive?" Would this influence his selections of poems? Would that make him present only a facet of Du Fu's personality?[29] The answers to these questions, of course, are in the poems.

Rexroth was a believer in anachronism. He was opposed to authority, institutions and the established order. He even expressed his dislike of Du Fu the Confucian official.[30] Du Fu, on the other hand, among all Chinese poets was probably the greatest exponent of Confucianism, which was famous for its stability and conservatism, and its advocacy of royalty to the throne. It is interesting to note that Ezra Pound's lifelong obsession with Confucianism may have been because of Confucius' idea of law and order, whereas Rexroth's love for Du Fu, a great Confucian, was despite Du's Confucianism. Rexroth wrote: "I have not translated any of these poems [Du's poems of advice to the throne] [...] However well intentioned, they savor of the social lie, at least to my taste, and do not interest me."[31] On the other hand, despite Pound's political and philosophical preferences, he seemed to prefer another great Chinese poet, Li Bo, who was anti-Confucian and basically a Taoist. The Du Fu that Rexroth's contemporaries knew through his eyes is less a poet concerned with the sufferings of the people than a poet indulging in "elegiac reverie," and who shows us how to face oneself alone. This Du Fu, after careful consideration, is another side of the poet that is not well known to his own countrymen. Rexroth's discovery is therefore another story of gain-- in contrast to loss-- in translation endeavour.

Ling Chung has given an account of Rexroth's early encounter of Chinese poetry:

> Rexroth's interest in Far Eastern literature was aroused by the translations of Ezra Pound, Arthur Waley and Witter Bynner. When Rexroth was about fifteen years old, he [...] discovered Ezra Pound's

[29] Chung, "This Ancient Man is I," 308.
[30] See Rexroth, *One Hundred Poems From the Chinese*, p. 130.
[31] Rexroth, *One Hundred Poems From the Chinese*, p. 130.

> translation of Chinese classical poetry, *Cathay* (1915). According to himself it is this book that introduced him to Chinese literature.[32]

Rexroth says that *Cathay* includes "one of the dozen or so major poems to be written by an American in the twentieth century, and still the best single translation from the Chinese."[33] And he thinks Witter Bynner's translation of Yuan Zhen (Yuan Chen)'s mourning poems for his dead wife "one of the best American poems of this century, incomparably Bynner's best poem."[34] As to the influence of Arthur Waley it is even more significant:

> I read him first as a young boy. His influence on my work has been incalculable, and better still, he led me to the original, both Chinese and Japanese, and opened for me the whole wonderful world of Far Eastern poetry. This world possesses to the full precisely qualities of which the literary sensibility of our demoralized Western culture stands in such obvious need. He has made me a better poet and a better man.[35]

When Rexroth was nineteen years old he went to New Mexico and there he met Witter Bynner, who told him more about Chinese poetry and Du Fu. From that time on Rexroth had a lifelong passion for this ancient Chinese poet. He reflected, many years later, that Du Fu made him a much healthier person, in morality and in the ability to experience things. He even said Du Fu was "the greatest nonepic, nondramatic poet who ever lived," and in some ways greater than Homer or Shakespeare.[36] The most intriguing technique of Du Fu, according to Rexroth, is his ability to present "himself immediately as a person in total communication" in a simple way.[37] In his reading of Arthur Waley's translations and the Du Fu poems one can see, according to Rexroth himself, an edifying process that is not restricted to aesthetics, but extended to moral issues. In this particular concern he is similar to Waley and Pound. Waley's extensive translations of Confucian and Taoist works and Pound's obsession with Confucianism suggest an attempt to introduce not only a foreign literature but also a foreign culture

---

[32] Chung, "This Ancient Man is I," 30.
[33] Rexroth, "The Poet as Translator," p. 35.
[34] Rexroth, "The Poet as Translator," p. 35.
[35] Rexroth, *An Autobiographical Novel* (New York: New Directions, 1964), p. 319.
[36] Rexroth, *An Autobiographical Novel*, pp. 318-319.
[37] Kenneth Rexroth, "Unacknowledged Legislators and 'art pour art'," in *Bird in the Bush, Obvious Essays* (New York: New Directions, 1959), p. 17.

and way of thinking. Though Rexroth's Chinese translations are confined to literature, his comments reveal some of his inclinations concerning moral education. It does not follow, however, that there is any similarity between Rexroth's and Pound and Waley's understandings of what exactly "a better man" or "healthier person" is supposed to mean. Their views of the moral aspects that one could borrow from the orient could still be far apart.

In the following poem there are features that are typical of Rexroth the translator at work: the use of both western and oriental terminology to familiarize and exoticize the text; use of shorter lines and enjambments, and what is more important, departing from the original drastically. This is how Rexroth's Du Fu spends his New Year's Eve:

> The men and beasts of the Zodiac
> Have marched over us once more.
> Green wine bottles and red lobster shells,
> Both emptied, litter the table.
> 'Should auld acquaintance be forgot?' Each
> Sits listening to his own thoughts,
> And the sound of cars starting outside.
> The birds in the eaves are restless,
> Because of the noise and light. Soon now
> In the winter dawn I will face
> My fortieth year. Borne headlong
> Towards the long shadows of sunset
> By the headstrong, stubborn moments,
> Life whirls past like drunken wildfire.[38]

---

[38] Rexroth, "Winter Dawn," in *One Hundred Poems From the Chinese*, p. 5. A word-for-word translation of the original is:

守	歲	阿	戎	家
Wait	year	Ah	Yung	home
椒	盤	已	頌	花
Pepper	basin	already	sing	flower
盍	簪	喧	櫪	馬
All	guest	noise	stable	horses
列	炬	散	林	鴉
Row	torches	drive	woods	crows
四	十	明	朝	過
	(Forty)	next	morning	arrive

William Hung, whose book *Tu Fu: China's Greatest Poet* was a source for Rexroth, finds that only by rendering the poems in prose form could he be faithful to the original and do justice to Du Fu. Hung renders the poem as follow:

> To see the year at a brotherly home, To participate in the songs and toasts with the pepper-wine, I can hear from the stable the noisy horses of the guests, I can see the crows leaving the trees because of the torches. By tomorrow, I shall no longer be forty; the evening of life will be fast coming upon me. Of what use is it to be cautious and to exercise restraint? Let me forget it all by being utterly drunk.[39]

The poem is supposed to be about a family waiting together at a table for the New Year to come, revealing also some customs of the Chinese in the Tang dynasty. As seen in the word-for-word translation and Hung's rendition, some descriptions, like "The men and beasts of the Zodiac," are added by Rexroth. It is obvious that the song, even without consulting the source and Hung's lines, is improvised by Rexroth. "The sound of cars starting outside" also gives a modern touch. Rexroth knows that in the first line it was a pot of red flowers that was placed on the table, as indicated in his footnote.[40] Yet as can be seen here Du Fu finished a bottle of wine and a lot of lobsters, behaving more like a contemporary man. Whether Du Fu ever ate any lobster, let alone on New Year's Eve, is of little significance compared to the overall strategy of changing the setting from a Tang China to a modern western one.

Rexroth uses Robert Burns' lyrics, a song the Tang Chinese could not have known. Rexroth's strategy is obviously to familiarize the text for the target reader. The scene of a dinner party almost over on a New Year's Eve may arouse more sympathy for a western reader, who is familiar with the archetypal image of loneliness in the

飛	騰	暮	景	斜
Fly	jump	evening	scene	slant
誰	能	更	拘	束
Who	needs	still	restrain	bind
爛	醉	是	生	涯
Deep	drunk	is	life	career

[39] Hung, *Tu Fu: China's Greatest Poet*, p. 68.
[40] See Rexroth, *One Hundred Chinese Poem*, p. 138.

midst of joyful celebration, while the traditional Chinese probably find a family union more touching, and the occasion may pose more questions to the individual who is about to be forty. The coming of a New Year also means growing one year older. *Meanwhile, Confucius has related his formation period,* implicating also the growing process of most people, by saying he has acquired the wisdom of not being bewildered by things at forty. Rexroth's translation in this sense reinforces the feeling of misery and oppression in the original. But what is more obvious is that he intends to convey a sense of sadness through the contrast between jubilation and serenity, which is absent in the original.

Rexroth also makes great alterations to the presentation of time. The last few lines in the original show a less mobile picture. What is "flying" is actually the evening scene. Rexroth changes the subject to "life," which "whirls past like drunken wildfire." Rexroth's translation is an attempt to transfer the Chinese poem to a new cultural context. What he does is to re-encode the message of the source text to the target language. It is understandable that a Chinese text would become less Chinese and more English in the hands of a translator like Rexroth.

Rexroth's lines are short, moving with quick tempo, while the run-on lines seem to push even faster. The scenes, hence the images and their juxtapositions, also change at greater pace. Images are reshuffled for sharper contrast, and, for example, the "wildfire" in the last line is either taken from "the torches" that were supposed to scare away the crows mentioned in a previous line in the original, which disappear in Rexroth's line, or are made up altogether by Rexroth to make a new combination, "the drunken wildfire," in which "drunken" should be used to qualify the speaker himself. The new image is sensuous and vivid, adding strength to the ending of the poem.

Rexroth used astronomical terms to give his translations a western, universal, or cosmological flavour. The word "Zodiac" above is not alone. Constellations are mentioned very often, and sometimes they help to present an atmosphere of outdoor life. While he tries to familiarize the foreign elements by using Western terminology, however, he sometimes seems to retain deliberately the Chinese names that sound

unfamiliar to English readers. His strategies in this connection are both familiarizing and defamiliarizing the text, depending on the poetic necessities, as for example in the following:

> The lives of many men are
> Shorter than the years since we have
> Seen each other. Aldebaran
> And Antares move as we have.[41]

In the original two stars are mentioned, *Shen* and *Shang*, and the idea is that the two stars could hardly be seen at the same time. One appears always means the absence of the other. Rexroth gives the Western names of two stars, and they do not carry the original meanings of mutual exclusion. Actually even if he rendered the original names there would not be such an association in the target system. He shifts the association to that of the moving and unstable instead.

He sometimes retains the Chinese names of place, whereas using Western terminology for the stars. The result is that the reader may feel that this is ancient China, but then we are literally under the same heaven also:

> Nightfall. I return from a
> Journey along the Tigers'
> Trail. The mountains are black.
> Everybody is at home
> Asleep. The Great Bear descends
> To the river. Overhead
> The stars are huge in the sky.[42]

---

[41] Rexroth, *One Hundred Poems From the Chinese*, p. 11. A word-for-word translation of the original is:

人	生	不	相	見
Man	life	not	each other	see
動	如	參	與	商
Move	like	*Sheng*	and	*Shang*

[42] Rexroth, *One Hundred Poems From the Chinese*, p. 31. I searched through Du Fu's collection, Qiu Zhaoao 仇兆鰲, ed., *Du shi xiang zhu* 杜詩詳註 (Taibei: Wenshizhe chubanshe, 1973), but could not find a poem that bears remote similarity to Rexroth's lines. It is likely that the poem was written by Rexroth himself, or rewritten to such an extent that it is beyond recognition.

The hostile and unfamiliar name, Tigers' Trail, is juxtaposed with the Great Bear, a familiar name. Western star names can be found in the following again, but the images of the moon and flower at the end may be more associative of the Chinese setting. The foreign and local flavours are once again mixed:

> The Autumn night is clear
> After the thunderstorm.
> Venus glows on the river.
> The Milky Way is white as snow.
> The dark sky is vast and deep.
> The Northern Crown sets in the dusk.
> The moon like a clear mirror
> Rises from the great void. When it
> Has climbed high in the sky, moonlit
> Frost glitters on the chrysanthemums.[43]

The moon, the mirror, the void, and the glittering frost on the chrysanthemums form a serene scene that presents itself, locating the reader. Rexroth expunges some lines, mainly the fourth, the fifth, and the seventh. In the original there is no flower at the end, let alone chrysanthemums, which are put there by Rexroth presumably for their oriental

---

[43] Rexroth, *One Hundred Poems From the Chinese*, p. 32. A word-for-word translation of the original is:

驟	雨	清	秋	夜
Sudden	rain	clear	autumn	night
金	波	耿	玉	繩
Golden	Wave	glows	Jade	String
天	河	元	自	白
Heaven	River	originally	self	white
江	浦	向	來	澄
River	side	as	always	clear
映	物	連	珠	斷
Reflecting	things	consecutively	beads	broken
緣	空	一	鋭	升
Along	sky	a	mirror	rises
餘	光	隱	更	漏
Residue	light	hidden	(sand clock)	
況	乃	露	華	凝
Moreover	is	dew	drops	condense

flavour. To enhance the vividness of the images and the poetic scene, Rexroth makes the flowers glitter with frost.

The Chinese scene dominates once again the following lines. Here Rexroth also manages to avoid using logical connectives to tell the reader about the sequence of events as well as the cause and effects of things. This style approximates Chinese syntax in its brevity, presenting things as they are without interference from the narrator. He mixes Chinese and the familiar Western terminology, and uses shorter sentences also:

> It is late in the year;
> Yin and Yang struggle
> In the brief sunlight.
> On the desert mountains.
> Frost and snow
> Gleam in the freezing night.
> Past midnight,
> Drums and bugles ring out,
> Violent, cutting the heart.
> Over the Triple Gorge the Milky Way
> Pulsates between the stars.[44]

Unlike Pound and Snyder, Rexroth usually did not use disrupted structure. In Rexroth's poems images are highlighted and the scenes are shifted rapidly through short sentences and run-on lines. The images "frost and snow," for example, constitute a line, while the phrase "gleam in the freezing night" forms another. The phrase "drums and bugles ring out" makes up a unit; "violent, cutting the heart" makes up another. In the last two lines he accentuates the visual effect of the images by splitting the sentence "over the Triple

---

[44] Rexroth, *One Hundred Poems From the Chinese*, p. 29. A word-for-word translation of the original is:

歲	暮	陰	陽	催	短	景
Year	late	Yin	Yang	push	short	scene
天	涯	霜	雪	鬢	寒	宵
Heaven	end	frost	snow	gleam	cold	night
五	更	鼓	角	聲	悲	壯
Fifth	watch	drum	bugle	sound	sad	sublime
三	峽	星	河	影	動	搖
Three	Gorges	Milky	Way	shadow	move	shake

Gorge the Milky Way pulsates between the stars" into two halves. The Milky Way over the Triple Gorge forms a scene, with the two images juxtaposing each other. The verb "pulsates" is saved for the beginning of the next line, the last line of the poem, and the impression of vibration is thus foregrounded. One can see more clearly Rexroth's method of using short sentences to juxtapose images by looking at the attempt of another translator. Bynner is to translate the lines into poetic form.[45] Compared to Rexroth Bynner shows a tendency towards more logical reasoning, partly because of the length of the sentences, and partly because of the intellectual pointers and connectives "while" and "and" at the beginning of the first two lines.

Though Rexroth's version is closer to the original in linguistic terms this time, it is not his consistent strategy. Rexroth uses pronouns throughout in his translation:

> I have had asthma for a
> Long time [...]
> It is quiet too. No crowds
> Bother me. I am brighter
> [...] I am happy here.[46]

There are no pronouns in the original. What then is Rexroth trying to do in this particular connection? His language is conversational, emphasizing the presence of a speaker. In the first example the repetition of the subject "I" intensifies the sense of

---

[45] This is Bynner's version:

> While winter daylight shortens in the elemental scale
> And snow and frost whiten the cold-circling night,
> Stark sounds the fifth-watch with a challenge of drum and bugle.

Witter Bynner and Kiang Kang-hu, *The Jade Mountain* (New York: Knopf, 1929), p. 156.

[46] Rexroth, *One Hundred Poems From the Chinese*, p. 19.

患	氣	經	時	久
Suffer	asthma	for	time	long
[...]				
喧	卑	方	避	俗
Noise	inferior	just	avoid	vulgarity
疏	快	頗	宜	人
Alert	quick	quite	suitable	people
			(feeling good)	

loneliness. The rapid repetition of "I" also suggests a happy mood, sounds like someone who cannot suppress his joy. The effect is closer to the sense of intimacy and immediacy in the original lines of Du Fu, who is almost inviting the audience to share his experience.

While Rexroth does not hesitate to introduce the subject "I" which is not shown in the original, he does write in a simple language that in a way resembles the Chinese syntax, and he usually uses words that contain one or two syllables. Besides highlighting the images, brevity of language coupled with run-on lines are also his techniques to bring out the "Chinese scene:"

Autumn Wind

The autumn wind blows white clouds
About the sky. Grass turns brown.
leaves fall. Wild geese fly south.
The last flowers bloom, orchids
And chrysanthemums with their
Bitter perfume. I dream of
That beautiful face I can
Never forget. I go for
a trip on the river [...]
I am happy for a moment
And then the old sorrow comes back.
I was young only a little while,
And now I am growing old.[47]

One can compare Rexroth's version with that of Waley.[48] Both translators try to intensify the juxtaposition of images in the same line through different ways of manipulating English syntax. There are two parts to each of the original lines, and in the middle of each line there is the connective which reads and sounds like a sigh. Waley used colons to connect the two parts, to suggest the vague relation, which is somewhat between analogy and cause-and-effect. Rexroth, however, disrupts the syntax. The method of using run-on lines to enhance the juxtaposition of images-- by putting various images or ideas in the same line, or highlighting an impression by placing it at

[47] Rexroth, *Love and the Turning Year*, p. 4.
[48] For the source text and Waley's translation see Chapter 5.

the beginning of a line-- is one of Rexroth's characteristics. As a result the lines show a sharp contrast of images.[49]

The following poem, "By The Winding River I," with its short and run-on lines, words that have one or two syllables, and a calculated departure from the original in meaning that could hardly be dismissed as mistake or negligence, shows Rexroth's strong personal preference:

Every day on the way home from
My office I pawn another
Of my spring clothes. Every day
I come home from the river bank
Drunk. Everywhere I go, I owe
Money for wine. History
Records few men who lived to be
Seventy. I watch the yellow
Butterflies drink deep of the
Flowers, and the dragonflies
Dipping the surface of the
Water again and again.
I cry out to the spring wind,
And the light and the passing hours.
We enjoy life such a little
While, why should men cross each other?[50]

---

[49] One could perceive better Rexroth's style, and for that matter Waley's, by comparing theirs with the same piece rendered by Herbert A. Giles:

Amari Aliquid

The autumn blast drives the white scud in the sky,
Leaves fade, and wild geese sweeping south meet the eye;
The scent of late flowers fills the soft air above,
My heart full of thoughts of the lady I love.

Herbert Giles, *Gems of Chinese Literature* (London: Quaritch, 1922), p. 304.

The lines are longer, following basically the original structure. Little attempt is shown, however, to put emphasis on the juxtaposition of images. The regular form, perhaps, provides not much room for the translator to maneuvre.

[50] Rexroth, *One Hundred Poems From the Chinese*, p. 13. A word-for-word translation of the original is:

朝	回	日	日	典	春	衣
Court	back	day	day	pawn	Spring	clothes
每	日	江	頭	盡	醉	歸
Every	day	river	bank	always	drunk	return
酒	債	尋	常	行	處	有
Wine	debt	(common)		everywhere	place	is
人	生	七	十	古	來	稀
Man	life	(seventy)		ancient	since	scarce

Though the last line of the original does say something like "Let us not be at odds with each other," it does not show an overall view of life. Rexroth's insertion of the cause (the last but one line), which leads to a necessary conclusion at the end, slightly changes Du Fu's sombre outlook of life. It is the wind and light that the speaker is addressing and inviting in the original,[51] and the description throughout presents a scene which leads to an understanding of the nature of things, a harmonious relation between the self and nature. Rexroth's presentation, however, shows more despair over life on the one hand ("We enjoy life such a little"), and a rebuttal of the conflicts in the human world (a rhetorical question at the end) on the other. His response is more in human terms, whereas Du Fu's is more metaphysical. It is ironical to know that Rexroth's ending may very well fit into Du Fu's ideas in many other poems. For this poem, however, one can only say that the scene seen by Du Fu and Rexroth leads to quite different conclusions, and Rexroth here acts more Du Fu than Du Fu.

Du Fu, like so many other Chinese poets of his time, may show outlooks on life diametrically opposed depending on the occasion. The Confucian Du Fu, who always had the well being of the state and the people at heart, managed to sustain a very positive attitude towards life and things in general, whereas the same individual may at another moment show intense sorrow, as when contemplating the smallness of the individual in the perpetual flux of time and history. Pessimism or sentimentalism, one should be reminded, is not something the ancient Chinese would have been ashamed of.

穿	花	蛺 蝶	深	深	見
Crossing	flowers	(butterflies)	deep	deep	see
點	水	蜻 蜓	欵	欵	飛
Touch	water	(dragonflies)	slowly	slowly	fly
傳	語	風 光	共	流	轉
Passing	words	wind light	together	move	around
暫	時	相 賞	莫	相	違
Temporarily	time	each appreciate	not	each	at odds

[51] William Hung's literal rendition of the last two lines, for example, is: "O wind and light and time, roll on; Let us not quarrel; let us enjoy life while we can." It is the natural objects that the speaker is addressing. Hung, *Tu Fu: China's Greatest Poet*, p. 129.

In "Night in the House by the River," the speaker laments the glamour and glories of the ancient heroes, who have gone down with their great deeds in history forever. The end of the poem, in Rexroth's translation, is:

> The great heroes and generals of old time
> Are yellow dust forever now.
> Such are the affairs of men.
> Poetry and letters
> Persist in silence and solitude.[52]

"Sleeping Dragon" and "Galloping Horse," titles of two famous historical figures that appear in the original, were dropped in the translation. Rexroth, as he himself claimed, tries to bypass allusions.[53] His aim is to write poems that are completely of his own time. Though foreign elements are sometimes kept to give a sense of exoticism, allusions suggesting a foreign cultural heritage may not be helpful in his effort to write English poems that appeal to the contemporary reader. The exotic flavour that he often retains serves the same purpose of appealing to the reader. Muriel Rukeyser wrote that all allusion would be contradictory to the indescribable "being there" of the poem. That "being there," according to her, is what translators are trying to bring over.[54] Giving up allusions which may handicap reception of the poem is in line with Rexroth's overall strategy.[55]

---

[52] Rexroth, *One Hundred Poems From the Chinese*, p. 29. A word-for-word translation of the original is:

臥	龍	躍	馬	終	黃	土
Sleeping	Dragon	Galloping	Horse	eventually	yellow	dust
人	事	音	書	漫	寂	寥
Human	affairs	sound	words	silent	(lonely)	

[53] Rexroth, "Notes," *One Hundred Poems From the Chinese*, p. 136.
[54] Muriel Rukeyser, "The Music of Translation," in *The World of Translation: Papers Delivered at the Conference on Literary Translation Held in New York City in May 1970 Under the Auspices of P. E. N. American Center* (New York: P. E. N. American Center, 1971), pp. 187-193 (p. 191).
[55] Burton Watson's reflection on place names, meanwhile, is worth noting. He does not think it is necessary to translate them:

> In a country as old as China, place names naturally come to have rich historical or legendary associations and their mere mention in literature is sufficient to call up scenes of departed glory, fierce battles, the excitement of a bustling city, or the loneliness of the frontier. The poets of China [...] are fond of working place names into their poems, both for the air of crisp reality they lend-- this happened not "some place" or "any place" but

The tone of the above poem is also drastically shifted from the original, in which there are no words that carry the meanings of "poetry" or "persist." The introduction of these words at the end adds a fighting spirit to the poem, and shows that there is something, that is, writing poetry, that the individual can cling to. It is not unusual that a Chinese poem ends with sorrow. The speaker may indulge in lamentation down to the very end without resolution. Not only did Rexroth change the tone to a positive one, he also made up an objective for the speaker.

Rexroth seems to have an inclination to introduce a positive view to literary fame to Du Fu's poems:

> [...] Stars blossom
> Over the vast desert of
> Waters. Moonlight flows on the
> Surging river. My poems have
> Made me famous [...][56]

In the original what Du Fu was trying to say is that reputation could not be attained by his literary endeavour (a way to express his mild frustration and dissatisfaction over himself and society as a whole), and he put his despair in a rhetorical question. Rexroth's line points to the opposite direction. In the same anthology, Rexroth also includes these lines of Du Fu:

> at a place called Such-and-such-- and for the dramatic or nostalgic overtones that such names carry [...]
>
> Beyond appreciating their concreteness, it is naturally difficult for a foreigner to assess the emotional effect which such place names may have for the Chinese reader [...]

Watson, *Chinese Lyricism: Shih Poetry from the Second to the Twelfth Century, with Translations* (New York: Columbia University Press, 1971), pp. 128-129.

[56] Rexroth, *One Hundred Poems From the Chinese*, p. 33. A word-for-word translation of the original is:

星	垂	平	野	闊
Stars	drooping	flat	field	broad
月	湧	大	江	流
Moon	embrace	big	river	flow
名	豈	文	章	著
Reputation	how (not because)	(arts, literature)		famous

[...] We appreciate
Each other's literary
Merits. Our poems will be handed
Down along with great dead poets'.[57]

There are no such lines in the original poem. In fact, Rexroth's version reads so different from the Chinese poem that it could hardly be identified.[58] Although such a twist of embracing the profession of poetry writing can be ascribed to Rexroth's creation, it reflects Du Fu in a more jubilant mood. The unyielding spirit, especially towards long lasting writings, can be seen easily in other Du Fu poems (such as the eight pieces of "Autumn Thoughts"). The same attitude of exalting the trade of a poet is also what Rexroth has been upholding.[59] So here once again Rexroth brings his personality into his Du Fu, yet in the meantime brings home the Du Fu that the traditional Chinese reader is even more familiar with. The glorification of poetry writing is also what Du Fu would do, and Rexroth did not just consider the poem he was translating, but the person Du Fu in his mind.

Like Pound, Rexroth put the emphasis more on the target text, and abandoned elements that do not carry relevant cultural associations for the target language. In the original, for example, there are historical figures, who are household legends to Chinese readers, but Rexroth set them aside.[60] As a result the poem reads more English on one hand, and the flow of the poetic meaning on the other is not interrupted for unknown details, which are most likely meaningless to the English reader. His strategy, therefore, is not so much to transfer the Chinese culture to his audience as to show an English poem purportedly from China. The foreign cultural element is there mainly to mark the foreign identity of the poem, not to hamper the reception process.

---

[57] Rexroth, *One Hundred Poems From the Chinese*, p. 15.
[58] The title of Rexroth's poem is "To Pi Ssu Yao," while the transliteration of the original should read something like "To Pei Shi Zhou" 寄裴施州, which is the only poem in Du's collection that I find bear some remote resemblance to Rexroth's lines.
[59] See Rexroth, "Unacknowledged legislators and 'Art Pour Art'," in *Bird in the Bush*, pp. 3-18.
[60] See the discussions of the "Sleeping Dragon" and "Galloping Horse" above.

In cases when Du Fu is facing "a poetic situation," Rexroth did not miss the chance to intensify the atmosphere, to present "the images themselves in concrete relationship."[61] The following is an example:

> White birds over the grey river.
> Scarlet flowers on the green hills.[62]

The fourth characters of both lines in the original, 逾 *yu* (more) and 欲 *yu* (almost, going to), are verbal, but there is no verb in Rexroth's translation. He is focusing on the presentation of scene and the juxtaposition of images. Verbs are taken away so that the images are foregrounded. The poetic situation, in Rexroth's term, or the "scene," is thus thickened.

Rexroth sometimes produces a scene that departs from the original drastically, but the result is that they are beautiful English lines that still carry a Chinese flavour. His Du Fu, for example, wrote this poem:

> A good rain knows its season.
> It comes at the edge of Spring.
> It steals through the night on the breeze
> Noiselessly wetting everything.
> Dark night, the clouds black as the roads,
> Only a light on a boat gleaming.
> In the morning, thoroughly soaked with water,
> The flowers hang their heavy heads.[63]

---

[61] Kenneth Rexroth, "Tu Fu Poems," in *Classics Revisited* (New York: Avon Books, 1965), p. 130.
[62] Rexroth, *One Hundred Poems From the Chinese*, p. 24. A word-for-word translation of the original is:

江	碧	鳥	逾	白
River	jade-like	bird	more	white
山	青	花	欲	燃
Hills	green	flowers	almost	burn

[63] Rexroth, *Love and the Turning Year*, p. 62. A word-for-word translation of the original is:

好	雨	知	時	節
Good	rain	knows	time	festival
當	春	乃	發	生
When	spring	then	take	place
隨	風	潛	入	夜
Follow	wind	covertly	enter	night

The imagery in Rexroth's last line expresses feeling. Rexroth took away the allusion to Brocade city at the end, and concentrated on the flowers, almost like using a close-up camera.[64] His preoccupation with what he calls the "Chinese rule" serves as a guiding principle of his translation, and leads him to make up lines that can be identified as containing Chinese scene, or Rexroth's Chinese scene.

The following poem by Du Fu, "Full Moon," may serve to summarize the poetic situation in Chinese poetry Rexroth cherished:

> Isolate and full, the moon
> Floats over the house by the river.
> Into the night the cold water rushes away below the gate.
> The bright gold spilled on the river is never still.
> The brilliance of my quilt is greater than precious silk.
> The circle without blemish.
> The empty mountains without sound.
> The moon hangs in the vacant, wide constellations.
> Pine cones drop in the old garden.
> The senna trees bloom.
> The same clear glory extends for ten thousand miles.[65]

潤	物	細	無	聲
Moisten	things	little	no	noise
野	徑	雲	俱	黑
Wild	path	clouds	all	dark
江	船	火	獨	明
River	boat	fire	alone	bright
曉	看	紅	濕	處
Morning	see	red	wet	area
花	重	錦	官	城
Flower	heavy	Brocade	Official	City
		(Chengdu)		

[64] Compare it, for example, with William Hung's rendition:

> A nice rain knows when to fall-- Coming as a natural product of the spring. Following the wind, it smoothly occupies the night And moistens everything with soft and silent blessings. Dark are the clouds above every country road; There is only one light coming from a slowly moving boat. In the morning I shall see many red and wet patches Of full and heavy flowers everywhere in the City of Brocade.

Hung, *Tu Fu: China's Greatest Poet*, p. 174.

[65] Rexroth, *One Hundred Poems From the Chinese*, p. 28. A word-for-word translation of the original is:

Different from his usual practice of using run-on lines, Rexroth takes every line as a unit (except the first line), an entity of itself. The effect is a slower tempo and a more static scene, echoing the sense of contentment. The full moon is a symbol for nirvana, a sudden illumination or understanding of life in Chinese poetry, so is "the circle." The other images, like "bright gold spilled on the river," "brilliance of my quilt," "precious silk," "empty mountains without sound," "moon hangs in the vacant," "pine cones drop in the cold garden," "the senna trees bloom," all suggest an oriental flavour. The last line, the clear glory that extends for ten thousand miles, emphasizes the fact that the harmony is universal. The listing of images, suppressing verbs to the minimal, also presents a scene that is subdued and serene. It is this kind of "Chinese rule," this kind of "poetic situation," or "elegiac reverie" that Rexroth sought, and he found such a scene in a poem of Du Fu. By highlighting these characteristics, his translation brings home his concept of Chinese rule and his understanding of the essence of Du Fu. As seen in the source text, the images in Rexroth's poems are basically those that appeared in the original. What he did this time is mainly not to break up the lines, keeping the line structure, the listing of images that suggest a cosmic order and perfection.

孤 Isolate	月 moon	當 facing	樓 house	滿 full
寒 Cold	江 river	動 move	夜 night	扉 gate
委 Spill	波 wave	金 gold	不 not	定 steady
照 Shine	席 quilt	綺 silk	逾 more	依 soft
未 Not	缺 imperfect	空 empty	山 mountain	靜 quiet
高 High	懸 hang	列 listed	宿 stars	稀 scarce
故 Old	園 home	松 pine	桂 senna	發 bloom
萬 Thousand	里 miles	共 together	清 clear	輝 light

Sometimes Rexroth introduces Chinese elements overtly into his own poems, only to juxtapose them with Western ones. He is not satisfied to just borrowing ideas from ancient China, but incorporates or transforms them into something new and foreign yet indigenous to the reader. Some of the nature images in his translated poems quoted above, for example, remind one of the scene in his own poem:

> [...] under
> The full moon and the few large stars.
> [...]
> "Our campfire dies out in the
> Lonely mountains. The transparent
> Moonlight stretches a thousand miles.
> The clear peace is without end.[66]

The moon and stars, the lonely mountains, the campfire that gradually dies out, and the transparent moonlight that stretches a thousand miles, altogether present a serene scene on cosmic scale. In the last line, the abstract scene, peace that is without end, is made concrete by the adjective "clear." The atmosphere reminds one of his perception of a Chinese scene or a poetic situation. Attempts to incorporate images that are more associative of Chinese flavours with the Western tradition in his own poems can also be perceived in the following lines ("Yin and Yang"), which might be mistaken for another of his Chinese translations:

> It is spring once more in the Coast Range
> Warm, perfumed, under the Easter moon.
> The flowers are back in their places.
> The birds back in their usual trees.
> The winter stars set in the ocean.
> the summer stars rise from the mountains.
> The air is filled with atoms of quicksilver.
> Resurrection envelops the earth.
> Geometrical, blazing, deathless,
> Animals and men march through heaven,
> Pacing their secret ceremony.
> The Lion gives the moon to the Virgin.
> She stands at the crossroads of heaven,
> Holding the full moon in her right hand,
> A glittering wheat ear in her left.
> The climax of the rite of rebirth
> Has ascended from the underworld
> Is proclaimed in light from the zenith.

[66] *The Collected Shorter Poems of Kenneth Rexroth* (New York: New Directions, 1966), pp. 234-236.

In the underworld the sun swims
Between the fish called Yes and No.[67]

The simple parallel sentences as well as the enumerating of things in the first part of this poem read very much like Chinese parallelisms; the universal harmony also reminds one of Chinese philosophy and some of the Chinese nature poems he translated. In the second half, however, Rexroth shifts to western mythology. The poem, just like the poet himself, reconciles opposing forces, witnessing a "rebirth" that "has ascended from the underworld" of the creative mind, and "is proclaimed in light from the zenith."

As quoted above, Rexroth considered Yuan Zhen's elegiac poems the best of all Bynner's works. Rexroth himself had suffered the death of his wife, and in his own poems in memorial of her he adopts similar technique of Yuan's by focusing on routine and trivial family life, which is also a common practice in Chinese elegiac tradition. Ling Chung has pointed out that the following lines "seem to have been derived from" Yuan Zhen:[68]

We thought the years would last forever,
They are all gone now, the days
We thought would not come for us are here.

And this is how Rexroth laments in his own poem:

I baked you a bannock birthday cake.
Here you did your best paintings--
Innocent, wondering landscapes.
Very few of them are left
Anywhere. You destroyed them
In the terrible trouble
Of your long sickness. Eighteen years
Have passed since that autumn.[69]

---

[67] *The Collected Shorter Poems of Kenneth Rexroth*, p. 23.

[68] Chung, "This Ancient Man is I," p. 181. A word-for-word translation of Yuan's lines is:

昔	日	戲	言	身	後	事
Past	days	joking	words	life	hereafter	matter
今	朝	都	到	眼	前	來
This	day	all	come	eye	front	come

[69] Rexroth, "Andree Rexroth: Kings River Canyon," in *The Collected Shorter Poems of Kenneth Rexroth*, pp. 191-192.

Not only does he adopt approaches that remind one of the Chinese tradition, but he also mentions the Chinese poets that influence him, identifying himself with them and using their poems as inter-texts. He continues:

> You are dead. With a thousand
> Convicts they have blown a highway
> Through Horseshoe bend. Youth is gone,
> That only came once. My hair
> Is turning grey and my body
> Heavier. I too move on to death.
> I think [...]
> Of Yuan Chen's great poem,
> Unbearably pitiful [...][70]

In a poem writing "For The Chinese Actress, Gardenia Chang," he compares himself with Du Fu (Tu Fu):

> When Tu Fu was a small boy
> He saw Kung Sung as she danced
> With two swords, and years later
> he remembered, and she lived
> In his memory, always
> Refining his perception,
> [...]
> Now, days later, you are still
> Clear and intact in my mind,
> Your arch, small, transcendent face,
> Your voice, so pure, light, and dry,
> [...]
> I know I shall remember
> You for many, many years.[71]

In *Love And The Turning Year: One Hundred More Poems From The Chinese,* Rexroth translates the following poem of a Chinese poet called "Wang Hung Kung:"

In The Mountain Village

> Wild flowers and grass grow on
> The ancient ceremonial
> Stairs. The sun sets between the
> Forested mountains. The swallows
> Who nested once in the painted

[70] "Andree Rexroth: Kings River Canyon," in *The Collected Shorter Poems of Kenneth Rexroth*, pp. 191-192.
[71] Rexroth, *The Collected Shorter Poems of Kenneth Rexroth*, p. 199.

Eaves of the palaces of
The young prince are flying
This evening between the homes
Of woodcutters and quarrymen.

More ancient by far than the stairs
Are the cyclopean walls
Of immense dry laid stones covered
With moss and ferns. If you approach
Quietly and imitate their
Voices, you can converse all day
With the tree frogs who live there.[72]

Although the theme here has little in common with the previous poem, the nostalgic, peaceful and contented mood in a natural environment is the same. The swallows that once nested in the princes' palaces but flying now in ordinary people's homes are famous imagery used by a Tang poet Liu Yuxi 劉禹錫 (772-842), and Wang Hung Kung's first stanza is obviously alluded to this.[73]

Wang Hung Kung's lines are more detailed and the images more concrete. The wild flowers and the evening sun are there. The imagery "painted eaves of the palaces" is more vivid than just names of the big families, which mean little in a foreign language, while the swallows flying between the homes of woodcutters and quarrymen are not only more concrete and precise than simply saying "ordinary homes," but are presented with montage effect as well. The images, furthermore, speak for human sorrows, a typical technique in Chinese poetry.

This poem also epitomizes the *xing* quality that has been discussed earlier in this thesis. In *xing*, feelings are not stated, but contained in the scene. There is no attempt in

---

[72] Rexroth, *Love and the Turning Year*, p. 119.

[73] A word-for-word translation of Liu Yuxi's poem is:

朱	雀	橋	邊	野	草	花
Red	Bird	Bridge	near	wild	flowers	grass
烏	衣	巷	口	夕	陽	斜
Black-Clothes		Lane	entrance	evening	sun	slanting
舊	時	王	謝	堂	前	燕
Old	time	Wang (big and famous families)	Xie	court	front	swallows
飛	入	尋	常	百	姓	家
Fly	into	(ordinary)		(people)		homes

this poem to rationalize the situation, or link the natural scene to human feelings. The first three sentences in the first stanza, "Wild flowers [...]/ The sun sets [...]/ The swallows [...]" describe the scene, and the sense of nostalgia is derived by the reader. The contrast between the present and the past is witnessed by the swallows, which have nested once in the noblemen's houses. The situation is not lamented by an individual who has experienced the differences, nor is there any attempt by the speaker to comment on the transient nature of things.

The simple sentences, juxtaposition of images through manipulation of line units, specifically run-on lines, have become a hallmark of Rexroth's representation of ancient China. This poem of Wang Hung Kung is also an example of the Chinese rule or a scene for elegiac reverie. Rexroth imitates voices, quietly, like the speaker of this poem. He imitates Chinese voices. Wang Hung Kung is Rexroth himself.[74] By creating a Chinese name, and putting his own creation among the translations, he is just playing a trick on his reader, quietly. What is left for scholars to "converse all day," actually, is his mischievous behaviour of blurring the distinction between writing and rewriting. His writing sounds so much like a translation from the Chinese that it makes little difference to the reader one way or another. To the general reader who could not read the original, whether there is an original means little. The translation is the original. Only in this case it is just the opposite: Rexroth wants his readers to believe that the original is a translation, because of its Chinese flavours, its Chinese scene of elegiac reverie. Behind this playful act is also the belief that a Chinese poem should sound and look Chinese, and a translator could even make up a Chinese poem, or tradition.

---

[74] Rexroth adopted a Chinese name王紅公 for himself, and the transliteration of this name in English is "Wang Hung Kung." At the end of his book *One Hundred More Poems From the Chinese: Love and the Turning Year*, Rexroth gave "notes" to the Chinese poets he had translated, and under the name Wang Hung Kung , he put down these words: "Wang Hung Kung is a contemporary poet." All the other poets included in the anthology are ancient Chinese poets. See Rexroth, *Love and the Turning Year: One Hundred More Poems From the Chinese*, p. 132. See also Ling Chung, *Yincang he xianxing* "隱藏和現形" , *Chungwai Literary Monthly* 中外文學 20.11 (1991), 5-24 (p. 23), note 6, in which she says Wang Hung Kung is Rexroth.

Chapter 8

Gary Snyder: The Mountain and the Mind

When talking about rewriting André Lefevere comments that,

> Writers are rewritten when their work passes from one literature into another, just as they are rewritten inside a given literature [...] First of all, they don't really submit. In many cases they have long been dead [...] if the writer does not 'submit', he or she will simply not exist in the receiving literature at all.[1]

In this way the monk from the Tang Dynasty was rewritten and "submitted," (or, "did not really submit.") One of the reasons why Cold Mountain 寒山 spoke for the Beat Generation in the receiving culture is that he "submitted" to it.

Pound and Rexroth, though emphasizing some aspects in the original language, were basically translating well established poets like Li Bo and Du Fu. Hardly known to his countrymen for centuries, Cold Mountain was first transferred to Japan and made his reputation there before he immigrated eastwards, to England (translated by Arthur Waley and published in 1954).[2] But his journey continued until he arrived on the west coast of the United States, California.[3] There he became the right mountain at the right time and in the right place. The Beat Generation in the early sixties found him, or he was camouflaged as one of the mountains there through Snyder's manipulation.

---

[1] Theo Hermans, *The Manipulation of Literature* (London: Croom Helm, 1985), pp. 235-236.

[2] *Encounter*, 3 (September, 1954), 3-8. For the reception of Cold Mountain in the English speaking world see also Ling Chung, "Whose Mountain is This?--Gary Snyder's Translation of Han Shan," *Renditions* 7 (1977), 93-102. Ling Chung, "The Reception of Cold Mountain's Poetry in the Far East and the United States," in *China and the West: Comparative Literature Studies*, ed. by William Tay and others (Hong Kong: The Chinese University Press, 1980), pp. 85-96. See also Hu Juren 胡菊人, "The Rebirth of the Monk Poet Han Shan," 詩僧寒山的復活 *Ming Pao Monthly* 明報月刊, 1 (November, 1966), 2-12.

[3] Gary Snyder, *Evergreen Review*, 2 (Autumn, 1958), 69-80; reprinted in his volume of poetry, *Riprap and Cold Mountain Poems* (San Francisco: Four Seasons Foundation, 1966), pp. 37-50.

Arthur Waley published twenty-seven of Han-Shan's poems in 1954,[4] while Burton Watson published one hundred poems of Han-Shan in 1962.[5] Gary Snyder's Cold Mountain came out in between, in 1958. Gary Synder's translations of twenty-four poems by Cold Mountain later appeared also in the following collections: *Riprap and Cold Mountain Poems*,[6] *A Range of Poems*,[7] *A Casebook on the Beat*,[8] and the *Anthology of Chinese Literature* edited by Cyril Birch.[9] The most recent attempt was made by Robert G. Henricks, whose book came out in 1990; it is also the most ambitious endeavour, as the title suggests: *The Poetry of Han-Shan: A Complete, Annotated Translation of Cold Mountain*.[10]

What is interesting about Gary Snyder's translation is that it is the shortest, but enjoyed a more popular reception. Herbert V. Fackler, who does not know Chinese himself, compares Snyder's translations with Arthur Waley's twenty seven poems and Burton Watson's one hundred poems of Cold Mountain, and comes to the conclusion that Synder's version achieves "a structural unity, high degree of imagery effectiveness, and a universal relevance which makes it the best poetry of the three versions."[11] He has to admit, however, that he is judging by poetic achievement, not from a translation viewpoint. This seems to be quite obvious. In the target language, from critics to general readers, poems are appreciated more for their charm and congeniality than their being supposedly faithful to an original.

Those who have the source text in mind, however, offer different conclusions. David Hawkes laments:

---

[4] *Encounter*, 3 (September, 1954), 3-8.
[5] *Cold Mountain: 100 Poems by the T'ang Poet Han-shan*, trans. with an introduction by Burton Watson (New York: Grove Press, 1962).
[6] Snyder, *Riprap and Cold Mountain Poems*, pp. 31-61.
[7] Gary Snyder, *A Range of Poems* (London: Fulcrum Press, 1966).
[8] *A Casebook on the Beat*, ed. by Thomas Francis Parkinson (New York: Thomas Y. Crowell, 1961).
[9] *Anthology of Chinese Literature*, ed. by Cyril Birch (New York: Grove Press, 1965).
[10] Robert G. Henricks, *The Poetry of Han-Shan: A Complete, Annotated Translation of Cold Mountain* (Albany: State University of New York Press, 1990).
[11] Herbert V. Fackler, "Three English Versions of Han Shan's Cold Mountain Poems," *Literature East & West*, 15.2 (1973), 270.

> Of the English translations I have seen I confess to an irrational weakness for Snyder's. He is rather inaccurate, and he occasionally falls into that peculiarly wanton kind of silliness which leads translators to turn gold and jade into diamonds and mink. But his translations read like poetry. Mr. Watson's seem to me to stand about midway between Snyder's and Waley's: more colloquial than Waley's; less violent than Snyder's.[12]

What Gary Snyder was facing is actually what Ezra Pound, Arthur Waley and Kenneth Rexroth faced. All were accused by critics, though for different reasons: Rexroth was accused, like Snyder, of being unfaithful;[13] Pound was accused by critics, not just of being unfaithful, but of making gross mistakes.[14] On top of being accused of unfaithfulness, Waley was also criticized for using no rhymes, and of doing great damage to English poetry.[15] Hawkes, however, reveals an important point when he notes that Snyder's translations read like poetry. As with the others, Snyder's merit, despite the criticisms, is that his translations stand as English poems in their own right.[16]

Cold Mountain was a monk in the seventh century. There is still a Cold Mountain Temple in Suzhou (near Shanghai). This monk, however, was different from others in that his ideas, incorporated with some Taoist thoughts, can hardly be classified. There is also little known about the person, besides that he lived a secluded life. He has not been a popular figure in Chinese literature because his colloquial language, to begin with, is not generally accepted as a decent style of poetry. His nonconformist attitudes gave him little

---

[12] David Hawkes, *Classical, Modern and Humane: Essays in Chinese literature*, ed. by John Minford and Siu-kit Wong (Hong Kong: The Chinese University Press, 1989), p. 250.

[13] Rexroth was accused by Ling Chung, his co-translator, for being unfaithful. See the discussions on Rexroth in the previous chapter.

[14] See the discussions on Pound in Chapter 6.

[15] See the discussions on Waley in Chapter 5.

[16] Rewriters created images of a writer, a work, sometimes even a whole literature. These images tended to reach more people than the corresponding realities did. These images and the impact they made, however, have not often been studied. The power wielded by these images and by their makers is enormous. See the

room to flourish in the Chinese literary tradition. Orthodox Buddhism did not consider him as a proper monk because of his behaviour; Taoists on the other hand thought of him as a Buddhist monk, though a very strange one, and, it is even more obvious that Confucianism did not allow weird, anti-social behaviour like his.

There are roughly over three hundred poems to his name, and out of these Snyder translated twenty four. The number of poems that Snyder translated reminds one of the nineteen poems that Pound selected to translate in *Cathay* (out of the numerous poems in crib forms in the Fenollosa notebooks) as well as Rexroth's thirty-six poems of Du Fu (out of the hundreds of Du Fu's poems that were available in English for his reference). Waley also remarked once that the translations he made were out of thousands of Chinese poems he had read.[17] Their selection signifies the editing work these translators have done as well as some kind of congeniality that may exist between the translators and the works. In the present case it may also, to some extent, point to Snyder's anticipation of the reception of the work in the English speaking world. But what is more important, it reflects the "reception" of the work by the translator himself. Benedetto Croce asserts that the historians's interest in past history is always connected to his interest in the life of the present time.[18] The same idea can be applied to the interest of Snyder, who, unlike professional translators whose selection of translation materials might be dictated by practical considerations, chose texts for personal reasons.

One may also add, perhaps figuratively, the "fusion of horizons" is more obviously seen here between Snyder and Cold Mountain (and between Cold Mountain and the Rocky Mountain as well) than elsewhere. When Pound and Rexroth singled out their Chinese poets, it mainly reflected their personal preferences, though later on the translations

---

discussion in André Lefevere, *Translation, Rewriting, and the Manipulation of Literary Fame* (London and New York: Routledge, 1992), p. 5.

[17] Morris, *Madly Singing in the Mountains*, p. 151.

[18] Benedetto Croce, *History: Its Theory and Practice*, trans. by Douglas Ainslie (New York: Russell and Russell, 1960), pp. 11-26.

exerted considerable influence on other poets, whereas Synder's Cold Mountain coincided with the temperament of an age. Incorporating the feeling of alienation from society and the importance of searching for the self with a lively and colloquial language, Snyder became a spokesman for the Beat Generation. That was the time when the young generation after the Second World War found materialism and the Establishment unbearable. The magic of Chan (Zen) Buddhism 禪, it should be noted, had already successfully captured the minds of many artists.[19]

There is no doubt that Japhy Ryder, the hero in Jack Kerouac's autobiographical novel *The Dharma Bums*, is Gary Snyder.[20] In spelling and pronunciation the two names bear great resemblance. In this book Ryder brought Kerouac to the mountains to experience the roughness and wildness of nature. Ryder is an independent, virile and rugged kind of person, just like the poet Gary Snyder as seen by himself and many of his friends.

If Japhy Ryder and Gary Snyder are two persons in one, then Snyder and Cold Mountain translated by himself are as close in temperament and spirit as any two human beings can be. Parkinson observes, "[Snyder] moves fluently through this world as a local spirit taking the forms of Coyote and Han Shan and a ghostly logger."[21] In *The Dharma*

---

[19] Alan Watts has put it succinctly:

> The appeal of Zen arts to the "modern" spirit in the West, the work of Suzuki [...] and the attraction of a non-conceptual, experiential philosophy in the climate of scientific relativism-- all these are involved. One might mention too the affinities between Zen and such purely Western trends as the philosophy of Wittgenstein, Existentialism, General Semantics, the metalinguistics of B. L. Whorf, and certain movements in the philosophy of science and in psychotherapy. Always in the background there is our vague disquiet, with the artificiality or "antinaturalness" of both Christianity, with its politically ordered cosmology, and technology, with its imperialistic mechanization of a natural world from which man himself feels strangely alien.

Alan W. Watts, *Beat Zen, Square Zen and Zen* (San Francisco: City lights, 1959), pp. 2-4. Also quoted in Ling Chung, "The Reception of Cold Mountain's Poetry in the Far East and the United States," in *China and the West: Comparative Literature Studies*, p. 89.

[20] Jack Kerouac, "Meditation in the Woods," *Chicago Review*, 22.2 (1958), 17-22. In this excerpt from *The Dharma Bums* (New York: New American Library, 1959), the real name Gary Snyder is used.

[21] Thomas Francis Parkinson, "The Poetry of Gary Snyder," *The Southern Review*, 4.3 (1968), 623.

Bums, Kerouac depicts Snyder as a modern reincarnation of Cold Mountain, leading him to the mountains like Buddha. Towards the end of the book, after Ryder has left for Japan, Kerouac went to the mountains and had this vision:

> I called Han Shan in the mountains: there was no answer [...] And suddenly it seemed I saw that unimaginable little CHINESE BUM standing there, in the fog, with the expressionless humor on his seamed face. It wasn't the real-life Japhy of rucksacks and Buddhism studies and big mad parties [...] it was the realer-than-life Japhy of my dreams.[22]

So Han Shan (Cold Mountain) is Snyder. In the preface to the Cold Mountain poems written by his contemporary, which Snyder translated as well, Cold Mountain was such a person: "He looked like a tramp. His body and face were old and beat. Yet in every word he breathed was a meaning in line with the subtle principles of things, if only you thought of it deeply. Everything he said had a feeling of the Tao in it, profound and arcane secrets [...] On that long veranda calling and singing [...] his nature was happy itself."[23] This image is also that of the hippies, and of Snyder. Kerouac tries to portray "a great new hero of American culture" in his novel,[24] and Cold Mountain, or Snyder, becomes one. But Snyder would rather secularize his hero image. Cold Mountain and his companion, he says, "became Immortals and you sometimes run into them today in the skidrows, orchards, hobo jungles, and logging camps of America."[25] So everyone can be Cold Mountain, if he wants to be, if he is a non-comformist, liberating himself from social constraints and the corrupted civilization.

The "fusion of horizons" between Snyder and Cold Mountain, meanwhile, is also dramatically achieved in the translation process, which was done, according to Snyder, "by an effort of concentration to project the 'picture' of the poem inside my mind, like a movie-- to see what's happening," and then, he would "write down in my own language

---

[22] Jack Kerouac, *The Dharma Bum*, pp. 190-91.
[23] "Preface To The Poems Of Han-Shan by Lu Ch'iu-Yin, Governor of T'ai Prefecture," in Gary Snyder, *A Range Of Poems* (London: Fulcrum Press, 1966), p. 32.
[24] Kerouac, *The Dharma Bum*, p. 27.
[25] Preface, "Cold Mountain Poems," *Evergreen*, p. 69.

what I see happening."[26] It is not, therefore, just to make clear what the original author was talking about, nor was it simply taking an empathetic understanding of the original meaning. He lets his mind, or rather, the picture of the poem inside his mind, tell him what is happening. This is the first step. The second step reveals two more significant points: he writes in his own language, and although he may consciously imitate the original style, it is still his. Furthermore, he writes down what he sees happening, recording, in a way, a real life experience, not what is supposed to be happening in the original.

Describing in a greater detail his experience in translating Han Shan in a talk with a group of translators and scholars in a conference, Snyder said:

> [...] I found myself forgetting the Chinese and going into a deep interior visualization of what the poem was about [...] The reason I have not translated more is that I discovered how to translate a poem by visualizing, and I also discovered that you can't do that very often, and that it takes a lot of time; and yet I could not afterwards be satisfied with anything less than that approach.[27]

This may explain the small number of the Cold Mountain poems he translated, and the translation process is very much related to his live experience:

> I had just been a four month's season in the high country of the Sierra Nevada, totally out of touch [...] left alone to work with rocks [...] and when I went into the Han Shan poems [...] when he talked about a cobbly stream, or he talked about the pine-wind, I wasn't just thinking about pine-wind in English and then pine-wind in Chinese, but I was hearing it, hearing the wind.[28]

His strategy was:

> And when a phrase like 'cloudy mist' or 'misty mountain' or 'cloudy mountain' or 'mountain in the cloud'[...] comes up (different version of a Chinese phrase Mr. Yip [Wai-lim Yip] brought up as a translation problem), the strategy ultimately is this [...] drop them and now remember

---

[26] Fackler, "Three English Versions of Han Shan's Cold Mountain Poems," 270.
[27] Gregory Orr, ed., "Chinese Poetry and American Imagination," *Ironwood* 17 (1981), 11-21; 38-51(41).
[28] Orr, "Chinese Poetry and American Imagination," p. 41.

> what it looks like to look at cloudy mountains and see what they look like, in your mind-- go deep into your mind and see what's happening; an interior visualization of the poem, which means of course that you have to draw on your senses, your recollection of your senses. And it certainly helps if you've had some sensory experiences in your life, to have that deep storehouse to pull it out of and re-experience it from, or if you can't re-experience it, go out and look it again.[29]

So Snyder's translation method is also a soul-searching process, an inward-trip depending not on the understanding of the source text or reality that is supposed to exist out there, but on the perception of the viewer. Snyder's notions of senses, experience and interior visualization are crucial notions.

In the same conference Wai-lim Yip gave his own opinion about translating Chinese poetry and the problem with rendering Chinese syntax. Yip remarked:

> Suppose we have the phrase-- it is a common phrase in Chinese poetry-- *sung-feng*, meaning "pine/wind." Most people would translate this as: "the winds in the pines" or "the wind through the pines"; this is descriptively telling you what is happening there, but with pine and wind together you are standing right in it-- you realize the pine, you also feel the wind, acting dramatically before you.[30]

It is interesting to see that while Yip was concerned with syntactical problems and issues relating to the source text, Snyder's strategy was to "drop them," and to search in his own mind what the imagery should feel like.

The way to Cold Mountain, after all, has to be grasped by oneself:

> Men ask the way to Cold Mountain
> Cold Mountain: there's no through trail.
> In summer, ice doesn't melt
> The rising sun blurs in swirling fog.
> How did I make it?
> My heart's not the same as yours.
> If your heart was like mine
> You'd get it and be right here.[31]

---

[29] Orr, "Chinese Poetry and American Imagination," p. 42.
[30] Orr, "Chinese Poetry and American Imagination," p. 39.
[31] Snyder, *Riprap & Cold Mountain Poems*, p. 42. A word-for-word translation of the original is:

And in Snyder's hand the Tang monk talks in colloquial language:

Most T'ien-t'ai men
Don't know Han Shan
Don't know his real thought
And call it silly talk.[32]

The last line of the original reads something like "call these empty words," which is simple and direct, but not as colloquial as "silly talk." So Snyder's strategy is to intensify colloquialism, as in this example:

Once at Cold Mountain, troubles cease
No more tangled, hung-up mind[33]

Snyder may have taken the clue from the fifth Chinese character of the second line, which means "hang," referring to what is hanging on one's mind, as if there were something that cannot be shaken off, but the English expression "hung-up" means something quite different. Snyder has observed that since Cold Mountain wrote in colloquial language of

---

[32] Snyder, *Riprap & Cold Mountain Poems,* poem 18, p. 54. A word-for-word translation of the original is:

多	少	天	台	人
Many (A lot)	few	Tian	Tai	men
不	識	寒	山	子
Not	knowing	Cold	Mountain	son
莫	知	真	意	度
Not	understanding	real	feeling	thought
喚	作	閒	言	語
Call	it	idle	words	language

[33] Gary Snyder, *Riprap & Cold Mountain Poems*, poem 19, p. 55. A word-for-word translation of the original is:

一	住	寒	山	萬	事	休
Once	stay	Cold	Mountain	thousand	things	end
更	無	雜	念	掛	心	頭
Yet	no	complicated	thoughts	hang	heart	head

his time, the translation might as well be in colloquialisms.[34] As a matter of fact, the very reason why Snyder came to know Cold Mountain and work on him was mainly because of his colloquialisms. Snyder recalls:

> That fall (1949) after several months in the Sierra Nevada rebuilding rock-retaining walls along the trails, I went back to work in a graduate seminar with Ch'en Shih-hsiang [...] He asked me what I would like to do. I said I would like to do some Buddhist poems that possibly were in a vernacular, and he said "Of course, Han Shan is the poet you should work with." Prior to that I had translated some T'ang poems as part of class work. Something happened to me that I had not experienced before in the effort of translation [...][35]

In response to a speech given by Wai-lim Yip, Robert Bly expressed his ideas about "grounding," which could well be taken as a footnote to Snyder's notion of visualization. Bly thinks that what is wrong with Chinese translations so far (excluding "the brilliant ones of Waley and Pound") is that they have been too "mental." There should be a process that he calls "grounding." When one is dealing with a Chinese poem, one should get the Chinese poem grounded inside the body. One method of grounding, he suggests, is that which Walt Whitman and William Carlos Williams brought forward, and that is the method of grounding it by using spoken language. Bly concludes that "pine-wind" is simply not a spoken term. Snyder's comment on Bly's words is, "they were just tending exactly in the direction that I wanted to go now [visualization]."[36]

The moon, which signifies harmony and perfection in Chinese poetry and in Rexroth's translations, sometimes looks different in the eye of Snyder's monk:

> When the moon shines, water sparkles clear
> When wind blows, grass swishes and rattles.

[34] Fackler, "Three English Versions of Han Shan's Cold Mountain Poems," 276.
[35] Orr, "Chinese Poetry and American Imagination," 40-41.
[36] Orr, "Chinese Poetry and American Imagination," p. 40.

On the bare plum, flowers of snow
On the dead stump, leaves of mist.[37]

There is a sense of misery in the original as well as in Snyder's lines, but the fact that Rexroth focused on the angelic quality of the moon whereas Snyder sometimes chose a different moon to render also suggests their different views towards nature, and for that matter towards "the Chinese rule," though both translators have translated quite a number of poems about the wilderness. In the scene depicted in Snyder's lines above, the moon, the wind, the bare plum, the mists and the dead stump together create an exotic, mystic and bewildered charm.

If the Chinese scene in Rexroth poems is usually a quiet and harmonious one, the mountain area-- supposedly that of China-- in Snyder's poems is sometimes tumultuous and aberrant. There exists an antagonistic relationship between the speaker and the environment, which is also not the kind of relationship found in the original. The way to the Cold Mountain, as Snyder himself experienced, is not an easy trip, and this is also reflected in the rugged and even cacophonous language he uses in poem no. 9:

Rough and dark--the Cold Mountain trail,
Sharp cobbles--the icy creek bank.
Yammering, chirping--always birds
Bleak, alone, not even a lone hiker.
Whip, whip--the wind slaps my face
Whirled and tumbled--snow piles on my back.
Morning after morning I don't see the sun

---

[37] Snyder, *Riprap & Cold Mountain Poems*, poem 14, p. 50. A word-for-word translation of the original is:

月	照	水	澄	澄
Moon	shines	water	clear	clear
風	吹	草	獵	獵
Wind	blows	grass	swishes	swishes
凋	梅	雪	作	花
Bare	plum	snow	makes	flowers
杌	木	雲	充	葉
Withered	stump	mists	become	leaves

Year after year, not a sign of spring.[38]

In the poem mentioned earlier (no. 6) the speaker says there is no through trail to Cold Mountain, but the speaker manages to get there because his heart is not like others'. In this poem (no. 9) the trail is formidable even to the speaker himself. The poem is exclusively about the obstacles to the mountain. How to overcome them, or whether anyone has ever done so, is left for the reader to ponder.

Snyder follows the original syntax and diction closely. In the first two lines he follows the Chinese sentence structure by omitting the verb to be and substituting it with a dash. On the other hand, however, he uses words that exaggerate the rocky and craggy

---

[38] Snyder, *Riprap & Cold Mountain Poems*, p. 45. A word-for-word translation of the original is:

杳 Distant	杳 distant	寒 Cold	山 Mountain	道 Road
落 Deserted	落 deserted	冷 cold	澗 creek	濱 bank
啾 Chirp	啾 chirp	常 always	有 have	鳥 birds
寂 Lonely	寂 lonely	更 even	無 no	人 people
淅 Whip	淅 whip	風 wind	吹 blow	面 face
紛 Confused	紛 confused	雪 snow	積 piles	身 body
朝 Morning (every morning)	朝 morning	不 not	見 see	日 sun
歲 Year	歲 year	不 not	知 know	春 spring

surroundings, words that are not suggested in the original, like "sharp cobbles," "icy," "bleak," "whip," "slaps," "whirled," and "tumbled."[39]

Poem 8 also depicts a boisterous road to Cold Mountain, but suggests that it is possible to reach the top:

> Clambering up the Cold Mountain path,
> The Cold Mountain trail goes on and on:
> The long gorge choked with scree and boulders,
> The wide creek, the mist-blurred grass.
> The moss is slippery, though there's been no rain
> The pine sings, but there's no wind.
> Who can leap the world's ties
> And sit with me among the white clouds?[40]

---

[39] A look at Robert Henricks' translation of the same poem in 1990 may show more clearly Snyder's attempt to change the "mountain scene" to a more rocky one. This is Henrrick's poem:

> Dark and obscure-- the way to Hanshan;
> Far apart-- the shores of the cold mountain stream.
>
> Chirp, chirp-- constantly there are the birds;
> Silent and still-- in addition there are no men.
>
> Whisper, whisper-- the wind blows in my face;
> Whirling and swirling-- the snow piles up all around.
>
> Day after day-- I don't see the sun;
> And year after year-- I've known no spring.

Henricks, *The Poetry of Han-Shan,* p. 70.

[40] Snyder, *Riprap & Cold Mountain Poems*, p. 44. A word-for-word translation of the original is:

登	陟	寒	山	道
Climb	up	Cold	Mountain	road
寒	山	路	不	窮
Cold	Mountain	road	no	end
溪	長	石	磊	磊
Brook	long	stone	stony	stony
澗	闊	草	濛	濛
Creek	wide	grass	misty	misty
苔	滑	非	關	雨
Moss	slippery	not	because	rain

The first six lines describe the endless and formidable road to Cold Mountain. The last two lines pose a question to the reader, challenging him to break away from worldly ties, to brave the dangerous road and get to the mountain top among the clouds. The fact that the moss is slippery not because of rain, and the pine sings not because of wind, suggests irrationality, something beyond intellectual comprehension. The strangeness of the scene also implies a breaking away from customary and comfortable environment. To "leap" requires courage and entails risk. To give up the worldly engagement is what so difficult for most people; hence the rhetorical question "who can [...]" at the end, suggesting that few could do so. Those are "ties," as the word itself suggests. The rough images in the first six lines are juxtaposed with the sense of forgetfulness in the last line. If sitting among the white clouds at the end represents a peaceful mind, the first six lines may represent the internal struggle and the difficulty encountered on the way to illumination.

In Snyder's translation, Cold Mountain, like the human mind, is not an unchanged realm of existence. Although it is often a place of harmony, it can also be tumultuous. The road to it is particularly so. The coarse objects associated with the path reflect one's state of mind on the lonely trip. They may also suggest Snyder's experience of illumination, which may not be all that pleasing at times. Though the road to Cold Mountain is also the road to

---

松	鳴	不	假	風
Pine	sound	no	need	wind
誰	能	超	世	累
Who	can	transcend	world	trouble
共	坐	白	雲	中
Together	sit	white	cloud	in

attain the Cold Mountain state of mind, the analogy is not stated. The graphic depiction adds to the concreteness and realism of the journey, the physical or the spiritual one.

It is usually the road to Cold Mountain that is rugged, not the mountain itself. But the Cold Mountain in the following poem is different:

> In the mountains it's cold.
> Always been cold, not just this year.
> Jagged scarps forever snowed in
> Woods in the dark revines spitting mist.
> Grass is still sprouting at the end of June,
> Leaves begin to fall in early August.
> And here am I, high on mountains,
> Peering and peering, but I can't even see the sky.[41]

Cold Mountain here is not a peaceful place. In other Cold Mountain poems one may just take the term "Cold Mountain" as a name without paying much attention to its association.

---

[41] Snyder, *Riprap & Cold Mountain Poems*, poem 3, p. 39. A word-for-word translation of the original is:

山 Mountain	中 in	何 how	太 too	冷 cold
自 Since	古 ancient	非 not	今 this	年 year
沓 Heap	嶂 hills	恒 always	凝 frozen	雪 snow
幽 Dark	林 woods	每 often	吐 spit	煙 smoke
草 Grass	生 grow	芒 (a date around June)	種	後 after
葉 Leaves	落 fall	立 stand (Winter Solstice)	秋 Autumn	前 before
此 Here	有 is	沈 indulge	迷 lost	客 person
窺 Peep	窺 peep	不 not	見 see	天 heaven

But in this poem, the unceasing coldness in the mountain is emphasized. The endless snow, the jagged scarps, and the woods in dark ravines that spit mist, together present an appalling scene, while the speaker cannot even see the sky. In the line "And here am I, high on mountains," however, one can see a self-assertive attitude and a sense of contentment. The place is remote, but this is the speaker's choice. There is not much sense of loneliness.

The twenty-four Cold Mountain poems that Snyder translated have formed an organic whole, in which Cold Mountain is a place as well as a state of mind. The correlation between the physical and spiritual worlds, however, remains implicit. The multi-signification of Cold Mountain can be seen in both Snyder's translation as well as in the original, for most often it is difficult to decide whether it is the place or the mind that the speaker is talking about. This representational mode reminds one of *xing*, in which the scene is always evocative of the feelings, but their relationship remains unexplained. Illumination is illusive and beyond words. The experience is to be felt by the individual, not attained through reasoning. Both *Chan* Buddhism and Taoism distrust language, and this attitude also coincides with the suggestiveness of *xing*. It is therefore important to consider the scene in Snyder's Cold Mountain poems in connection with the speaker's inner thoughts.

The moonlight scene in Snyder's rendition, as mentioned above, is sometimes appalling, but the moon can still suggest peace and harmony. In Buddhism and Chinese literature, the roundness, fullness, and brightness of the moon are always associated with perfection, or an ultimate enlightenment. Poem 11 presents such a world of harmony:

> Spring-water in the green creek is clear
> Moonlight on Cold Mountain is white
> Silent knowledge-- the spirit is enlightened of itself

Contemplate the void: this world exceeds stillness.[42]

The word "spring" here refers to underground water, but it could also mean springtime. In both cases the word enriches the greenness of water, and "spring-water" is super-imposed on the green creek, reinforcing the impression of greenness. The sense of whiteness is also intensified by the images "moonlight" and "Cold Mountain," since coldness is usually associated with whiteness. The first two lines are parallel in structure, and the images create a sense of greenness, whiteness and purity. The last two lines shift to a direct description of the abstract idea of quietude and illumination, echoing the concrete scene depicted earlier.

Poem 22 presents a moonlit scene as follows:

On top of Cold Mountain the lone round moon
Lights the whole clear cloudless sky.
Honor this priceless natural treasure
Concealed in five shadows, sunk deep in the flesh.[43]

---

[42] Snyder, *Riprap & Cold Mountain Poems*, p. 47. A word-for-word translation of the original is:

碧	澗	泉	水	清
Jade	creek	spring	water	clear
寒	山	月	華	白
Cold	Mountain	moon	light	white
默	知	神	自	明
Silent	know	spirit	self	enlighten
觀	空	境	逾	寂
Contemplate	emptiness	scene	more	quiet

[43] Snyder, *Riprap & Cold Mountain Poems*, p. 58. A word-for-word translation of the original is:

寒	山	頂	上	月	輪	孤
Cold	Mountain	top	above	moon	wheel	alone
照	見	晴	空	一	物	無
Shine	see	clear	sky	one	spot	without

The poem describes a universal harmony until the last line. In the last line of the original the subject, which is omitted, is the individual, while *kegui* 可貴 (honoured) is an adjective phrase (which becomes a verb in the translation) qualifying the priceless treasure. In the original, the speaker laments, in the midst of the great harmony, that the self (omitted in the original) is always sunk in the soiled and sullied flesh. The great harmony is contrasted with the filthy body of human beings.

Snyder uses run-on lines, and what is concealed in "five shadows" and sunk in the flesh now seems to be nature itself, instead of the individual. Synder's version focuses on a scene that has its ugly side embodied in the harmony. The contrast is in the appearance and reality of the scene, whereas in the original it is the greatness of the universe and the baseness of the individual that are contrasted. In the original what is sullen is the flesh, which prevents ordinary people from appreciating the beauty and greatness of the universe. The priceless natural treasure *wujiabao* 無價寶 is the Buddhist sentiments innate in everybody, but it is a pity that such sentiments are imprisoned in the flesh. Snyder's reading, however, reveals a different views of life.[44] He sees a sharp contradiction in the natural world, in which something hideous is hidden. There is an antagonism between the different cosmic forces, though the speaker still "honor(s) this priceless natural treasure" which is "concealed in five shadows." Such imperfection may well be the reason why the

可	貴	天		然	無	價	寶
Honour	dear		(natural)		(priceless)		treasure
埋	在	五		陰	溺	身	軀
Concealed	in	five		shadows	sunk	body	trunk

[44] In Classical Chinese the subject of a sentence is often omitted. In the original it is "I" who is concealed in five shadows.

moonlit scene so valuable, according to the speaker, because the natural beauty is all the more transient.

The complicated and inexplicable relationship between the external world and the internal mind is to be contemplated by the reader, while the scene is often presented as it is without explanation. Poem 17, for example, begins with these lines:

> If I hide out at Cold Mountain
> Living off mountain plants and berries--
> All my lifetime, why worry?[45]

and poem 23:

> My home was at Cold Mountain from the start,
> Rambling among the hills, far from trouble.[46]

In these two examples, Cold Mountain seems not only to refer to a place, but also to a state of mind. The significance of the name "Cold," meanwhile, depends very much on the setting of the particular poem. A summer or a winter Cold Mountain would arouse different

---

[45] Snyder, *Riprap & Cold Mountain Poems*, p. 53. A word-for-word translation of the original is:

一	自	遁	寒	山
Once	since	hide	Cold	Mountain
養	命	餐	山	果
Nurture	life	eat	mountain	fruit
生	平	何	所	憂
(Lifetime)		what	things	worry

[46] Snyder, *Riprap & Cold Mountain Poems*, p. 59. A word-for-word translation of the original is:

我	家	本	住	在	寒	山
My	home	originally	lives	in	Cold	Mountain
石	巖	棲	息	離	煩	緣
Stone	cliff	stay	rest	away	trouble	karma

sensations. But basically it is a place in which one would wish to stay, a place of serenity, as opposed to the hustle and bustle outside the mountain region. On the other hand, the mountain may be located in one's mind, and the trouble may disappear when one looks inside.

And this is the rest of poem 23:

> [...]
> Gone, and a million things leave no trace
> Loosed, and it flows through the galaxies
> A fountain of light, into the very mind--
> Not a thing, and yet it appears before me:
> Now I know the pearl of Buddha-nature
> Know its use: a boundless perfect sphere.[47]

Nothingness and the understanding of nothingness are the themes of the poem. The lines above describe Buddha-nature, and the difficulty of the description lies in the contradictory nature of the topic: to represent nothingness with something. The line "Not a thing, and yet it appears before me" epitomizes the paradox. The first two lines ("Gone [...]/ Loosed [...]")

---

[47] Snyder, *Riprap & Cold Mountain Poems*, p. 59. A word-for-word translation of the original is:

泯	時	萬	象	無	痕	跡
Disappear	moment	thousands	objects	without	trace	track
舒	處	周	流	遍	大	千
Relaxed	time	around	flow	everywhere	big (universe)	thousand
光	影	騰	輝	照	心	地
Light	shadow	rise	light	shine	heart	place
無	有	一	法	當	現	前
Not		one	way	right	in	front
方	知	摩	尼	一	顆	珠
Then	know	(Buddha)		one	piece	pearl
解	用	無	方	處	處	圓
Understand	use	no	method	(everywhere)		round

try to depict the existence and whereabouts of Buddha-nature. Brightness and roundness are used to represent the sense of nothingness, both inside and outside. There are a million things, as opposed to the idea of nothingness. The contradiction is seen in the poem as well as throughout the universe. The external world and the internal mind are also juxtaposed with each other, for "it flows through the galaxies/ A fountain of, into the very mind." Buddha-nature is an abstract idea, but a pearl is a concrete image. The phrase "a pearl of Buddha-nature" changes an abstract idea into something tangible, while at the same time adding mystery and a sense of strangeness to the image "pearl."

In poem 12 the Cold Mountain seems to be a peaceful dwelling:

In my first thirty years of life
I roamed hundreds and thousands of miles.
Walked by rivers through deep green grass
Entered cities of boiling red dust.
Tried drugs, but couldn't make Immortal;
Read books and wrote poems on history.
Today I'm back at Cold Mountain:
I'll sleep by the creek and purify my ears.[48]

[48] Snyder, *Riprap & Cold Mountain Poems*, p. 48. A word-for-word translation of the original is:

出	生	三	十	年
Come	born	three	ten	years
嘗	游	千	萬	里
Have	travelled	a thousand	ten thousand	miles
行	江	青	草	合
Walk	river	green	grass	enclose
入	塞	紅	塵	起
Enter	passes	red	dust	rises
煉	藥	空	求	仙
Make	drugs	futile	become	immortals
讀	書	兼	詠	史
Read	books	and	sing about	history
今	日	歸	寒	山
To-	day	return	Cold	Mountain

The first eight lines describe the harsh life the speaker has gone through in his early days, while the last two lines show a sense of contentment once he returns home. The speaker does not specify what he has been searching for, but it does not sound like aimless wanderings. The urge to go on despite tiresome is clear. The description seems to refer to a spiritual journey also, as seen in the effort to take drugs, to enter big cities, to read books and write poems on history. All this suggests a quest for spiritual contentment or meaning of life, but the distinction between a mental journey and a real roaming is blurred. Nor is it clear what the speaker has obtained. The final peace is in Cold Mountain, but the solution only lies in some commonplace activities. To purify one's ear is a phrase used by a hermit in ancient China in response to someone who asked him to go out and serve in the government, which was very corrupted. The speaker seems to say that he has tried everything but is not satisfied. The word "back" suggests a sense of relief, and the search outside seems to be in vain.

Nor is Cold Mountain just the name of a place in poem 24:

> When men see Han-shan
> They all say he's crazy
> And not much to look at--
> Dressed in rags and hides.
> They don't get what I say
> & I don't talk their language.
> All I can say to those I meet:
> "Try and make it to Cold Mountain."[49]

枕	流	兼	洗	耳
Sleep	creek	and	wash	ears

[49] Snyder, *Riprap & Cold Mountain Poems*, p. 60. A word-for-word translation of the original is:

時	人	見	寒	山
Present	people	see	Han	Shan

The last two words in the first and last line, Han-shan and Cold Mountain respectively, are the same characters in the original. "Han Shan" is the transliteration while Cold Mountain is the meaning of the term. Snyder's rendition distinguishes the different implications in the two places. The first 寒山 should be the person, hence Han-shan; the second 寒山 should be the place, hence Cold Mountain. The most important message of the poem is in the last line, but it still does not say much about what place Cold Mountain is. The description throughout the poem suggests that Han-shan is a social outcast. Society does not understand him, nor does he conform to it. As to why one would change his mind once he gets to Cold Mountain (suggested in the last line), the speaker does not specify. If Cold Mountain is just a place of perfect harmony, meanwhile, it still does not explain why it could lead one to understand Han-shan better. That Cold Mountain is also a state of mind is hinted here; to make it there also means to have the same kind of mind as the speaker's.

各	謂	是	風	顛
Everyone	says	is	crazy	wild
貌	不	起	人	目
Appearance	not	attracts	people's	eye
身	唯	布	裘	纏
Body	only	cloth	clothes	wrap
我	語	他	不	會
My	words	he	not	understand
他	語	我	不	言
His	language	I	not	speak
爲	報	往	來	者
To	repay	go	come	people
可	來	向	寒	山
Can	come	to	Cold	Mountain

But sometimes even Han-shan himself seems to have difficulty in remembering the way to Cold Mountain, as in poem 5:

> I wanted a good place to settle:
> Cold Mountain would be safe.
> Light wind in a hidden pine--
> Listen close-- the sound gets better.
> Under it a gray-haired man
> Mumbles along reading Huang and Lao.
> For ten years I haven't gone back home
> I've even forgotten the way by which I came.[50]

The "way," just like the word "Tao" 道 in the source language, could also mean a method or a spiritual experience. To forget the way could mean that one has been away from the truth for so long that one can no longer remember it. But in Buddhism as well as Taoism, to forget something, especially how to express something in words, could mean a higher level

---

[50] Snyder, *Riprap & Cold Mountain Poems*, p. 41. A word-for-word translation of the original is:

欲	得	安	身	處
Want	get	settle	body	place
寒	山	可	長	保
Cold	Mountain	can	lasting	safety
微	風	吹	幽	松
Mild	wind	blows	hidden	pine
近	聽	聲	愈	好
Near	hear	sound	more	good
下	有	斑	白	人
Beneath	there is	mixed	white	person
喃	喃	讀	黃	老
Mumbling	mumbling	read	Huang	Lao
十	年	歸	不	得
Ten	years	return	not	possible
忘	郤	來	時	道
(Forget)		coming	time	path

of understanding, which transcends the restrictions of the rational mind. The light wind, the hidden pine, the listening of the sound, the gray-haired man, the mumbling and reading of Taoism, all suggest a peaceful mind that is free from worldly troubles. The external world here echoes the internal mind, and the two worlds could hardly be distinguished.

The monk Han-shan has been familiar with the place Cold Mountain, and frequently introduces it to the reader:

> I settled at Cold Mountain long ago,
> Already it seems like years and years.
> Freely drifting, I prowl the woods and streams
> And linger watching things themselves.
> Men don't get this far into the mountains,
> White clouds gather and billow.
> Thin grass does for a mattress,
> The blue sky makes a good quilt.
> Happy with a stone underhead
> Let heaven and earth go about their changes.[51]

---

[51] Snyder, *Riprap & Cold Mountain Poems*, poem 7, p. 43. A word-for-word translation of the original is:

粵	自	居	寒	山
Particle	since	live	Cold	Mountain
曾	經	幾	萬	載
Has	passed	a few	ten thousand	years
任	運	遯	林	泉
Let	fate	hide	woods	springs
棲	遲	觀	自	在
Stay	late	observe	(freedom, liberty)	
巖	中	人	不	到
Mountain	in	people	not	come
白	雲	常	靉	靉
White	cloud	always	wave	wave
細	草	作	臥	褥
Thin	grass	becomes	lying	mattress
青	天	爲	被	蓋
Blue	sky	becomes	quilt	cover

That "men don't get this far into the mountains" could mean that men don't get far enough into this way of life. The way of life here is presented in concrete images: prowling the woods and streams and watching things themselves, with the grass as mattress, the sky as quilt, and a stone as pillow. The leisure life, or the state of mind, is very much related to the natural environment. The last line summarizes a view of life symbolized by Cold Mountain: let nature take its course, and the individual is not at odds with it.

Snyder imitates Chinese syntax, especially the omission of the subject:

> Clambering up the Cold Mountain path,
> The Cold Mountain trail goes on and on.[52]

There is no subject in the first line of the original. Snyder keeps a similar structure and the result is a dangling modifier. In Snyder's lines, it is the Cold Mountain itself that is "Clambering up the Cold Mountain path," though it is easily understood that the subject, which is omitted, should be the speaker himself. The participle phrase at the beginning,

---

快 (Happy)	活	枕 sleep	石 stone	頭 head
天 Heaven	地 earth	任 let	變 change	改 alter

[52] Snyder, *Riprap & Cold Mountain Poems*, p. 44. For a perceptive discussion of the language characteristics of Snyder's Cold Mountain poems and Snyder's experiment with the English syntax see Xi Mi 奚密, "*Hanshan yishi yu qiaoda ji-- yi ge wenxue dianxing de xingcheng*" 寒山譯詩與敲打集-- 一個文學典型的形成 , in *Zhongmei wenxue yinyuan* 中美文學因緣, ed. by Zheng Shusen 鄭樹森 (Taibei: Dong Da, 1985), pp. 165-193.

A word-for-word translation of the original is:

登 Climb	陟 up	寒 cold	山 Mountain	道 path
寒 Cold	山 Mountain	路 road	不 no	窮 end

meanwhile, strengthens the sense of endlessness in the second line, while the repetition, "the Cold Mountain path" and the "Cold Mountain trail," reinforces the sense of fatigue.

The subject is also omitted in the following lines, in which things are presented from a distance, slightly moving away from emotionalism; poem no. 10:

> Slowly consumed, like fire down a candle;
> Forever flowing, like a passing river.[53]

The two lines are in parallel structure: an adverb, an adjective (respectively past participle and present participle), and then a phrase begins with the word "like." This is also the fundamental structure of the original lines. The parallel lines substantiate the description, building up a sense of suspension, for after reading the lines, the reader does not know what is being compared.

Snyder keeps experimenting with the English language. This is poem no. 4:

> High, low, old parapet-walls
> Big, small, the aging tombs.[54]

The description is concise and direct, leaving all the connectives and intellectual pointers aside, as in the original; images are thus sharply juxtaposed with each other. Just like the original, the two lines are parallel: "high," "low," "old" in the first line and "big," "small,"

---

[53] Snyder, *Riprap & Cold Mountain Poems*, p. 46. A word-for-word translation of the original is:

漸	滅	如	殘	燭
Gradually	reduce	as	consumed	candle
長	流	似	逝	川
Forever	flowing	like	passing	river

[54] Snyder, *Riprap & Cold Mountain Poems*, p. 40. A word-for-word translation of the original is:

高	低	舊	雉	堞
High	low	old	castles	fortress
大	小	古	墳	塋
Big	small	ancient	tombs	grave

"aging" in the second line are adjectives, while "parapet-walls" in the first line and "tombs" in the second line are nouns.

Like Pound and Waley, Snyder aims at exoticizing the texts. Besides working on the syntax to accentuate a poetic meaning, transliterations like "T'ien Tai" and "Han Shan" are also used. Snyder sometimes used terms like "silverware and car" to give a contemporary touch, but he also retained terms that carry Chinese association, like in poem 20 he wrote: "Your poems lack the Basic truth of Tao." Sometimes the association may not be self-explanatory. There is this line, for example, in poem 5: "Mumbles along reading Huang and Lao." Lao could be more easily identified as Laotze, the founder of Taoism; Huang is the legendary first Chinese Emperor, and every major invention in ancient China was attributed to him, including Taoism. The unknown term "Huang" is probably retained to add an unascertained and unfamiliar sense. And in poem 10:

> Yesterday I called on friends and family:
> More than half had gone to the Yellow Springs.[55]

"Yellow Springs," the Chinese equivalent for Hades, is left unexplained, but the meaning should be quite clear, while the term itself also presents a vivid and macabre image.

Snyder sometimes tries to give the poem new meaning in the new social context. As mentioned above, poem no. 2 runs:

> Go tell families with silverware and cars
> "What's the use of all that noise and money?"[56]

---

[55] Snyder, *Riprap & Cold Mountain Poems*, p. 46. A word-for-word translation of the original is:

昨	來	訪	親	友
Yesterday	come	visit	relatives	friends
大	半	入	黃	泉
Over	half	enter	Yellow	Springs

[56] Snyder, *Riprap & Cold Mountain Poems*, p. 38. Ling Chung has discussed these two lines, saying that "families with silverware and cars" are not a "fitting equivalent" of the original. Chung, "Whose Mountain is This?--Gary Snyder's Translation of Han Shan," *Renditions* 7 (1977), 99-102 (95). Here I am trying to look

"Silverware and cars" are not in the original. The bells-and-caldrons families in the original refer to the rich ones, whereas the families with silverware and cars in Snyder's lines are not necessarily rich, but there is a touch of contemporaneity . Snyder's strategy to familiarize the texts, along with an effort to retain some of the exotic elements, is shown in these examples. His preoccupation with colloquialisms discussed above could also be viewed as an attempt to give a local flavour and a sense of contemporaneity to the poems.

The Cold Mountain experience, to Snyder, does not end with translation work. He continued to live in the same place and that kind of life, in which man and nature are closely linked, for years to come. This is the first of his *Riprap* poems:

Mid-August At Sourdough Mountain Lookout

Down valley a smoke haze
Three days heat, after five days rain
Pitch glows on the fir-cones
Across rocks and meadows
Swarms of new flies.

I cannot remember things I once read
A few friends, but they are in cities.
Drinking cold snow-water from a tin cup
Looking down for miles
Through high still air.[57]

The setting is still rough and harsh, while the syntax is also simple and uninvolved. In the first line, images are presented without a clear-cut relationship nor a verb in between.

---

at the issue in connection with Snyder's strategy to familiarize the text. A word-for-word translation of the original is:

寄	語	鐘	鼎	家
Send	words	bells	caldrons	families
虛	名	定	無	益
Vain	names	definitely	no	use

[57] Snyder, *Riprap & Cold Mountain Poems*, p. 1.

Using a noun qualifying another noun, like "smoke haze," "snow-water," and "tin cup" is commonly found in Snyder's own poems.[58] Snyder claimed that when he was translating he "wasn't just thinking about pine-wind in English and then pine-wind in Chinese," but "was hearing it, hearing the wind."[59] He would not use terms like "pine-wind" to translate,[60] and advocated dropping them. The simple structure of using a noun to qualify another noun, however, should go well with the idea of concretization, intensification, and juxtaposition of images. Notice also the number of strong stresses in the first stanza and the last line of the poem. In the last few lines one can also find dangling participles with no subject, a common device in the Cold Mountain poems.

The following is an example of the hard, cold mountain scene in Snyder's native land. Besides the geographical names and modern setting, the place could well be one in which Cold Mountain lived:

> Whole towns shut down
> hitching the Coast road, only gypos
> Running their beat trucks, no logs on
> Gave me rides. Loggers all gone fishing
> Chainsaws in a pool of cold oil
> On back porches of ten thousand
> Split-shake houses, quiet in summer rain.
> Hitched north all of Washington
> Crossing and re-crossing the passes
> Blown like dust, no place to work.
>
> Climbing the steep ridge below Shuksan
> clumps of pine
> float out the fog
> No place to think or work
> drifting.
> [...][61]

---

[58] For a more detailed discussion of the style of Snyder's poems see Xi Mi 奚密, "*Hanshan yishi yu qiaoda ji-- yi ge wenxue dianxing de xingcheng*" 寒山譯詩與敲打集-- 一個文學典型的形成, pp. 165-193. I owe the idea for this comparison to her.

See also the discussion in Parkinson, "The Poetry of Gary Snyder," 616-632.

[59] Orr, "Chinese Poetry and American Imagination," p. 41.

[60] Orr, "Chinese Poetry and American Imagination," p. 41.

[61] Snyder, *Riprap & Cold Mountain Poems*, p. 2.

The images in the second stanza, the steep ridge, clumps of pine that float out the fog, and the feeling of estrangement echo the Cold Mountain poems. The arrangement of short line-units to juxtapose images could also be viewed as a development along the line of the Cold Mountain experiments.

Like the way to the Cold Mountain, the way to the Rocky Mountain is jagged and rough. The journey seems like a purificatory process, and has to be explored by the lonely self, while the language also bears Han Shan's accent:

> [...] Hands and knees
> Pushing the Bear grass, thousands
> Of arrowhead leavings over a
> Hundred yards. Not one good
> Head, just razor flakes
> On a hill snowed all but summer,
> A land of fat summer deer,
> They came to camp. On their
> Own trails. I followed my own
> Trail here. Picked up the cold-drill,
> Pick, singlejack, and sack
> Of dynamite.
> Ten thousand years.[62]

The short sentences, the dangling modifier and the suppression of verbs are all characteristics of Snyder's own works, reminiscent of the Cold Mountain poems. The trip is also a lonely one, symbolic of an inward journey.

These are the opening poems of the *Riprap* collection, first published about a year after the Cold Mountain poems, but some of the *Riprap* poems were written in the mid-fifties, even earlier than the translation work.[63] Snyder's writings and rewriting show similarity in poetic thoughts and techniques, and the translated works are very related to his personal experience. Snyder revitalizes, or helps to reincarnate the Buddhist monk that has long been dead or hidden in some Chinese mountains into a hippie dressed in new but

---

[62] Snyder, *Riprap & Cold Mountain Poems*, p. 9.
[63] As seen in the dates indicated in the poems of *Riprap and Cold Mountain Poems.*

shabby clothes. By speaking in new dialect now Cold Mountain also speaks for a whole new generation.

Chapter 9: Conclusion

The China Which is There: Rewriting and Manipulating

In this thesis I have studied the strategies adopted by translators at different times for different purposes and different readers. Owing to the constraints of language, poetics, ideology and culture which determine the reception process, classical Chinese poetry was not translated in large quantity and was not well received until the first decade of the twentieth century, when Pound and Waley adopted new strategies, each in his own way to accommodate the source text, while in the meantime traditional metric forms were not totally abandoned. The four translators discussed in this thesis were not professors of Chinese literature. Their strategies, particularly Pound, Rexroth, and Snyder's, are also different from those of scholars who translated for professional readers.

Translation studies before Even-Zohar had concentrated upon functional notions of equivalence or the subjective ability of the translators to derive an equivalent text.[1] Translation that emphasized fidelity to the source text enjoyed great prestige at the beginning of this century, and much criticism of Waley, Pound, Rexroth, and Snyder has focused on the notion of faithfulness.[2] Polysystem theory formulated by Even-Zohar and developed by Gideon Toury holds that a translated text is not an isolated entity, but functions within a literary system, which interrelates with a set of other systems that form a hierarchical structure. The translator basically makes his decisions according to the social norms and literary conventions in the target culture. Pound's use of translation to promote

[1] The term "functional notions of equivalence" is used by Gentzler. See Edwin Gentzler, *Contemporary Translation Theories* (London: Routledge, 1993), p. 107.

an ideological confrontation is one example of how translation was manipulated as a weapon.

Theo Hermans' notion of manipulation, which takes the Polysystem theory further, holds that literature is a complex and dynamic system. He investigates the norms and constraints that govern the production and reception of translations, and asserts that all translation implies manipulation of the source text for a certain purpose.[3] Pound, Waley, Rexroth, and Snyder have been accused by critics of either damaging the English language (mainly the traditional metrics and syntax), or being unfaithful to the original texts, while their attempts to make the texts fit in with a new language and poetics, and make them more acceptable to the receiving culture, have not been fully recognized.

André Lefevere takes the idea of manipulation further by considering translation as rewriting. Pound rewrote the Chinese poets mainly into imagists in his early work *Cathay*, while he later rewrote the Confucian *Odes* into a particular ideology (his understanding of Confucianism), and a particular poetics (the ideogrammic method). Waley gave up his early attempts of translating classical Chinese poetry into rhymes and disrupted syntax, and developed the sprung rhythm, creating an illusion that classical Chinese poetry in the original was written in a kind of rhymeless free verse. Rexroth rewrote the Chinese poets, particularly Du Fu, according to his concept of the Chinese rule, or the Chinese scene, whereas Snyder rewrote the Tang poet Cold Mountain in such a way that echoes the anxiety and yearning of the hippies roaming in the Rocky Mountain in the 1960s.

---

[2] See, for example, Frederic Peachy and Richard Lattimore, *The Pound Newsletter* 5 (1919); Frederic Peachy and Richard Lattimore, *The New Age* (27 November). See also the discussions of Waley, Pound, Rexroth and Snyder respectively in Chapters 5, 6, 7, and 8.

[3] Theo Hermans, ed., *The Manipulation of Literature* (London: Croom Helm, 1985), pp. 10-11.

Lefevere wrote that translations which members of a culture have come to trust may mean more to them than translations that could claim to represent the original better.[4] The four translators discussed in this thesis have reconstructed the poets' characteristics and did a lot of image-making. They selected poets to illustrate a certain poetics or ideology. Waley was editing a culture, not just individual works. He has painted a China enshrined in humanism, choosing only a small fraction of the thousands of Chinese poems he may have read to illustrate his view. Although he translated Li Bo because of Li's representative position in the source system, he did not forget to tell his readers about Li's callousness, showing that Li is different from many of his fellow poets. Other poets Waley selected, in particular Bo Juyi and Yuan Mei, were made to be sensible, warm, full of human passion and earthly wisdom. In the Confucian *Odes* Pound followed the order of appearance in the classic work anthologized by Confucius, while Waley rearranged them according to themes, making them useful also for cultural and anthropological study. When he created *Cathay* Pound chose fourteen poems, which are mainly about loneliness and separation, out of hundreds in the Fenollosa notebooks, to echo the wartime sentiments around 1914. There are over three hundred Han-shan poems, and Snyder picked twenty four of them to form an organic whole that features the experience of illumination of a monk. Rexroth selected poems that demonstrate a "Chinese scene." He highlighted the lyrical side of Du Fu, leaving out the Confucian Du Fu and expunging most of the allusions. As a result his Du Fu is no longer a "poet-historian" 詩史 as the ancient Chinese called him, but mainly a lyrical poet. These translators reconstructed the texts in the image that they desired, or the target system required.

---

[4] André Lefevere, ed., *Translation/ History/ Culture: A Sourcebook*, (London and New York: Routledge, 1992), p. 2.

Patronage circumscribes the translators' ideological space,[5] and is a control mechanism which regulates and even manipulates.[6] The effect of patronage, however, could be very subtle and indirect. Waley was closely associated with the British Museum. Although he never accepted a regular university post, he was an Honorary Lecturer at the School of Oriental and African Studies, giving talks and conducting seminars. It could be said that his patrons were basically the orientalists and the academic establishment. Waley's association with the academic institutes, however, does not necessarily limit his patronage to academic establishments only. The blending of history narrative with poetry translation in order to paint the portrait of a poet, an age, or a culture is a technique that Waley often used. Different from many sinologists teaching in universities, Waley has enjoyed popular fame. While being taken as a source of information of Chinese culture and literature,[7] his translations are also accessible to the average reader.

Waley was also known to his friends as a poet. In a BBC interview with Roy Fuller Waley talked about his role as a scholar and as a poet, and commented that these double identities could only happen when scholarship in Chinese was in a rudimentary state. As it became more and more academically minute, the more difficult it was to combine the two roles.[8] Waley's broad interest in Chinese culture and literature is manifested in his selection of materials, which covers a wide range of subjects, genres and periods. A general orientalist like him would be unusual in an academic world which emphasizes specialization, and he was aware of his limitation. He once described his kind of

---

[5] Lefevere, *Translation/ History/ Culture: A Sourcebook*, p. 8.
[6] Hermans, *The Manipulation of Literature*, p. 14.
[7] See the discussions in Chapter 5 as well as the comments throughout *Madly Singing in the Mountains: An Appreciation and Anthology of Arthur Waley,* ed. with a preface by Ivan Morris (London: George Allen & Unwin Ltd, 1970).
[8] Morris, *Madly Singing in the Mountains*, p. 143.

scholarship as rather slapdash with very few footnotes.[9] But this approach also enabled him to extend the scope of his readership.

Literal translation of literature, according to Lefevere, is not aimed at influencing the masses, but rather at making the text accessible to scholarly analysis without having it enter the body of literature in the receiving culture.[10] Pound, Rexroth, and Snyder's translations are far from being literal. They are well-known poets, and although they learned some Chinese, they are usually not considered as sinologists. Pound's translations were once regarded as invention and creation, while Rexroth and Snyder's translations were often anthologized in collections of English poetry. Their readers are usually those who like to read English poems that are purportedly from the Chinese, and who may not be interested in reading poems with the original texts placed alongside for comparison.

Lefevere has commented on Goethe's concept of "critical translations," which "might just as well be used for the type of translation of a work of literature that is not produced with the intention of representing its original as *literature* in the receiving culture."[11] The statement may serve as a portrayal of strategies adopted in general by professional scholars. Sinologists' translations, from Bernhard Karlgren's to Burton Watson and David Hawkes's, seem to function in this way. Their works are useful in a class of Chinese literature; in many cases their works could be printed face to face with the original, giving the reader an idea of what the original is all about. The patrons of these translators or institutions that publish their works usually expect the same thing, that the text should be accessible to scholarly analysis. What is more important, the patrons'

---

[9] Morris, *Madly Singing in the Mountains*, p. 25.
[10] Lefevere, *Translation/ History/ Culture: A Sourcebook*, p. 6.
[11] Lefevere, *Translation/ History/ Culture: A Sourcebook*, p. 6.

attitude is very much determined by the reader, whose expectations shape those of the patrons', while these translators presumably are aware of the expectations on them as well.

Sinologists or translators who belong to an institution, like David Hawkes, Burton Watson, and Stephen Owen, generally have the confidence of their patrons and their audience. They do not need to translate "word for word," but their works are trusted to be authentic.[12] On the other hand, poets who translate, like Pound and Rexroth, have the confidence of their publishers and audience also but, mainly as fine poets, and their works therefore are generally taken for granted as poems in their own right, but not reliable information as such. One can imagine, meanwhile, that it may be more acceptable for Pound and Rexroth to translate in the way they did, but if a Burton Watson or Stephen Owen translated in that way, they could hardly survive the close scrutiny of their patrons- - the educational institutions, including the critics and the students.

It is important to place the position of the translators discussed in this thesis in a polysystems context. There is one thing in common among the translators discussed in this thesis: they appeal not only to professional readers, but also to those who did not ordinarily read translations from Chinese before.[13] Attitudes and expectations are thus more flexible, while the range of language and strategies have also become greater in variety. Waley's translations have occupied an authoritative and popular position for a long time. Pound, Rexroth, and Snyder's translations, meanwhile, are not restricted to a context studied only

[12] See Lefevere, *Translation/ History/ Culture: A Sourcebook*, p. 14.
[13] Waley, for example, said that some of his readers did not ordinarily read poetry. See Morris, *Madly Singing in the Mountains*, p. 135.

by the professional reader, and are distinct from what Lefevere calls high texts, which are mainly read in educational institutions.[14]

Gideon Toury holds that the translator has a basic choice between two polar alternatives: he could subject himself to the original text, with its textual relations and the norms expressed by and contained in it, or he could subject himself to the linguistic and literary norms active in the target literary polysystem.[15] If the first position is adopted as an overall strategy, the translation tends to adhere to the norms of the original work and to the norms of the source literary polysystem as a whole. He calls such a tendency the pursuit of an adequate translation. If the second position is adopted, the linguistic and literary norms of the target system are set into full operation. Adherence to the norms of the target system, meanwhile, determines the acceptability of the text in the target linguistic and literary polysystems as well as its exact position within them. The boundary between the two positions, however, is not distinct. Translators discussed in this thesis tend to combine the two positions. Pound and Snyder, for example, often stick to the original syntax, but they also adhere to the norms of the target system, which may partially account for the acceptability of their translation in the target polysystem. Waley, on the other hand, pays great attention to the linguistic and literary norms active in the target system (by using unruffled language, for example), but, according to Toury's classification, his attempt tends to be a pursuit of adequate translation.

Pound and Waley use contemporary language, with little padding and few inversions. The new poetic style did not force the Chinese language and poetics to fit into an existing formal structure. In the case of Pound's translations, however, it could be

---

[14] André Lefevere, *Translation, Rewriting and the Manipulation of Literary Fame* (London: Routledge, 1992), p. 3.

argued that Pound sometimes strained English syntax to fit the Chinese. The two approaches, Pound's somewhat disrupted syntax and Waley's smooth and grammatical lines, which may not be as distinct at times, set an example for other translators of Chinese poetry, a phenomenon that has lasted for almost a century. Stanley Kunitz observed that the invention of Chinese poetry in English could be attributed to Waley and Pound, and that Waley and Pound were the ones who set the pattern for poets who followed, and that their style was a transparently clear invention, represented a creative act on the part of the translator himself.[16] Despite their different attitudes towards the source texts, Pound and Waley had one thing in common as to the style of the target language. Their language is in most cases lively and contemporary. In general it gives a sense of dramatic immediacy. Rexroth has argued that all great translations survived into our time because they were so completely of their own time.[17] Waley and Pound's styles converge at this point, that their language is very much of their own time.

The introduction of new structures and rhythms, hence a new poetics that, among other properties, emphasizes images and their juxtaposition, coincided with a new era of English poetry. But the process of introducing Chinese poetry into the English speaking world did not come naturally or smoothly. It is interesting to compare the strategies of translators like Pound and Waley's with those of Fitzgerald as perceived by Lefevere.[18] Instead of giving the Chinese poems "a liberal dose of Western poetics," Pound and Waley

---

[15] Gideon Toury, *In Search of a Theory of Translation* (Tel Aviv: The Porter Institute, 1980), p. 54.
[16] Gregory Orr, "Chinese Poetry and American Imagination," *Ironwood* 17 (1981), 11-54 (39).
[17] Kenneth Rexroth, "The Poet as Translator," in *The Craft and Context of Translation*, ed. by Arrowsmith and Shattuck (Austin: University of Texas Press, 1961), pp. 29-49.
[18] Commenting on Edward Fitzgerald's statement that "It is an amusement for me to take what Liberties I like with these Persians, who (as I think) are not Poets enough to frighten one from such excursions, and who really do want a little Art to shape them," Lefevere writes that the "little Art" represents a liberal dose of Western poetics and Western Universe of Discourse. See Lefevere, *Translation/ History/ Culture: A Sourcebook*, p. 4.

gave a much bigger liberal dose to the existing Western poetics. To some at that time, it was certainly an overdose. Chinese culture had not been regarded as central, and lyric poetry, which is the foremost form in the Chinese literary tradition, was generally not perceived as the highest in Western tradition. This is, one should be reminded, also the general background against which Legge and Giles translated, and later Pound and Waley. When the latter two came on the scene, three battles were fought in one: the battle to upgrade the lyric as well as the Chinese poetic tradition (which is a matter of degree), the battle against deadening poetic conventions of the time, the battle against those predecessors who had tried to make Chinese lyrical poems conform to traditional English structures. These battles were won in the early twentieth century, and marked the start of a new language for translating Chinese poetry.

Translators like Pound and Rexroth constantly reminded the reader that there was a lot in Chinese poetry that the West could learn from, such as the juxtaposition of concrete images and the quiet Chinese scene that is suggestive of feelings. The strategies that they adopted, however, depended on their conceptions of the source culture, which was not taken as primary. Perhaps it is because of this that they would manipulate the source texts to such a great extent. James Liu's puzzlement over why so many translators who hardly knew Chinese tried their hands at Chinese poetry points to the same phenomenon, that Chinese culture had been regarded as marginal, but this marginality also means a freer environment for manoeuvre.

The idea of meaning beyond the signified has been a major feature of Chinese poetry, which relies heavily on x*ing*. One of the characteristics of *xing* is to present concrete scenes while not giving explanatory details. This kind of technique was also what

the imagists cherished. Traditional English nineteenth century poetics had been more concerned with elevated style, witty conceits and extended meaning, whereas the imagist poetics advocated direct presentation of things. What handicapped the spread of imagist poetics is also what handicapped the transfer of Chinese poetry into English. The convention of English poetry when Fenollosa first discovered Chinese poetry was not ready to accommodate a broad transfer of it.

As discussed in chapter 3, Yuan Haowen in the twelfth century mocking Yuan Zhen for the latter's favour of Du Fu's discursive poems, Wang Guowei in the early twentieth century criticizing the poetic convention of the Southern Song Dynasty while praising the Northern Song's (and his criticism on the value of individual lines here and there as well), and Qian Zhongshu in the 1940s teasing Arthur Waley for his over-enthusiasm for Bo Juyi, all have to do with their views on x*ing*, which stands at the opposite side of discursive narration. It should be pointed out that classical Chinese poetry is highly stylized, relying on fixed formal architecture. But in cases when an English fixed formal structure replaced the Chinese fixed formal structure the result seems to have been less well received. The new style that conveyed modernist poetics and imagism, on the other hand, proved also to be the one that accommodated classical Chinese poetry.

The poems in *Cathay* are mainly imagistic. Pound manipulates the line-units to highlight the images and the juxtaposition of them. On many occasions he follows the original syntax, in which connectives and intellectual pointers are left out. The suppression of explicatory details usually results in foregrounding the images, and results also in more active readers' participation. This way of expressing and its requirement on readers' deciphering bear resemblance to the encoding and decoding characteristics of *xing*.

Imagistic poetics upholds the belief that the object world should be presented directly. Chinese poetry, on the other hand, often presents images as they are without conceptualizing; it is inclined to be imagistic, not narrative.

Besides precision, Pound also cherishes suggestiveness in poetry.[19] The reconciliation of these two seemingly contradictory approaches is revealed in Pound's statement that one can be wholly precise in representing a vagueness,[20] and also in his praise for the Jewel Stairs' poem for its suggestiveness. He seeks out the luminous details and presents them without commenting. While the details are precise and concrete, their significance and their relations with each other are not spelled out, hence the notion of suggestiveness. In *Cathay* there is also an instinctive use of the natural world as an analogy for the human. The scene in Chinese poetry usually consists of simple and concrete objects, coinciding with Pound's belief in precision and suggestion. With the arrangement of perception into unconnected units, a technique that Pound has used in *Cathay* and later in his own poetry, the requirement on the reader's participation is also greater. The job of connecting the various parts is left for the reader. Retaining the original linguistic arrangement that leaves out the personal pronoun also makes it possible not to restrict the situation to one participant, that is, the speaker, and the reader's presence is subtly invited.

Waley had used disrupted syntax, but later settled on grammatical lines. The sprung rhythm he used is usually associated with images, and is typical of his kind of Chinese poetry. Waley's lines read easily yet drawing the reader's attention to the images through its somewhat strange rhythm. The use of a new poetic language facilitated the foregrounding of images and the presenting of simple objects. In Waley's translations

[19] See the detailed discussions in Wai-lim Yip, *Ezra Pound's Cathay* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1969), in particular the chapter "Precision or Suggestion: Pre-*Cathay* Obsessions," pp. 34-69.

romantic fantasy found in English poetry at that time was replaced by non-romantic situations, while hyperbole was substituted by commonplace emotions. The pictorial scene in his translations is often suggestive of a mood, and the thoughts and manners of ancient China are vividly presented, particularly for the first time in the English speaking world, through a series of works in the 30s and 40s.

Rexroth upholds the notion of the Chinese scene, in which a poetic situation is presented without explanation. His understanding of the "Chinese rule" is always a peaceful world of serene atmosphere, while the significance of such a harmony is left for the reader to ponder over. There may be an observer, usually the speaker, but there may not be anyone in the picture. In either case the reader could be a participant. This kind of presentational mode, relying on a scene to suggest feelings beyond the confine of words, coincides also with the Chinese concept of *xing*, particularly the requirement of the reader's participation.

In the Cold Mountain poems, the speaker tries not to corrupt the wordless purity, but only gives physical analogies familiar from the reader's own experience. Images are used to suggest such illusive things as enlightenment, because the experience itself is beyond words and cannot be spoken about directly. Cold Mountain and the moon echo a state of mind, with spiritual attainment inside, Cold mountain and the moon outside. The inner and outer worlds are juxtaposed while their relation is left for the reader to connect. The physical journey often parallels a spiritual advancement, while the *Tao*, literally the way, is presented in concrete images. The poems do not rely on allusions or metaphysical narration, and the frightening trip to the Cold Mountain is meant to be directly experienced by the audience.

---

[20] *Literary Essays of Ezra Pound*, ed. with an introduction by T. S. Eliot (London: Faber, 1960), p. 44.

Xing also refers to the reading process. It allows great freedom for the reader to decide for himself what a text is supposed to mean, or to signify. *Xing* sees that the meaning of a work is not exhausted by the author, and new meanings are generated by the reader in every reading, in spite of the original writer's intention. Iser, on the other hand, emphasizes the blanks a reader has to fill in to make sense out of a text.[21] He argues that different readers are free to actualize the work in different ways, and there is no single correct interpretation.[22] Fish holds that reading is a process of experiencing what the text does to us,[23] which is a matter of interpretation. It is therefore both in the Chinese tradition of *xing* and modern Reader Response theory that reading is only a generating of significances. In this way *xing* also provides a theoretical basis for the translator's interpretations.

The translators discussed in this thesis often impart a sense of strangeness. Exoticizing the orient did not start with Pound and Waley; it had been an orientalist tradition since the eighteenth century. But Waley managed to concretize such an approach by presenting a "real China" which was full of passion and reason, and its poetry has the charm of straightforward simplicity and intensity, yet evoking strange sensations. Pound's effort was to juxtapose images, finding or inventing a corresponding poetics in ancient China that fitted into his idea of re-vitalizing the English system. Chinese characters and poetics provided a theoretical basis for his own kind of poetry. Ancient China was not only alive, but was even drawn into the battle between rival poetics in this century. To declare a war against conventional structures, Pound had to take a clear stance, which was on the

---

[21] Wolfgang Iser, *Prospecting* (Baltimore: John Hopkins University Press, 1989), pp. 33-34

[22] Wolfgang Iser, "The Reading Process: A Phenomenological Approach," in *The Implied Reader* (Baltimore: Johns Hopkins University, 1974), pp. 274-294.

opposite side of the existing formal norms, with China and Chinese poetry standing by him. Chinese poetry therefore has to be very different from the English poetry of the nineteenth century, in language, poetic mood, and mode of presentation. In the works of Pound and Waley the sense of strangeness was achieved through a modernization of language, rather than archaization.

Early twentieth century English readers of translated classical Chinese poetry may have had no prior knowledge of the original, but there has been a gradually formed tradition, one that has come to be identified as a Chinese tradition, especially after the monumental works of Pound and Waley. Said observes that all works on the Orient are inter-related to form a larger body of strength, and that every writer on the Orient assumes some previous knowledge of the Orient. Each work on the Orient affiliates itself with other works, with audiences and institutions, and with the Orient itself.[24] Waley's translation of Bo Juyi, for example, inspired the American poet James Wright to write of his own plight, likening it to Bo's isolation in a small town on the Yangtze River.[25]

Burton Raffel also wrote of his admiration for Waley as a boy:

> Thus Hsu Ling, in the 6th century A. D. -and Waley made it so real that, in my high school, there was a Chinese-poetry-writing cult. One of my friends was the most successful of the Waley-imitators; I envied him deeply [...] But to all of us, and to everyone who reads with open eyes and mind, Hsu Ling/Waley was and is revelation itself.[26]

And one of the reasons why Raffel was moved by Pound was his contemporary style:

---

[23] Stanley Fish, "Literature in the Reader: Affective Stylistics" in *Reader Response Criticism*, ed. by Jane Tompkins (Baltimore: Johns Hopkins University Press, 1980), pp. 70-100.
[24] Edward Said, *Orientalism: Western Conceptions of the Orient* (New York: Pantheon, 1978), p. 20.
[25] James Wright, *Above the River: The Complete Poems* (New York: Farrar, Straus and Giroux, 1990), p. 119.
[26] Burton Raffel, *The Forked Tongue: A Study of the Translation Process* (The Hague: Mouton & Co., 1971), p. 159.

> There was also, primarily, Ezra Pound. Together with Waley, I suspect, Pound is responsible for virtually all that is good in modern English and American verse translation [...] And I weep still, reading Pound/Fenollosa's "The River-Merchant's wife: A letter:"

After quoting the poem, Raffel exclaims, "How could such burning precision NOT profoundly affect a developing mind?" His preoccupation, on the other hand, also reminds one of Said's contention in his discussion of the individual as an orientalist, that no production of knowledge in the human sciences can ever ignore its author's involvement in his own circumstances. According to him, a European or American studying the Orient comes up against the Orient as a European or American. It means being aware that one belongs to a power with definite interests in the Orient, and more important, that one belongs to a part of the earth with a definite history of involvement in the Orient.[27]

Most of the translators discussed in the thesis also dress up the exotic flavour with some kind of local colour. The force that pulls these two opposing elements together is from the target system, which requires something new and different, with something that the reader could identify with. The target system has been the governing factor that dictated the kind of work to be translated and shaped the strategy that was adopted.

Not only are the translators making the image of a culture, but also the image of individual poets. The reader may find it easier to identify the translator than the original writer. To begin with, the reader comes to know the poet through the translator. Sometimes a reader may come to know a poet through various translators. In that case it is also the translators who are as visible as, if not more visible than the original poet. Quite often the reader thinks of the poet in terms of the translator, such as Pound's Li Bo, Waley's Bo Juyi, Rexroth's Du Fu, or Snyder's Cold Mountain. James Wright has said: "I have to leave the

Chinese language to those who are competent to deal with it. Still, I am willing to accept the authority of the translators who have presented what seem to me real poems in English."[28] Perhaps to the general reader what seem to be real poems in English matters most.

While it is true a Li Bo may not distinguish himself so much as the translator makes his own appearance through translation, the image of Chinese poets in the West, however, does bear implicitly some of the traits of their original identity. It is not accidental that Rexroth hails Du Fu as the greatest lyrical poet for Du's "elegiac mood" but does not consider Du's narrative power, nor is it strange that Rexroth especially favours the "Chinese scene." This is exactly what Yuan Haowen was trying to say about Du's greatness, except Rexroth says it in a clearer and more concrete manner, probably with the benefit of his knowledge of the discursive tradition in the West that enables him to see better the essence of the "quiet scene" and its suggestiveness. Meanwhile, Li Bo in the Chinese tradition is not only famous for his sweeping and majestic style; together with Du Fu he is also noted for his use of concrete and precise images, a characteristic which, according to Qian Zhongshu, is the prerequisite of major poets, because only by doing so can one push the power of language to the limit, as compared to Chinese painters trying to represent abstractions that push the power of their own medium to the limit (by painting the void, or something non-existent).[29] It is therefore not surprising that Li Bo enjoyed a great success when Ezra Pound chose him to be the main poet of his *Cathay* poems, which

---

[27] Said, *Orientalism*, p. 11.
[28] Orr, "Chinese Poetry and the American Imagination," p. 18.
[29] See Qian Zhongshu, "Chinese Poetry and Chinese Painting," *Qijui Ji* (Shanghai: Shanghai Classical Books Press, 1985), pp. 1-28.

emphasize concreteness and imagist poetics. The images in Li Bo's poems, as Ford Madox Hueffer says about the *Cathay* poems,[30] are fresh, vivid and alive.

In an essay arguing for the use of poetry of the Far East in the general education curriculum, Rexroth asserts that there are few subjects more suitable for wide introduction into the general curriculum of the English speaking world. The courses should not be treated as subjects in themselves, but as part of general courses in literature or civilization. The reason he gave is, the translations of Ezra Pound, Amy Lowell and Witter Bynner are their best works, and amongst the best poems of the twentieth century.[31] He did not mention his own translations, which could well serve as one of the examples. But it may be argued that to many, Chinese poetry is considered as part of the heritage of the English speaking world. When David Hawkes comments on Waley's works, he praises him for managing to "place Ancient China in a wider context, so that it seems no longer the culture of a forgotten moon-world, but a part of our own heritage as fellow-men."[32] Peter Quennell has also recounted his experience with his first reading of Waley's *More Translations from the Chinese*: "It added a new dimension to my knowledge of poetry; and, by the time I had reached the last page, I felt almost as familiar with Li Po and Po Chu-i as with Shelley, Wordsworth, Keats and Coleridge."[33] Similar accounts of the reception of Waley and Pound's Chinese translations are not unusual among contemporary men of letters.

To the average western reader, China may always be a place far and beyond. This impression may lead to a lack of knowledge of the other. A lack of knowledge also brings

---

[30] Hueffer writes, "The poems in *Cathay* are things of a supreme beauty. What poetry should be, that they are." Quoted in T. S. Eliot's "Ezra Pound: His Metric and Poetry," in *To Criticize the Critic* (London: Faber, 1965), p. 181.

[31] Kenneth Rexroth, "The Poetry of the Far East in a General Education," in *Approaches to the Oriental Classics: Asian Literature and Thought in General Education*, ed. by Wm. Theodore de Bary (New York: Columbia University Press, 1959), p. 201.

[32] Morris, *Madly Singing in the Mountains*, p. 51.

along with some kind of uneasiness or even fear. The film *China Syndrome* in the 1980s, which was about the threat of a nuclear leakage, acquired its name because people in the West have long believed if they dig a hole (a drop of radioactive material in this case) it would pass through the centre of the earth and eventually get to the other side of the planet, that is, China. Besides the notion of remoteness about China, there is also an implicit and subtle fear about her behind this "syndrome"-- China symbolizes the most terrible consequence that no one can afford.

China seems to represent what belongs to "the other" for the West. Things that are far away and that the West is not, are imagined as what is in China. China becomes a framework for the West to differentiate itself from what it is not. Spinoza has remarked that every individual thing cannot exist or be conditioned to act unless it be conditioned for existence and action by a cause other than itself.[34] This impulse to define oneself by emphasizing one's difference with the other tends to push the other to a farther position, and fantasies or idealization of the other are natural result. Such an attitude may not be all that pernicious if it does not result in a stock response that leads to the ignoring of most of the essence of the source culture.

The image of China has constantly been shaped and reshaped to fit the intellectual atmosphere of the time. When T. S. Eliot hailed Pound as the "inventor of Chinese poetry," he may unconsciously have revealed what was deep in the mind of many critics, that the translators usually invented out of necessities, only Pound's invention was more striking than the others. In concluding an article Zhang Longxi quotes the famous lines of Kipling--

---

[33] Morris, *Madly Singing in the Mountains*, p. 88.
[34] *The Ethics*, Prop. xxviii; *Correspondence*, Letter L; in *The Chief Works of Benedict de Spinoza*, trans. by R. H. M. Elwes, 2 vols. (New York: Dover Publications, 1951), vol. 2, pp. 67 and 370.

"Oh, East is East, and West is West [...] When two strong men stand face to face [...]" and comments,

> The picture of two men facing each other in confrontation is what Kipling had in mind, but the "strong ones" in *our* mind are those who work to bring humanity not to division and confrontation but to understanding and harmony [...] The other in their discerning eyes is no longer exotic, mystifying, inexplicable, but something to be learned and assimilated [...][35]

This is perhaps a situation that scholars and translators alike would aspire to see, but a myth, almost by definition, is something that defies rationality. Ramond Dawson puts it succinctly in his book: "for the great majority of people [Europeans] China will continue to be slightly unreal: a country of fans and lanterns, of pigtails and slant eyes, of chopsticks and bird's-nest soup, of pavilions and pagodas, of pidgin English and bound feet."[36] The early travellers, subsequent translators and sinologues have formed so strong a myth that any rendition of works on ancient China, if it departs too far from the myth (if a China does not sound like or act like a China, or a China does not look a little strange), would run the risk of contradicting the reader's expectations. So the reader's preconceived notion of the strange and mysterious China and the writers or translators' representation mutually reinforce each other. As Said observes, what the Orientalist does is to confirm the Orient in his readers' eyes; he neither tries nor wants to unsettle already firm convictions.[37]

It is ironic that the reader may expect a foreigner, almost as a rule, to wear foreign clothes so that he looks what he is, a foreigner. What makes a foreigner foreign is that he must be, first and foremost, foreign. So, contradictory as it may sound, the process of

---

[35] "The Myth of the Other: China in the Eyes of the West," in Yang, Zhoulan and Yue Daiyun, ed., *Literatures, Histories, and Literary Histories: The Proceedings of the 2nd Sino- U. S. Comparative Literature Symposium*, ed. by (Shenyang: Liaoning University Press, 1989), p. 218

naturalization is always accompanied by an act of exoticization. The translator may put national dress onto his translated text, that is, dress it according to fashion,[38] but he may be equally aware of stressing the foreign flavour. There are two forces pulling in opposite directions, usually with one force dominating. Which force comes out stronger also means which strategy dominates. Basically, translators and readers alike, have something to expect from the East, and that something has been built up over the ages, shaped basically by patronage and ideology. The similarity between scholarly translations and translations attempted by non-professionals is that, the China represented must look and sound Chinese, always with a touch of strangeness, which is a tradition constrained yet by a larger patron-- the general audience's horizon of expectation in the target culture.

---

[36] Raymond Dawson, *The Chinese Chameleon: An Analysis of European conceptions of Chinese Civilization* (London: Oxford University Press, 1967), p. 7.

[37] Said, *Orientalism*, p. 65.

[38] Lefevere wrote that the French adapted all things to their natural taste, and Homer had to enter France a captive, and dress according to fashion. He had to allow them to take his beard and his old simple clothes away from him. See Susan Bassnett and André Lefevere, *Translation, History and Culture* (London: Pinter, 1990), p. 18.

Select Bibliography

Primary Sources

Acker, William, *T'ao the Hermit: Sixty Poems by T'ao Ch'ien* (London: Thames & Hudson, 1952)

Alley, Rewi, *Tu Fu: Selected Poems* (Peking: Foreign Language Press, 1962)

Ayling, Alan, and Duncan Mackintosh, *A Collection of Chinese Lyrics* (London: Routledge & Kegan Paul, 1965)

Ayling, Alan, and Duncan Mackintosh, *A Further Collection of Chinese Lyrics* (London: Routledge & Kegan Paul, 1969)

Ayscough, Florence, and Amy Lowell, *Fir-Flower Tablets* (Boston: Houghton Mifflin, 1921)

Ayscough, Florence, *Tu Fu: The Autobiography of a Chinese Poet*, Vol. I, A. D. 712-759 (Boston: Houghton Mifflin, 1929)

Ayscough, Florence, *Travels of a Chinese Poet: Tu Fu, Guest of Rivers and Lake*, Vol. II, A. D. 759-770 (Boston: Houghton Mifflin, 1934)

Birch, Cyril, ed., *Anthology of Chinese Literature* (New York: Grove Press, 1965)

Bo Juyi xuan ji 白居易選集, ed. by Wang Rubi 王如弼 (Shanghai: Guji chubanshe, 1980)

Bullett, Gerald, *The Golden Years of Fan Ch'eng-ta* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1946)

Bynner, Witter, and Kiang Kang-hu, *The Jade Mountain* (New York: Knopf, 1929; New York: Doubleday reprint, 1964; Vintage reprint, 1972)

Candlin, Clara, *The Herald Wind* (London: Murray, 1933)

Candlin, Clara, *The Rapier of Lu* (London: Murray, 1946)

Chang, Lily Pao-hu, and Karjorie Sinclair, *The Poems of T'ao Ch'ien* (Honolulu: University of Hawaii Press, 1953)

Chang, Yin-nan, and Lewis C. Walmsley, *The Poems of Wang Wei* (Rutland, Vermont: Tuttle, 1959)

Chaves, Jonathan, *Yang Wan-li: Heaven My Blanket, Earth my Pillow* (New York:

Weatherhill, 1975)

Chaves, Jonathan, *Mei Yao-ch'en and the Development of Early Sung Poetry* (New York: Columbia University Press, 1976)

Ch'en, C. J., and Michael Bullock, *Poems of Solitude* (London: Abelard-Schuman, 1960)

Cheng, Francóis, *Chinese Poetic Writing: With an Anthology of T'ang Poetry Translated from the Chinese*, trans. by Donald A. Riggs and Jerome P. Seaton (Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 1982)

Ch'u, Ta-kao, *Chinese Lyrics* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1937)

Cooper, Arthur, *Li Po and Tu Fu* (Baltimore: Penguin, 1973)

Ding, Zuxin, and Burton Raffel, *Gems of Chinese Poetry* (Shenyang, China: Liaoning University Press, 1986)

Fletcher, W. J., *Gems of Chinese Verse* (New York: Paragon Book Reprint Corp., 1966)

Fletcher, W. J., *More Gems of Chinese Poetry* (New York: Paragon Book Reprint Corp., 1966)

Frodsham, J. D., and Ch'eng Hsi, *An Anthology of Chinese Verse: Han Wei Chin and the Northern and Southern Dynasties* (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1967)

Frodsham, J. D., *The Murmuring Stream: the Life and Works of Hsieh Ling-yun* (Kuala Lumpur: University of Malaya Press, 1967)

Frodsham, J. D., *The Poems of Li Ho* (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1970)

Fusek, Lois, *Among the flowers: The Hua-chien Chi* (New York: Columbia University Press, 1981)

Gao Buying 高步瀛, ed., *Xin jiao Tang Song shi juyao* 新校唐宋詩舉要 (Taibei: Shijie, 1968)

Giles, H. A., *Gems of Chinese Literature* (Shanghai: Kelley and Walsh, 1922)

Graham, A. C., *Poems of the Late T'ang* (New York: Penguin, 1967)

Gu shi shijiu shou ji shi 古詩十九首集釋, ed. by Sui Shesen 隋樹森 (Hong Kong: Zhonghua, 1975)

Guo Maoqian 郭茂倩, ed., *Yuefu shiji* 樂府詩集 (Beijing: Zhonghua, 1979)

Hanshanzi shiji 寒山子詩集, *sibu congkanben* 四部叢刊本 (Shanghai: Commercial Press, 1929)

Hart, Henry, *A Hundred Names* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1933)

Hart, Henry, *A Garden of Peonies* (Standford: Standford University Press, 1938)

Hawkes, David, *Ch'u Tz'u: The Songs of the South* (Boston: Beacon, 1959)

Hawkes, David, *A Little Primer of Tu Fu* (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1970)

Henricks, Robert G., *The Poetry of Han-Shan: A Complete, Annotated Translation of Cold Mountain* (Albany: State University of New York Press, 1990)

Hightower, Robert, *Poetry of T'ao Ch'ien* (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1970)

Holzman, Donald, *Poetry and Politics: The Life and Works of Juan Chi* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1976)

Hu, P'in-ch'ing, *Li Ch'ing-chao* (New York: Twayne Publishers, 1966)

Hung, William, *Tu Fu: China's Greatest Poet* (Cambridge, Massachusetts: Harvard University Press, 1952)

Ives, Mabel L., *Chinese Love Songs* (Upper Montclair, New Jersey: B. L. Hutchinson, 1949)

Jennings, William, " *The Shi King: The Old "Poetry Classic" of the Chinese, A Close Metrical Translation, with Annotations* (London and New York: George Routledge and Sons, 1891)

Jenyns, Soame, *Selections from the 300 Poems of the T'ang Dynasty* (Wisdom of the East Series, London: Murray, 1940)

Jenyns, Soame, *A Further Selection from the 300 Poems of the T'ang Dynasty* (Wisdom of the East Series, London: Murray, 1944)

Karlgren, Bernhard, *The Book of Odes* (Stockholm: Museum of Far Eastern Antiquities, 1950)

Kent, George W., *Works of Dust and Jade: 47 Poems and Ballads of the Third Century Chinese Poet Ts'ao Chih* (New York: Philosophical Library, 1969)

Kotewall, Robert, and Norman L. Smith, *The Penguin Book of Chinese Verse*, ed. by A. R. Davis (Baltimore: Penguin, 1962)

Legge, James, *The Chinese Classics: The She King* (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1871)

Levy, Howard S., *Translations from Po Chu-i's Collected Works*, 2 vols. (New York: Paragon, 1971)

Li Taibo ji 李太白集 (Taibei: Heluo, 1975)

Liu, James J. Y., *The Poetry of Li Shang-yin: Ninth-Century Baroque Chinese Poet* (Chicago: Chicago University Press, 1969)

Liu, James J. Y., *Major Lyricists of the Northern Sung* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1974)

Liu, Shih Shun, *One Hundred and One Chinese Poems* (Hong Kong: Cathay, 1967)

Liu, Wu-chi, and Irving Lo, *Sunflower Splendor: Three Thousand Years of Chinese Poetry* (New York: Anchor Press, 1975)

Liu, Yih-ling, and Shabid Suhrawardy, *Poems of Lee Hou-chu* (Bombay: Orient Longmans, 1948)

Liu Yuxi ji 劉禹錫集 (Shanghai: Renmin, 1975)

Lo, Irving Yucheng, *Hsin Ch'i-chi* (New York: Paragon, 1971)

Lu, Shu-xiang, and Xu Yuanzhong, ed., *Gems of Classical Chinese Poetry in Various English Translations* (Hong Kong: Joint Publishing Co. Ltd., 1988)

Ma Ruichen 馬瑞辰, *Mao shi zhuan jian tong shi* 毛詩傳箋通釋 (Taibei: Zhonghua, 1968)

Mathers, Powys, *Love Songs of Asia* (New York: Knopf, 1946)

Mayhew, Lenore, and William McNaughton, *A Gold Orchid: The Love Poems of Tzu Yeh* (Rutland, Vermont: Tuttle, 1972)

Mote, F. W., *The Poet Kao Ch'i, 1336-1374* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1962)

Nienhauser, William H., *Liu Tsung-yuan* (Twayne world Authors Series, New York: Twayne Publishers, 1973)

Obata, Shigeyoshi, *The Works of Li Po* (New York: Dutton, 1922)

Owen, Stephen, *The Poetry of Meng Chiao and Han Yu* (New Haven: Yale University Press, 1975)

Owen, Stephen, *The Poetry of Early T'ang* (New Haven: Yale University Press, 1977)

Owen, Stephen, *The Great Age of Chinese Poetry: The High T'ang* (New Haven: Yale University Press, 1981)

Palandri, Angela Jung, *Yuan Chen* (Boston: N. P., 1977)

Payne, Robert, *The White Pony* (New York: John Day, 1947)

Pound, Ezra, *Ezra Pound: Selected Poems*, ed. by T. S. Eliot (London: Faber & Gwyer, 1928)

Pound, Ezra, *The Cantos of Ezra Pound* (New York: New Directions, 1949)

Pound, Ezra, *The Classic Anthology as Defined by Confucius* (Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 1954)

Pound, Ezra, *Personae* (New York: New Directions, 1990)

Qiu Zhaoao 仇兆鰲, ed., *Du shi xiang zhu* 杜詩詳註 (Taibei: Wenshizhe chubanshe, 1973)

Quan Han Sanguo Jin Nan Bei Chao shi 全漢三國晉南北朝詩, ed. by Ding Fubao, 6 vols. Reprint (Taibei: Yiwen, n. d.)

Rexroth, Kenneth, *One Hundred Poems from the Chinese* (New York: New Directions, 1956)

Rexroth, Kenneth, *The Collected Shorter Poems of Kenneth Rexroth* (New York: New Directions, 1966)

Rexroth, Kenneth, *Love and the Turning Year: One Hundred More Poems from the Chinese* (New York: New Directions, 1970)

Rexroth, Kenneth, and Ling Chung, *The Orchid Boat: The Women Poets of China*, (New York: McGraw-Hill, 1972)

Rexroth, Kenneth, and Ling Chung, *Li Ch'ing-chao: Complete Poems*, (New York: New Directions, 1979)

Robinson, G. W., *Poems of Wang Wei* (Harmondworth: Penguin, 1973)

Sarkeim, Eric, *The Silent Zero, in Search of Sound: An Anthology of Chinese Poems from the Beginning Through the Sixth Century* (New York: Grossman Publishers, 1967)

Scott, John, *Love and Protest: Chinese Poems from the Sixth Century B. C. to the Seventh Century A. D.* (New York: Harper Colophon Books, 1972)

Snyder, Gary, "The Cold Mountain Poems of Han-shan" *Evergreen Review*, 2.6 (1958), 69-80

Snyder, Gary, *Evergreen Review Reader* 1957-1967 (New York: Grove Press), 211-215

Snyder, Gary, *Riprap & Cold Mountain Poems* (San Francisco: Four Seasons Foundation, 1969)

Tang shi sanbai shou xiangxi 唐詩三百首詳析 ed. by Yu Shouzhen 喻守真 (Hong Kong: Zhonghua, 1977)

Tang Song Ming Jia Ci Xuan 唐宋名家詞選 (Shanghai: Shanghai Classic Literature Printing House, 1956)

Ts'ai, Ting-kan, *Chinese Poems in English Rhymes* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1932)

Turner, John, *A Golden Treasury of Chinese Poetry* (Hong Kong: Renditions Book, 1989)

Waley, Arthur, *A Hundred and Seventy Chinese Poems* (London: George Allen & Unwin Ltd, 1918)

Waley, Arthur, *More Translations from the Chinese* (London: George Allen & Unwin Ltd, 1919)

Waley, Arthur, *The Temple and Other Poems* (London: George Allen & Unwin Ltd, 1923)

Waley, Arthur, *The Book of Songs* (London: George Allen & Unwin Ltd, 1937)

Waley, Arthur, *Chinese Poems* (London: George Allen & Unwin Ltd, 1946)

Waley, Arthur, *The Life and Times of Po Chu-i* (London: George Allen & Unwin Ltd, 1949)

Waley, Arthur, *The Poetry and Career of Li Po* (London: Allen & Unwin, 1950)

Waley, Arthur, "27 Poems by Han-shan" *Encounter*, 3.3 (1954), 3-8

Waley, Arthur, *The Nine Songs: A Study of Shamanism in Ancient China* (London: George Allen & Unwin Ltd, 1955)

Waley, Arthur, *Yuan Mei: Eighteenth Century Chinese Poet* (London: George Allen & Unwin Ltd, 1956)

Waley, Arthur, *Ballads and Songs from Tun-Huang: An Anthology* (London: George Allen & Unwin Ltd, 1960)

Walmsley, Dorothy B., *Wang Wei, the Painter-Poet* (Rutland, Vermont: Tuttle, 1968)

Watson, Burton, *Cold Mountain: 100 Poems by the T'ang Poet Han-shan* (New York: Columbia University Press, 1962, 1970)

Watson, Burton, *Su Tung-p'o* (New York: Columbia University Press, 1965)

Watson, Burton, *Chinese Lyricism: Shih Poetry from the Second to the Twelfth*

Century, with Translations (New York: Columbia University Press, 1971)

Watson, Burton, *The Old Man Who Does as He Pleases* (New York: Columbia University Press, 1973)

Wong, Man, *Poems from the Chinese* (Hong Kong: Creation Books, 1950)

Wu, John C. H., *The Four Seasons of T'ang Poetry* (Rutland, Vermont: Tuttle, 1972)

Xu, Yuanzhong, ed., *On Chinese Verse in English Rhyme: From the Book of Poetry to the Romance of the Western Bower* (Beijing: Peking University Press, 1992)

Yip, Wai-lim, *Hiding the Universe: Poems by Wang Wei* (New York: Grossman Publishers, 1972)

Yu, Pauline, *The Poetry of Wang Wei: New Translations and Commentary* (Bloomington: Indiana University, 1980)

Zhu Xi 朱熹, *Chu ci ji zhu* 楚辭集注 (Taibei: Zhengzhong, 1974)

Secondary Sources

Abbas, M. A., "Response," *Tamkang Review* 15.1-4 (Autumn-Summer 1984-5), 385-388

Aldridge, A. Owen, "East-West Relations: Universal Literature, Yes; Common Poetics, No," *Tamkang Review* 10.1 (Autumn 1979), 17-34

Aldridge, A. Owen, "The Perception of China in English Literature of the Enlightenment," *Asian Culture Quarterly* 14.2 (1986), 1-26

Aldridge, A. Owen, "The First Chinese Drama in English Translation," *Asian Culture Quarterly*, 16.3 (Autumn 1988), 22-32

Aldridge, A. Owen, "China in the Spanish Enlightenment," *International Comparative Literature Association* 12 (1990), 404-409

Aldridge, A. Owen, "K'ieng Long and Western Letters," Tamkang Review 22.1-4 (Autumn-Summer 1991-2), 17-42

Alexander, Michael, *The Poetic Achievement of Ezra Pound* (London & Boston: Faber and Faber, 1978)

Arrowsmith, W. and Shattuck, R., ed., *The Craft and Context of Translation* (Austin: University of Texas Press, 1961)

Baird, James, "Critical Problems in the Orientalism of Western Poetry," in *Asia and the Humanities* (Bloomington: Comp. Lit. Committee, Indiana University, 1959)

Barricelli, Jean-Pierre, "Nature Images in Leopardi and Li Po," *Tamkang Review* 18.1-4 (Autumn-Summer 1987-8), 1-10

Bassnett, Susan and André Lefevere, *Translation, History and Culture* (London: Pinter, 1990)

Bassnett-McGuire, Susan, *Translation Studies*, revised edn. (London: Routledge, 1991)

Bassnett, Susan, *Comparative Literature: A Critical Introduction* (Oxford: Blackwell, 1993)

Bays, Carol Ann, *Ernest F. Fenollosa: New Perspectives in Poetics* (unpublished doctoral dissertation, Wayne State, 1978)

Benjamin, Andrew, *Translation and the Nature of Philosophy* (London: Routledge, 1989)

Berg, Stephen and Robert Mezey, *Naked Poetry: Recent American Poetry in Open Forms* (Indianapolis: the Bobbs-Merrill, 1969)

Biguenet, John and Schulte, Rainer, ed., *The Craft of Translation* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1989)

Blunden, Edmund, "China in English Literature," *Eastern Horizon* 1 (August 1960), 27-33

Bly, Robert, *The Eight Stages of Translation* (Boston: Rowan Tree Press, 1983)

Bohn, Willard, "Modernizing the Ideogram: Apollinaire and Visual Form," *Tamkang Review* 18.1-4 (Autumn-Summer 1987-8), 11-22

Brooks, Cleanth, *Understanding Poetry* (New York: Holt, Rinehart and Winston, 1950)

Brower, Reuben, ed., *On Translation* (Cambridge, Massachusetts: Harvard University Press, 1959)

Brower, Reuben, *Mirror On Mirror* (Cambridge, Massachusetts: Harvard University Press, 1974)

Bynner, Witter, "Translating Chinese Poetry," *Asia* 21 (December 1921), 993-997; 1042-1043

Bynner, Witter, "Translating Wang Wei," *Poetry: A Magazine of Verse* 19 (Feb 1922), 272-278

Cai, Zong-qi, "Poundian and Chinese Aesthetics of Dynamic Force: A Re-Discovery of Fenollosa and Pound's Theory of Chinese Written Character," *Comparative Literature Studies* 30.2 (1990), 56-74

Cao, Zuoya, *Li Ching-Chao and Christina Rossetti: Nature and Feeling in Their Lyrics* (University Park: Penn. State University, 1989)

Catford, J. C., *A Linguistic Theory of Translation* (London: Oxford University Press, 1965)

Chan, Marie, "Chinese Heroic Poems and European Epic," *Comparative Literature* 26.2 (Spring 1974), 142-168

Chan, Mimi, and Piers Gray, "The Game of Names: A Note on Rendering Chinese Poetry into English Verse," *Renditions* 14 (1980), 87-94

Chan, Ping-leung, "The Tragic Theme in Li Sao," in *China and the West: Comparative Literature Studies* (1980), 97-107

Chang, Sun Kang-i, "Chinese 'Lyric Criticism' in the Six Dynasties," in *Theories of Arts in China* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1983), pp. 215-224

Chang, Yao-hsin, "Pound's *Cantos* and Confucianism," in *Ezra Pound: The Legacy of Kulchur* (Tuscaloosa & London: University of Alabama Press, 1988), pp. 86-112

Chao, Yeh Chia-ying, "Wu Wen-ying's *Tz'u*: A Modern View," *Harvard Journal of Asiatic Studies* 29 (1969), 53-92

Chao, Yeh Chia-ying, "Practice and Principle in Wang Kuo-wei's Criticism," *Tamkang Review* 2.1 (April 1971), 117-128

Chao, Yeh Chia-ying, "The Ch'ang-chou School of Tz'u-criticism," *Harvard Journal of Asiatic Studies* 35 (1975), 101-152

Cheadle, Mary Paterson, "Ezra Pound's Confucian Translation" (unpublished doctoral dissertation, University of California, Berkeley, 1987)

Chen, David Ying, "Li Ho and Keats: A Comparative Study of Two Poets" (unpublished doctoral dissertation, Indiana University, 1962)

Chen Hang 陳沆 (1785-1826), *Shi bi xing jian* 詩比興箋 (Beijing: Zhonghua, 1965)

Chen, Peng-hsiang, "*Ch'iu* [Autumn] and the Tradition of Literary Melancholy," *Asian Culture Quarterly* 8.3 (Autumn 1980), 59-81

Chen, Peng-hsiang, "The Tradition and Variation of Autumnal Lamentation,"

Tamkang Review 11.2 (Winter 1980), 111-138

Chen, Peng-hsiang, *Thou Hast Thy Music Too: Autumn in Classical English and Chinese Poetry* (Taibei: Lucky Bookstore, 1981)

Chen, Peng-hsiang, "Autumn and Melancholy in Classical Chinese and English Literature," *Chinese Comparatist* 23.4 (December 1982), 75-85

Chen, Peng-hsiang, "Thematology East and West: A Survey and Theoretical Exploration," *Tamkang Review* 14.1-4 (Autumn-Summer 1983-4), 63-84

Chen, Shih-hsiang, "In Search of the Beginnings of Chinese Literary Criticism," *University of California Publications in Semitic Philology, Semitic and Oriental Studies Presented to William Popper* 11 (1951), 45-64

Chen, Shih-hsiang, "The Cultural Essence of Chinese Literature," in *Interrelation of Cultures: Their Contribution to International Understanding* (Paris: UNESCO, 1953), 43-85

Chen, Shih-hsiang, "Early Chinese Concepts of Poetry," *Transactions of the International Conference of Orientalists in Japan* 11 (1966), 63-68

Chen, Shih-hsiang, "The *Shih-ching*: Its Generic Significance in Chinese Literary History and Poetics," *Bulletin of the Institute of History and Philology, Academia Sinica* (Taibei, Taiwan) 39.1 (1969), 371-413

Chen, Shih-hsiang, "On Structural Analysis of the Ch'u Tz'u Nine Songs," *Tamkang Review* 2.1 (April 1971), 3-14

Chen, Shih-hsiang, "On Chinese Lyrical Tradition," *Tamkang Review* 2.2/ 3.1 (October-April 1971-2), 17-24

Chen, Shih-hsiang, "The Genesis of Poetic Time: The Greatness of Ch'u Yuan, Studies with a New Critical Approach," *Tsing Hua Journal of Chinese Studies* 10.1, no. 1 (1973), 1-42

Chen, Shih-hsiang, "Chinese Poetics and Zenism," *Orient* 10 (1975), 131-139

Chen, Shou-yi, "John Webb: A Forgotten Page in the Early History in Europe," *Chinese Social and Political Review* 19.3 (October 1935), 295-330

Chen, Shou-yi, "Thomas Percy and His Chinese Studies," *Chinese Social and Political Review*, 20.2 (July 1936), 202-230

Chen, Shou-yi, "Oliver Goldsmith and His Chinese Letters," *T'ien Hsia* 8 (1939), 34-52

Chen, Tsu-wen, "Problems in Translating Poetry," *Tamkang Review* 2.2/3.1 (October-April 1971-72), 467-478

Cheng, Chien, "Su Tung-p'o and Hsin Chia-hsuan: A Comparison," *Tamkang Review* 1.2 (October 1970), 45-58

Cheung, Chi-yiu, "Arthur Waley: Translator of Chinese Poetry" (unpublished doctoral dissertation, University of Southern California, 1978)

Cheung, Dominic, "*Ars Poetica* and the Poetic Experience in East-west Poetry," *Tamkang Review* 10.1 (Autumn 1979), 57-66

Chi, Ch'iu-lang, "A Comparative Approach to Late T'ang Poetry," *Tamkang Review* 2.2/3.1 (October-April 1971-2), 269-278

Chou, Shan, "Beginning with Images in the Nature Poetry of Wang Wei," *Harvard Journal of Asiatic Studies* 42.1 (1982), 117-37

Chou, Ying-hsing, "The Linguistic and Mythical Structure of *Hsing* as a Combinational Model," *Chinese-Western Comparative Literature: Theory and Strategy* (1980), 51-78

Chow, Tse-tsung, "The Early History of the Chinese Word *Shih* (Poetry)," in *Wen-lin: Studies in the Chinese Humanities* (Madison: The Department of East Asian Languages and Literature of the University of Wisconsin, 1968), pp. 151-209

Christy, Arthur, "*Chinoiserie* and *Vers Libre*," *Open Court* 43 (April 1929), 209-218

Chu, Limin, "China in the Poetry of the Overland," *American Studies* 7.3 (September 1977), 1- 26

Chu, Limin, "A Narrative Account of Westerners' Impressions of Old China," *Asian Culture Quarterly* 8.2 (Summer 1980), 1-33

Chu, Stephen Yiu-wai, "Interpretation, Textuality, Paradox: From Reading Hermeneutics' Reading *towards* a Chinese Hermeneutics," *Tamkang Review* 22.1-4 (Autumn-Summer 1991-2), 341-371

Chung, Ling, "Kenneth Rexroth and Chinese Poetry: Translation, Imitation, and Adaptation" (unpublished doctoral dissertation, University of Wisconsin, 1972)

Chung, Ling, "Whose Mountain is This?--Gary Snyder's Translation of Han Shan," *Renditions* 7 (1977), 99-102

Chung, Ling, "Ezra Pound's Interpretation of *Cheng Ming* and His Literary Theories," *International Comparative Literature Association* 73.2 (1979), 689-692

Chung, Ling, "The Reception of Cold Mountain's Poetry in the Far East and the United States," *China and the West: Comparative Literature Studies* (1980), 85-96

Chung, Ling, "This Ancient Man is I," *Renditions* 21-22 (1984), 307-330

Chung, Ling, *Yincang he xianxing* "隱藏和現形" , *Chungwai Literary Monthly* 中外文學 20.11 (1991), 5-24

Conant, Martha Pike, *The Oriental Tale in England in the Eighteenth Century* (London: Frank Cass, 1966)

Cranmer-Byng, J. L., ed., *An Embassy to China* (London: Longmans, 1962)

Croce, Benedetto, *History: Its Theory and Practice*, trans. by Douglas Ainslie (New York: Russell and Russell, 1960)

Culler, Jonathan, "Literary Competence," in *Structuralist Poetics* (London: Routledge, 1975), pp. 113-131

Culler, Jonathan, *The Pursuit of Signs* (Ithaca: Cornell University Press, 1981).

Davie, Donald, *Ezra Pound: Poet as Sculptor* (London: Routledge & Kegan Paul Ltd., 1965)

Dawson, Raymond, ed., *The Legacy of China* (London: Oxford University Press, 1964)

Dawson, Raymond, *The Chinese Chameleon: An Analysis of European Conceptions of Chinese Civilization* (London: Oxford University Press, 1967)

Deane, Hugh, "Ezra Pound's Chinese Translucencies," *Eastern Horizon* 20.4 (April 1981), 39-41

Deeney, John J., "Chinese-English Comparative Literature Studies: A Poetics of Contrast?" *International Comparative Literature Association* (1979), 602-605

Delisle, Jean, *Translation: An Interpretative Approach* (Ottawa and London: University of Ottawa Press, 1988)

Dembo, L. S., *The Confucian Odes of Ezra Pound: A Critical Appraisal* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1963)

Denney, Reuel, "The Portable Pagoda: Asia and America in the Work of Gary Snyder," in *Asian and Western Writers in Dialogue: New Cultural Identities* (London: Macmillan Press, 1982)

Dilthey, W., *W. Dilthey: Selected Writings*, ed. and trans. by H. P. Rickman (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1976)

Dragin, Peter, and Paul Dresman, "Forms of Open Form: A Comparison of English Translations of Li Ch'ing Chao," *Tamkang Review* 15.1-4 (Autumn-Summer 1984-5), 285-306

Dunn, James H., "Translation and Poetics: Reciprocal Technologies in the History of Chinese-to-English Transfer," *Tamkang Review* 16.4 (Summer 1986), 381-94

Eagleton, Terry, *Literary Theory: an Introduction* (Oxford: Blackwell, 1983)

Eliot, T. S., *To Criticize the Critic* (London: Faber, 1965)

Emery, Clark M., *Ideas into Action: A Study of Pound's Cantos* (Coral Gables: University of Miami Press, 1959)

Eoyang, Eugene, "The Confucian Odes: Ezra Pound's Translation of the *Shih Ching*," *Paideuma* 3.1 (1974), 33-47

Eoyang, Eugene, "The Tone of the Poet and the Tone of the Translator," *Yearbook of Comparative and General Literature* 24 (1975), 75-83

Eoyang, Eugene, "Coming to Terms: The Popular as Pejorative," *Yearbook of Comparative and General Literature* 28 (1979), 41-45

Eoyang, Eugene, "Polar Paradigms in Poetics: Chinese and Western Literary Premises," *Comparative Literature East and West: Traditions and Trends* (Honolulu: University of Hawaii Press, 1989), 11-21

Eoyang, Eugene, "The Maladjusted Messenger: Rezeptionasthetik in Translation," *Literatures Histories and Literary Histories* (1989), 158-187

Espey, John J., *Ezra Pound's Mauberley: A Study in Composition* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1955)

Even-Zohar, Itamar, *Papers in Historical Poetics* (Tel Aviv: The Porter Institute for Poetics and Semiotics, 1978)

Fackler, Herbert V., "Three English Version of Han-Shan's Cold Mountain Poems," *Literature: East and West* 15.2 (1971), 269-278

Fan, Cunzhong, "The Beginnings of the Influence of Chinese Culture in England," *Waiguoyu* 6 (1982), 2-13

Fan, Tsen-chung (Fan Cunzhong), "Chinese Culture in England: Studies from Sir William Temple to Oliver Goldsmith" (unpublished doctoral dissertation, Harvard University, 1931)

Fan, Tsen-chung, *Dr. Johnson and Chinese Culture* (London: The China Society, 1945)

Fan, Tsen-chung, "Sir William Jones's Chinese Studies," *Review of English Studies* 22.88 (October 1946), 304-314

Fang, Achilles, *Rhymeprose on Literature: The Wen-fu of Lu Chi (A. D. 261-303)* (Cambridge, Massachusetts: Harvard University Press, 1951)

Fang, Achilles, "Fenollosa and Pound," *Harvard Journal of Asiatic Studies* 20 (1957),

134-179

Fang, Achilles, "Materials for the Study of Pound's *Cantos*" (unpublished doctoral dissertation, Harvard University, 1958)

Fenollosa, Ernest, *The Chinese Written Character as a Medium for Poetry*, ed. by Ezra Pound (San Francisco: City Lights, 1936)

Fish, Stanley, *Is there a Text in this Class?* (Cambridge, Massachusetts: Harvard University Press, 1980)

Fish, Stanley, "Interpreting the Variorum," in *Modern Criticism and Theory*, ed. by David Lodge (Harlow: Longman, 1988), pp. 311-329

Fisk, Craig, "The Verse Eye and the Self-animating Landscape in Chinese Poetry," *Tamkang Review* 8.1 (April 1977), 123-54

Flanagan, Kathleen Theresa, "The Orient as Pretext for Aesthetic Revolution in Modern Poetry in English" (unpublished doctoral dissertation, University of North Carolina, Chapel Hill, 1987)

Fletcher, John Gould, "The Orient and Contemporary Poetry," in *The Asian Legacy and American Life*, ed. by Arthur E. Christy (New York: John Day, 1945), pp. 145-174

Fokkema, Douwe W., and Kenne-Ibsch Elrud, *Theories of Literature in the Twentieth Century: Structuralism, Marxism, Aesthetics of Reception, Semiotics* (London: C. Hurst & Co., 1977)

Fong, Grace S., "Wu Wengying's *Yongwu Ci*: Poem as Artifice and Poem as Metaphor," *Harvard Journal of Asiatic Studies* 45 (1985), 323-347

Fong, Grace S., "Contextualization and Generic Codes in the Allegorical Reading of *Tz'u* Poetry," *Tamkang Review* 19.1-4 (Autumn-Summer 1988-9), 663-680

Frankel, Hans, "The 'I' in Chinese Poetry" *Oriens* 10 (1957), 128-130

Frankel, Hans, *Biographies of Meng Hao-jan* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1952, 1961)

Frankel, Hans, "Fifteen Poems by Ts'ao Chih: An Attempt at a New Approach," *Journal of the American Oriental Society*, 84 (No. 1, Jan/ March, 1964), 1-14

Frankel, Hans, "The Contemplation of the Past in T'ang Poetry," in *Perspectives on the T'ang*, ed. by Arthur Wright and Denis Teitchett (New Haven: Yale University Press, 1973), pp. 345-365

Frankel, Hans, *The Flowering Plum and the Palace Lady: Interpretations of Chinese Poetry* (New Haven: Yale University Press, 1976)

Frankel, Hans, "English Translations of Classical Chinese Poetry Since the 1950s: Problems and Achievements," *Tamkang Review* 15.1-4 (Autumn-Summer 1984-5), 307-328

Fraser, G. S., *Ezra Pound* (New York: Grove Press, 1961)

Frodsham, J. D., "The Origins of Chinese Nature Poetry," *Asia Major* 8 (1960), 68-103

Frodsham, J. D., "Reluctant Muse: Chinese Poetry in the West," *Orient/West* 9.5 (September-October, 1964), 21-30

Frodsham, J. D., "Landscape Poetry in China and Europe," *Comparative Literature* 19.3 (Summer 1967), 193-215

Fu, James S., "The Device of *Hsing* in Classical Chinese Poetry," *Asian Pacific Quarterly of Cultural and Social Affairs* (Seoul, Korea) 10.1 (Summer 1978), 14-19

Fuehrer, Berhard, "In Search of a *Tertium Comparationis* of the Poetological Approach of Zhong Hong (467?- 518) and Julius Caesar Scaliger (1482- 1558)," *Chinese Literature and European Context* (1994), 163-168

Fukuda, Rikutaro, "Ezra Pound and the Orient-- some Oriental Figures Behind E. Pound," *Tamkang Review* 2.2/3.1 (October-April 1971-2), 61-70

Gaddis Rose, M., ed., *Translation Spectrum: Essays in Theory and Practice* (Albany: State University of New York, 1981)

Gálik, Marian, "On the Influence of Foreign Ideas on Chinese Literary Criticism," A*sian and African Studies* 2 (1966), 38-48

Gálik, Marian, "Concept of Creative Personality in Traditional Chinese Literary Criticism," *Oriens Extremus* 27.2 (1980), 183-202

Gálik, Marian, "At the Beginning was *Shijing*: On the Reception of Chinese Literature in Bohemia and Slovakia (1897-1988)," *Asian and African Studies* 25 (1990), 39-56

Gardner, Geoffrey, ed., *For Rexroth* (New York: The Ark, 1980)

Gentzler, Edwin, *Contemporary Translation Theories* (London: Routledge, 1993)

Giles, H. A., "A Re-translation," *New China Review* 2.4 (August 1920), 319-321

Giles, H. A., "Mr. Waley and *The Lute Girl's Song*," *New China Review* 3 (1921), 281-288

Giles, H. A., *A History of Chinese Literature* (New York: F. Ungar Publishing Co., 1967)

Graham, A. C., "A New Translation of a Chinese Poet: Li Ho," *Bulletin of the School of Oriental and African Studies, University of London*, 34 (1971), 560-570

Graham, J. F., *Difference and Translation* (Ithaca and London: Cornell University Press, 1985)

Gridley, Roy E., "Some Chinese Elements in Modern American Poetry," in *American Literature in China* (Chengdu: Sichuan University Press, 1989)

Guillén, Claudio, "Some Observations on Parallel Poetic Forms," *Tamkang Review* 2.2/3.1 (October-April 1971-2), 395-416

Hall, Jonathan, and Ackbar Abbas, ed., *Literature & Anthropology* (Hong Kong: Hong Kong University Press, 1986)

Hatim, Basil, and Ian Mason, *Discourse and Translation* (London: Longman, 1990)

Hawkes, David, "Literature: Chinese Poetry and the English Reader," in *The Legacy of China*, ed. by Raymond Dawson (London: Oxford University Press, 1964), pp. 90-115

Hawkes, David, "The Translator, the Mirror and the Dream-- some Observations on a New Theory," *Renditions* 13 (1980), 5-20

Hawkes, David, "Cold Mountain," in *Classical, Modern and Humane: Essays in Chinese Literature*, ed. by John Minford and Siu-kit Wong (Hong Kong: Chinese University Press, 1989), pp. 249-252

Hermans, Theo, ed., *The Manipulation of Literature* (London: Croom Helm, 1985)

Hightower, James Robert, "The *Wen Hsuan* and Genre Theory," *Harvard Journal of Asiatic Studies* 20 (1957), 512-532

Hill, G. B., and L. F. Powell, ed., *Boswell's Life of Johnson*, 4 vols (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1934)

Hirsch, E. D., *Validity in Interpretation* (New Haven: Yale University Press, 1976)

Holmes, James, ed., *The Nature of Translation: Essays on the Theory and Practice of Literary Translation* (The Hague: Mouton, 1970)

Holmes, James, Jose Lambert, and Raymond Van den Broeck, ed., *Literature and Translation: New Perspectives in Literary Studies with a Basic Bibliography of Books on Translation Studies* (Leuven: Acco., 1978)

Holmes, James, *Transalted! Papers on Literary Translation and Translation Studies* (Amsterdam: Rodopi, 1988)

Holzmann, Donald, *Poetry and Politics: The Life and Work of Juan Chi A. D. 210-263* (Cambridge: University of Cambridge Press, 1976)

Hou, Chien, "Suggestiveness in Chinese Poetics," *Neohelicon* 11.1 (1983), 55-68

Hsiao, Gene Ching-song, "Semiotic Interpretation of Chinese Poetry: Tu Mu's Poetry as Example" (unpublished doctoral dissertation, University of Arizona, 1985)

Hsieh, Wen Tung, "English Translations of Chinese Poetry," *The Criticism: A Literary Review* 17.68 (April 1938), 403-423

Hsin, Kwan-chue, "A Brief Comparative Study of Confucian and Western Aesthetics," *Asian Culture Quarterly* 20.3 (Autumn 1992), 1-39

Hu, Juren 胡菊人, *Shiseng Hanshan de fuhuo* (The Rebirth of the Monk Poet Han Shan) 詩僧寒山的復活, *Ming Pao Monthly* 明報月刊 1 (November, 1966), 2-12

Hung, Ming-shui, "An Approach to Teaching Classical Chinese Poetry," *Journal of Chinese Language Teachers Association* 15.3 (October 1980), 87-99

Husserl, Edmund, *Experience and Judgement: Investigations in a Genealogy of Logic*, rev. and ed. by Ludwig Langgrebe, trans. by James S. Churchill and K. Ameriks (London: Routledge and Kegan Paul, 1948)

Hwang, Mei-shu, "Where is 'I' in Classical Chinese Poetry? An Experimental Interpretation," *Tamkang Review* 15.1-4 (Autumn-Summer 1984-5), 31-48

Iser, Wolfgang, *The Implied Reader* (Baltimore: Johns Hopkins University Press, 1974)

Iser, Wolfgang, *Prospecting* (Baltimore: John Hopkins University Press, 1989)

Jauss, Hans Robert, *Towards an Aesthetic of Reception* (Brighton: Harvester, 1982)

Jenner, W. J. F., "Insuperable Barriers? Some Thoughts on the Reception of Chinese Writing in English Translation," *Worlds Apart: Recent Chinese Writing and Its Audiences* (1990), 177-197

Jiang, Kong Yang, "A Comparative Study of Ancient Chinese and Occidental Aesthetic Thought," *Cowrie* 1.3 (1985), 46-54

Johns, Francis A., "Arthur Waley and Amy Lowell: A Note," *Journal of the Rutgers University Libraries* 44.1 (June 1982), 17-22

Jung, Angela Chih-ying, "Ezra Pound and China" (unpublished doctoral dissertation, University of Washington, 1955)

Kahn, Paul, "Han Shan in English," *Renditions* 25 (Spring 1986), 140-175

Kao, Karl S. Y., "Rhetorical Devices in the Chinese Literary Tradition," *Tamkang Review* 14.1-4 (Autumn-Summer 1983-4), 325-338

Kao, Yu-kung, and Tsu-lin Mei, "Tu Fu's Autumn Meditations: An Exercise in Linguistic Criticism," *Harvard Journal of Asiatic Studies* 28 (1968), 44-80

Kao, Yu-kung, and Tsu-lin Mei, "Syntax, Diction, and Imagery in T'ang Poetry," *Harvard Journal of Asiatic Studies* 31 (1971), 51-136

Katz, Michael, "Amy Lowell and the Orient," *Comparative Literature Studies* 18.2 (June 1981), 124-140

Kawamoto, Koji, "An Awkward Venus: The Moon in Imagist Poetry," *Tamkang Review* 18.1-4 (Autumn-Summer 1987-8), 85-96

Kelly, Alan Lawrence, Jr., "Confucianism and the Meaning of the *Cantos* of Ezra Pound" (unpublished doctoral dissertation, Indiana University, 1986)

Kelly, L. G., *The True Interpreter: A History of Translation Theory and Practice in the West* (Oxford: Blackwell, 1979)

Kennedy, George. "Fenollosa, Pound and the Chinese Character," *Yale Literary Magazine* 36 (1958), 24-36

Kenner, Hugh, *The Poetry of Ezra Pound* (London: Faber & Faber, 1951)

Kenner, Hugh, ed., *The Translations of Ezra Pound* (London: Faber and Faber, 1953)

Kenner, Hugh, "Ezra Pound and Chinese," *Agenda* 4.2 (1965), 38-41

Kenner, Hugh, "The Invention of China," *Spectrum* 9.1 (1967), 21-53

Kenner, Hugh, *The Pound Era* (London: Faber & Faber, 1971)

Kenner, Hugh, "The Poetics of Error," *Tamkang Review* 6.2/ 7.1 (October-April 1975- 6), 89-98

Kerouac, Jack, "Meditation in the Woods," *Chicago Review*, 22.2 (1958)

Kerouac, Jack, *The Dharma Bums* (New York: The New American Library, 1959)

Kittel, Harald and Frank, Armin Paul, *Interculturality and the Historical Study of Literary Translation* (Berlin: Erich Schmidt Verlag, 1991)

Knoerle, Jeanne S. P., "Ezra Pound and the Literature of China," *Tamkang Review* 4.1 (April 1973), 53-62

Knoerle, Mary Gregory, "The Poetic Theories of Lu Chi, with a Brief Comparison with Horace's *Ars Poetica*," *Journal of Aesthetics and Arts Criticism* 25 (1966), 137-143

Kodama, Sanehide, "The Chinese Subject in Ezra Pound's Poetry," *Studies in English Literature* 47 (August- March 1970-71), 37-62

Ku, Tim-hung, "A Semiotic Approach to Wang Wei's Wang River Sequence: An Exploration of the Principle of Equivalence and the Principle of Disjunction," *Tamkang Review* 14.1-4 (Autumn- Summer 1983-4), 339-354

Ku, Tim-hung, "A Semiotic Approach to Chinese-English Love Poetry: Focusing on the Space of the Addressee," *Tamkang Review* 20.2 (Winter 1989), 169-194

Kung, Wen-kai, "The Poetry and Poetic Diction of Tu Mu's Poetry," *Tsing Hua Journal of Chinese Studies* 12.1-2 (December 1979), 281-307

Kwan-Terry, John, "Ezra Pound and the Invention of China," *Tamkang Review* 10.1 (Autumn 1979), 127-144

Lach, Donald F., "China and the Era of the Enlightenment," *Journal of Modern History* 14 (1942), 209-223

Lach, Donald F., "Literature," in *Asia in the Making of Europe, vol. I: The Century of Discovery* (Chicago and London: University of Chicago Press, 1965), pp. 74-80

Lach, Donald F., "English Literature," in *Asia in the Making of Europe, vol. II: A Century of Wonder* (Chicago and London: University of Chicago Press, 1965), pp. 361-392

Lach, Donald F., *China in the Eyes of Europe* (Chicago and London: The University of Chicago Press, 1968)

Lach, Donald F., and Theodore Nicholas Foss, "Images of Asia and Asians in European Fiction, 1500-1800," *Asia in Western Fiction* (1990), 14-34

Lai, Robert Sheng-yu, "A Comparative Analysis of the Theme of Time in Elizabethan and Northern Sung Lyric Poetry," *Tamkang Review* 14.1-4 (Autumn-summer 1983-4), 115-140

Lan, H. R., "Working Toward a New Canon," *Journal of Chinese Language Teachers Association* 26.2 (May 1991), 33-50

Larkin, Greg, "From Noman to Everyman: Chinese Characters in the *Pisan Cantos*," *Tamkang Review* 11.3 (Spring 1981), 307-316

Larsen, Jeanne, "Gathering Lotuses, Picking Water Chestnuts: A Manifestation of the Pastoral in Medieval Chinese Verse," *The Comparatists* 11 (May 1987), 5-20

Larsen, Jeanne, "Women of Religion in Tang Poetry: Toward a New Pedagogy of Reading Traditional Genre," *Journal of Chinese Language Teachers Association* 22.3 (October 1987), 1-25

Lattimore, David, "Chinese Language and Literature in the University," *Indiana Companion to Traditional Chinese Literature* 5.3 (October, 1969), 68-81

Lau, Joseph S. M., "To Disillusion or to Disenchant?: The Use of Translation as Interpretation," *Tamkang Review* 10.2 (Winter 1979), 227-242

Lau, Joseph S. M., "Translation as Interpretation: A Pedagogical View," *Tamkang Review* 15.1-4 (Autumn-Summer 1984-5), 349-366

Leary, Lewis, ed., *Motive and Method in the Cantos of Ezra Pound* (New York: Columbia University Press, 1961)

Lee, Joseph J., "An Exploration of the 'Universe' in Chinese Poetry," *Literature: East and West* (Sept. 1966), 211-219

Lee, Joseph J., *Wang Ch'ang-ling* (Boston: G. K. Hall, 1982)

Lee, Pen-ti, and Donald Murray, "The Quality of *Cathay*: Ezra Pound's Early Translations of the Chinese Poems," *Literature: East and West* 10.3 (September 1966), 264-277

Lefevere, André, "The Study of Literary Translation and the Study of Comparative Literature," *Babel* 17.4 (1971), 13-15

Lefevere, André, "Translation-- Its Use," *Tamkang Review* 4.2 (October 1973), 49-78

Lefevere, André, *Translating Poetry: Seven Strategies and a Blueprint* (Assen/Amsterdam: Van Gorcum, 1975)

Lefevere, André, "Western Hermeneutics and Concepts of Chinese Literary Theory," *Tamkang Review* 6.2/ 7.1 (October- April 1975-76), 159-168

Lefevere, André, "Slauerhoff and 'Po Tsju I': Three Paradigms for the Study of Influence," *Tamkang Review* 10.1 (Autumn 1979), 67-78

Lefevere, André, "Some Tactical Steps Toward a Common Poetics," *China and the West: Comparative Literature Studies* (1980), 9-16

Lefevere, André, "The Study of Literary Translation: Productive and Less So," *Tamkang Review* 15.1-4 (Autumn-Summer 1984-5), 367-384

Lefevere, André, "Translation and/ in Comparative Literature," *Yearbook of Comparative and General Literature* 35 (1986), 40-50

Lefevere, André, *Translation/ History/ Culture: A Sourcebook* (London: Routledge, 1992)

Lefevere, André, *Translation, Rewriting and the Manipulation of Literary Fame*

(London: Routledge, 1992)

Levy, Dore J., "Constructing Sequences: Another Look at the Principle of *Fu* 'Enumeration'," *Harvard Journal of Asiatic Studies*, 46 (1986), 471-493

Levy, Dore J., *Chinese Narrative Poetry: The Late Han through T'ang Dynasties* (Durham: Duke University Press, 1988)

Lin, Yao-fu, "'The Mountains Are Your Mind': Orientalism in the Poetry of Gary Snyder," *Tamkang Review* 6.2/ 7.1 (October-April 1975-76), 357-392

The Literary Mind and the Carving of Dragons: A Study of Thought and Pattern in Chinese Literature, trans. and annotated by Vincent Yu-chung Shih (Hong Kong: The Chinese University Press, 1983)

Liu, James J. Y., *The Art of Chinese Poetry* (Chicago: The University of Chicago Press, 1962)

Liu, James J. Y., "Towards a Chinese Theory of Poetry," *Yearbook of Comparative and General Literature* 15 (1966), 159-165

Liu, James J. Y., *The Chinese Knight-errant* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1967)

Liu, James J. Y., "Prolegomena to a Study of Traditional Chinese Theories of Literature," *Literature: East and West* 18.3 (1972), 935-949

Liu, James J. Y., *Major Lyricists of the Northern Sung* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1974)

Liu, James J. Y., "Language-Literature-Translation: A Bifocal Approach in a Tetardic Framework," in The *Art and Profession of Translation: Proceedings of the Asia Foundation Conference on Chinese-English Translation*, ed. by T. C. Lai (Hong Kong: The Hong Kong Translation Society, 1975), pp. 1-8

Liu, James J.Y., "Polarity of Aims and Methods: Naturalization or Barbarization?" *Yearbook of Comparative and General Literature* 24 (1975), 60-68

Liu, James J. Y., "Tradition and Creativity in Early Ch'ing Poetics," in *Artists and Tradition: Use of the Past in Chinese Culture* (Princeton: The Art Museum, Princeton University, 1976), pp. 17-20

Liu, James J. Y., *Essentials of Chinese Art* (N. Scituate, Massachusetts: Duxbury Press, 1979)

Liu, James J. Y., *Chinese Theories of Literature* (Chicago: Chicago University Press, 1979)

Liu, James J. Y., "Time, Space, and Self in Chinese Poetry," *Chinese Literature: Essays, Articles and Reviews* 2 (1979), 137-156

Liu, James J. Y., *The Intralingual Critic: Interpreting Chinese Poetry* (Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 1982)

Liu, James J. Y., *The Interlingual Critic: Interpreting Chinese Poetry* (Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 1982)

Liu, James J. Y., "The Poet and His Audience in Classical Chinese Poetry," *Critical Issues in East Asian Literature* (1983), 9-28

Liu, James J. Y., and Richard J. Lynn, ed., *Language-- Paradox-- Poetics: A Chinese Perspective* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1988)

Liu, James T. C., "On Translation," *Journal of the American Oriental Society* 36.2 (Feb 1977), 402-423

Liu, Wan, "Classical Poetry in China and England: A Comparison of Formal Stylistics," *Comparative Literature Studies* 25.2 (1988), 152-165

Liu, Wan, "Poetics of Allusion: Tu Fu, Li Shang-yin, Ezra Pound, and T. S. Eliot" (unpublished doctoral dissertation, Princeton University, 1992)

Liu, Wu-chi, *An Introduction to Chinese Literature* (Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 1966)

Liu Xie 劉勰, *Wenxin diaolong zhu* 文心雕龍注, ed. by Fan Wenlan 范文瀾 (Taibei: Daming, 1965)

Lo, Irving Yucheng, "Fidelity in Translation and the Limits of Uncivility," in The *Art and Profession of Translation: Proceedings of the Asia Foundation Conference on Chinese-English Translation*, ed. by T. C. Lai (Hong Kong: The Hong Kong Translation Society, 1975), pp. 107-124

Lockwood, Williams J., "Kenneth Rexroth's Versions of Li Ch'ing Chao," *Tamkang Review* (Autumn-Summer 1984-5), 389-410

Lovejoy, A. O., "The Chinese Origin of a Romanticism," *Journal of English and Germanic Philosophy*, 32 (Jan. 1933), 1-20

Lu, Zhiwai, *Five Lectures On Chinese Poetry* (Beijing: The Foreign Language Teaching and Research Press, 1935)

Lynn, Richard J., "Chinese Theories of Literature: A Review of a Recent Study," *Journal of Chinese Language Teachers Association* 8 (1978), 64-67

Lynn, Richard J., "The Sudden and the Gradual in Chinese Poetry Criticism: An Examination of the Ch'an-Poetry Analogy," in *The Sudden and Gradual: Approaches to Enlightenment in Chinese Thought* (Honolulu: Kuroda Institute, University of Hawaii, 1987), pp. 381-428

MacLeish, Archibald, *Poetry and Experience* (Cambridge: Riverside Press, 1961)

Malone, David H., "Cultural Assumptions & Western Literary Criticism," *Tamkang Review* 6.2/ 7.1 (October- April 1975-1976), 55-68

Mao, Nathan, "The Influence of Zen Buddhism on Gary Snyder," *Tamkang Review* 5.2 (October 1974), 125-134

Mao, Nathan, and Ts'un-yan Liu, *Li Yu* (Boston: Twayne Publishers, 1977)

Marsh, Edward Howard, *Georgian Poetry 1920-1922* (London: The Poetry Bookshop, 1922)

McDougall, Bonnie S., "European Influences in the Poetry of Ho Ch'i-fan," *Journal of the Oriental Society of Australia* 5.1-2 (December 1967), 133-151

McDougall, Bonnie S., *The Introduction of Western Literacy Theories into Modern China, 1919-1925* (Tokyo: Centre for East Asian Cultural Studies, 1971)

McDougall, Bonnie S., "The Importance of Being Earnest in China: Early Chinese Attitudes Towards Oscar Wilde," *Journal of the Oriental Society of Australia* 9 (1972-3), 84-89

McDougall, Bonnie S., "The Impact of Western Literary Trends," in *Modern Chinese Literature in the May Fourth Era* (Cambridge, Massachusetts: Harvard University Press, 1977), pp. 37-61

McDougall, Bonnie S., *Mao Zedong's "Talks at the Yan'an Conference on Literature and Art": A Translation of the 1943 Text with Commentary* (Ann Arbor: Center for Chinese Studies, University of Michigan, 1980)

McDougall, Bonnie S., ed., *Popular Chinese Literature and Performing Arts in the People's Republic of China, 1949-1979* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1984)

McDougall, Bonnie S., *The August Sleepwalker by Bei Dao* (New York: New Directions, 1988)

McDougall, Bonnie S., *Three Kings: Three Stories from Today's China* (London: Collins Harvill, 1990)

McDougall, Bonnie S., *Waves: Stories by Bei Dao* (New York: New Directions, 1990)

McDougall, Bonnie S., and Chen Maiping, *Old Snow: Poems by Bei Dao* (London: Anvil Press, 1992)

McLachlan, Ian, "The Translator as Critic: Notes on Certain Questions Arising from the Translation of T'ao Yuan-ming," *Enquiry* 1.2 (Summer 1967), 1-20

McLeod, Dan, "Some Images of China in the Works of Gary Snyder," *Tamkang Review* 10.3 (Spring & Summer 1980), 369-384

McLuhan, Marshall, *Understanding Media* (New York: McGraw-Hill, 1960)

McNaughton, William, "Pound's Translations of Chinese '*Melopoeia*'" *Texas Quarterly* 10.4 (1967): 52-56

McNaughton, William, "Chinese Poetry in Untranslation," *Critique* 1 (1968), 191-204

Mencius, translated by D. C. Lau (Hong Kong: The Chinese University Press, 1984)

Meng, Mong, "Configuration of a Lyrical World: A Study of Tao Yuan-ming's Poetics from a Comparative Perspective" (unpublished doctoral dissertation, Rutgers, The State University of New Jersey, 1990)

Miao, Ronald C., "On the Translation of Traditional Chinese Poetry: A Review of Some Recent Trends," *Yearbook of Comparative and General Literature* 24 (1975), 93-100

Miao, Ronald C., ed., *Studies in Chinese Poetry and Poetics* (San Francisco: Chinese Materials Center, 1978)

Miles, Josephine, *The Poem: A Critical Anthology* (Englewood: Prentice-Hall, 1959)

Miller, James Whipple, "The Poetry of Meng Hao-jan: Translations and Critical Introduction for the Western Reader" (unpublished doctoral dissertation, Princeton University, 1972)

Miller, James Whipple, "English Romanticism and Chinese Nature Poetry," *Chinese Literature* 24.3 (Summer 1972), 213-236

Miller, Lucien, "Poetry as Contemplation: T'ao Ch'ien's 'Homing' and William Wordsworth's 'Tintern Abbey'," *Journal of the Institute of Chinese Studies, Chinese University of Hong Kong* 6. 2 (December 1973), 563-586

Miner, Earl, *The Japanese Tradition in British and American Literature* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1958)

Miner, Earl, *Comparative Poetics: An Intercultural Essay on Theories of Literature* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1990)

Miyake, Akiko, "Between Confucius and Eleusis: Ezra Pound's Assimilation of Chinese Culture and Writing the *Cantos* I-LXXI" (unpublished doctoral dissertation, Duke University, 1970)

Monk, Samuel Holt, ed., *Five Miscellaneous Essays by Sir William Temple* (Ann Arbor: University of Michigan Press, 1963)

Morris, Ivan, ed., *Madly Singing in the Mountains: An Appreciation and Anthology of Arthur Waley* (London: George Allen & Unwin Ltd, 1970)

Morrison, Madison, "The Oriental Element in Modernist Anglo-American Poetry d(Parts I, II)," *Asian Culture Quarterly* 12.1-2 (1984), 71-91; 33-53

de Nagy, N. C., *The Poetry of Ezra Pound: The Imagist Stage* (Bern: Francke Verlag, 1960)

de Nagy, N. C., *Ezra Pound's Poetics and Literary Tradition: The Critical Decade* (Bern: Francke Verlag, 1966)

Nänny, Max, *Ezra Pound: Poetics for an Electric Age* (Bern and Munich, Francke Verlag, 1973)

Newmark, Peter, *Approaches to Translation* (London: Pergamon, 1981)

Newmark, Peter, *A Textbook of Translation* (London: Prentice-Hall, 1988)

Nida, Eugene, *Towards a Science of Translating* (Leiden: E. J. Brill, 1964)

Nida, Eugene A., and Charles R. Taber, *The Theory and Practice of Translation* (Leiden: E. J. Brill, 1969)

Nienhauser, William H., "Thrice-Told Tales: Translating Japanese Translations of Chinese Poetry into English," *Translation Review* 10 (1982), 27-33

Norman, Charles, *Ezra Pound: A Biography* (New York: Macmillan, 1960)

Orr, Gregory, ed., "Chinese Poetry and the American Imagination," *Ironwood* 17 (1981), 11-21; 38-51

Osborne, Edna Pearle, *Oriental Diction and Theme in English Verse, 1740-1840* (Kansas: University of Kansas, 1916)

Owen, Stephen, and Ronald C. Miao, ed., *Studies in Chinese Poetry and Poetics* (San Francisco: Chinese Materials Center, 1978)

Owen, Stephen, "Transparencies: Reading the T'ang Lyric," *Harvard Journal of Asiatic Studies* 39.2 (1979), 231-251

Owen, Stephen, "The Historicity of Understanding," *Tamkang Review* 14.1-4 (Autumn-Summer 1983-4), 435-464

Owen, Stephen, *Traditional Chinese Poetry and Poetics: Omen of the World* (Madison: University of Wisconsin Press, 1985)

Owen, Stephen, *Mi-lou: Poetry and the Labyrinth of Desire*, vol. 39 (Cambridge: Massachusetts: Harvard University Press, 1989)

Palandri, Angela Jung, "The Stone is Alive in My Hand-- Ezra Pound's Chinese Translations," *Literature: East and West* 10 (1966), 278-291

Palandri, Angela Jung, "Ezra Pound and His Italian Critics," *Tamkang Review* 3.2 (October 1972), 41-58

Parkinson, Thomas, ed., *A Casebook on the Beat*, (New York: Thomas Y. Crowell, 1961)

Parkinson, Thomas, "The Poetry of Gary Snyder," *The Southern Review* 4 (1968), 616-632

Pearlman, Daniel D., *The Barb of Time: On the Unity of Pound's 'Cantos'* (New York: Oxford University Press, 1969)

Plaks, Andrew H., "Where the Lines Meet: Parallelism in Chinese and Western Literatures," *Poetics Today* (Fall 1990), 523-546

Pound, Ezra, *Instigations* (New York: Boni and Liveright, 1920)

Pound, Ezra, *Antheil and the Treatise on Harmony* (London: Peter Russell, 1927)

Pound, Ezra, *ABC of Reading* (London: Routledge, 1934)

Pound, Ezra, *Make It New* (New Haven: Yale University, 1935)

Pound, Ezra, *Confucius: The Great Digest & Unwobbling Pivot* (New York: New Directions, 1951)

Pound, Ezra, *The Spirit of Romance* (Norfolk, Conn.: New Directions, 1952)

Pound, Ezra, *Guide to Kulchur* (Norfolk, Conn.: New Directions, 1952)

Pound, Ezra, *ABC of Economics* (London: Peter Russell, 1953)

Pound, Ezra, *Analects* (London: Peter Owen, 1956)

Pound, Ezra, *Gaudier-Brzeska: A Memoir* (New York: New Directions, 1960)

Pound, Ezra, *The Letters of Ezra Pound: 1907-1941*, ed. by D. D. Paige (New York: Harcourt, Brace & World, 1960)

Pound, Ezra, *Literary Essays of Ezra Pound*, ed. by T. S. Eliot (London: Faber and Faber, 1960)

Qian, Zhongshu (Chien Chung-shu), "China in the English Literature of the Seventeenth Century," *Quarterly Bulletin of Chinese Bibliography* 1 (1940), 351-384

Qian, Zhongshu, "China in the English Literature of the Eighteenth Century,"

Quarterly Bulletin of Chinese Bibliography 2.2-4 (December 1941), 113-152

Qian, Zhongshu, "An Early Chinese Version of Longfellow's *Psalm of Life*," *Philobiblon* 2.2 (March, 1948), 10-17

Qian, Zhongshu, "Lin Ch'in-nan Revisited," *Renditions* 5 (1975), 8-21

Qian, Zhongshu, *Tan Yi Lu* 談藝錄 (Hong Kong: Guoguang Sujue, 1979)

Qian, Zhongshu, "Synaethesia," *Cowrie* 1.1 (1983), 1-20

Qian, Zhongshu, "Poetry as Vehicle of Grief," *Renditions* 21-22 (1984), 21-40

Qian Zhongshu, *Qijue Ji* 七絕集 (Shanghai: Shanghai Classical Books Press, 1985)

Raffel, Burton, *The Forked Tongue: A Study of the Translation Process* (The Hague: Mouton, 1971)

Raffel, Burton, "Ezra Pound and the Reception of Chinese Poetry in the English-speaking World," *Bordercrossings* 1 (1987), 5-19

Raffel, Burton, *The Art of Translating Poetry* (University Park and London: The Pennsylvania State University Press, 1988)

Reck, Michael, *Ezra Pound: A Close-Up* (New York: McGraw-Hill Book Company, 1967)

Rexroth, Kenneth, "The Poetry of the Far East in a General Education," in *Approaches to the Oriental Classics: Asian Literature and Thought in General Education* (New York: Columbia University Press, 1959), pp. 196-201

Rickett, Adele Austin, "Technical Terms in Chinese Literary Criticism," *Literature: East and West* 12 (1968), 141-147

Rickett, Adele Austin, "The Personality of the Chinese Critic," *Yearbook of Comparative Criticism*, 6 (1973), 111-134

Rickett, Adele Austin, "A 'Translation' Exercise in Chinese Poetry," *Journal of Chinese Language Teachers Association* 9.1 (April 1974), 4-12

Rickett, Adele Austin, ed., *Chinese Approaches to Literature from Confucius to Liang Ch'i-ch'ao* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1977)

Rickett, Adele Austin, *Wang Kuo-wei's Jen-chien T'zu-hua-- a Study in Chinese Literary Criticism* (Hong Kong: Hong Kong University Press, 1977)

Rosenthal, M. L., *A Primer of Ezra Pound* (New York: Macmillan, 1960)

Ruppenthal, Stephen Hal, "The Transmission of Buddhism in the Poetry of Han Shan" (unpublished doctoral dissertation, University of California, Berkeley,

1974)

Rush, Ronald, "Pound and Li Po: What Becomes a Man," in *Ezra Pound Among the Poets* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1985)

Said, Edward W., *Orientalism: Western Conceptions of the Orient* (New York: Pantheon, 1978)

Savory, Theodore, *The Art of Translation* (Boston: The Writer, Inc., 1968)

Schneidau, Herbert N., *Ezra Pound: The Image and the Real* (Baton Rouge: Louisiana State University Press, 1969)

Schulte, Rainer and Biguenet, John, ed., *Theories of Translation: An Anthology of Essays from Dryden to Derrida* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1992)

Schwartz, W. Leonard, "A Study of Amy Lowell's Far Eastern Verse," *Modern Language Notes*, 43 (1928), 145-152

Shu, Yunzhong, "Gary Snyder and Taoism," *Tamkang Review* 17.3 (Spring 1987), 245-261

Snell-Hornby, Mary, *Translation Studies: An Integrated Approach* (Amsterdam: John Benjamin, 1988)

So, Francis K. H., "In Search of Cosmic Vision: Li Po and His European Partners," *Chinese Literature and European Context* (1994), 169-176

Spence, Jonathan, "The Explorer Who Never Left Home--Arthur Waley," *Rendition* 5 (Autumn 1975), 32-37

Stalberg, Roberta Helmer, "The Poems of the Han-Shan Collection" (unpublished doctoral dissertation, The Ohio State University, 1977)

Steiner, George, *After Babel: Aspects of Language and Translation* (London: Oxford University Press, 1975)

Steiner, T. R., *English Translation Theory 1650- 1800* (Amsterdam and Assen: Van Gorcum, 1975)

Stephens, Edma Buell, "The Oriental Influence in John Gould Fletcher's Poetry" (unpublished doctoral dissertation, Arkansas, 1961)

Stevenson, Frank, "History as Metaphor and Metonym: The Frame of Reference in Pound's 'Canto 85'" *Tamkang Review* 14.1-4 (Autumn-Summer 1983-4), 173-198

Stock, Noel, *The Life of Ezra Pound* (New York: Pantheon Books, 1970)

Strachey, Lytton, "An Anthology," in *Characters and Commentaries* (New York:

Harcourt, Brace and Co., 1933)

Suen, Sam Chung-sang, "The Metaphysical in Poetry: A Comparative Study of the Poetry of Han Yu and John Donne" (unpublished doctoral dissertation, State University of New York, 1978)

Sullivan, J. P., *Ezra Pound and Sextus Propertius: A Study in Creative Translation* (Austin: University of Texas Press, 1964)

Sullivan, J. P., "Ezra Pound and the Classics," in *New Approaches to Poetry and Idea* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1969), pp. 215-241

Sun, Cecile Chu-chin, "A Sense of Scene: Depictions of Scene as Expressions of Feeling in Chinese and English Poetry" (unpublished doctoral dissertation, Indiana University, 1982)

Sun, Cecile Chu-chin, "*Ch'ing* and *Ching*: Correlation Between Inner Feeling and Outer Reality in Chinese and English Poetry," *International Comparative Literature Association* (1982), 658-663

Sun, Cecile Chu-chin, "Comparing Chinese and English Lyrics: The Correlative Mode of Presentation," *Tamkang Review* 14.1-4 (Autumn-Summer 1983-4), 487-508

Sun, Cecile Chu-chin, "Problems of Perspective in Chinese-Western Comparative Literature Studies," *Canadian Review of Comparative Literature* 8.4 (December 1986), 531-547

Sun, Cecile Chu-chin, "Two Modes of Stanzaic Interactions in *Shih Ching* and Their Implications for Comparative Poetics," *Tamkang Review* 19.1-4 (Autumn-Summer 1988-9), 803-834

Sun, Hong, *The Epic of Ezra Pound: A Modern Poetic Quest in Chinese Ambiguity* (Terre Haute: Indiana State University, 1982)

Sun, Jingyao, "Resource and Tradition," *Literatures Histories and Literary Histories* (1989), 344-363

Sutton, Walter, "The Literary Image and the Reader," *Journal of Aesthetics and Art Criticism*, 16. 1 (Sept. 1957), 112-123

Tay, William, "Between Kung and Eleusis: Li Chi, the Eleusinian Rites, Erigena, and Ezra Pound," *Paideuma* 4 (1975), 37-54

Tay, William, "*Cheng Ming*: The New Paideuma of Ezra Pound," *Tamkang Review* 6.1 (April 1975), 121-148

Tay, William, "The Sun on the Silk: Ezra Pound and Confucianism" (unpublished doctoral dissertation, University of California, San Diego, 1977)

Tay, William, "Confucianism as Leitmotif: The *Four Books* in the *Pisan Cantos*," *Tamkang Review* 9.3 (Spring 1979), 235-268

Tay, William, "Meditation and Description in Tu Fu's 'Thoughts Written While Travelling at Night'," *Studies in Stylistics* 27 (1979), 227-248

Tay, William, "The Substantive Level Revisited: Concreteness and Nature Imagery in T'ang Poetry," *China and the West: Comparative Literature Studies* (1980), 127-149

Tay, William, "The Poetics of Juxtaposition: Haiku, Chinese Poetry and Ezra Pound," in *Essays in Commemoration of the Golden Jubilee of the Fung Ping Shan Library* (Hong Kong: University of Hong Kong, 1982), pp. 306-316

Teele, Roy E., "Through a Glass Darkly: A Study of English Translations of Chinese Poetry" (unpublished doctoral dissertation, Columbia University, 1950)

Teele, Roy E., "In Search of Cathay," *Delos* 6 (1971), 185-193

Teele, Roy E., "Trends in Translation of Chinese Poetry, 1950-1970," *Tamkang Review* 2.2/3.1 (October-April 1971-2), 479-494

Tietjens, Eunice, "The Orient's Gift to American Poetry," *Asia* 36.11 (November 1936), 746-749

Tompkins, Jane, ed., *Reader-Response Criticism: From Formalism to Post-Structuralism* (Baltimore and London: The Johns Hopkins University Press, 1980)

Touponce, William F., "Review: *Chinese-Western Comparative Literature: Theory and Strategy*," *Tamkang Review* 6.3 (Spring 1981), 317-327

Touponce, William F., "Straw Dogs: A Deconstructive Reading of the Problem of Mimesis in James Liu's *Chinese Theories of Literature*," *Tamkang Review* 11.4 (Summer 1981), 359-390

Toury, Gideon, *In Search of a Theory of Translation* (Tel Aviv: The Porter Institute for Poetics and Semiotics, 1980)

Tsai, Frederick C., "The Name and Nature of Translation," *Renditions* 10 (1978), 112-120

Tsukimura, Reiko, "Li Shang-Yin's Poetry: Three Ways of Looking at the Inner Reality- Introspection, Recollection, and Vision," *Literature: East and West* 11.3 (1967), 273-291

Turner, John, "Translating Chinese Poetry-- My Aim and Scope," *Renditions* 5 (1975), 50-65

Venuti, Lawrence, *Rethinking Translation: Discourse, Subjectivity, Ideology* (London:

Routledge, 1992)

Wagner, Marsha L., "From Image to Metaphor: Wang Wei's Use of Light and Color," *Journal of Chinese Language Teachers Association* 12.1 (February 1977), 111-117

Wagner, Marsha L., "Classical Chinese Poetry," *Journal of Chinese Language Teachers Association* 14.3 (October 1979), 107-139

Waley, Arthur, "*The Lute girl's Song*-- Mr. Waley's Reply to Prof. Giles," *New China Review* 3 (1921), 376-377

Waley, Arthur, *The Way and Its Power* (London: George Allen & Unwin Ltd, 1934)

Waley, Arthur, *Three Ways of Thought in Ancient China* (London: George Allen & Unwin Ltd, 1939)

Waley, Arthur, *Monkey* (London: George Allen & Unwin Ltd, 1942)

Waley, Arthur, *The Real Tripitaka and Other Pieces* (London: George Allen & Unwin Ltd, 1952)

Waley, Arthur, *The Opium War Through Chinese Eyes* (London: Dufour Editions, 1958)

Walther, Shirley Y. T., "A Re-examination of the Ideogrammic Method of Ezra Pound" (unpublished doctoral dissertation, Kansas State University, 1983)

Walther, Shirley Y. T., "Juxtaposition and Its Limitations: An Explanation of Obscurity in Ezra Pound's Poetry," *Tamkang Review* 14.1-4 (Autumn-Summer 1983-4), 199-212

Walther, Shirley Y. T., "An Evaluation of Fenollosa's 'Ars Poetica'," *Bulletin of College of Arts and Letters*, National Central University, Chung-li, Taiwan, 3 (1985), 37-47

Wand, David Hsin-fu, "*Cathay* Revisited: The Chinese Tradition in the Poetry of Ezra Pound and Gary Snyder" (unpublished doctoral dissertation, University of California, Berkeley, 1972)

Wang, An-yan Tang, "Subjective and Objective in the Poetic Mind: A Comparative Study of the Poetry of William Butler Yeats and Tu Fu" (unpublished doctoral dissertation, Indiana University, 1981)

Wang, Chi-chen, "Traditional Literature: Nature and Limitations," in *China: Essays on Various Aspects of Chinese Civilization* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1946), pp. 386-396

Wang, Ching-hsien, "Sartorial Emblems and the Quest: A Comparative Study of the *Li Sao* and the *Faerie Queene*," *Tamkang Review* 2.2/3.1 (October-April 1971-2),

309-328

Wang, Ching-hsien, *The Bell and the Drum: Shih Ching as Formulaic Poetry in an Oral Tradition* (Berkeley & L. A.: University of California, 1974)

Wang, Ching-hsien, "The Weneid: A Chinese Epic in *Shih Ching*," *Essays in Commemoration of the Golden Jubilee of the Fung Ping Shan Library* (Hong Kong: University of Hong Kong, 1982), 105-142

Wang, Fang-yu, "Levels of Difficulty in Translation," *Renditions* 10 (1975), 46-48

Wang Fuzhi 王夫之, *Jiangzhai shihua jianzhu* 薑齋詩話箋注, annotated by Dai Hongsen 戴鴻森 (Taibei: Muduo, 1982)

Wang Guowei 王國維, *Renjian cihua* 人間詞話 (Taibei: Kaiming, 1975)

Wang, Hui-Ming, "'Poetry as Word Painting': A Preliminary Statement," *Ironwood* 17 (1981), 55

Wang, John C. Y., "Ezra Pound as a Translator of Classical Chinese Poetry," *Sewanee Review* 73.3 (Summer 1965), 345-357

Wang Li 王力, *Hanyu shilu xue* 漢語詩律學 (Shanghai: Jiaoyu chubanshe, 1962)

Wang, Zuoliang, "The Poet as Translator," *Degrees of Affinity* (1985), 100-128

Wang, Zuoliang, *A Sense of Beginning: Studies in Literature and Translation* (Beijing: Foreign Language Teaching and Research Press, 1991)

Warren, Rosanna, *The Art of Translation: Voices from the Field* (Boston: Northeastern University Press, 1989)

Watts, Alan W., *Beat Zen, Square Zen and Zen* (San Francisco: City lights, 1959)

Weiss, Theodore, "Ezra Pound and the Cross-cultural Sources of Modern Poetry," in *Only Connect: Literary Perspectives East and West* (Adelaide: Centre for Research in the New Literatures in English & East-West Center, 1981), pp. 45-57

Weissbort, Daniel, ed., *Translating Poetry: The Double Labyrinth* (London: The Macmillan Press, 1989)

Weitzman, Arthur J., "Oriental Languages and Literature in Seventeenth-Century England," *Babel* 11 (1965), 163-167

Wells, Henry W., "The *Shih Ching* as World Literature," *Literature: East and West* 9 (1965), 310-20

Wells, Henry W., "Man and Nature in Tu Fu's Poetry," *Tamkang Review* 5.1 (April 1974), 11-30

Wells, Henry W., "William Carlos Williams and Traditions in Chinese Poetry," *Literature Half-Yearly* 16.1 (1974-75), 3-24

Wells, Tanya, "Ezra Pound's 'Cathay' and the American Idea of China" (unpublished doctoral dissertation, Arizona State University, 1983)

Wesling, Donald, "Translating Sung *Tz'u*: Contemporary English Renditions of the Chinese Lyrical," *Tamkang Review* 15.1-4 (Autumn-Summer 1984-5), 411-450

Williams, William Carlos, "Williams' Dialogue with Po Chu-yi, 1918-21," *William Carlos Williams Review* 17.1 (Spring 1991), 1-19

Wilson, James, "Ritual and Reception: Ezra Pound's Translations of Troubadour and Chinese Lyrics" (unpublished doctoral dissertation, University of California, Berkeley, 1987)

Wilss, W., *Translation Theory and its Implementation* (Tübinger: Narr, 1984)

Winters, Lee Eugene, "The Relationship of Chinese Poetry to British and American Poetry in the Twentieth Century" (unpublished doctoral dissertation, University of California, 1956)

Witemeyer, Hugh, *The Poetry of Ezra Pound: Forms and Renewal, 1908-20* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1969)

Wixted, John Timothy, *Poems on Poetry-- Literary Criticism by Yuan Hao-wen (1190-1257)* (Wiesbaden: Franz Steiner Verlag, 1982)

Wixted, John Timothy, "Sung-dynasty and Western Poems on Poetry," *Renditions* (Spring & Autumn 1984), 351-359

Wong, Laurence, "Image-making in Classical Chinese Poetry and in Western Poetry," *Chinese Literature and European Context* (1994), 177-190

Wong, Siu-kit, "*Ch'ing* in Chinese Literary Criticism: A Study of the Poetry-Talk" (unpublished doctoral dissertation, Oxford University, 1969)

Wong, Siu-kit, ed. and trans., *Early Chinese Literary Criticism* (Hong Kong: Joint Publishing Company, 1983)

Wong, Siu-kit, *Notes on Poetry from the Ginger Studio, Translated with Annotations* (Hong Kong: Chinese University of Hong Kong, 1987)

Wong, Siu-kit, and Kar-shu Li, "Three English Translations of the *Shijing*," *Renditions* 25 (1986), 113-139

Wong, Tak-wai, "On Defining Chinese Baroque Poetry," *Tamkang Review* 8.1 (April 1977), 25-72

Wong, Tak-wai, and M. A. Abbas Wong, ed., *Literary Theory Today* (Hong Kong: Hong Kong University Press, 1981)

Wong, Tak-wai, "Baroque Elements in Wen T'ing-yun's *Tzu* Poetry," *International Comparative Literature Association* (1982), 487-492

Wong, Yoon-wah, *Ssu-k'ung T'u: A Poet-Critic of the T'ang* (Hong Kong: Chinese University Press, 1976)

Wright, James, *Above the River: the Complete Poems* (New York: Farrar, Straus and Giroux, 1990)

Wyman, Mary, "Chinese Mysticism and Wordsworth," *Journal of History of Ideas*, 10 (1949), 517-538

Xi, Mi 奚密, *Hanshan yishi yu qiaoda ji-- yi ge wenxue dienxing de xingcheng* 寒山譯詩與敲打集-- 一個文學典型的形成 , in C*hongmei wenshui yinyuan* 中美文學因緣 ed. by Zheng Shusen (William Tay) 鄭樹森, (Taibei: Dung Da, 1985)

Yang, Vincent, *Nature and Self: A Study of the Poetry of Su Dongpo with Comparisons to the Poetry of William Wordsworth* (New York: Lang, 1989)

Yang, Zhouhan, "Milton's 'Canie Waggon Light'-- a Note on Cross-cultural Impact," *Cowrie* 1.3 (1986), 29-45

Yang, Zhouhan, "*Daowang Shi*, or Poetry Lamenting the Deceased Wife," *Cowrie* 1.5 (1988), 1-10

Yang, Zhouhan, and Yue Daiyun, ed., *Literatures, Histories, and Literary Histories: The Proceedings of the 2nd Sino- U. S. Comparative Literature Symposium*, (Shenyang: Liaoning University Press, 1989)

Yeh, Michelle Hsi (Xi Mi), "Metaphor and Metonymy: A Comparative Study of Chinese and Western Poetics" (unpublished doctoral dissertation, University of South California, 1982)

Yeh, Michelle Hsi, "Circularity: Emergence of a Form in Modern Chinese Poetry," *Modern Chinese Literature* 3.1-2 (Spring-Fall 1987), 33-46

Yeh, Michelle Hsi, "Metaphor and '*Bi*': Western and Chinese Poetics," *Comparative Literature* 39.3 (1987), 237-254

Yeh, Michelle Hsi, "The Short Lyric in Modern Chinese Poetry," *Tamkang Review* 19.1-4 (Autumn- Summer 1988-9), 853-874

Yeh, Michelle Hsi, *Modern Chinese Poetry: Theory and Practice Since 1917* (New Haven: Yale University Press, 1991)

Yeh, Michelle Hsi, *Anthology of Modern Chinese Poetry* (New Haven: Yale

University Press, 1992)

Yeo, Song-nian, "The Problem of 'Sentimental Fallacy' in Chinese Literary Criticism," *Tamkang Review* 6.2/7.1 (October-April 1975-1976), 341-356

Ying, Hu, "Making a Difference: Stories of the Translator at the Turn of the Century" (unpublished doctoral dissertation, Princeton University, 1993)

Yip, Wai-lim, "The Chinese Poem: A Different Mode of Representation," *Delos* 3 (1969), 62-79

Yip, Wai-lim, *Ezra Pound's Cathay* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1969)

Yip, Wai-lim, "One Case in the Translation of the Voice in a Poem: Exterior or Interior Dialogue," *Delos* 4 (1970), 202-207

Yip, Wai-lim, "Yen Yu and the Poetic Theories in the Sung Dynasty," *Tamkang Review* 1.2 (October 1970), 183-200

Yip, Wai-lim, "Wang Wei and the Aesthetic of Pure Experience," *Tamkang Review* 2.2/3.1 (October-April 1971-2), 199-218

Yip, Wai-lim, "Classical Chinese and Modern Anglo-American Poetry: Convergence of Language and Poetry," *Comparative Literature Studies* 11.1 (March 1974), 21-47

Yip, Wai-lim, "The Use of 'Models' in East-West Comparative Literature," *Tamkang Review* 6.2/ 7.1 (October- April 1975- 1976), 109-126

Yip Wai-lim, *Chinese Poetry: Major Modes and Genres* (Berkeley and Los Angeles: University of California Press, 1976)

Yip, Wai-lim, "Translating Chinese Poetry, the Convergence of Languages and Poetics-- a Radical Introduction," in *Chinese Poetry: Major Modes and Genres* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1976), pp. 1-41

Yip, Wai-lim, "The Taoist Aesthetic: Wu-yen Tu-hua, the Unspeaking, Self-conditioning, Self-transforming, Self-complete Nature," in *China and the West: Comparative Literature Studies* (1980), 17-32

Yip, Wai-lim, "Convergences and Divergences Between Classical Chinese and Modern American Poetry," *Ironwood* 17 (1981), 58-59

Yip, Wai-lim, "Beyond *Chinoiserie*: Differentiating Sameness in the Oriental Hermeneutic Community," *Tamkang Review* 15.1-4 (Autumn-Summer 1984-5), 221-232

Yip, Wai-lim, "Vestiges of the Oral Dimension: Examples from the *Shih Ching*," *Tamkang Review* 16.1 (Fall 1985), 17-50

Yip, Wai-lim, "The Framing of Critical Theories: A Reconsideration," *Studies in Language and Literature*, Taiwan 2 (1986), 1-11

Yip, Wai-lim, "Against Domination: Gary Snyder as An Apologist for Nature," in *Chinese Text: Studies in Comparative Literature*, ed. by Ying-hsiung Chou (Hong Kong: The Chinese University Press, 1986), pp. 75-84

Yu, Pauline Ruth, "Wang Wei's Journeys in Ignorance," *Tamkang Review* 8.1 (April 1977), 73-88

Yu, Pauline Ruth, *Poetry of Wang Wei* (Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 1980)

Yu, Pauline Ruth, "Allegory, Allegoresis, and the Classic of Poetry," *Harvard Journal of Asiatic Studies* 43 (1983), 377-411

Yu, Pauline Ruth, *The Reading of Imagery in the Chinese Poetic Tradition* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1987)

Yu, Pauline Ruth, "Collections, Canons and Classical Chinese Poetry," *Literatures Histories and Literary Histories* (1989), 265-291

Yu, Pauline Ruth, "Comparative Literature and Its Discontents," in *Approaches to the Asian Classics* (New York: Columbia University Press, 1990), pp. 364-369

Yuan, Heh-hsiang, "Twice Removed: A Matter of Interpretation," *Tamkang Review* 14.1-4 (Autumn-Summer 1983-4), 569-588

Yuan, Heh-hsiang, "Two Assumptions: A Rapprochment of Chinese-Western Literary Ideas," in *Aesthetics and the Literature of Ideas: Essays in Honor of A. Owen Aldridge* (Newark: University of Delaware Press, 1990), pp. 34-43

Zhang, Lonxi, "Western Theory and Chinese Reality," *Critical Inquiry* 19 (Autumn 1992), 105-130

Zhu Guangqian 朱光潛, *Shi Lun* 詩論 (Hong Kong: Shan Lian Bookstore, 1984)

Zhu Guangqian (Chu Kwang-tsien), *The Psychology of Tragedy* (Hong Kong: Joint Publishing Company, 1987)

Zoeren, Stephen Van, *Poetry and Personality: Reading, Exegesis, and Hermeneutics in Traditional China* (Stanford: Stanford University Press, 1991)

This thesis has been prepared according to the guidelines on thesis presentation issued by the Graduate School, University of Warwick.